

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF APRIL 17, 2008**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Herb Donaldson
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
John Sanders
Randall DeFord
Jason Canada
Frank Sparkman
Scott Kehne
Trudy Moore
James Pierce
John Stancil
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. None were noted.

- Approval of Minutes – March 20, 2008, meeting

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES.
THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Bennett stated that Cardinal Investment Properties has withdrawn the application for 18 Market Square.

14 Market Square - Market Square H-1, John L. Sanders/Pace Architecture (Applicant) – Certificate No. 40308MKT - Install signboard above storefront, 2'6" by 10", non illuminated.

409 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1, William Meredith, Certificate No. 32708ONK - Remove asbestos shingles and repair existing siding and wood trim if necessary OR repair existing asbestos shingles; repair or replace gutters if necessary; repair or replace roof if necessary.

222 Leonard Place - Old North Knoxville H-1, Billie Lane (Applicant), Certificate No. 32708ONKB - Replace asphalt shingle roof.

2016 Fairmont Blvd. - Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1, Virginia Bamburg (Applicant), Certificate No. 32008FEM - Repair and rebuild one bay portico with gabled roof and arched ceiling, 6x6 wood columns.

2100 Jefferson Ave. - Edgewood-Park City H-1, John Wampler/High Oaks Construction (Applicant), Certificate No. 31708EDG - Repair siding and wood trim as necessary; reroof; add gutters; repair windows; point masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2; replace porch floor, ceiling; all repairs to be kind with like materials.

2318 Jefferson Ave. - Edgewood-Park City H-1, David Kerns (Applicant), Certificate No. 32508EDG - Remove artificial siding; repair original wood siding and window sills as necessary; repoint masonry as necessary, using Preservation Brief No. 2; reroof; install HVAC outside unit on existing pad; install new wood front door with half-view glass; install beadboard front porch ceiling; repair gutters if necessary; remove aluminum storage shed from rear yard; repair rear deck.

2032 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood-Park City, Jason Canada (Applicant), Certificate No.040108EDG - Repair windows as necessary; install imbricated shingles on gable ends; repair siding, corner boards, and skirt boards as necessary; install 8" square wood columns with brackets on front porch, and balustrade of 2x2's on 4-5" centers set into top and bottom rails; install adequate foundation on rear addition, bricked on exterior; repair existing foundation parge coat; install half view wood door; install color clad storm windows; repair or install gutters; repair or install new color-clad storm windows. (Issued 4/1/2008)

1020 Gratz Street - Fourth & Gill H-1, Tom Donaldson (Applicant), Certificate No. 320084&G - Repair or replace poplar wall covering in kind as necessary; replace tongue and groove porch floor in kind.

817 Eleanor Street - Fourth & Gill H-1, Martha Olson, Certificate No. 331084&G – Repair foundation, including portion located under front porch, removing existing porch floor and utilizing temporary plywood covering; repair porch floor with tongue & groove porch flooring.

10809 Second Drive - Village of Concord H-1, David and Carol Russell, Certificate No. 32608CON - Modify existing accessory building of concrete block: add siding to match primary building; replace broken doors; replace windows with double hung windows to match house; add shutters.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General

402, 404, 406, 414, 1011, 1016 11th Street – Jason DeBord (Cardinal Investment Properties, LLC) (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 40108 GEN

Work Description

Repair or replace windows as necessary, duplicating style of window being replaced if replacement is necessary. (Window styles vary among the Seven Houses, and include 1/1, 2/2, 2/1 and 4/4.) Remove glass atrium added to 1011 Laurel at the time of the World's Fair, returning house to its original footprint.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40108GEN. Proposed window repair and replacement are consistent with Standard #6. Removal of the added greenhouse at 1011 Laurel is consistent with Standards #2 & #3. The added greenhouse is inconsistent with the building.

Additional Comments

Standard #6: "Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials."

Standard #2: "The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #3: "Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken."

