

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF APRIL 16, 2009

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen
Charles Faulkner

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
John Saggio
Stacy Cox
Kim Trent
Holly Cook
Jamie Rowe
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

- Approval of Minutes – March 19, 2009, meeting

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE MARCH 19 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Arning announced that next Sunday the 4th & Gill neighborhood will host their annual home tour. There will be nine houses on the tour, two of which are new infill houses. He encouraged commissioners to attend.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

601 Caswell Avenue - Fourth & Gill H-1, Scott Haynes (Applicant) Dept. of Community Development, Certificate No. 402094&G - Reroof, replacing asphalt shingles in kind; repair gutters

445 S. Gay Street - General, David Smith, Johnson & Galyon (Applicant), Certificate No. 33009GEN - Complete brick repair as required, using Preservation Brief #2, caulk marble cladding and trim as necessary.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

814 Scenic Drive – JLS Construction, John Saggio (Applicant), Steve and Ann Bailey (Owners) – Certificate No. 33009SCN

Work Description

Fountain (on a pedestal approximately 3-4 feet above ground), wooden gazebo with brick columns and cobblestone entry, grass lawn and landscaping on newly vacant lot at 814 Scenic; install new driveway off Scenic.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 33009SCN. The proposed landscaping plan is sensitive to the existing historic district and complements the design of 806 Scenic, an architecturally significant building even though it is not included in the NC-1 overlay.

Bennett got an email from Ms. Nancy Bills stating that the neighborhood is pleased with the plan.

Grieve stated that he reviewed the plans with Mr. Bailey, who assured him that if they ever sell the property, they will make sure it goes on the historic overlay.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY ARNING TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1700 Jefferson Avenue – Cynthia Armbrister (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 318090EDG

Work Description

Reroof, using comparable shingles; replace wood siding, soffit, eaves and other trim with materials of identical type and design, as necessary; repair or replace asphalt shingles in front gable with wood or asphalt/fiberglass shingles; repair wood front porch floor or replace with materials of identical type and design as necessary; repair and glass in existing small screened rear porch, not visible from Jefferson; install color clad storm windows and repair existing wood sash windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 31809EDG. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Although this certificate was issued as a Level I Certificate, Bennett wanted the HZC to be aware that there will be a change in a rear porch, which is not screened in. There will be no change in the footprint or the railing, but the applicant will be substituting glass in the openings where there is now window screen wire. The rear porch is not visible from Jefferson. Bennett stated that no vote was needed because this application is a Level 1.

300 Main Street – Jayne Burnett, Public Building Authority (Applicant), Knox County Government (Owner) – Certificate No. 40209GEN

Work Description

Applicant is requesting approval of the concept of replacing all windows with metal clad windows that replicate in dimension, size and design the deteriorated wood windows now found on the building.

Replace severely deteriorated windows of various dates with exact size and profile duplicate of existing historic windows that is a painted surface, aluminum clad window. Replacement window will duplicate the oldest generation of windows in building, replacing sashes and frame, retaining brick surround and marble trim on exterior. Interior trim and/or finish surrounding windows will not be altered and interior of sash will be stained or finished wood. Transoms will be replaced with stained glass color matched to original stained glass transoms, and will also substitute for original stained glass transoms that have been altered with new clear glass; replacement transoms will have exterior metal clad grids, interior wood grids, and internal grids to provide a visual duplication of existing windows; heavy pulls on exterior of windows will be reused or replicated; lugs or dog ears on bottom of top sashes will be replicated as an integrated feature. New windows will incorporate energy saving features and will be in better condition and easily maintained.

Repair porch floor of tile and marble, repairing marble and replacing tile and terra cotta with exact replicas.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Concept of metal clad replacement windows.

Additional Comments

The applicant has taken great care to duplicate the existing wood windows, including the stained glass small-paned transoms. The existing windows are very deteriorated, as revealed by a window survey completed by the applicant's consultant, and must be replaced.

