

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF DECEMBER 17, 2009**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Duane Grieve
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
John Stancil
Jamie Rowe
Todd Ellis
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Scott Busby (ex.)

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 19 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

609 Caswell Avenue - 4th & Gill H-1 - Melissa Caldwell Weddig – Certificate No. 1118094&G - Repair as needed in kind for porch fascia, soffit, gutter and roof.

509 E. Scott Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Pete Creel – Certificate No.11709ONK - Repair siding and trim in kind as necessary; repair or replace damaged fascia in kind as necessary; install gutters, either half-round or standard, color clad to match trim.

15 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Julie Morris, WBIR TV – Certificate No.111209MKT - Install 24"x30" sign in neon affixed to window from interior of building, and install neon sign in window above entry doors. The signs will not occupy more than 30% of the total window space when combined with all signage on the storefront.

19 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Fritz Thumler (Superior Signs) – Certificate No.120109MKT - Install hanging sign, painted metal, non-illuminated, 2'x3" double sided, on metal bracket.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

Dr. Charles Faulkner stated that about one year ago a developer was planning to tear a house down at the corner of 17th & Clinch. The house has been torn down, and it looks like there is a wall that could be a wall of Ft. Sanders from the Battle of Ft. Sanders.

Whetsel stated that this is Grieve's last meeting as a commissioner, and he is being sworn in as a City Councilman this week.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Tazewell Pike NC-1

4320 Tazewell Pike – Todd Ellis – Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 112409TAZ

Work Description

Construct new additions to existing Ranch house which will result in a two story building with a three-quarter shed-roofed front porch, a side facing gabled garage, a raised central portion with a end gabled roof and front facing gablet, and a shed roofed rear porch. Materials used on the addition are to duplicate the original materials, including concrete roof tiles on front elevation.

Note: The applicant received approval for an addition to the property under Certificate No. 60608TAZ; that addition involved fairly extensive modifications including gabled extensions on the front elevation, gabled dormers to the south, rear modifications and extending the chimney to accommodate a two story building.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 112409TAZ. Proposed modifications are consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

These proposed additions to the primary structure, like the first, will insert two roof features recommended in the design guidelines - offsetting gables and dormer windows (pg. 7, Design Guidelines). These will be accomplished on the front elevation by the addition of a raised second floor central portion. The currently uncovered front porch will also be emphasized with a shed roof covering. The additions created to the roofline and overall appearance are consistent with the complex roof shapes called for in the Tazewell Pike Design Guidelines.

The adopted design guidelines do state that new additions should be made to the sides or rear of the existing buildings, and if made to the front should not comprise more than one-quarter of the front elevation. The first approved additions comprised approximately fifty percent of the front elevation. In this version, the more extensive modifications are made to the rear, while the changes to the front section are minimized and preserve more of the original front facade. The additions enhance the distinctiveness of the existing house, adding interest and appropriate roof forms, while recognizing the distinctive wall cladding.

Mr. Ellis applied to the commission a year ago to make changes to the house and a secondary building. The secondary building is finished, but they have redesigned the house plans. It meets the guidelines.

Todd Ellis, 4320 Tazewell Pike, stated that he decided to change the design to make the house fit better in the neighborhood. There will be less change on the front of the house.

Bolen stated that this design fits in better with the neighborhood and thanked Mr. Ellis for changing it.

Jamie Rowe, 4215 Tazewell Pike, stated that the neighborhood is pleased.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

300 Main Street – Jayne Burritt, Public Building Authority – Applicant, Knox County Government - Owner – Certificate No. 120109GEN

Work Description

Applicant is requesting approval to replace all wood windows in building with metal clad windows that replicate in dimensions, size and design the deteriorated wood windows now found on the building.

Replace severely deteriorated windows of various dates with exact size and profile duplicate of existing historic windows that is a painted surface, aluminum clad window. Replacement window will duplicate the oldest generation of windows in building, replacing sashes and frame, retaining brick surround and marble trim on exterior. Interior trim and/or finish surrounding windows will not be altered and interior of sash will be stained or finished wood. Transoms will be replaced with stained glass color matched to original stained glass transoms, and will also substitute for original stained glass transoms that have been altered with new clear glass; replacement transoms will have exterior metal clad grids, interior wood grids, and internal grids to provide a visual duplication of existing windows; heavy pulls on exterior of windows will be reused or replicated; lugs or dog ears on bottom of top sashes will be replicated. New windows will incorporate energy saving features and will be in better condition and easily maintained.

Staff Recommendation

DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE pending inspection of final design. The Public Building Authority anticipates installing one of the windows so it can be examined by the Historic Zoning Commission and staff. The projected date for installation is 12/15.

Without a model window to examine, I cannot write a recommendation.

Bennett stated that the state enabling legislation says if the Commission does not act, the application is approved automatically. She could not write a staff review and recommends the Commission deny the application without prejudice so PBA can come back next month.

Gresham stated that some of the windows are the existing wooden and some are steel sash. Bennett has asked that the metal windows remain.

Martin asked if we should go look at the windows today. Bennett told her that the Commission is welcome to look at the present windows, but the new replica will be installed about 10 days before the next meeting. Martin stated that the Commission should have competitive quotes from two companies for both repair of existing windows and pricing of all wood replacement windows. The existing windows might be able to be repaired.

Arning suggested that the Commissioners look at the windows before the next meeting. He suggested they be repaired instead of replaced. The Public Building Authority is supposed to check on the cost of repairing instead of replacing. He is receiving calls from preservationists who are against replacing the windows. It will cost \$2,500 to replace each window. Gresham responded that we do not approve the cost of windows. County government has to appropriate the funds for maintenance of the Knox County Court House, including the windows. Bennett mentioned that she has been told the Commission should get quotes on storm windows, also. Bolin stated that the commission has already approved the windows with aluminum cladding.

Bennett pointed out that the concept of aluminum windows with an appropriate design was approved.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on January 21, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.