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

18 Market Square – Michael Brady, Inc. (Applicant), Cardinal Enterprises (Owner) – Certificate No. 40208MKT. **WITHDRAWN**

14 Market Square – John L. Sanders AIA, Sanders Pace Architecture, (Applicant), Allen Grady (Owner) – Certificate No. 40308MKT

Work Description

Install black awning with downlights, no signage or logos, over width of storefront between piers (20'2" and 6' deep).

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40308MKT. Proposed sign and canopy are consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

See Section II.D.1., which allows a sign board located below the second story window sills and above the storefront, and II.E.2.-4, which allows canopies above the display windows and below the storefront cornice or sign panel, between the piers.

John Sanders, 14 Market Square, noted the description of the awning should be that it is 6' deep with a recessed width of 10'5".

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

447 N. Broadway – Randall DeFord (Applicant) Minvilla Manor, LP, Ginny Weatherstone, President (Owner) – Certificate No. 40208GEN

Work Description

NOTE: To assist in describing the two sections of the buildings Allan Associates Architects PLLC has used the terms Building A and Building B. Building A is the portion of the building facing North Broadway. Building B is the portion of the building facing West Fifth Avenue.

Façade: Brick façade will be cleaned and repaired in accordance with the recommendations of the National Park Service’s Preservation Briefs; the brick will be repainted. Due to possible damage to the original brick façade, stuccoed portions of the façade will be cleaned and repainted. Existing windows will be restored; missing windows will be replaced with compatible new windows. One non-original window opening in the east end projecting bay of Building B will be removed and the opening filled in with brick and mortar to match that of the adjacent wall. Missing stone sills will be replaced. Metal cornice will be cleaned, repaired and repainted.

Porches: Brick piers will be repaired as described in the section on Brick Façade. Wood ceiling, brackets and cornice features will be repaired and replaced where missing. Enough molding and trim remain to replicate the missing portions.

Building A: the original porch floors and floor structure were removed in the 1960s to create a common lobby for both buildings at a new elevation between the basement and first floor. Much of the original porch material remains above the floor level. Because the first floor of Building A will be used as the main and accessible entrance to both buildings, no aspect of these porch floors are planned to be restored. Instead, a concrete porch floor will be installed at the level of the original building floor. This new porch floor will be linked with a new ramp to provide an accessible entrance to both buildings and a single set of concrete steps and brick wing walls with brick caps will be built at one end.

Building B: These front porches will have their original floors restored in elevation and material, with the following exception. There are two sets of concrete steps and brick wing walls with concrete caps which we propose to leave in place. Three of these porch floors have been raised a few inches; we propose to return these to their original level and wood flooring. The floor of Building B is at one level and the porches of Building B were originally all at another level a few inches below the building floor level. New concrete steps and brick wing walls with brick caps will be provided from the sidewalk to the porches.

While we possess physical evidence of most of the various architectural elements of the front porches, no portions of the porch railings exist. We have been unable to locate any historic photos of the building. The only evidence we have of porch railing is the shadow on the brick piers. There is an ‘over paint’ shadow of the vertical board which the rail abutted.

That shadow confirms the existence of a rail and its height. Our proposed rail is intended to suggest a simple and compatible reference to a historic wood porch rail without creating a false sense of history by using an elaborately turned spindle for which we have no documentation on these buildings.

Additions: Buildings A and B will be linked by a corridor and elevator core. This addition will be recessed away from the North Broadway façade to reduce visual impact. The painted brick addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

A new exit stair will be built behind the Building B near Queen Street in order to have a low visual impact upon the structure. The stair will be accessed via covered open air corridors placed in an area that would have originally been a recessed area between two townhouses. The painted brick addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

A new stair will be built behind Building A to meet exiting requirements with a low visual impact upon the structure. The stair will be placed in an area that would have originally been a recessed area between two townhouses. The addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

Demolition: Existing non original concrete and metal stairs will be removed. Additionally, on the rear of Building A, one of the original recessed exterior areas that would have been between two individual townhouses has been filled in with an enclosed addition. The enclosure closes off the originally open end of this area with a wood frame wall and clad with stucco. This frame addition, porch roof and concrete steps will be removed in order to return back of this portion of Building A to its original appearance.

