

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF FEBRUARY 19, 2009

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Scott Busby (ex.)
Herb Donaldson
Sandra Martin (ex.)

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
John Conley
Roy Payne
Tina Rolen
John & Cynthia Stancil
Jim Odle
Glen Lakin
John Craig
Charles Richmond
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded commissioners to recuse themselves if there is a conflict of interest.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 15 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Bennett distributed questionnaires on the State of Preservation and asked that both city and county HZC members respond so a report could be prepared for both the city and the county.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

930 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1- John Conley – Certificate No. 204094&G -Remove existing satellite dish; remove aluminum siding on sides and rear elevation, repair weatherboard, soffit and eaves as necessary. Repair windows as necessary. Repair beadboard ceilings on first and second front and rear porches. Repair porch floors in kind as necessary. Remove unoriginal plywood enclosure from porte cochere. Repoint and clean masonry as necessary, using Preservation Brief No. 2. Jack up sinking porch columns. Repair or replace Scamozzi capitals on front porch (first and second stories) and porte cochere, in kind, as necessary. Remove fire escape and its concrete base from rear elevation. Repair storm windows as necessary, with eventual replacement with wood storm windows.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Edgewood Park City H-1

1600 Jefferson Avenue - Dennis Ward (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 11309EDG

Work Description

1) Construct 8' x 10' rear addition with 3/12 pitch center gable, poplar siding, and French doors, using continuation of existing concrete block foundation, removing existing door adjacent to addition and replacing with two over two wood window to match remainder of windows on house, and installing shingles on existing shed roof to one side of addition. 2) Construct 8'x10' shed to rear of primary building with 3/12 pitch shingled gabled roof, poplar siding. 3) Construct 8'x10' rear deck, unroofed, at rear of requested addition. 4) Move recessed front door forward, creating a shallower recess at the front entry.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 11309EDG. Proposed changes are consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

1) The proposed rear addition and deck will enhance the already existing addition, creating a more balanced rear façade and introducing necessary interior space, as will the rear deck (work item #3). (See Pg. 29, #12, 13 and 14. 2) The proposed rear shed is consistent with the requirements for outbuildings (pg. 29, #15). 4) Moving the location of the front entry forward will not alter the historic character of the front façade, while enhancing the use of interior space (pg. 21, #1-4).

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that the neighborhood supports everything the applicant is planning to do that is within the guidelines.

MOTION BY MCADAMS AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth and Gill H-1

930 Luttrell Street – John Conley (Applicant), Aurora Loan Services LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 204094&G

Work Description

Level II: Add missing calmes to front elevation windows. Redo front porch steps, installing brick steps (possibly with concrete treads) with splayed brick buttresses (marble slab or concrete caps) to mimic shape of sidewalk apron. Rebuild tops of chimneys with corbelling. Replace shingled balustrade (installed in mid 1990s) with spindles to mimic design and scale of first floor porch spindles with 36" height from recessed porch floor. Reconfigure porte cochere roof to be an extension of front porch roofline. Install columns that duplicate front porch columns on existing brick piers of porte cochere. In front gable, remove current (relatively new) single fixed

pane rectangular window and replace with fanlight with tracery; Add square patterned imbricated shingles on front facing gable. Remove weather boarded enclosures on first and second story rear porches on southeast side, extending first floor porch to rear by ten feet with portion to be under roof and screened in and second story porch to be screened in. Install open deck across remainder of rear elevation. (NOTE: None of the work on the rear porches, or the rear deck addition, will be visible from Luttrell.) Replace existing unoriginal windows on rear and side elevations (some storm windows without windows, some sliding windows) with wood one over one double hung windows. Add wood one over one double hung windows on rear elevation in kitchen (east side, rear, not visible from Luttrell). (NOTE: Any replacement windows will be more vertical than horizontal and will be appropriately sized.) Install sconces to either side of front entry door. Install porch ceiling lights and ceiling fans on front porch and balcony and on rear, screened porches. Install solar shingles on roof on rear elevation (not visible from Luttrell). Relocate gas meters from front elevation. Install antique quarter-sawn oak front first story entry door with full or half-view beveled glass. Reroof building, using concrete roofing tiles or patterned metal shingles. Remove existing porch foundation coverings on front porch and replace with patterned brick lattice-like panels. Install wrought iron fence at front sidewalk, no taller than 36", and install privacy fence in back yard.

Level IV: Demolish rear deteriorated secondary residential building, in poor condition (possibly c. 1930s).

NOTE: Applicant intends to construct a garage at the rear of the lot, and will submit design in future.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 20409EDG. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

John Conley, 3106 Keller Bend Road, stated he is hoping to use solar shingles on a rear elevation.

Tina Rolan, 1130 Luttrell Street, is the new neighborhood representative. They are glad to have them in the neighborhood, and there are no objections to their plans.

Bennett stated that the guidelines say solar panels can be installed if they are on the back and are not visible. Mr. Conley hopes that new siding he saw demonstrated several months ago, which is only available in Europe now, will be available in the United States soon; he intends to use it if possible.

