

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING OF FEBRUARY 21, 2008**

-----

**City HZC Present**

Nic Arning  
Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Duane Grieve  
Melissa McAdams  
Sandra Martin  
Finbarr Saunders  
Melynda Whetsel

**County HZC Present**

Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Others Present:**

Sharon Boyce  
Jason DeBord  
Patrick Hunt  
Phil MacDonald  
Devin Ferguson  
John Stancil  
Sean Martin  
James Pierce  
Anthony Williams  
Markus Chady  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West

**Members Absent:**

Herb Donaldson (ex.)

**Members Absent:**

Linda Claussen (ex.)  
Steve Cotham (ex.)  
Charles Faulkner (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

- Approval of Minutes – January 17, 2008, meeting

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

• Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning  
No report.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

***1635 Jefferson Avenue*** - Edgewood/ParkCity - Matthew T. Kellogg, Certificate No.11408EDG - Remove asbestos wall shingles and repair poplar; replace tongue and groove porch floor in kind; replace roof covering on front porch with membrane roof; remove protruding round roof vents with ridge vent; repair or rebuild existing brick chimney; tuckpoint foundation; reinstall modillions on section of roof overhang; replace front door and side door with three-quarter view wood doors; either rebuild and repair infill masonry between porch piers using stucco or brick, or rebuild using painted plywood panels and authentic lattice.

***1111 Luttrell Street*** - 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill - Patrick Hunt, Certificate No. 1213074&G - Remove vinyl siding, repair wood wall covering and trim in kind as necessary.

*1019 Eleanor Street* - 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill - Bob Whetsel, Certificate No. 206084&G -  
Repair/replace porch flooring with tongue & groove flooring; replace/repair tapered round 8" porch columns in kind; repair storm windows; repair siding, trim and soffit in kind as necessary.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **Market Square H-1**

*17 Market* – Knoxville Area Chamber Partnership (Applicant) – Certificate No. 20408MKT

#### **Description of Work**

Install weather camera on roof of building.

#### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20408MKT. The Market Square Design Guidelines do not address the placement of remote control cameras. However, the rooftop location and the presence of a parapet wall will mitigate negative visual effects.

#### **Additional Comments**

The camera and its support are not a structural modification and will be easily removable in the future. The Secretary of Interior's Standards, which form the foundation of the Market Square Design Guidelines, provide that "Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structure shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. (Standard #10).

### **MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

### **General**

*602 S. Gay Street* – Jason Debord/Michael Brady, Inc., The Burwell Owner's Condominium Association – Certificate No. 20408GEN

#### **Description of Work**

Install balconies at several locations on south and east building facades, as shown on attachments. Balconies to be tube steel, suspended with cables from sides of building, requiring window removal and installation of full glass door to gain access to balcony. Width of balconies to encompass width of two windows on east elevations.

#### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20408GEN with modifications that would 1) refuse the installation of balconies on the south elevation nearest Gay Street, 2) require removed windows to be stored, and 3) specify color of balconies match fire escape.

#### **Additional Comments**

The east facing elevations of the building, highlighted by common red brick, do not contain significant design elements; the same is true for the south facing elevation at the rear of the building, which is set in from the Gay Street façade and is also built of common red brick. On those elevations, balconies will not be apparent, and will not significantly alter the overall architecture of the building. The commissioners may want to recommend that if original windows are removed from the openings, they be stored in the building to facilitate a reversal of the balconies in the future. Commissioners may also want to be sure that the materials used to construct the balconies match in coloration and design the recently installed fire escape on the rear of the building.

Five balconies are proposed for the south façade nearest Gay Street, and could be visible from Gay Street. They are also proposed for the portion of the building that is surfaced in buff colored brick, and contains cornice elements that wrap around from the Gay Street façade; the designers of that 1928 addition to the Burwell understood that that portion of the building would be visible from Gay Street. The east facing elevations of the building, highlighted by common red brick, do not contain significant design elements; the same is true for the south facing elevation at the rear of the building.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards are used as the guidelines for this building. Two of the Standards address the installation of balconies on the south elevation nearest Gay Street:

#5 - Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

#9 - New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property . . .