Site

The entire rear area will be fenced with a 42-48 inch ornamental metal fence to provide security. The Building B (West Fifth Avenue) façade will receive a 42-48 inch ornamental metal fence and gates between the porches and city sidewalk.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40208GEN. The proposed changes are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards adopted as design guidelines for this property.

Additional Comments

The project that centers around this building will meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards adopted as design guidelines, and has been reviewed at the state and National level for conformity with those Standards.

Randall DeFord, 1511 Laurel Avenue, stated that he is a consultant and Allan Associates are the architects. They are going through the National Park Service seeking tax credits.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2032 Jefferson Avenue – Jason Canada (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 040108EDG

Work Description

Remove unoriginal kitchen window on east side addition; remove rear bathroom window on first floor; install skylight on rear, west side, not visible from Jefferson (hidden by dormer).

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 040108EDG. Work proposed in Level II is consistent with approved Design guidelines; Level I certificate was issued 4/2/08.

Additional Comments

Applicant proposes to remove two windows, one on the rear elevation and one unoriginal window on an addition at the rear of the building; neither window is readily visible from the street, with the only original window being completely hidden on the rear elevation. Both are desirable to increase the efficiency of the interior floor plan. (See Windows, pg. 15, Design Guidelines)

Proposed skylight is at the rear of the side roof elevation, behind a larger dormer, and will not be visible from Jefferson, meeting the design guidelines provisions (see Roofs, Pg. 15, #5.)

Bennett stated that the applicant wishes to build a garage at the back of the property. There is a bump out on the east elevation with a kitchen window that is not original and that the applicant wants to remove, and a rear bathroom window he also wants to remove. He wants to install a skylight that will not be visible from Jefferson.

David Canada, 2032 Jefferson, stated that he gave Bennett the porch design. He brought pictures of the bump out where they want to remove the window to show the commissioners. His son, Jason, wants to do straight columns and needs guidance with the brackets. Bennett stated that we do not know what was there originally. He would rather use the straight column with the bracket.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue representing the neighborhood, stated that the neighborhood understands what is being proposed and agrees with the applicant’s request.

Bennett confirmed that the applicant intends to use straight square columns with no splayed bottom and bracket that matches others on the house on the front porch. The roof pitch of the garage will match the 6/12 on the house.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION USING STRAIGHT SQUARE COLUMNS TO THE BASE AND BRACKETS THAT MATCH THE OTHERS ON THE FRONT PORCH. THE ROOF PITCH OF THE GARAGE WILL MATCH THE 6/12 PITCH ON THE HOUSE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1

2020 Emoriland Boulevard – Jordan Reagan/Reagan Investments (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 31208FEM - Construct new two story house, approximate 15' side yard on east and approximate 5' on west; front yard setback same as measurements of house on either side to front corner; siding (aluminum, vinyl, Hardi-plank smooth, or wood) to resemble wood, brick faced foundation, one over one windows; hipped roof with front gable (either asphalt shingle or metal roof); eight foot deep. Shed roof full front porch with paired square wood columns and sawn wood railing with rails set into top and bottom rails; rear deck; half view glass front door. If driveway is constructed, it will terminate in rear yard.

Work Description

Construct new two-story house, approximate 15' side yard on east and approximate 5' on west; front yard setback same as measurements of house on either side to front corner; siding (aluminum, vinyl, Hardi-plank smooth, or wood) to resemble wood, brick faced foundation, one over one windows; hipped roof with front gable (either asphalt shingle or metal roof); 8' deep. Shed roof full front porch with paired square wood columns and sawn wood railing with rails set into top and bottom rails; rear deck; half view glass front door. If driveway is constructed, it will terminate in rear yard.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 31208FEM. The proposed house design is an appropriate interpretation of the Colonial Revival style detailed in the Matrix of Prevalent House Styles and Design Features, pg. 6 of the Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

The proposed site plan shows the house located to one side of the lot to allow driveway access to the rear yard.

