

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JUNE 19, 2008

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Herb Donaldson

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Kenneth Gresham (ex)

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
Brian Pittman
Gregor Smee
Robert Marlino
John Stancil
Jamie Rowe
Kathy Gonzalez
Cynthia Greene
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. None were noted.

- Approval of Minutes – May 15, 2008, meeting

Bolen stated that he would like this statement he made at the May 15 meeting added to the minutes. “The addition of the 16-22 Market Square would be visible from all parts of the square.”

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES, INCLUDING THE ADDITIONAL WORDING REGARDING MARKET SQUARE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Discussion of **1018 Scenic Drive**: Ann Bennett

A non-contributing addition, a metal shed was resting on a brick patio. The owner, Tom Namey, had an agreement with DIY Network to film the demolition of the shed and restore the patio; if the permit could not be obtained quickly, the opportunity to conduct the demolition and restoration would be lost. After consulting with neighbors on Scenic and with Arning, Bennett issued a level 1 certificate so that the filming could take place.

1018 Scenic Drive - Scenic Drive NC-1, Tom Namey (Applicant), Certificate No. 60408SCN - Demolish non-contributing metal shed addition at rear of house, not visible from Scenic Drive, restoring original brick patio.

2009 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Susan Koelzer (Applicant) – Certificate No. 50908EDG - Replace oldest section of roof with new shingles to match shingles on newly constructed rear portion; install new color clad gutters and downspouts to match gutters and downspouts on new portion of house; introduce metal cladding over tarred portion of rear roof, not visible from Washington Avenue; install motorized attic vents on rear portion of roof, not visible from Washington Avenue.

1805 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Bobby Braley (Applicant) – Certificate No. 52808EDG. Replace rotten and missing windows with one over one wood windows. (Emergency issue of Certificate under Level I for replacement windows in order to secure the house - 5/28/2008). Remove oversize composite shingles and restore wood weatherboard siding and wood trim in kind, as necessary. Remove second door added in duplex conversion, and install Craftsman style wood entry door, retaining original transom and sidelights.

209 W. Glenwood Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Tim Sparer (Applicant) – Certificate No. 51208ONK - Replacement of existing siding and trim pieces with poplar siding (in-kind). Repaint entire house.

119 W. Glenwood Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Granvil Radcliffe (Applicant) – Certificate No. 51408ONK - Reroof house, replacing asphalt shingles in kind; repair siding and other wood trim as necessary; gutter repair as necessary.

930 Gratz - 4th & Gill H-1 - Caleb Wilson (Applicant) – Certificate No. 605084&G - Repair wood siding in kind as necessary; install window sill to replace rotten window sill; repair spindles in porch railing, replicating original turned wood spindles; repair or replace existing concrete steps; repair window screens.

515 College Street – Mechanicsville H-1 - Russ Salmans (Home Renovation Specialist) (Applicant) – Certificate No. 60208MEC - Reroof, using dimensional shingles.

1323 Hannah - Mechanicsville H-1 - Tim Rich (Bahai Faith) (Applicant) – Certificate No. 52308MEC -Install metal handicapped ramp accessing front porch on east side (removed from Hannah and Arthur). Ramp to be metal with metal railing until it reaches the porch, when there will be a wood floor extending from the porch, with a railing as required.

1405 Hannah - Mechanicsville H-1 - THD at Home Services (Kari Gibbons) (Applicant) – Certificate No. 60508MEC - Install color clad gutters and downspouts.

26 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Cardinal Sign Corporation – Greg Stollings for Rita’s Ices (Applicant) – Certificate No. 60308MKT - Install one non-illuminated hanging sign, centered for main entry door, 6 sq. ft. in dimension and flag mounted.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General

Work Description

1) Add garage door to northernmost bay on west elevation to convert one section of basement into garage, taking advantage of existing structural conditions; garage door to be wood with Norman Gothic arches with inset vertically grooved tongue & groove boards, resembling carriage doors. (NOTE: approval of garage opening would modify previously issued Certificate No. 62906GEN.) 2) Repair and reinstall first story front porch rail on south elevation, replacing missing sections and replicating original, with height of 2'9-3/8" and openings between vertical members of 4-1/4"; 2) Install new railing inside newly opened arch on west elevation, replicating vertical openings of existing railing but at 36" height. 3) Redesign front elevation balcony to allow drainage and prevent future rotting, duplicating original railing design with 4-1/4" vertical openings but raising railing height to 36". 4) Allow curb cut for proposed garage. 5) Reinstall basement windows which should have been in brick foundation between the two chimneys on the west elevation.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60408GEN. Proposed changes do not destroy original material; retain significant historic design features such as railings that do not meet current building codes.

Additional Comments

The installation of garage doors, while not present in the original building, allows the building to adapt to modern demands, rendering it more marketable, without harming original material which has already been modified.

