

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 18, 2008**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Herb Donaldson
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham
Charles Faulkner
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
David Kerns
Elizabeth Eason
Mahastie Vafaie
John Stancil
Cynthia Stancil
James Pierce
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West
Pam Dishongh

Members Absent:

Melynda Whetsel (ex.)

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. None were noted.

- Approval of Minutes – August 21 , 2008, meeting

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

Bennett discussed the Level 1 certificates.

309 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1, Nancy McHugh - Certificate No. 81508ONK - Install simple iron railing on front porch and front steps.

1109 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill H-1, Kent Kendrick – Certificate No. 821084&G - Remove artificial siding; make repairs in kind to wood siding, soffit, fascia and trim.

1401 Hannah Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1, Cherry Lindsey – Certificate No. 81108MEC - Repair/replace existing wood windows with new wood windows, same size and pane configuration.

2112 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood/Park City H-1, David Canada – Certificate No. 81208EDG - Replace roof; repair windows; repair brick piers on front porch using low content Portland mortar; repair siding and trim as necessary; repair porch columns, repair porch floors and ceilings, front and back, as necessary; repair or replace garage door on rear building facing alley.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2100 Jefferson Avenue – John Wampler (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 90408EDG

Work Description

Replace unoriginal 6 panel front entry door with wood half view door appropriate to style of house.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 90408EDG. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines and will return an entry door of appropriate appearance to the front entry.

John Stancil, 2003 Jefferson Avenue, stated that the neighborhood is in favor of the project. He asked if the door is the only work that will be done, and Bennett stated that the applicant already has a certificate to do siding repair and reroofing.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth & Gill H-1

1120 Luttrell Avenue - David Kerns (applicant), Craig Eutz (Owner) – Certificate No. 904084&G

Work Description

Remove asbestos shingles (finish wall covering and degree of replacement or repair to be included in later application); rebuild rear wall of formerly enclosed rear porch, retaining brick piers and using concrete block infill (rear wall is not visible from Luttrell); remove secondary entrance (seven panel ladder back wood door) from front porch.

NOTE: Applicant wishes to repair and extend front porch and propose appropriate treatment for roof extension of front bay window, as well as determine appropriate siding material and degree of replacement repair; applicant understands that further Certificate application will be necessary when asbestos shingles have been removed and original design can be determined.)

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 940084&G. Removal of asbestos singles meets design guidelines. Rebuilding of foundation wall of enclosed rear porch will not be visible from Luttrell. Secondary entrance is on side wall, not apparent from street.

Additional Comments

Applicant is working with owner to design front porch and bay window roof modifications that will be appropriate to design of house. Those designs will be the subject of a second Certificate application, after asbestos shingles are removed and the shadows can be examined to help determine original design.

David Kerns, 410 Locust Hill, stated that he will take the siding off the house and is planning to make the porch bigger. He will bring the drawings next month. Bennett talked to Whetsel and she will talk to the owner. Whetsel is not worried about his enlarging the porch since it is on the side, but she does not want to see it built any closer to the street. Arning asked what he will do with the asbestos shingles. Mr. Kerns stated that he will do whatever the law says. Arning knows someone who is looking for asbestos shingles.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH BOLEN RECUSING.

Market Square H-1

10-12 Market Square – Elizabeth Eason (Andrew Goodwin) (Applicants), Mahastie Vafaie #12 (Owner) & City of Knoxville #10 (Owner) – Certificate No. 90408MKT

Work Description

#12 - Insert an additional opening on the side wall, spaced to blend with the existing windows, with a single hollow core metal door and transom to replicate front door; #10 - install a raised platform and 3 to 4-step entry stair at door, stopping short of existing walkway and with landscaping for separation from existing walkway, with a permanent metal rail surrounding pervious pavement seating area; metal railing to match design of railing in front of #12. (Seating would also be separated from walkway and public area, but would occupy a portion of it.)

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE portion of Certificate No. 90408MKT with regard to 12 Market Square. DENY portion of Certificate No. 90408MKT that modifies existing public park.

Additional Comments

The building wall proposed for the exit is not an original wall. It was reconstructed with openings onto the public space to the south. The addition of an exit door will have no impact on the remaining original architecture, and will provide a needed emergency exit.