Steve Cotham has not met with the owner and likes the plans but wants the owner to build a driveway. Bennett stated that the builder did move the plan of the house over so a driveway could be put in. Parking pads are not acceptable. Wall covering on the house might be wood or Hardiplank. NC-1 allows both.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND TO ASK THAT THE SETBACK BE 5' ON THE WEST SIDE TO ALLOW FOR THE DRIVEWAY. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Tazewell Pike NC-1

4226 Tazewell Pike - Cliff Sands (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 30208TAZ

Work Description

Construction of secondary (accessory) structure, approximately 20x37 feet, with gable end, shingled roof, siding to match existing house, foundation slab or to match existing home foundation if matching material can be found, with overhead garage door. Accessory building to be located approximately 180 feet from Tazewell Pike, and 5 feet from side line.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 21208TAZ. Proposed outbuilding is located to the side and well to the rear of the existing primary structure on the lot. Applicant is matching the materials on the existing building (see pgs. 8 & 9 of design guidelines).

Additional Comments

Even though it is well back of the existing dwelling and will not be visible from Tazewell Pike, the proposed accessory structure is consistent with the design guidelines.

Cliff Sands, 4226 Tazewell Pike, stated that he will try to match the stone on the front of the house. He asked if he could move the garage back to more level ground.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

409 E. Oklahoma – William Meredith (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 32708ONK

Work Description

Replace window in front gable roof. Replace windows in block building (non-contributing) located to the rear of primary building and not visible from E. Oklahoma; install vinyl siding on block building.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 32708ONK. If the attic window is changed, a specific design will call for more information than was provided in this application. The Design Guidelines, pg. 29, Accessory Buildings, call for wood siding and windows.

Additional Comments

Applicant has indicated that window in front gable of the house is deteriorated and in need of replacement. If he chooses to replace this window, the new window should be consistent with the architecture of the building, and any grandfathering that accompanies the existing window will be lost. Originally, the front gable would have had a very small glassed opening or louvered

shutter, since the attic space was probably converted to living space long after the house was built. Code requirements for a bedroom opening would include a minimum 5.7 sq. ft. of open exit space, with minimum dimensions of no smaller than 20" in width and 22" in height. An exact size and design must be submitted in order to allow an adequate review.

Tom Reynolds, City Chief Building Inspector, stated that he has been talking to Mr. Meredith and has made a site visit. Mr. Meredith said the house used to be addressed as 411 E. Oklahoma, so Reynolds researched both 409 and 411 to find building permits that would create a grandfathered situation for the multiple apartments at that address. Reynolds stated he could not find a building permit for it to be a multifamily, so a building permit allowing repair of a multifamily could not be issued. When a use is not grandfathered, the owner is allowed to

respond with evidence that establishes a legal use. This house was apparently converted illegally to a multifamily dwelling. Since in 1962, the city directories indicate the house was single family, and no permit has been obtained to change the use to multifamily, the house is not grandfathered, and only two dwelling units would be allowed on the property, consistent with the current base zoning of the area.

Bennett explained that because the use issues are still being determined, there is not an explanation of the window would go in the front gable. She is recommending that the Commission deny the request for the attic window replacement without prejudice. James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, representing the neighborhood, stated that they agreed with staff recommendation.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE THE FRONT ATTIC WINDOW AND TO DENY AS INAPPROPRIATE THE REMAINING PART OF THE APPLICATION. THE MOTION WAS ADOPTED.

1518 Broadway - Malleharris LLC, J Myers Morton (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 40308ONK

Work Description

Use cementitious siding because wood siding is not available to execute siding design approved at Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting of November 15, 2007.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40308ONK.

