

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF MAY 21, 2009**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Steve Cotham (ex.)

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
Tom Brechko
Daniel Hugh
Kim Trent
James Pierce
Jamie Rowe
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Herb Donaldson (ex.)

Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

Approval of Minutes – April 16, 2009, meeting

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE APRIL 16 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

1025 Luttrell Avenue - Fourth & Gill H-1 - Tim Parker (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 409094&G - Rebuild rear deck, raising elevation to be even with interior floor at rear door. Deck is located in rear yard, behind side walls of house, and not visible from Luttrell. The deck will occupy approximately the same footprint as the current deck.

1022 Luttrell Avenue - Fourth & Gill H-1 - Rob Frost (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 420094&G - Repair and/or replace in kind wood siding, soffit and fascia and other trim, gutters; remove concrete stoop that led to a side entrance door, since removed.

1015 Eleanor Street -Fourth & Gill H-1 - John Jacobs (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 430094&G - Repair, using same design and like materials, the front porch spindles, flooring, fascia and soffit; reroof front porch using shingles or membrane; repair built in gutters, or install new guttering; replace unmatched porch column with new column to match originals; repair siding, skirt board and corner boards and other trim, as necessary, using identical design and like materials.

941 Eleanor Street - Fourth & Gill H-1 - Indya Kincannon (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 506094&G - Replacement of rotting wood on rear porch, repair of leaking porch roof and screening in of porch.

820 Gratz - Fourth & Gill H-1 - Arline Harmon (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 428094&G - Reroof, using in kind shingles to asphalt shingles; repair tile covering on front steps; repair siding, fascia and soffit as necessary; install gutters.

1417 Cornelia Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Jared Brewster (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 40809ONK - Interior demolition only, removal of artificial siding, repair of holes in roof. APPLICANT UNDERSTANDS WORK IS LIMITED TO THESE ITEMS PENDING REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF CERTIFICATE FOR COMPLETE STRUCTURE BY HZC.

1912 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 -Lynn Sullivan (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 42909EDG - Replace metal porch roof with metal porch roof, replace balcony roof with membrane (not visible from Washington); repair siding, trim, soffit, porch floor and ceiling and fascia in kind (like materials and design) as necessary.

9 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Sanders Pace Architecture (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 5409MKTA - Installation of new signage and new fencing at patio.

1712 Clinch Avenue - Fort Sanders NC-1 - Merit Construction Co., Inc. (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 50409FTSA - Replacing front porch.

1714 Clinch Avenue - Fort Sanders NC-1 - Merit Construction Co., Inc. (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 50409FTSB - Replacing front porch.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

OLD NORTH KNOXVILLE H-1

510 E. Scott Avenue – Tom Brechko (Owner/Applicant) -Certificate No. 43009ONK

Work Description

Replace siding, fascia, soffit and trim boards in kind, as necessary; replace two basement doors, neither original, with appropriate replacement doors (not visible from Scott); install new wood windows (three) in rear wall to replace three windows (central fixed pane); install new wood window in rear gable (window would be casement with appearance of one over one double hung); install utilities underground Install 8'x8' deck on side of house behind lattice screen with deck elevation to be no more than 2'; install wood screen/storm door at front entry using antique grille.

Add 12'x20' accessory structure (workshop) with gable roof with 12/12 pitch, board and batten type siding, one over one wood window on each 12' end and wood door with fixed six pane window on each side of door on 20' front elevation, rear elevation with no fenestration or entry.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 43009ONK. The proposed work is consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

A majority of the work proposed, with the exception of work on the rear façade windows and the construction of outbuildings, is repair work duplicating existing materials. The work on the rear façade consists of replacing unoriginal windows on the first story with three wood windows of equal width using the existing openings; the windows currently found on the wall are not original to the house. The proposed windows will more nearly mimic the size of other original windows throughout the house, and are appropriate for the structure. The gable window proposed for the rear façade was been approved by this Commission in June, 2006 (a now-expired Certificate), and are consistent with pg. 28, L1-6. The outbuilding proposed for the rear of the lot is also consistent with the guidelines, pg. 29 M1-4. The deck and gazebo were also previously approved.

Tom Brechko, 510 E. Scott, stated that he may have to come back in 2 years for another certificate if he does not finish the work.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, representing Old North Knoxville, stated that the neighborhood agrees with the project.

MOTION BY ARNING AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

309 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Daniel Hugh (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 41309ONK

Work Description

Demolish existing garage and construct new garage using stuccoed foundation, wood lap siding, windows facing house and half-view door, 8/12 roof with composition shingles.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 41309ONK. Existing garage is too small to house applicant's automobile. Proposed replacement will be in same general location, with design features consistent with original construction.