Brian Pittman, 623 W. Hill Avenue, stated that the rail on the top of the porch is original, but it is only 2' high. It is slightly different than the lower rail. He wants to add to the top and bottom to comply with codes. Tom Reynolds, Chief, Building, Zoning and Plans Review, stated that if there is a railing there, it can be repaired, but in raising the height to 36" any addition openings cannot be greater than 4". Reynolds stated that the state may have a problem with the garage facing Henley Street. Sharon Boyce stated that the curb cut is a Tennessee Department of Transportation issue. Bennett explained that while the curb cut is a DOT issue, it does alter the appearance of the site, and that alteration should be reviewed by the HZC.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION SUBJECT TO ADDED OPENINGS ON THE RAILING NOT BEING MORE THAN 4". THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

1805 Jefferson – Bobby Braley (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 52808EDG.

Work Description

Replace rotten and missing windows with one over one wood windows. (Emergency issue of Certificate under Level I for replacement windows in order to secure the house - 5/28/2008). Remove oversize composite shingles and restore wood weatherboard siding and wood trim in kind, as necessary. Remove second door added in duplex conversion, and install Craftsman style wood entry door, retaining original transom and sidelights.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 52808EDG. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Certificate for window replacement portion of application was issued on 52808 EDG due to applicant's need to secure house quickly. Removal of added siding materials and replacement with wood is called for in Wall coverings, pg. 22, # 2 & #7. Removal of second entrance and restoration of original transoms and sidelights with new door, see Entrances, pg. 20, #1.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that the neighborhood applauds his work.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

4 Market Square – Robert Marlino (Smee Busby) (Applicant), 4MC LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 60508MKT

Work Description

Install two signs. 1) hanging sign, sized 2'6"x3'7", two sided, from simple bracket; 2) hanging blade sign on side wall, 189" (approximately 15'9") long x 37.5" wide with a 6" projection from the building, internally light (using LED illumination) with outline of white light bulbs on perimeter and centered letters internally illuminated in white, and with blue outline on perimeter and flat edge on side and an arrow at bottom to resemble neon sign.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60508MKT. Proposed front hanging sign is consistent with adopted design guidelines (see Signs, D 2.) Proposed blade sign is not discussed in design guidelines, but is consistent with era and materials for Market Square.

Additional Comments

The proposed blade sign is located on the walkway, off the frontage of Market Square, and uses modern lighting to replicate a neon blade sign typical of the 1920s when the Vogue Building was constructed. Its coloration, shape and lighting will enhance the historic character of Market

Square, and will not set a precedent for the remainder of the buildings on the Square since none of them has access to a location removed from the front elevation of the buildings. Neon is discussed as an appropriate lighting for Market Square signs (see Signs, D.5.)

Gregor Smee, 408 Schooner, and Robert Marlino, 118 Fronda Lane, stated that the sign is to draw people into the courtyard. The sign will be LED that looks like neon. It is backlit and internally lit also. Tom Reynolds stated that the zoning in C-2, which allows a 50 square foot sign. Each business can only have a 50 square foot sign. Mr. Smee stated that there will be a restaurant on the main level. The Square Room in the back is leasable performance space.

Reynolds suggested they talk to the sign inspector because lighting is becoming an issue to the residents who live downtown. The sign ordinance is being rewritten. The ordinance does not mention lighted signs in this district. Montgomery asked if dimmers could be put on it in LED, and Mr. Smee stated they could. Whetsel asked if the proportion is accurate on the drawing, and Mr. Smee stated it is. Grieve stated that he was the architect for the courtyard; the courtyard was designed as a thoroughfare and passive park to link Market Square to Gay Street through the lobby of the restored Miller's Building, now home to the Knoxville Utilities Board. Architectural elements from buildings in Knoxville are displayed in the courtyard. Grieve opposed a side entrance to this building, but commended the architects on the look of the entrance.

Grieve is opposed to the proposed blade sign, which he feels takes away from the courtyard and the trompe l'oeil painted on the Millers Building. The proposed blade sign is very tall; the fact that it is lighted he also feels is disruptive. He suggested the architects talk more about the sign to the city.

Smee stated that he respects Grieve's opinion. He noted that sign is 15' above the walkway, and narrowing it would compromise the sign's attempt to replicate historic design. Grieve suggested it be included in the sign on the front of the building. Saunders asked how far back the sign is from the entrance. Mr. Smee answered that it is 70' or 80' from Market Square. He notes that the sign limitations currently in effect on Market Square call for every business to get a 50 square foot sign. Reynolds stated that every application should have a good description of exactly what is being asked for with dimensions. Busby stated that the Market Square guidelines allow a sign on the front, and they are not questioning those. Bennett discussed the size of signs and the two buildings together. Grieve stated that KUB and Tomato Head should be involved with this application. Bennett suggested that the commission hold a workshop after July 4 to discuss this information. The commission will meet on July 9 at 3 p.m. on Market Square at Smee Busby offices. Grieve stated that signage is being discussed all over the city, and the Knoxville City Council is considering signage.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE FOR 30 DAYS. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH BUSBY RECUSING.

Busby announced that there will be a tour of the houses at 237 and 239 Deaderick on June 27 at noon.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on July 17, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.