

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING OF MAY 15, 2008**

-----

**City HZC Present**

Nic Arning  
Sean Bolen  
Herb Donaldson  
Melissa McAdams  
Sandra Martin  
Finbarr Saunders  
Melynda Whetsel

**County HZC Present**

Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Charles Faulkner  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Others Present:**

Sharon Boyce  
Jerry Crowe  
Jason DeBord  
John Craig  
Robert Moyers  
Holly Cook  
John Stancil  
Will Crumley, Sequoyah  
LTD  
Cynthia Green  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West

**Members Absent:**

Scott Busby (ex.)  
Duane Grieve (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. None were noted.

- Approval of Minutes – April 17, 2008, meeting

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE MINUTES.  
THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

**627 Eleanor Street** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1-John Wampler/ High Oaks Construction (Applicant) - Certificate No. 411084&GA. Repair windows; install storm windows, color-clad to match house's paint scheme; reroof, making any necessary repairs in kind; repair wood siding and trim in kind, as necessary.

**621 Eleanor Street** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1- John Wampler/High Oaks Construction (Applicant) - Certificate No. 411084&GB. Repair windows; install storm windows, color-clad to match house's paint scheme; reroof, making any necessary repairs in kind; repair wood siding and trim in kind, as necessary.

**704 Haynes Place** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Tom Donaldson (Applicant) – Certificate No. 415084&G. Repair fire-damaged structure and coverings, including rebuilding and replacing roofing material, with roof pitch (6/12) to duplicate existing side gable roof with front cross gable, with asphalt shingle covering, 12" eave overhang with undersurface of tongue and groove 4" boards, exposed knee braces of full dimension lumber; replace poplar siding with beveled corners to duplicate existing; replace 3/1 side (east) elevation window with same dimension three over one wood window with window trim and sill to match existing on remainder of house; rebuild front

porch using existing footprint, columns, and floor, with exposed 2"x4" rafters, beadboard or tongue and groove 4" ceiling boards (not plywood), and 4x4 or 6x6 room beams and trusses; replace French door and sidelights on east side of north elevation; repair central window assembly. Rebuild within existing footprint of house with no additions.

**708 Haynes Place** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Tom Donaldson (Applicant) – Certificate No. 415084&GB. Repair eave overhang and roof members damaged in fire at 704 Haynes Place, in kind, including knee braces of 4x4 and 4" tongue and groove boards on undersurface of eave overhang.

**1119 Luttrell Street** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Zachary Weisfeld (Applicant) – Certificate No. 501084&GA. Roof repair.

**608 Caswell Avenue** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Zachary Weisfeld (Applicant) – Certificate No. 501084&GB. Roof repair.

**1307 Kenyon Avenue** - Old North Knoxville H-1- William G. Pittman (Applicant) – Certificate No. 41408ONK. Remove aluminum siding, repairing poplar siding and wood trim as needed; remove metal awnings on front elevation.

**1335 Armstrong Avenue** - Old North Knoxville H-1-Vaughn McCoy (Applicant) Certificate No. 41708ONK. Install exterior gutters, surfacing over interior gutters on front; repair soffit; repair wood siding in kind as necessary; reinstall original wooden storm shutters; reglaze or repair wood windows as necessary. (Duplicate of work provided for in Certificate 42601ONK, with items that have been completed omitted from this certificate.)

**1421 Hannah Avenue** - Mechanicsville H-1 - Rafik Hanna (Applicant) – Certificate No. 42408MEC. Repair existing 2/2 windows; repair damaged wood siding in kind where necessary.

**6341 Middlebrook Pike** - General - Will Crumley Sequoyah LTD (Applicant) – Certificate No. 42208GEN. Repoint and repair exterior brick as necessary, using provisions of Preservation Brief No. 2; Repair windows if possible; repair or rebuild fascia; reroof using cedar shakes to match original wood shake house roof; install new half-round gutters and round downspouts.

**2036 Jefferson Avenue** - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - David Grant (Applicant) – Certificate No. 41008EDG. Replace asphalt shingle roof, with decking repairs if necessary; remove turbine vents and install ridge vent and soffit vents if necessary; install gutters and downspouts; repair windows and install storm windows, color clad to match house; remove artificial siding; repair soffit, roof deck, wood siding and trim if necessary.

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **Edgewood-Park City H-1**

**2036 Jefferson** – David Grant (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 41008EDG.

#### **Work Description**

Install rear deck, 20x25 in area, not visible from Jefferson; replace inappropriate contemporary front door with wood front door with half or full view glass and sidelights; replace inappropriate rear door with half view door; install beadboard front porch ceiling.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 41008EDG. Proposed work items are consistent with adopted design guidelines for Edgewood-Park City H-1.

