

**MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 20, 2008**

**City HZC Present**

Nic Arning  
Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Herb Donaldson  
Duane Grieve  
Melissa McAdams  
Sandra Martin  
Melynda Whetsel

**Members Absent:**

Finbarr Saunders

**County HZC Present**

Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Charles Faulkner  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Members Absent:**

**Others Present:**

Sharon Boyce  
David Kerns  
Chris Eutz  
Kevin Nelson  
Glen Lowery  
Robin Fiore  
John Craig  
John Sanders  
Andie Ray  
Mark Heinz  
Frank Sparkman  
Floyd Smith  
John Stancil  
Cynthia Stancil  
James Pierce  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West  
Pam Dishongh

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. None were noted.

McAdams stated that the minutes should be changed in the paragraph concerning the Gobblers Knob/Sherrod Road designation. The street name did not change, but the name of the community for the designation should change to Gobblers Knob/Sherrod Road.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 16 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

**908 Eleanor Street** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Jack & Joan Echman (Owner/Applicants) – Certificate No. 1009084&G. Remove wood siding, as necessary to install insulation, replacing wood siding in kind without change to appearance of house.

**601 W. Summit Hill Drive** – General - Tony/Neon Service Co. (Applicant) – Certificate No. 101408GEN - Install monument sign in front yard just above stone wall, facing Summit Hill. Sign to be painted metal mounted on painted wood 4x4 posts with painted background and lettering for Lincoln Memorial University. Sign not illuminated and approximately 43" tall (total height 6') and sign portion length of 15'6". Painted or vinyl letters applied flat on surface.

**501 W. Main Street** – General - Tim Pope/Advanced Signs (Applicant) – Certificate No. 102808GEN - 1) Install new sign face (background and lettering) on existing signs to reflect new tenant - Capital Mark Bank; 2) install new sign face on back of existing monument signs to match new coloring and text so signs become two-sided; 3) change background and lettering on existing ATM machines so they identify Capital Mark Bank.

**2100 Washington Avenue** - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Church of our Lord Jesus Christ of the Apostolic Faith, Inc. (Applicant) – Certificate No. 101008EDG - Reroof, using dimensional shingles and replacing roof decking as necessary; replace fascia and soffit in kind if necessary; replace gutters and downspouts in kind if necessary; repoint brick, using low-Portland content mortar.

**1416 Fremont** - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Sandra Carpenter (Applicant) – Certificate No. 102108ONK - Replace existing roof with metal roof; install color clad gutters and downspouts.

**124 E. Scott Avenue** - Old North Knoxville H-1 - David and Beth Booker (Applicant) – Certificate No. 102208ONKA - Install color clad storm windows; reroof, replacing asphalt shingles with fiberglass or asphalt shingles; install new gutters, if necessary; replace soffit and fascia trim, in kind, if necessary.

**1424 Armstrong Avenue** - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Juliet McVay (Applicant) – Certificate No. 102208ONKB - Install new entry door on east side of front façade, replacing inappropriate, deteriorated modern door with solid door appropriate to style of building.

**1110 Harvey** - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Pam Gorman (Applicant) – Certificate No. 1100408ONK - Repair wood weatherboard, fascia and soffit in kind; install gutters and downspouts.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **Fourth and Gill H-1**

**1120 Luttrell Avenue** – David Kerns (Applicant), Craig Eutz (Owner) – Certificate No. 1030084&G

#### **Work Description**

Increase size of front porch with hexagonal side addition 5 feet deep from edge of existing porch. Porch addition to travel between 5 and 6 feet down side of building. Porch roof to be supported by square wood columns to match existing, with sawn wood brackets, balustrade of edge butted 1x4 or 1x6 boards with secondary sawn pattern, wood tongue and groove porch floor, bead board ceiling, applied trim feature above the bay window; increase overhang above porch to match depth of overhang existing above bay window. Brick foundation to match existing brick foundation. Porch ceiling to be either shingles or metal standing seam.

#### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 1003084&G. Proposed addition to front porch will enhance, rather than conflict with the building's architectural design, by making the porch large enough to provide exterior seating. The original porch design is unknown.

### **Additional Comments**

Extending the beam above the bay will improve the appearance of the front façade, while providing some additional protection from the rain. Replacement columns will improve the porch's appearance, as will the addition of brackets and the embellishment proposed to be located over the bay window.