Additional Comments

The proposed garage is consistent with the design guidelines requirements for outbuildings: (pg. 29, M 1) - The design of the replacement building mimics the design of the current structure, (pg. 29, M 3) - is located to the rear of the primary building on the lot, and (pg. 29 M 4) is constructed of materials and in a design consistent with the original, using wood lap siding, overhanging eaves and other features consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

Daniel Hugh, 309 E. Oklahoma, stated he wants to tear down the carriage house because it is not big enough for his car and build a garage.

James Pierce, representing Old North Knoxville, stated that the area as a whole has to tell a story, and one of the parts are the carriage houses. They are as significant as the homes are. It is not on a corner or visible from the street. The neighborhood does not support demolishing the structure

and would like to see the application postponed so the neighborhood can discuss it. If he is allowed to demolish it, there are design guidelines he has to use. The doors are not in keeping with a carriage house door.

Grieve stated that he supports a postponement because of the design. Arning is reluctant to vote to tear down a historic building in a historic district and asked about the building next to it. Mr. Hugh stated that the guidelines will not let you have two outside structures of 750 sq. ft. If he could get a variance he would do it. Sean Bolen asked how many carriage houses are left and Bennett responded that she does not know, but there are not many. Faulkner stated that one of his students wrote a thesis on carriage houses in Old North Knoxville, and he is not sure how many are left.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO DENY THE APPLICATION WITHOUT PREJUDICE SO THE NEIGHBORHOOD AND MR. HUGH CAN DISCUSS HIS PLANS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

222 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Martha Olson (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 50609ONK

Work Description

Enclose portion of rear porch (12 by 6.5'), includes a window. Continuing to replace slate roof with asphalt shingle roof. Repairs to siding (in-kind). Also may include railing on rear steps, which will either be a pipe rail or sawn wood 2"x2" balusters set into a top and bottom rail.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50609ONK. Proposed improvements are consistent with the adopted design guidelines. (See pg. 28, L 1-6.)

Martha Olson, 601 Augusta Avenue, stated that she plans to sell the house and wants to add a bath off the main hall by enclosing the back porch and also add a laundry room.

James Pierce stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

GENERAL

1011 Laurel Avenue – Kim Trent/Executive Director Knox Heritage, Inc. (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 42009GEN

Work Description

Reduce footprint of house by removing rear addition, and side addition, both newer and non-contributing. Open front porch, installing square wood porch posts and shed roof, balustrade with sawn or turned wood spindles; restore bay on east elevation with second story porch above, infilling space between two gable ends; remove rear enclosure; install one over one windows, paired on side bay; install gutters; install standing seam metal roof that will accommodate solar collectors and install solar collectors on east side elevation or install asphalt or fiberglass shingle roof covering; repoint masonry as necessary, using Preservation Brief No. 2.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 42009GEN. Proposed modifications will return building to an earlier, more appropriate appearance, closely mimicking the original exterior style of the building.

Kim Trent, 112 S. Gay Street, Executive Director of Knox Heritage, stated that Cardinal Development and Kinsey Probasco are giving them property that was condemned. Knox Heritage will open the house the way it was and will put a metal roof with solar heat and water. The house will be the model project for the city’s solar project. Arning stated that Beth Eason, Lee Ingram, Robert Marlino and Sean Martin were some of the architects who contributed design expertise for this project, and next Tuesday at 2 p.m. the project will be announced. The architects are donating their time.

Montgomery stated that she is excited about the use of solar energy.

Bolen asked about the porch, said it looks very small and suggested it be larger. Ms. Trent stated that the original porch was small. Grieve added that there was a period where the porches were built small, and this ties in with what they are doing with this house. Bolen asked about the solar panels and if they are visible from the street. Ms. Trent stated that the panels go between the seams of the standing seam roof and are made of a film that is the same color as the roof, although it reflects light differently.

Gresham suggested that the members of the Knox Heritage not take part in the discussion and vote. Sharon Boyce also suggested they not vote.

Tom Reynolds stated that he wants to participate in the discussion of 309 Oklahoma. With this house there may be an issue about locating something next door.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED WITH MCADAMS AND SAUNDERS RECUSING.

FOURTH & GILL H-1

906 Luttrell Street – Karen Holt (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 429094&G

Work Description

Construct rear screened porch to replace smaller open porch. New porch will have hipped roof of 3/12 or higher, if possible, shingled roof to match house, white clad guttering and fascia to

match existing, 6"x6" square posts, paired on end and at stair, 2"x2" sawn spindles, and be supported on brick columns to match house with lattice between columns. New porch will not be visible from Luttrell.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 429094&G. Proposed porch is consistent with adopted design guidelines for new additions. See pg. 18, New Additions, and particularly Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4 & 5.