**Additional Comments**

The proposed beadboard porch ceiling is appropriate to the style and era of the house's original construction (pg. 19, #1). Replacing the entry door, currently a six panel metal door, with a half- or full-view glass door is also appropriate to the Bungalow style (pg. 21.) The proposed rear deck is on the rear elevation of the building, and is not visible from Jefferson.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that he has talked to the owner and the neighborhood supports the applicant's work.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**4<sup>th</sup> and Gill H-1**

*611 Gill Avenue* – Robert Moyers (Knoxville Codes Enforcement) (Applicant), Shirley Ann Amos (Owner) – Certificate No. 430084&G

**Work Description**

Demolition of non-contributing addition on west side of house, including garage/storage building, joined to historic house by breezeway.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE demolition of garage and breezeway only. These portions of the building are not significant and alter the appearance of the historic house, in addition to being a public hazard.

**Additional Comments**

Garage and attached breezeway have not achieved significance, and are in extremely poor condition, creating a hazard to the general public and attached property on the west.

Whetsel asked about the status of the house. Bennett stated she has met with the property owners, but the Property Assessor's records do not show an owner now.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Old North Knoxville H-1**

*1132 Harvey Street* – Ruby and Jerry Crowe (Owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 42908ONK

**Work Description**

Construct rear deck, 16' wide x 10-12' deep, 10-12" off ground, no railing, one step around angled perimeter. Construct storage shed, approximately 12x14, with front gable roof, asphalt shingle covering, stuccoed block foundation, wood lap siding to match house, two windows on sides, matching windows in house, and plank double doors with cross bracing facing house and located at 5' side and rear setback.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 42908ONK. Proposed deck and storage shed are in rear yard, and are not visible from Harvey.

**Additional Comments**

The proposed storage shed will be visible from Folsom, running at the side and one lot away from this property, and from East Glenwood across a paved parking lot on the corner of Oklahoma and East Glenwood. Applicants have taken care to make the deck as unobtrusive as possible by constructing it at a low enough elevation that no railing will be required, and by stepping it down to the yard through the use of a perimeter step that travels the circumference of the deck. The storage shed is consistent with the design guidelines regarding Auxiliary or Outbuildings found on Pg. 29 of the design guidelines, through the use of a design that is common in older outbuildings in the neighborhood, and through use of plank double doors with cross bracing and the use of four inch lap wood siding and a stuccoed foundation. The outbuilding is also located at the rear of the lot. (See pg. 29, M.1-4).

Bennett stated she has talked to the neighborhood representative and the neighborhood approves.

Jerry Crowe, 1132 Harvey Street, stated that the shed will be built with details borrowed from, and sensitive to, the house.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**General**

*129 W. Jackson Avenue* – Eric Vallance/Ben Testerman Construction Company (Applicant), Testerman, Testerman & Buckner, LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 42908GEN

**Work Description**

Construct concave type awnings at each storefront with black frames, two tone coca in color with graphics on both fixed valances reading "The Jacksonian.". Awnings (top to bottom of valance)

72", 16" valance, 147" total depth and 254" total width (taking into account the width of the storefronts).

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 42908GEN. Proposed awning is appropriately scaled and styled for building at 129 W. Jackson.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION.**

*6341 Middlebrook Pike* – Will Crumley, Sequoyah LTD LLC (Applicant), Tom Weiss (Owner) – Certificate No. 42208GEN

**Work Description**

Replace wood windows as necessary, matching overall size and sash, muntin and mullion sizes and profiles; Build new continuous porch step around front and side wrap around porch; Install new utility room at rear corner of ell; Install new wood rear porch, matching design of front and side porch, at rear corner of back el; install new basement access doors on rear elevation; Install heating and air conditioning units outside rear elevation; Build access ramp on rear elevation or on back of side porch, not visible from Middlebrook Pike.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 42208GEN.

**Additional Comments**

Applicant discovered evidence of an earlier wood shingle roof as the original roof when removing the deteriorated asphalt shingle roof. All additional changes to the structure, including a rear porch, handicapped access ramp, and cellar access doors, are at the rear of the structure, will be removable in the future if that becomes necessary without creating harm to the original structure, and will not be visible from Middlebrook Pike. This approach to providing the improvements necessary to meet building code requirements is consistent with the secretary of Interior's Standards which were adopted at the time of designation to govern exterior changes to the Lones-Dowell House.

Saunders stated that the Commission has been concerned for years about this house, and he is glad the house is being renovated.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Market Square H-1**

*16, 18, 20, 22 Market Square* – Jason DeBord (Owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 50208MKT

## **Work Description**

Repair existing brick facades where necessary, with replacement brick and mortar to match existing; repair existing window sills if necessary; install sign board on #16 in keeping with cornice of #18 & #20, smaller in scale and spanning between outer pilasters above storefront and below window sills; repair existing cornice at #18 & #20; install new sign board on #22, spanning between outermost pilasters and filling in space above storefront and below window sills, with signage to be relocated to sign board areas; review in concept one story rooftop addition. Addition has been modified from initial submission (withdrawn at 4/17/2008 meeting) to step back from front parapet walls 19'11". Additional materials have not been determined and will need to be reviewed separately by HZC, but are thought to be like contemporary storefront construction with black metal structure with glass inserts and top cornice overhang of approximately 12" to provide weather and sun protection. The approximate height of the addition on 16-18 and 20 is 11' taller than the roof elevation of 18-20 and 8' taller than the top of the parapet. The rooftop addition height proposed for 22 Market is approximately 3'6" lower than that for 16-18-20 Market for a 4-5' elevation greater than the parapet walls.