David Kerns is the contractor. Bolin complimented his work and is a creative way to redo the porch. Don't connect bay and porch roof. Busby thinks there could be a drainage problem if there were separated. Grieve is concerned about the Gingerbread, railings and brackets. Shutters should be working shutters on a historic house. Kerns there is no room for real shutters.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND THAT BENNETT WILL WORK CLOSELY WITH THE APPLICANT ON THE DETAILS. COMMISSION PREFERS THAT SHUTTERS NOT BE INSTALLED. ONCE THE ELEMENTS ARE DEMOLISHED, THEY WILL CHECK TO SEE WHETHER THE BAY WINDOW SHOULD BE EXTENDED AND NOT CONNECTED TO THE PORCH. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*813 Deery Street* – Kevin Nelson (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 1021084&G

### **Work Description**

Repair fascia, soffit, siding as necessary, in kind; remove existing porch railing of sawn wood 2x2 spindles on 6" center set into top and bottom rails; replace porch rail with small dimension turned wood spindles set into top and bottom rails on 3" centers.

### **Staff Recommendation**

DENY Certificate No. 1021084&G. The railing installed on the house is inappropriate because of the height required by contemporary building codes.

### **Additional Comments**

813 Deery is thought to be a George F. Barber design. However, the design has not been located in Barber's catalogues, so the design of the original railing has not been found. At the time of designation, the porch railing was a short, sawn wood railing with square balusters; that design was not appropriate to the house. The applicant, realizing the inappropriateness of that design, replaced it with a railing of turned balusters, set into the top and bottom rails, and closely spaced.

Current building codes require that a railing be 36" high if a railing is required. The rail was installed at that height, and at that height, looks inappropriate. The porch floor appears to be only 16-20" above the ground, and therefore does not require a railing. If the applicant wishes to install a railing to improve the appearance of the house, that new railing also does not need to be 36" high because the height of the porch floor does not require one. Staff recommendation is that one of two courses be followed: 1) remove the railing altogether; or 2) design a new railing

at the appropriate height. If the applicant chooses the second alternative, the railing should be shortened approximately 10-12".

Bennett stated that Mr. Nelson did not get permission to install the railings. Bolen asked if the commission would have approved the 36" railing, and Whetsel stated that it should be 24" high or there should not be any railings at all.

**MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO DENY THE CERTIFICATE WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE APPLICANT CAN COME BACK NEXT MONTH AFTER WORKING WITH BENNETT ON THE DESIGN. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Old North Knoxville H-1**

*110 E. Scott Avenue* – Glen Lowery (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 102708ONK

**Work Description**

Constructing a walk-in closet on the existing patio with in-kind materials, under shed roof that extends the already existing shed roof. Addition is on the rear elevation of the house and will not be visible from Scott Avenue.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 102708ONK. The room the applicant proposes to add to the house is at the rear of the building, not visible from Scott. The design guidelines provide that additions are to be at the rear of the historic building.

**Additional Comments**

See adopted design guidelines, pg. 28, L 1, 3, 4 and 6.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation. He asked if the additions could be taken off if the house was going to be restored to historic. Bennett yes it could be reversed.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1230 Armstrong Avenue* – Robin Fiore (Applicant), Catherine Sell (Owner) – Certificate No. 110708ONK

**Work Description**

Construct frame garage in side yard, halfway back from front line of house, with garage door opening to Armstrong.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 110708ONK WITH MODIFICATIONS. Applicant wants to place garage half way back of the front façade of the building. Design guidelines state "Garages shall be located to the rear of the primary building on the lot."(M3, pg. 29)

**Additional Comments**

The adopted design guidelines, M3 (pg. 29) provide that "Garages shall be located to the rear of the primary building on the lot."

Robin Fiore, 1230 Armstrong, stated that the garage will be 75’ back from the street, 5’ from the side, 11 ½ feet wide and 25’ deep and will stop at the seating area.

Grieve stated that the commission needs a site plan to see the exact site plan location of driveway and the future garage.

Pierce stated that the guidelines say a building should be at the rear. The placement is far enough back and the neighborhood agrees with the plan.

Grieve asked Mr. Fiore if he would like to draw a site plan while is here today.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION BECAUSE THE SITE PLAN HAS NOW BEEN INCLUDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Market Square H-1**

**9 Market Square** – Michael Aktalay, Sanders Pace Architecture, LLC (Applicant), Emory Place Partners, LLC, John Craig (Owner) – Certificate No. 110608MKT

**Work Description**

Replace existing aluminum storefront system with new standard wood and glass system and luxfer glass transoms; replace or add historically appropriate cornice; replace existing windows with new wood two over two double hung windows; add new awning of shelf design; add new blade sign projecting from building with no more than 9 sq. ft. (overall dimension of sign.)