The proposed balconies on the south elevation nearest Gay Street would result in a modification of the original design, and would also alter historic materials that characterize the property. Balconies on that portion of the elevation are not recommended. Although the commission discussed the fact that a better design could be achieved by installing balconies on all of the windows that are on the buff-colored south-facing brick, and although including balconies on all of those windows is preferable to omitting some of the balconies, and will result in a less patchy looking installation, the building would still be altered from its original appearance by the balconies, and balconies installed on the buff-colored brick would conflict with Standards #5 and #9.

The balconies on the south side do not meet the Standards. Brick would have to be removed from that elevation, destroying original significant material. Balconies that are not on the white brick should be approved. Any original windows should be saved.

Jason DeBord, 810 Clinch, stated that two months ago Michael Brady, Inc., filed an application requesting that balconies be installed on the red brick part of the building. Once Cardinal had sold all the units, they planned to come back to the commission for approval of the balconies. The owners do want balconies. The balconies proposed for this bay of the building are symmetrical. Busby asked what color they will be. DeBord stated probably the color of the brick or matching the fire escape. Deed restrictions will be written to prohibit drying plants, things hanging on balconies, etc. The units go all the way through to the back. Whetsel stated that at the last meeting she talked about how they wanted to install balconies in one place and not in

another. The historic structure is significant and should not be altered. DeBord stated that Gay and Clinch would be impacted but not the south side. We are not trying to set a precedent like the Candy Factory and Brownlow. He agreed to H-1 for this building and might be reluctant to agree to H-1 at another location.

Saunders stated that the Commission's responsibility is to promote development of downtown, and all historic buildings in downtown are not designated. DeBord stated that Cardinal is trying to develop this area to make it appealing for people to live downtown. Montgomery stated that if balconies were painted white they would not show. Grieve added that the Commission is supposed to uphold the guidelines. He expressed concern that the balconies conflict with the Tennessee Theatre sign. DeBord stated that the Tennessee Theater sign is there because the owners of the Burwell Building wanted it there. Bennett stated that when local buildings placed on the National Register, they are monitored for exterior changes after they are listed. The National Register staff looks at the building and, in some instances, could remove it from the National Register. The buff colored brick on the south side will be difficult to recreate in later years. Arning stated that when the Commission spends this much time on a piece of property, it is not done haphazardly. The Commission has no review authority over the other downtown buildings that do not have an H-1, but for designated buildings, the Historic Zoning Commission must uphold the Standards that are the basis for the design guidelines.

**MOTION SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE TO ALLOW BALCONIES ON THE SOUTH SIDE NEAREST GAY STREET, AND ADD BALCONIES ON THE EAST AND SOUTH SIDES, REQUIRING THAT WINDOWS AND BALCONIES MATCH THE COLOR ON THE BUILDING. THE MOTION FAILED.**

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO ACCEPT STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO 1) REFUSE THE INSTALLATION OF BALCONIES ON THE SOUTH ELEVATION NEAREST GAY STREET, 2) REQUIRE REMOVED WINDOWS TO BE STORED, AND 3) SPECIFY COLOR OF BALCONIES MATCH FIRE ESCAPE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Busby stated that he has looked for condos for sale in the Burwell Building and did not find any. Condo buyers want condos in a historic building. The tenants bought them even though they did not have balconies. DeBord stated that he discussed balconies with the owners before they bought. Busby commended the work that DeBord has done on the buildings downtown. This is a difficult decision for the Commission, but it has to uphold the Standards.

#### **Fourth and Gill H-1**

***1111 Luttrell Street*** – Patrick Hunt (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 1213074&G

### **Description of Work**

Replace one over one wood windows with one over one double glazed wood windows.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 1213074&G. Proposed changes are consistent with adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines as noted below.

### **Additional Comments**

Proposed replacement windows are the same overall size as the originals, with the same pane division muntin style and exterior depth, width and profile (Windows, #4, pg. 11.) Additional windows proposed for enclosed rear porch are compatible with the other building windows (#7, pg. 11). The proposed awning at the new entry is a duplicate of an element already found on the building, and is consistent with the entry's use as a service or secondary entrance. (Doors, #2, #3, #4, Pg. 13). The parking pad proposed for the north side of the lot sits back from the front elevation of the house, utilizes an existing curb cut, and will not appear as a noticeable change from the street.

Patrick Hunt, 1111 Luttrell, stated that the rear door does not have an awning, and he wants to duplicate the one over the basement door. He intends to keep the sashes he is removing and store them in the barn.

Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor, 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill representative, stated that the neighborhood approves of the work he plans to do.

### **MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1019 Eleanor Street* – Bob Whetsel (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 206084&G

### **Description of Work**

Reinstall Scamozzi capitals on porch columns, replace handrails on front porch with turned or square cut spindles on 4-5" centers set into top and bottom rails; replace concrete unoriginal front porch steps and brick buttresses with wood front porch steps, wood stringers, closed risers, and railing to match front porch railing.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 206084&G. Proposed work elements are consistent with adopted design guidelines. (NOTE: Level I Certificate issued 2/06/08.)

### **Additional Comments**

The installation of column capitals and wood stairs, as well as a more appropriate railing, will return the house to an appropriate earlier appearance. The applicant will install replacement capitals that match capitals originally found on the house, and documented through partial column capitals found on the columns during an earlier rehabilitation. The concrete steps and

brick buttresses are also from an earlier reworking of the porch. The proposed work items are consistent with the adopted design guidelines regarding porches (pg. 12, Design Guidelines.)

Melinda Whetsel, 1015 Luttrell, stated that she provided the picture to show what the steps and handrail will look like after they remove the concrete steps. The house was rehabbed over 20 years ago, and some of the work does not meet our standards today.

Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor, 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill representative, stated that the neighborhood approves of the work the Whetsel's plan to do.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH WHETSEL RECUSING.**

**Edgewood-Park City H-1**

*1635 Jefferson Avenue* – Matthew T. Kellogg (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 11408EDG

**Description of Work**

Demolish westernmost outbuilding, frame, shed roof, c. 1963 (non-contributing).

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 11408EDG. A Level 1 certificate that will guide restoration of the exterior has been issued. The outbuilding proposed for demolition is in extremely deteriorated condition, and is not visible from Jefferson Avenue.

**Additional Comments**

There are no distinguishing characteristics associated with this deteriorated building; the architectural and historical character of the primary building and of the district will not be harmed by its demolition.

The neighborhood wrote a letter agreeing with the application.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1904 Washington Avenue* - Charles B. Hassenboehler, Jr. - (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 20608EDG

**Description of Work**

Repair foundation; remove second story front added room and restore porch, if it was a porch, adding window to match historic windows; siding repair in kind; repair windows; remove added front door, replacing with matching window; remove storm door; remove rear fire stair.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20608EDG. Proposed changes are consistent with design guidelines and will remove alterations and return the house to its original appearance.

Hassenboehler is reapplying for the work, some of which is complete, but needs additional time to finish the project.

The neighborhood approves of his plans.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Scenic Drive NC-1**

*1015 Scenic Drive* – Phil MacDonald (Applicant) - Richard and Deborah Whipple (Owners) Certificate No. 20508SNC

**Description of Work**

Construct one story, gable roof, two-bay garage with wood siding and carriage style garage doors, sitting at the south side and behind the house.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20508SNC. Proposed construction is consistent in style with primary building and consistent with the design guidelines, which all for additions to be at the rear or side of existing buildings (New Additions, pg. 12, #9).

Phil MacDonald, 1015 Scenic Drive was in attendance.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1105 Scenic Drive* –Devin Ferguson (Integrus) (Applicant) - Keith and Kimberley Campbell (Owners) – Certificate No. 20808SNC

**Description of Work**

Removing a rear screened porch and replacing it with a garage; removing existing garage and adding a laundry room; add covered stoop for front entry. Hardi-shake and brick veneer exterior, with asphalt roof shingles. Front porch will have swept front gable with small telescoping front gable to mark front entry, brick columns with segmental arch at front entry; tripled square columns at corner of side section of front porch.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20808SNC. Proposed changes will improve front façade of house so it blends better with other historic buildings on Scenic.

Devin Ferguson, 1105 Scenic, is the applicant.

Bolen asked if the garage is original, and Ferguson stated that it is. Bennett added that this is a demolition and addition of new space. She stated that homes on Scenic Drive are allowed to demolish structures. This application is consistent with the guidelines because it is in an NC-1.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Grieve stated that the commission just approved two certificates in the newest NC-1 for residents who have followed the adopted guidelines.