Although this project is not subject to review under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act, and is not a tax credit project, staff did discuss the project with Tennessee Historical Commission staff. There is no doubt that the windows are so deteriorated they must be replaced. A complete window inventory was submitted with the application; Commissioners received a copy in their packets. Given that the building sits so far back from Main Street, and that the windows are most noticeable on upper stories, if the applicant meets three conditions, metal replacement windows should be

acceptable. Those conditions are: 1) that the glass used in the windows not be to reflective, so that it more nearly resembles the old glass found in the windows now; 2) that the windows not be tinted at all, or if tinted, that tint must be very light; and 3) that the profiles of the window sashes and surrounds duplicate exactly the historic window profiles now found in the building.

Bennett recommends approval if the windows are match the profiles of the originals, even if they are metal clad (instead of wood) for longevity and ease of maintenance. She asked that the windows not be tinted or reflected and the profiles of windows duplicate the profiles exactly. She reported she had talked to Louis Jackson with the Tennessee Historical Commission in Nashville, and he suggested that the application be approved. Montgomery asked what would happen to the old glass. Bennett does not know but there would be people who would be interested in having them.

Arning stated that we do not allow metal clad and wanted to know why we are allowing it. Bennett stated that these are custom windows. He asked what the difference is in the cost of wood and metal clad windows. Stacy Cox, Studio Four Design, 414 Clinch Avenue, stated that the metal clad windows are cheaper by \$300,000 than wood. The cost of each window is \$6,000; there is an estimate of \$1.2 million for the entire project. The current windows are single pane and should be insulated. Arning stated that the commission has received articles on how wood windows are better than metal clad.

Grieve has mixed feelings about the project, but from the interior it is a wood window. He is working on a historic building in Maryville, and they are rebuilding the old wood windows to reuse. Mr. Cox stated that to rebuild a window, it is very hard to use the old and new glass together. There are not that many windows now that have the wavy glass except the transoms. Any glass that can be saved will be. Arning would like to see the glass donated to Knox Heritage. He thinks there should be a way to use the old windows.

Gresham stated that these windows are exactly like the original and in the neighborhoods they come to us asking to use windows that are just close and not exact. Montgomery added that you would not want wavy glass in both pieces of glass, and painted wood would always look different from metal clad. Arning asked if they considered storm windows, and Mr. Cox said they felt that would compromise the historic character of the windows, either on the exterior or on the interior with interior storms, where the windows are exposed and not obscured with window treatments.

Bolen asked if the company did a cost estimate on using the old windows. Mr. Cox responded that they did not.

Grieve stated that the guidelines governing this project are the Secretary of the Interior guidelines. He also feels the commission should consider new products depending on how they will be used and what context governs their use. If the objective of the Commission is to preserve and restore, there are new products that will do this. The interest is in preserving the building and having windows that look like the original.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE CONCEPT OF WOOD METAL CLAD WINDOWS. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH ARNING AND BOLEN OPPOSED.

Whetsel turned the meeting over to Kenneth Gresham for Knox County.

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

528 W. Emory Road – Kenna Stephens (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 32409GEN

Work Description

Install wood handicapped ramp from rear door traveling to left to access parking lot.

Staff Recommendation

Certificate No. 32409GEN to install a handicapped ramp to the rear of the building was issued on 3-24-2009.

Montgomery stated that she would like to have seen a picture of the ramp, but there was not one included in the packet. Cotham stated that this is not a permanent structure.

No vote was needed, and the meeting was turned back over to Whetsel.

Other Business

National Register nomination review: Chilhowee Park & Sterchi Mansion

Bennett described the Sterchi Mansion that was built in 1910. Comments will be forwarded to the National Park Service.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE SENDING STERCHI MANSION NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION TO THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Holly Cook, 1300 N. Broadway, was recognized as the person who wrote the description of the Chilhowee Park Historic District for the National Register nomination.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE SENDING THE CHILHOWEE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION TO THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett stated there are additions to the Mayor's Report – Annual Report on Preservation for 2008 since the last publication. After it is approved, it will go to Mayor Haslam to present the report to City Council for their approval.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE MAYOR'S ANNUAL REPORT ON PRESERVATION FOR 2008. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett will be updating a report for the county. She described what will be included.

Grieve stated that he is involved in Scenic Knoxville, and they have preserved the ban on any new digital billboards in city, and there will be no more electronic message boards.

McAdams thanked Holly Cook and Knox Heritage for their work. Arming also thanked McAdams and Grieve.

Montgomery announced that Earthfest will be held at Pellissippi this weekend.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on May 21, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.