

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JULY 16, 2009**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Sharon Boyce
Cynthia Stancil
Jamie Rowe
Wolfgang Shaver
Robert Haws
Jon Haas
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Herb Donaldson
Melissa McAdams (ex.)

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)
Charles Faulkner (ex.)
Carol Montgomery (ex.)

Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

- Approval of Minutes – June 18, 2009, meeting

Arning stated that the June 18 minutes reflect a unanimous vote on the Court House windows, and he voted against them.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE JUNE 18 MINUTES WITH THE CORRECTION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

627 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - John Wampler (Applicant) – Certificate No. 611094&G - Repair trim in kind, as needed, rebuild or repoint chimney, duplicating original chimney and using Preservation Brief No. 2.

935 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Aaron Pennington (Applicant) – Certificate No. 610094&G - Replacement of fascia and soffit in kind as necessary.

1203 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - S & J Design and Construction, Janis Sakalla (Applicant) – Certificate No. 630094&G - Repairing front porch floor, in kind; repair siding, fascia and soffit, in kind, if necessary; install full view color clad storm door.

219 Leonard Place - Old North Knoxville H-1 - David Metler (Applicant) – Certificate No. 62909ONK - Replace soffit and fascia, in kind, with identical materials.

35 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Gustavo Carol – Certificate No. 62209MKT - Hanging sign - metal extended bracket and sign, round in design and not to exceed 6 sq. ft.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Mechanicsville – H-1

213 Deaderick Street – MeadowRidge Investments, Blaine Hopkins (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 62909MEC

Work Description

1) Demolish the enclosed portion of the original wrap around porch on the north elevation and restore the original elevation and wraparound porch. 2) Enclose a portion of the rear porch to gain floor space for bathroom, without altering rear egress, and with all coverings and windows to match remainder of house. 3) Install two windows on stairwell on north elevation, one on the first floor and one at the landing. 4) Install window on front facing porch of north side extension. 5) Decrease the size of one window on the left (south) elevation to accommodate the installation of an interior bath. 6) Rebuild chimney with soft, low Portland-content mortar.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 62909MEC. The proposed changes are consistent with the adopted Mechanicsville Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

Applicant is proposing to undo some changes made to the building over time, and to add space to the rear elevation in order to accommodate needed interior facilities while allowing for a return to the original footprint of the wrap around porch. This work will not only return the occupancy of the house to single family, but recapture a great deal of the original architecture.

Grieve asked Wolfgang Shaver, 10907 Parkside Drive, representing the applicant, if the commission approves the application if they are approving the front door and asked if the master bedroom is a new addition. Mr. Shaver responded that the master bedroom is not the addition and will be restored to the original house. There is going to be another window to be restored facing the porch into the master bedroom, and it will match the other windows. The front door will be half glass and wood. Bennett suggested he call her because there are some neighbors who lived there, and they could tell him what the original door looked like.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE WITH CONDITION THAT THE COMMISSION BE GIVEN A DRAWING OF THE FRONT ELEVATION TO ADDRESS THE FRONT, WINDOW AND COLUMNS SUBMITTED BEFORE A CERTIFICATE CAN BE ISSUED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th & Gill H-1

621 Eleanor Street – John Wampler (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 629094&G

Work Description

Repair chimneys, using low-Portland content mortar and Preservation Brief No. 2; replace roof covering; replace or repair windows as necessary or install storm windows; remove window on rear elevation, second story; remove balcony added on side (c.1970) and install window where door is now located; repair and reinstall fretwork on front porch; replace porch railing to match fretwork (using 1x1 spindles set into top and bottom rail with 1 inch spacing) at original height; repair siding, fascia and soffit as necessary; replace metal rear door with wood, 15 light beveled door.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 629094&G. Proposed work is consistent with the 4th & Gill design guidelines.

Additional Comments

In addition to the repair and re-installation of original materials on the front porch, the applicant proposes to remove an added, inappropriate balcony system on the side elevation of the property, and to alter windows on the rear of the house. The adopted design guidelines provide that changes to the building should be made on the rear of the building, not visible from the street. In this case, the change in the window is required to accommodate an interior bath or kitchen.

Melynda stated that Mr. Wampler called her, and the neighborhood approves the work.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville - H-1

1025 Kenyon – Robert J. Haws (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 61609ONK

Work Description

Replace existing one over one, wood, double hung, deteriorated windows, as needed, with wood windows, one over one, duplicating size of original windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE replacement windows for one over one double hung ONLY, Certificate No. 61609ONK. There are windows in the building at 1025 Kenyon that include six over six and eight over eight windows. Replacement windows should replace exactly.

Additional Comments

The Old North Knoxville design guidelines require that replacement windows be the same size as the originals, with the same pane division, muntin depth, width, profile and of the same materials. Without a complete window inventory, it is not known which of the existing windows were replaced in the past and which are original. If the applicant wishes to replace the severely deteriorated and unrepairable one over one windows, meeting the other qualifications of the

design guidelines (see pg. 15, B2), the design guidelines allow that replacement. Replacing all windows with one over one double hung wood windows that meet the other provisions of the design guidelines should not be done until it is determined which windows are original and which are not.