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 100608MKT. Proposed designs are consistent with design guidelines.

**Additional Comments**

NOTE: A plan note calls for a stain color for the storefront to be selected by the architect. Color is not a concern, but care should be taken to use an opaque stain that will mimic a paint coat on the storefront, so that the surface nearly resembles a painted wooden surface.

John Sanders, Pace Architecture, stated that he wants to change the stain to paint instead. Bolen asked about the demolition that has already been done. Sanders stated they have only removed the aluminum on the front.

Andie Ray, 7 Market, stated that the Market Square Association approves of this work.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**General**

**803 S. Gay Street** – Mark Heinz (Applicant), Bijou Theatre (Owner) – Certificate No. 110608GEN

**Work Description**

Install new marquee and blade sign. Vertical blade sign will replicate sign from the 1930s and will be located within the same bay on the building. Sign exterior - aluminum sheet metal, painted, in a blue color, with a white neon light band at the perimeter, and the decorative cap and the work Bijou outlined in LEDs, all static. The word "theatre" at the base of the blade sign will be cut into the aluminum sheet and internally lit.

The marquee sign is three sided and similar to the 1930s version of the marquee. The materials and finishes are similar to the blade sign, with the backing of the lettering portion made of translucent acrylic internally lit with fluorescent lighting.

Size of blade sign: 16' tall, with 2'5" width for majority of blade and 4'2-3/8" width for capitol. Dominant plane of marquee, 16'.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 110608GEN, which is consistent with the historic theater use of the building, and with the Secretary of Interior's Standards adopted as design guidelines for the building.

**Additional Comments**

As the attached photographs illustrate, when the building was converted to a theater, the blade sign and marquee (since removed) were dominant features of the façade, affirming the building's use as a theatre.

Mark Heinz, 123 S. Gay Street, stated that the Bijou will be celebrating its 100<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2009, and they would like to have the signs up for it.

**A MOTION WAS MADE BY GRIEVE AND SECONDED BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*601 W. Summit Hill Drive* - Sparkman and Associates (Applicant), Old City Hall Knoxville Partnership (Owner) – Certificate No. 110508GEN

**Work Description**

Install entry door and landing with stairs on north elevation of brick building noted as Building #7 in the National Register nomination, which is behind the main building, facing a residential high rise. Landing and stairs will rest on brick piers and will be painted steel, and will have standing seam roof covering to match the existing roof.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 110508GEN. The proposed entrance will be located on an inconspicuous elevation to the rear of the building, is designed appropriately to blend with the overall design of the building, and is necessary to satisfy exit codes.

Frank Sparkman, 3991 Midland Avenue stated that the sign meets the historic character and current codes for stairs. Stairs have to be covered now. Grieve stated he is working on a building and understood you do not have to cover stairs now.

**MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*501 W. Main Street* - Tim Pope/Advanced Signs (Applicant), Samuel Furrow (Owner) – Certificate No. 102808GEN

**Work Description**

Install indirect lighting for monument sign on Cumberland Avenue.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 102808GEN. The sign that will receive indirect lighting is at the rear of the building outside the wall that parallels Cumberland. Indirect lighting will not affect the building's architectural integrity.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Other Business**

Arning stated that Gobblers Knob will be heard by City Council on December 16.

**Election of Officers**

Arning turned the meeting over to county chair Kenneth Gresham.

**MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY COTHAM TO NOMINATE KENNETH GRESHAM AS CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO NOMINATE STEVE COTHAM AS VICE CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Gresham turned the meeting over to Arning.

**MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO NOMINATE NIC ARNING AS CHAIR.**

**MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO NOMINATE MELYNDA WHETSEL AS CHAIR.**

**MOTION BY GRIEVE, SECOND BY MARTIN TO CEASE NOMINATIONS, APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Arning for Whetsel; Bolen for Arning; Busby for Arning; Donaldson for Arning; Grieve for Whetsel, Martin for Whetsel; McAdams for Whetsel and Whetsel for Whetsel.

**WITH FIVE VOTES FOR WHETSEL AND THREE FOR ARNING, WHETSEL WAS ELECTED THE NEW CHAIR.**

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO NOMINATE NIC ARNING AS VICE CHAIR. MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE ARNING BY ACCLAMATION. MOTION APPROVED.**

Grieve thanked Arning for all his years of service and stated that he looked forward to his passion for the commission. He appreciates the work Arning has done.

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on December 18, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.