Whetsel spoke as a liaison from the neighborhood, and stated that Ms. Holt is a member of the 4th and Gill Board. Tina Rolen, representing the 4th and Gill neighborhood, sent Bennett an email stating that the neighborhood has no objections to the proposed construction by Ms. Holt.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

330 Gill Avenue – City of Knoxville (Sharon Boyce) - Certificate No. 417094&G

Work Description

Subdivision of existing lot approximately 140 x 150 foot lot into three lots, each 140 feet from Gratz to alley on west property lines and approximately 50 feet wide. The following provisions will be necessary to bring the lots into consistency with other historic parcels in the Fourth & Gill H-1 Historic Overlay and with the properties fronting on the east side of Gratz:

- A. Front yard setback on Gratz Street from 25' to 20', Lots 17R4-1, 17R4-2 and 17R4-3.
- B. Front yard setback on Gill Avenue from 25' to 10', Lot 17R4-1.
- C. South side yard setback from 12' to 5' for a two-story house, Lot 17R4-1.
- D. North and south side yard setbacks from 12' to 5' for a two-story house, Lots 17R4-2 and 17R4-3.
- E. Lot width from 75' to 50', Lots 17R4-1, 17R4-2 and 17R4-3.
- F. Lot area from 7,500 sq. ft. to 7,084 sq. ft. (Lot 17R4-1), 7,060 sq. ft. (Lot 17R4-2), and 7,036 sq. ft. (Lot 17R4-3).
- G. Article V, Section 6, Create a small lot of record for Lots 17R4-1, 17R4-2 and 17R4-3.
- H. Driveway access for Lots 17R4-1, 17R4-2 and 17R4-3 will be from the 10' alley. There will be no driveway access from Gratz Street or Gill Avenue.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 417094&G, which will allow subdivision into lots that will respect the dimensions of the majority of lots in 4th & Gill.

Bennett stated that the city will go to the Board of Zoning Appeals to apply for the variances.

Sharon Boyce, City of Knoxville, stated that they may require porches. The Historic Zoning Commission will have to approve the plans for the houses to be built. There may be an issue for the setbacks since there is no house on the property. Subdividing the lot will make them easier to sell.

Tina Rolen, representing the 4th and Gill neighborhood, sent Bennett an email stating that the neighborhood definitely supports the subdivision of the existing lot at 330 Gill.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

EDGEWOOD-PARK CITY H-1

2111 Jefferson Avenue – Robert Moyers (Applicant) – Nino Lynch (Owner) - Certificate No. 42209EDG

Work Description

Demolish vacant, abandoned house which has lost architectural and structural integrity.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 42209EDG. This property has been altered enough that its architectural integrity is lost and it has no structural integrity. It has become a hazard to nearby residents.

Additional Comments

Any new building will be required to follow the provisions of the design guidelines.

Bennett stated that the house is a hazard to the neighborhood.

Robert Moyers, City of Knoxville, stated that the house was condemned 2005. It cannot be secured and has vagrants and children going in it. Nino Lynch is the owner, but they cannot locate him.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that the neighborhood does not want a vacant lot there. They want to be sure that the city is diligent on what goes back, and that it is appropriate to the neighborhood. They would like to see it saved, but they realize it must be torn down.

Bolen asked since this property is condemned if it could be saved, and Mr. Moyers stated it could not be. Bennett stated that it has no floor, no stud wall or attic joist. In 2006 someone started working on it, but the whole back is open. There is a demolition order from the Better Building Board.

Arning asked how long it would be before the lot is sold. Mr. Moyers stated that the lot could stay vacant for years. The owner will be assessed the cost of demolition.

Grieve stated that Mr. Moyers' office has done everything they can to save it.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED WITH BOLEN OPPOSING AND ARNING ABSTAINING.

Other Business

Arning stated that the Public Building Authority (PBA) came before the commission last month regarding replacing the windows in the Old Court House. He encouraged the commissioners to look at the windows. In his opinion, they do not look that bad or seem to need replacing. They look like they are salvageable.

Gresham stated that if you are standing on the street looking on right side, that office was the Register of Deeds. The windows are steel and there is wire in the glass. He asked if they are going to replicate these windows. The Chancery Court had a vault, and there was a steel window and wire in the glass. These issues need to be addressed. Arning stated that most of the windows have stained glass at the top. Bennett stated these will be replaced in kind. Grieve agrees with Arning that PBA should get the cost difference between refurbishing and replacing the windows.

There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on June 18, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.