**Tazewell Pike NC-1**

*4413 Tazewell Pike* – Knoxville Gospel Halls – Arnie Holt (Applicant) Arthur Troyer (Owner) Certificate No. 20508TZL

**Description of Work**

Construct new church behind existing house. New building to be one story stucco or brick veneer building with hipped or side gabled, asphalt shingled roof. Remove existing garage, which is not contributing to the district. NOTE: Applicant hopes to improve the house located to the front of the lot, intending to complete a one-lot subdivision and sell the existing house. Applicant understands that if improvements to the exterior of the house warrant a building permit, further consultation with the Historic Zoning Commission will be required.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20508TZL. The proposed building is consistent with the recommendations in the adopted design guidelines.

Bennett received an email from Arnie Holt asking that his application be withdrawn because it was denied by MPC. There is no Tazewell Pike representative present.

**Additional Comments**

The details of the design guidelines satisfied by the design of the new building are:  
Materials (pg. 8) - Brick which is uniform in color, or stucco.  
Access (pg. 10) - Access to new developments should appear as driveways or narrow roads. Site (pg. 11) - Include native and ornamental trees and foundation planting.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO ALLOW THIS APPLICATION TO BE WITHDRAWN.**



## **Old North Knoxville H-1**

*1316 Grainger Avenue* - Erin Lund (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 20608ONK

### **Description of Work**

Install deck railing on rear deck of square cut spindles set into top and bottom rail.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 20608ONK. The proposed railing is a necessary safety element. The deck is located to the rear of the house and the railing will not be obvious from Grainger.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that the neighborhood is in agreement.

**MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

## **Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1**

*2016 Fairmont Boulevard* – Williamsbuilt Construction (Anthony Williams) (Applicant) - Virginia Lanni Bamberg (Owner) – Certificate No.11608FEM

### **Description of Work**

Construct new front porch, 30' wide, 8' deep: roof slope 2/12, shingled, wood banister at front edge approximately 24" high with square 4"x4" posts and 2" balusters set into top and bottom rail; 6"x6" square wood columns, exposed concrete block foundation with 4" concrete slab floor, concrete steps.

### **Staff Recommendation**

DENY Certificate No. 11608FEM without prejudice. Submitted drawing does not contain details adequate to assess impact of change of porch design on front elevation of building.

### **Additional Comments**

The Fairmont Park design guidelines suggest that porticos are more appropriate for two story Colonial Revival dwellings. Those porticos should be gabled with arched ceilings or broken pediments. As a second alternative full and half porches may be considered. Porch trim includes columns with elaborate capitals and turned or sawn wood balustrades. (pg. 6, Design Guidelines.) Bennett stated she does not have enough details as to the work to be done. She sent the owner and the contractor pictures of typical Colonial Revival porches to determine if one of those closely duplicated the work being requested for approval.

Anthony Williams, 7411 Cross Bow Lane, stated that he chose one of the pictures that Bennett had sent him, which is the full front porch with top deck, square cut balustrades and short posts on the deck.

Whetsel asked if a concrete slab is acceptable for an NC-1. Bennett answered that the house has a concrete block foundation and walls.

Markus Chady, 1532 Emoriland Boulevard, on behalf of neighborhood stated that they received the drawing, and the board approved it. They are encouraging construction of a porch. The neighborhood needs a more detailed drawing of the porch, column size, etc.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE SO THE APPLICANT CAN COME BACK AFTER THE NEIGHBORHOOD SEES THE PLAN. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Discussion: Island Home Park potential designation

Bennett stated that she is meeting tonight with James Pierce regarding the H-1 overlay in 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill being expanded. She will also be meeting with representatives in Edgewood Park City to expand their H-1. Island Home Park is considering an H-1 and NC-1. She has met with representatives from the neighborhood. They have drafted H-1 and NC-1 guidelines. Bennett stated they are doing H-1 and NC-1 because there is so much information that needs to be given to the neighbors. If she has a large number of unwilling people it would be hard to pass.

- Election of Officers

Busby nominated Arning as Chair.

Whetsel stated that her term is over in November 2008. She would like to be reappointed and would accept the nomination as chair for next year but not this year.

Martin nominated Whetsel to be Vice Chair for 2008.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY THAT THE NOMINATIONS CEASE AND TO ACCEPT THE NOMINATIONS BY ACCLIMATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.