The public space that forms the park at #10 Market Square is owned by the City of Knoxville, and was developed to be a pedestrian space and link between Gay Street and Market Square. Inserting seating into the space diminishes that public function, which should remain the primary use of the publicly-owned space. Inserting seating also alters the design of the open space, and reduces its ability to provide passive recreational space. Sharon Boyce, City Law Department, stated that this is city property and issues need to be worked out before it comes before the board. Bennett stated that there are two properties involved, the emergency door on #12 Market and the park space on #10 Market. She suggested that the commission may want to act on the

emergency door. Elizabeth Eason, 130 W. Jackson, stated she is fine with keeping both applications together. Bennett stated that the commission cannot postpone something by law but would have to deny without prejudice so applicant can come back in the future.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE EMERGENCY DOOR AT #12 MARKET AND DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE THE SEATING APPLICATION AT #10 MARKET. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Grieve suggested to the commission that they take the drawing, go to the park and look at the plans from the Millers Building and from the arch entrance. Also, they should look at the amount of space the tables will take up. We knew if we put an entrance on one side, that a request would probably come for the other side. Now #4 Market may ask for seating. He has talked to Elizabeth Eason and asked if anyone can take their lunch and use the tables. Eason stated that when you look at the park and the drawings, the seating is behind the edge of the sidewalk. There is still greenery at the path. Grieve asked that they review their railings to make them compatible with the railings on the other side.

Tom Reynolds stated that he would like to see the exit door on the side. Fire codes will not let them put an exit through the kitchen in the back.

Other

2007 Preservation Report – City of Knoxville

Arning stated that Bennett reports to the City Mayor what has taken place regarding historic properties over the last year. Bennett completed an update of the preservation plan. She is working with several neighborhood groups who are considering overlays. The Sherrod Road area applied yesterday and will be heard in October.

Bennett does Section 106 reviews, housing rehab and cell towers. She is meeting with neighborhoods to expand or revise their guidelines. She has met with Island Home and Adair Gardens. Old North Knoxville also may expand. North Hills will not seek a local designation, but was recently placed on the National Register. The Mechanicsville guidelines need revising.

Bolen asked when guidelines are amended if they are usually made more lenient or strict. Bennett stated that the process for amending is the same process as creating the guidelines with 80 percent approval. The guidelines could be less restrictive.

Faulkner asked if there will be a county report, and Bennett replied that we need to do a county update of the preservation plan.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STATUS OF PRESERVATION AND COMMEND BENNETT FOR HER WORK. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY FAULKNER FOR STAFF TO PREPARE AN UPDATE TO THE COUNTY PLAN. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Arning stated there was an article in the News Sentinel about Admiral Farragut. In 10 days the bulldozers will level the area, and historic artifacts will be lost. A group is trying to raise funds for a study before this happens. Gresham asked if the area had been designated historic. Arning answered that it has not, and we have no control over it. There is a monument there, but is on private property. Faulkner asked if the archeology is done, then what happens. Arning stated that we would try to talk to the owner and to save that spot. There is a picture of the cabin and we know what it looked like. We would like to build a replica if possible.

Pam Dishongh stated she had researched the Farragut birthplace. McFee owned the property in 1900s. He stated that, without knowing the log cabin was Farragut's birthplace, he had torn it down. There was disagreement about whether Farragut was born there or at Campbell Station. Bennett stated that the location of the original cabin was not known. The marker supposedly marks the location of the original home, but is not near a water source or the ferry site. Dishongh will find the article. Arning stated that \$9,500 was needed to pursue archeological study of the site.

Grieve asked if a demolition permit has been issued for the house across Kingston Pike from the Teen Board. Bennett stated it had been. The house is an English Cottage Revival design with stone wall covering and a circular driveway. Bennett stated that materials in the house are being salvaged to construct another house in Sequoyah Hills, and that the house is listed as contributing in the Kingston Pike National Register Historic District. She noted that she had met with Kingston Pike neighbors last summer to discuss a local designation. Grieve noted that despite the struggle to secure NC-1 designation for Scenic Drive, he felt the designation was seen as positive by owners in the district.

Grieve stated that he and Randall DeFord are working on a design for 1644 Clinch Avenue. He anticipates that will be before the Commission at their October 16 meeting.

Grieve noted he is the President of Scenic Knoxville, and invited everyone to join them for their first meeting on October 30 at the History Center at 5:30 p.m.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on October 16, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.