Additional Comments

Although the design guidelines adopted for Old North Knoxville specify wood siding, there are three mitigating factors in the case of this building - 1) only half of the building is in the historic overlay; 2) the building was built in an era when non-traditional building materials were commonly used; and 3) the applicant (Frank Sparkman, architect for the project) made the Commission aware at the November 15, 2007, meeting that he did not know if wood to execute this design was reasonably available; Sparkman and the commission noted that it would be

possible to revisit the type of materials used if securing wood siding became a problem. The current design and materials are not in keeping with the overall design of Old North Knoxville, and the appearance of the building will be improved by the installation of new materials contemplated in this certificate.

Bennett the applicant was not able to find a replacement that would match. They will use cementitious wood siding materials.

Frank Sparkman, Sparkman Architects, 3991 Midland Avenue, stated that this is not a historic building, and they have two choices of materials. Wood would be a problem to use. This will be traditional looking lapsiding made out of cementitious material.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place representing Old North Knoxville, stated that the neighborhood appreciates the owner's consideration of wood siding on this building. The building is half in and half out of the district, so we concur without using wood because it is not completely in the district. Grieve stated that he is pleased with the use of the cementitious board which could be historic in 50 years.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

1164 Armstrong (Armstead Pl.) – Scott Kehne, Farmers Mutual of Tennessee – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 32608GEN

Work Description

Demolish designated structure.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 32608GEN. Proposed demolition is not consistent with adopted Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

Farmer's Mutual (Mr. Kehne's firm) purchased 1164 Armstrong in March 2005. The building was in poor condition then, and its condition has not improved since there has been no maintenance since 2005.

Some time after it purchased the property, Farmer's Mutual indicated a desire to demolish the building in order to accommodate a retention basin in connection with proposed construction at the corner of Broadway and Wells (not included in an H-1 overlay). Mr. Kehne offered the building for removal to another lot in the Old North area; the costs of moving it could not be recouped in the sales price, and no appropriate location was found for the building. Old North then worked with Mr. Kehne to allow provide for landscaping and other buffering, both on the H-1 lot and on the adjacent undesignated parcel. The initial design proposed by Farmer's Mutual was a brick office building with limited front yard parking and heavy landscaping, which could have been acceptable to Old North. In the current proposal, the undesignated parcel appears to contain more front yard parking and diminished landscaping. However, that site plan and the design of the building are not the subject of this review, since that property is undesignated.

Under the currently submitted proposal, the lot at 1164 Armstrong, which is designated, will be used for 7 parking spaces and a dumpster. The south and west sides of the dumpster will be screened with "Otto Luyken" Laurels, while the parking area to the west will be ringed with alternating Sky Pencil Hollies and Dwarf Boxwoods. Access to the parking will be screened on the west with Viburnum and Thornless Honeylocust. On the north and west sides of the detention pond will be Foster Hollies on an 11' spacing. The bottom of the detention pond will be sodded. Sweetbay magnolias will be the three easternmost trees at the eastern south side of the detention pond. Along Broadway will be two Cloud Nine Dogwoods. The corner of Broadway and Wells will be planted with two Kousa Dogwoods and Otto Luyken Laurel. Three

additional trees on the Wells side of the parcel will be planted with Washington Hawthorns. The trees that are called out are generally 15-20 feet tall, while most of the shrubs are 8-10' tall, all at maturity. They will adequately buffer the residential properties to the west, although granting demolition of the building at 1164 Armstrong will not guarantee that the applicant's new building will be constructed or the landscaping installed.

Arning stated that he has received three emails concerning the building be torn down, and they support the applicant's recommendation. Bennett stated that one problem is the original address was Armstead Place, but Armstead Place was closed by City Council, and is the only access to the lot. The house is now addressed on Armstrong.

Scott Kehne, representing Farmers Mutual of Tennessee, Broadway and Wells. He distributed plans for a new building. He described the proposed building plans to the commission. The new City Stormwater Ordinance required them to acquire the house for a retention basin. They have met with the Old Knoxville group several times. Some residents are for their plans and some are against. Old North residents suggested they have an NC-1 put on it, but Farmer's Mutual decided not to. David Brace, Knoxville Public Service Department, suggested that 1164 Armstrong be demolished. It is not economically feasible for them to restore this house, and there is no public street access. The property would still be in H-1, and we would only pave it for a parking lot and landscaping. Busby asked if the house could be used for residential. Mr. Kehne stated that the access would be through their parking lot.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place representing the neighborhood, stated that the Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Association exists to preserve the neighborhood. They cannot support the removal of a historic structure. They have tried to come to some kind of an agreement. They verified at their last meeting that if the owner would allow the property to have an H-1 overlay put on it, they would not oppose the demolition.