## **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE cornice, sign board and; APPROVE concept of third floor addition. The brick repair and sign boards are consistent with adopted design guidelines. The roof addition has been modified to be less visible from Market Square.

## **Additional Comments**

For items related to brick, cornice and sign board items, see Market Square Design Guidelines, see II.C.1. Masonry and II.D.1. Signs. Market Square Design Guidelines also contain provisions for New Construction in Section III. III.7. "The height and setback of new buildings shall be consistent with neighboring buildings." The design guidelines are based on the Secretary of Interior's Standards, which in Standard # 9 provide ". . . Alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural materials, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood or environment." 16-22 Market Square are two story buildings, as are the buildings on either side of them. There is already a rooftop addition on #18-20 that encloses an atrium and stairs that provide access to the rooftop. The currently proposed addition to the rooftop of these buildings will vary in scale from the surrounding buildings; however, the new addition will be minimized by being located to the rear of the parapet wall of these buildings almost 20 feet.

In guiding projects using the Secretary's Standards, the National Register review staff has sometimes allowed roof additions for buildings taking advantage of the Federal tax credits. Although the additions discussed in this staff report are not intended to use the investment tax credits, the interpretation of the Secretary's Standards is useful in gauging the impact of this project. Generally, rooftop additions would be allowed with two restrictions: first, that the addition must only take place on four story or greater buildings, and second, that the addition must be set back in such a way that it is not visible from surrounding streets. While these additions are not proposed for four story buildings, they are substantially back from the parapet wall, and if the materials are very transparent, will not be obvious from Market Square. The fact that there is already an addition on these buildings, and that the deterioration of these buildings

necessitated a complete rebuilding of the roofs and removed historic materials associated with the rooftops also mitigates the impact of these proposed additions.

Bennett stated that this plan is only a concept plan, and they will come back with a final plan. Jason DeBord, 810 W. Clinch, stated that he is submitting a revised application from the one he submitted in April. The additional story will not be visible from ground level because it will be setback 20' from the edge of the building. This building is structurally built to hold another story. He will come back and present the proposed materials, which will be as transparent as possible. Saunders asked if this is a different plan, and Mr. DeBord stated it is different. The HVAC unit will be moved to the back of the building.

John Craig, 12226 Brighton Court, stated that he appreciated the tour Mr. DeBord gave of the building. He talked to the Market Square Board, and they discussed that the Secretary's Guidelines suggest that additions should not be added to buildings less than four stories. He believes the revised plan is much better. He would like to see the visibility minimized. The

Market Square Board would also like to request that the cornices be replaced on Nos. 16, 18 and 20 and that the cornices be replicated because this might screen the addition. Mr. DeBord stated that the parapet wall collapsed during the restoration of the building. They could add the replicated cornice. Mr. Craig stated that in general the feedbacks of the ones opposed were in the minority.

Arning received an email from Busby stating he was concerned about the commission going against the Secretary Standards. Approving this application may lead to other people wanting to add stories.

Whetsel asked if there is a rooftop addition now, and Mr. DeBord stated there is an addition. She stated that the Market Square guidelines should be modified to address this. Bolen stated the addition of the 16-22 Market Square would be visible from all parts of the square, but the 20' setback helps. The cornice will make a difference.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO MODIFY THE STAFF REPORT DRAWING OF THE CORNICE AT 16, 18 & 20 MARKET TO REPLICATE THE EXISTING CORNICE. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH ARNING VOTING NO.**

**Other Business** - National Register Certified Local Government Review  
North Hills National Register District

Bennett stated that the Tennessee Historical Commission is going to consider the National Register for North Hills. Holly Cook from Knox Heritage is here. Bennett described houses in the neighborhood. The neighborhood considered an H-1 a few years ago, but some residents were opposed. As a certified local government, the commissioners are asked to review.

**MOTION BY MCADAMS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE NOMINATION OF THE NORTH HILLS NEIGHBORHOOD TO THE NATIONAL REGISTER. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Bennett described the status of the house at 645 Mars Hill Road. It was nominated to the National Register for its representation of early settlement and its architecture. It was one of the few brick homes from the 1820s remaining in Knox County. The house burned in late 2002, and the owner had it demolished. Nothing remains of the building and its former location is now a vacant parcel. She asked that it be removed from the National Register.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO REMOVE 645 MARS HILL ROAD FROM THE NATIONAL REGISTER. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Adjournment

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on June 19, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.