Bennett thinks the original windows were one over one. There are apartments in it, and as they become vacant, Bennett will meet with the window installer to decide which windows are original, and Mr. Haws will replace them over a period of time.

Robert Haws, 2011 Spence Place stated that he will replace all the windows eventually. The windows have to be specially built, and Southland Distributors is the window company that will replace them. It is a multi-family house.

Bennett received an email that the neighborhood agrees with the proposed work.

Grieve stated that he wants to make sure the diamond windows are replaced in kind.

MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fort Sanders – NC-1

1633 Clinch Avenue – Jon Haas (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 62909FTS

Work Description

1) Replace primary roof, destroyed by fire. Applicant has presented three alternatives for roof replacement, with the final alternative to be selected based on budget and bearing capabilities of existing structure. First alternative: Hip roof with lower cross gables, flat roof over front rooms, gabled roof over bay and a turret at the southwest corner of building, dormers on east side and north and south side of east ell. Preferred roof surface of pitched roof will be slate, with asphalt shingles as second choice. Turret will be copper clad. Second alternative: Will duplicate first alternative as outlined above, except that turret will not be rebuilt and will be flat roofed, and there will be no dormers. Third alternative: Will eliminate gabled roof over bay, substituting shed roof.

NOTE: This Certificate duplicates the language approved for roof replacement only in Certificate No. 52705FTS, approved by the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission on June 16, 2005. That Certificate expired two years after issuance, in 2007.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 62909FTS. This Certificate duplicates a certificate issued June 16, 2005. That Certificate has expired, and was necessary for the applicant to receive a building permit.

Additional Comments

The work required to save this house is extensive, and applicant has made progress in shoring up the foundation and installing the interior supports, from the basement up, that are necessary to support the roof. He intends to continue to work diligently. However, the certificate granting permission to install and complete the roof had expired and must be reissued.

Bennett stated that this application has been before the commission in the past. Jon Haas has been working on the house ever since the last certificate.

Jon Haas, 2215 Highland Avenue, stated that he submitted his drawings to Tom Reynolds last week. He is ready to start building. He is going to use the No. 3 roof option. He is ready to start putting the roof on and hopes to have it on within a year. He is meeting with Kim Trent and Knox Heritage either July 29 or 30 and invited the commission to attend. Bennett will set up another time when the commissioners can go.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bolen asked about the progress on the windows in the courthouse. We approved metal clad replacement windows but have to see a mockup. Bennett metal clad would be acceptable, but we did not pick a contractor. Bennett responded that they may not be an exact duplication.

Arning has gotten many calls and emails from citizens who are upset. He suggested that commissioners look at the windows that are nonrepairable. Bennett stated that the copy of the window survey has been distributed to each commissioner concerning each window. Arning disagrees with it.

Whetsel stated that all the commission is responsible for is determining whether they are appropriate or not. We determined that the proposed windows are appropriate. Grieve added that we have to meet the guidelines that we oversee. We do not select the manufacturer or contractor. We will make sure it replicates the current windows. We want to see a window that replicates when PBA makes their choice. Bennett stated that there are so many different kinds of windows that are not original. Grieve wants to see consistency in the windows. Materials today are much better than in the past, and we should be concerned about the material that will give the right aesthetic look. There are materials today that can replicate what was done 100 years ago.

Arning stated that the windows have a 10-year warranty and the glass has a 20-year warranty. The wood has lasted 100 years. How do we reconcile this after reading the articles about wood windows can be replaced. Bennett answered that it depends on who is doing the maintenance and the size of the windows. Sometimes it just is not possible to continue the maintenance because a majority of the windows are hard to maintain and are very large. She talked to Louis Jackson, the tax credit person with the Tennessee Historical Commission, and he agrees with the replacement. Bennett said she could ask PBA for a cost for repairing the wood windows.

Gresham stated that governments like to replace instead of repairing. If the windows have no maintenance that is one thing. Metal would last a lot longer without maintenance. Whetsel stated

that concerning irate citizens, we are conflicted in this decision, and we have to consider the maintenance. This decision was not made easily. Bennett stated that all those repairs that have been done cause her not to know which windows are original.

Busby announced that the AIA Tennessee Convention will be held in Knoxville on July 29-August 1, and there will be tours to Mechanicsville, UT, etc. There will be a host chapter party July 29 from 7-11 at the Square Room on Market Square that is open to the public. On July 31 a movie about the Birds Nest, the Chinese Olympic stadium, will be shown at the Riviera. Exhibition halls will be open to see products at the Convention Center. The website is AIATN.org. Grieve stated there will be tours to the George Barber homes, Oak Ridge and Alex Haley farm.

Bennett stated that she will bring information on the National Trust Conference in October to the August meeting.

Other Business

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on August 20, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.