Whetsel stated that she was on the Historic Zoning Commission when the application came before us last time. Nothing has been done in a year to the house, and you cannot drive to it. This building would secure the corner and offer more security to preserve the houses behind it. We need to preserve the Broadway corridor. She supports the demolition. She asked Mr. Kehne if the commission approves the demolition, would the new building be built. He stated that Farmer's Mutual intends to build after these problems are resolved.

Grieve stated that having his office located on Emory Place, there is a lot of development there. He agrees with Whetsel that the commission would like to see a business on Broadway. Any time a new building goes in, it is hard to build because retention ponds are required. He commended them on their plans for this new building and supports demolition of the property.

Bennett stated one of the concerns is that the neighborhood wants more than verbal assurance that this building will be built. Boyce added that if the commission votes to demolish, it could be sold unless there are conditions put on it. Gresham stated that the commission either consent to tear it down, or it will come down by itself in a few years. We should get rid of it quickly.

Mr. Pierce stated that the cost of moving it would be prohibitive. The owner would have the responsibility to move it. It was their intent to demolish it when they bought it, and it is their fault it has been neglected.

Bolin stated that the Old North neighborhood does not want the house demolished without some assurance that the integrity of the entrance to the neighborhood will be protected, and one concession would be to make it H-1 overlay for the entire property. Mr. Kehne stated that their board believed that it could affect the future impact of the property; the board of Farmers' Mutual has rejected the offer of H-1 for the property. We have owned it two years and have secured the house. The homeless have broken a hole in the foundation and are using the basement for shelter.

Bennett appreciates that the Old North Knoxville Board has worked with the owners concerning this situation. The Commissioners have the responsibility to uphold the H-1 designation, if possible. She asked Boyce what condition could be put on the application. Boyce stated that the commission can put a condition on it that Farmer's Mutual would definitely build the building.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL NOT TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND ALLOW DEMOLITION OF THIS PROPERTY. THE MOTION PASSED SEVEN TO TWO. BUSBY (YES), DONALDSON (YES), GRIEVE (YES), MARTIN (YES), MCADAMS (YES), SAUNDERS (YES), WHETSEL (YES), ARNING (NO) AND BOLEN (NO).

Fourth & Gill H-1

1310 Luttrell – Trudy Moore – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 403084&G

Work Description

Construct one story gable roof garage, roof pitch to match house, wood shingle wall covering. Clopay custom overhead doors to mimic carriage house, building turned to avoid direct door opening on Luttrell. In-ground pool.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 403084&G.

Additional Comments

The design guidelines, pg. 19, Outbuildings #1, provide that simple one story garages are appropriate in the Fourth and Gill Historic District, provided their size and construction materials are consistent with the primary building on the lot.

Applicant proposes to install an in-ground pool with a pool deck resembling stone, in the large front/side yard on corner of Luttrell and Glenwood, with garage behind it and turned so it does not open directly on Luttrell. The corner of Glenwood and Luttrell is a major neighborhood entrance.

Although the design of the garage and the pool are consistent with the design guidelines and appropriate to the district, the location of the pool at a major neighborhood entrance may not be appropriate. The adopted design guidelines do not address this issue, providing only that outbuildings should be built at the rear of lots in Fourth & Gill.

Bennett stated that since the application was made, there has been discussion with building codes about the setbacks, and Ms. Moore should modify the site plans. She confirms she would like a denial without prejudice. Bennett will change the staff recommendation to deny without prejudice to give her time to revise the plans for the setbacks.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO DENY THE APPLICATION WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on May 15, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.