

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF DECEMBER 18, 2008**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)
Charles Faulkner

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Kevin Nelson
Michael Harding
John Stancil
Cynthia Stancil
James Pierce
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Herb Donaldson
Duane Grieve

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. None were noted.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 20 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning

Sharon Boyce explained that awnings and marquees are allowed by the zoning ordinance as part of a building permit. They cannot be enclosed with plastic. If an applicant wants them to extend farther across the sidewalk than the building code allows, an encroachment agreement with city would be required. Market Square is not a right-of-way, and is not a street, which creates a problem with signs. A 10' pedestrian access must be maintained, and there will be specific regulations for Market Square. Bennett stated that the guidelines cover signs and awnings on Market Square. Boyce added that applicants need to start at the Building Permits office. They do not have to go before City Council unless they go beyond the height and distance except in a C-6 zone. This is found in Article 5, Section 6 in the Zoning Code.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

712 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Daniel Sturdevan (Applicant) – Certificate No. 1117084&G - Replace deteriorated metal access stair at rear of building with new wood stair, built exactly the same size and on the same footprint. NOTE: the stair is located on the rear elevation of the building and is not visible from Deery.

716 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Heather Parnell (Applicant) – Certificate No. 1204084&G - Replace fascia, soffit, corbels and other wooden trim members in kind preparatory to painting. Repair and replace elements of second story porch on front elevation in kind, as necessary.

1701 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Steve & Rebecca Loy (Applicant) – Certificate No. 111308EDG - Install color-clad storm windows; repair existing windows.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

Bennett stated that the Sherrod Road/Gobblers Knob was approved by City Council on first reading and will require a second reading before final adoption.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth and Gill H-1

716 Deery – Heather Parnell - (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 1204084&G

Work Description

Convert rear, side elevation window (north side) to door and add stoop. Approximate dimension of porch 5'x6' with wood floor and skirting of lattice. Door to be full view (salvage from YMCA). Hipped roof supported by columns and trim to resemble front porch.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 1204084&G (Level II and Level I portions). The proposed change at the rear, north side elevation will be nearly invisible from the street, and provides a necessary exit from the building.

Additional Comments

Providing a rear exit from the kitchen in this location will enable the applicant to avoid making harmful changes to the historic interior floor plan. Although the new addition is a porch, the considerations for its design are consistent with the guidelines for new additions, pg. 18 of the Design Guidelines. It is small in proportion, designed to be consistent with other side porches in the district, and will be sympathetic to, but does not duplicate, the historic front porches found on the building.

Whetsel thanked that applicant sent pictures of stoops in the neighborhood. Bolen stated that we do not have pictures of what the porch will look like. There is no description of a railing.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

813 Deery – Kevin Nelson – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 1125084&G

Work Description

Modify newly installed porch rail of turned spindles with flat top and bottom rail, to be height of removed railing sawn spindles and rails. Install 5/4 cap in flat top rail to add decorative detail. Modified rail will be height of pre-existing rail, matched to ghosts showing where sawn wood rail was located.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 1125084&G. Balustrade removed from house several months ago was not original. There is a ghost left from removed railings that shows the height of previous railings. Applicant proposes to replicate that height in the new railing.

Additional Comments

The primary concern with the newly installed railing was that it was not an appropriate height for the structure, and that it had a top railing that was too plain for the building. Reinstalling the railing at a lower height, and adding the decorative top railing will blend it much better with the existing house. Although this building is probably a George Barber design, it has not been located in any pattern books, so the design of the original railing is unknown.

Whetsel thanked Kevin Nelson for correcting the problem. Bolen stated that the spindles should be 26” high. Bennett explained that although the code required height for a railing was more than 26”, there was no requirement for a railing on this porch, because it’s separation from the ground was insufficient to trigger a building codes requirement, and that the shadows of former railing were at varying heights around the porch, planned to look level and compensate for various slopes in the porch floor.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1324 Grainger Avenue – Kevin Nelson - (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 112508ONK

Work Description

Reroof, using asphalt shingles. Install gutters and downspouts. Rebuild chimney, with top corbelling, mistakenly removed from roof.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 112508ONK. Applicant has agreed to rebuild the chimney in its original form, restoring the integrity of masonry elements of the house. The roof and gutter replacement and installation are consistent with design guidelines.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ADDING THAT THE APPLICANT CAN PUT THE CHIMNEY WITHIN 2’ OF WHERE IT WAS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fort Sanders NC-1

1506 Laurel Avenue – Neely Realty Company (Michael Harding), (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 120308FTS

Work Description

Remove enclosed front porch, projecting bay on mansard roofed front-facing dormer, and fire stairs on both side elevations. Rebuild front façade with original depth front porch with shed roof supported by square columns with bases and top molding, wrought metal railing on side elevations, and flat plane front wall of dormer with two windows. Paired entrance doors from front porch to each duplex unit, flanked by small rectangular windows on façade. Remove aluminum siding and replace with vinyl siding, exposing belt course on side elevations and using beveled siding of wider reveal, or material mimicking wood shingles, on top story. Replace all windows with appropriately sized windows. Incorporate covered deck at first floor elevation on rear elevation.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No 120308FTS. Proposed changes will improve the appearance of the building and the street, removing exterior fire stairs and reintroducing an open front porch to the building.

Additional Comments

The original design of the dormer for this house was probably not a front-facing gambrel, although missing artificial covering on the west side has revealed a fairly old section of roof trim that does indicate an original, or at least very early construction time. The bay window was certainly a more contemporary addition, and is proposed for removal. Removal of the second story bay window and fire stairs, as well as the front porch enclosure, will do much to improve the appearance of this building.

Bennett stated that she received a letter from Randall DeFord stating that the neighborhood agrees with the work.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

1701 Jefferson Avenue – Steve Loy – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 120408EDG

Work Description

1) Construct storage shed approximately 12'x20' and about 8' tall on concrete slab with wood lap siding and beadboard or board & batten siding, roof slope to duplicate roof slope of house with metal roof and attached extension, painted to match house. Paired doors in six foot opening visible from Monroe (side street) and window matching house on elevation facing house, either three over one or one over one.

2) Enlarge rear and side deck from 8' to 9'x20' to 12' to 14'x20', matching current floor elevation. Enlarged deck will not be roofed.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 120408EDG. Proposed storage shed is consistent with the adopted design guidelines for the district (see Outbuildings, pg. 29 #13). The addition to the deck will enlarge the existing deck to provide needed seating space.

Additional Comments

The remainder of the items mentioned on this Certificate are included for information only, and do not require a Commission review, since they are Level I activities.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that the neighborhood agrees with staff recommendation

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

Review of National Register nomination for Church Street United Methodist Church.

Bennett stated that the Tennessee Historical Commission will hear the application for church in January. The church is being nominated because of the close association of the history of this area, the architects and stained glass designers. Bennett would like a motion from the commission to authorize her to request that Church Street United Methodist Church be placed on the National Register.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO AUTHORIZE BENNETT TO REQUEST THAT CHURCH STREET UNITED METHODIST BE PLACED ON THE NATIONAL REGISTER IN RECOGNITION OF ITS ARCHITECTURAL SIGNIFICANCE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on January 15, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.