Grieve asked Bennett what the difference is between the description of work and the staff recommendation, and Bennett said there is no difference in the work items. There were so many work items that she chose to itemize rather than summarize them, with the staff recommendation referencing each relevant guideline.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE BOTH LEVELS OF THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bolen thanked the applicant for using solar panels and asked him to use caution on the second floor drainage.

725 Deery Street – Roy Payne (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 205094&G

Work Description

Construct a small building addition to rear, side of house. Materials will include reuse of existing wood siding and trim. The addition will extend a second story rear cross gable roof, filling in a recessed portion of the rear elevation; submitted elevations do not show window or door openings.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 205094&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted recommendations, New Additions, pg. 18, #1.

Roy Payne, 725 Deery Street. There will be windows on the back and one in the laundry room and above it will be an octagonal window. He may put a solar panel on the east elevation. He asked Bennett if she would come and look to see if she thinks the panel would show from the street. He is also thinking about sky lights, and Bennett stated they can be added if they do not show from street. Bennett stated she can issue the certificate, and he can get the building permit today. Ann could amend the certificate to add windows, solar panels and sky lights if they do not show.

Ms. Rolen stated the neighborhood had no objections.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH DOOR AND WINDOWS TO BE ADDED AND WITH APPLICANT TO CONSULT WITH STAFF ABOUT THE ADDITION OF SOLAR PANELS AND SKY LIGHTS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

37 Market Square – Jim Odle, Odle & Young Architects (Applicant), Glenn Laiken (Owner) – Certificate No. 20509MKT

Work Description

1) Selective demolition and discovery; 2) Conceptual approval of second story addition.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Item 1; DENY Item 2 of Certificate No. 20509MKT.

Additional Comments

1) The selective demolition called for in Item 1 will allow the applicant to discover the original, or an appropriate, treatment for the front and north elevations, both of which have been altered over time. 2) Although the rooftop addition requested in this certificate is recessed

approximately 40 feet from the front façade, the Market Square Design Guidelines call for the height of new additions to be consistent with neighboring buildings. In this case, the neighboring building is two stories in height. (pg. 22, #7). In addition, although rooftop additions are allowed by the Secretary of Interior's Standards, on which these design guidelines are based, they are called for on four story or taller buildings.

Bennett stated that this certificate came before the commission 18 months ago because the building was collapsing and had to be rebuilt. The second story addition is set back 40', but the guidelines only allow additions on 4-story buildings. Scott Busby was unable to be at the meeting but sent an email to Bennett with these remarks: 1. I agree with the denial of the rooftop addition. This does not meet the guidelines. 2. I agree with the approval for exploratory demolition. I also believe that if there ever was an exception to allow complete demolition and rebuilding, this would qualify. 3. Per the design guidelines, the entry door off of Market Square needs to be recessed. 4. Also, they will most likely need an additional stair at the front for egress from the second floor mezzanine, and it may have to be incorporated into the front entry.

Bennett stated that they might discover there was a corner door, but they will not know until they do selective demolition.

Jim Odle, Odle and Young, and Glen Laiken 37 Market. Mr. Odle emailed Bennett when realized the third story is controversial and wants more time for consideration. Bennett stated that it is a state law that the commission has to hear it today and can deny it without prejudice. Mr. Odle stated that the building is old, and they need to find out what is there and will do an interior gut of the building. There are also structural issues. Mr. Laiken stated that he is the owner and moved here from Los Angeles because he liked Knoxville so well.

Reynolds stated that permits for demolition can be a problem, and it is important to get a structural engineer. There will not be any demolition until the engineer checks it and asked that he be very cautious.

John Craig, 29 Market Square, stated that the Market Square Association has not had a chance to review the certificate, but they are glad it is being repaired. We want to incorporate the streetscape on that side because it is the entrance to Market Square.

Grieve stated that Mr. Odle talked to him this week, and he has confidence in him. Grieve asked if he has to tear the building down, what size building can go back. Bennett stated that the guidelines do not say. Grieve stated that we should consider whether a third story should go on it since it is prominent from the TVA Towers. Grieve asked how many buildings on the square have asked for an additional story, and Bennett stated only one has been approved, and it has not been built yet. There are variations of heights on the buildings there. Mr. Odle stated that they will look at the viability of what is there and will come back with a more thorough plan for what they want to do. Mr. Laiken stated that they recognize this is the first visual for Market Square when entering on the north end and thanked the Commission for their consideration and time.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE PORTION OF THE CERTIFICATE FOR SELECTION DEMOLITION AND DENY WITHOUT

PREJUDICE THE THIRD STORY ADDITION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

Evaluation, 424-428 E. Scott, Old North Knoxville H-1.

Charles Richmond, 428 E. Scott Avenue, purchased the property in 1997, took off the roof and found that 424 and 428 E. Scott had a house and commercial building joined together. He wants to amend the staff report to make two contributing structures and make them into separate lots. He distributed before and after photos. They were surprised to find a house within the mansard roof and replaced the dormer and porch. He wants these included in the historic district.

Grieve and Whetsel both stated they are pleased with his plans. Arning stated he is pleased with his work and commends him for what he is doing.

MOTION BY ARNING AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH MCADAMS RECUSING.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on March 19, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.