

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2007

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Herb Donaldson
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel
Lila Wilson

Members Absent:

Scott Busby (ex.)
Linda Claussen (ex.)
Steve Cotham (ex.)
Duane Grieve (ex.)

County HZC Present

Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
Sean Martin
Ray Snyder
John Stancil
Isa Infante
Elizabeth Eason
James Pierce
Jason DeBord
Lawrence and Nancy
Fitzpatrick
Bill Pittman
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Arning (Knoxville HZC Chairman) called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

- Approval of Minutes – August 16, 2007, meeting

A MOTION WAS MADE BY SAUNDERS AND SECONDED BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 16, 2007 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

721 Luttrell Street - Fourth & Gill H-1, JACWAL Enterprises, Applicant. Certificate No.813074&G. To replace existing siding as needed. Paint the exterior of home. Repair guttering as needed. Mortar and point on home as needed. To reinforce and finish porch. To update exterior lighting. Light landscaping. Possible extension of back porch, with future approval by Commission.

821 Deery Street - Fourth & Gill H-1, Patrick McInturff, Applicant. Certificate No. 905074&G. Repair porch roof, installing consistent shingle roofing; repair porch structure, ceiling and flooring in kind as necessary; repair porch posts, spindles and column boxes (piers) in kind; install code compliant stairs (wood, brick or concrete replacement) with closed risers; repair secondary entrance stairs and posts; install handrails as necessary, using metal pipe rails.

1129 Harvey- Old North Knoxville H-1, Allen Harris, Applicant. Certificate No. 82107ONK. Replace oversize, deteriorated siding with 4-5" lap poplar siding; patterned wood shingles in gable ends, corner boards, trim, fascia and soffit; replace front porch deck with wood, reinstall existing columns and railing of square pickets, 2"x2", set into top and bottom rail.

2041 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1, Kevin Nelson, Applicant. Certificate No. 82207EDG. Remove layers of artificial siding to determine underlying materials, additions, and missing features. Applicant is formulating plans for complete rehabilitation and will be back before the commission when those plans have been completed.

1907 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1, George Carter, Applicant. Certificate No. 82407EDG. Repair and reinstall existing front porch railing, repair gutters, repair and reinforce supports on back porch; repair existing shutters.

213 Deaderick Street - Mechanicsville H-1, Blaine Hopkins, Applicant, Certificate No. 80907MEC. Remove asbestos shingles and assess condition and style of original siding. NOTE: Applicant understands that further review will be necessary after selective removal of the artificial shingles and assessment of the condition of original materials.

151 Major Reynolds Place – General, Gina Lesniak, Applicant. Certificate No. 83007GEN. Replace lettering and background on all existing signs and lettering on building, changing from AmSouth to Regions', with size, placement, and lettering size to remain consistent.

35 Market Square - Market Square H-1, David Brown (Applicant). Certificate No. 82107MKT. 6'x18" channel lettering mounted on building; lettering on store window (no more than 30%).

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General

601 W. Summit Hill - Old City Hall Partnership (Bill Owen) (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 82807GEN

Description of Work

Replace bottom sash of windows (not original, but installed c. 1980) in order to make windows operable. Complete general exterior woodwork repairs in kind if needed.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 82807GEN. The original windows were removed in the course of past rehabilitations of the building. The current owners intend to convert the fixed bottom sash to a moveable sash; the basic window will not change.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECONDED BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth & Gill

1305 Luttrell Street - Warren Ince, Michael Brady, Inc. Architects (Applicant) – Brownlow Lofts, LLC (Owner) – 830074&G4

Description of Work

Create rooftop deck behind parapet wall on northeast elevation of building, using existing window and opening to create access door and installing plain dark-painted pipe rail above parapet wall. NOTE: Conversion of window to door will be hidden behind parapet wall, as will items on deck. Deck will not be visible except for pipe rail used at top of parapet wall to bring balustrade height in compliance with codes.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 830074&G. Proposed change to original plan will allow access through a door to the rooftop, but the only changes will be the substitution of a door for a window and the addition of the pipe rail, which will be unobtrusive.

Additional Comments

Both proposed changes are readily correctible in the future; applicant will obtain a door that is consistent with pane configuration of replacement windows.

Jason DeBord, 3828 Dellwood Drive, stated he decided to change the window to an access door and, for safety issues is adding the railing that will be as unobtrusive as possible. He had talked to the neighbors who said they thought the tenants would try to go out on the roof through the window even if it was not a door. Whetsel stated that the neighborhood is in agreement with this plan. DeBord stated that the interior construction has started, and a model will be ready soon.

Sean Bolen stated that this side is perceived as being the front of the building. His concern is making a deck on the front might set a precedent. Arning stated that each case stands on its own. Bennett added that this building is unique because of the additions made in the 1920s; this configuration is not repeated on buildings currently designated. Whetsel added that she feels the pipe railing will be transparent.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

934 Luttrell Street – Lawrence and Nancy Fitzpatrick (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 904074&G

Description of Work

Redesign front porch to duplicate the original, using shingled column bases, round wood or composite columns, Doric capitals, and a compound railing of turned wood spindles set into a

base board, with a pierced top railing. Install lattice screening in the two bays on the side porch (south elevation) between the porch columns to provide a privacy screen, utilizing an oval cut-out in each lattice screen.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 904074&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

The design guidelines require that porches be repaired or replaced with duplicating wood floors, balustrades, posts and columns and allow for reconstruction consistent with the neighborhood context. (pg. 12, Porches, #1). Guidelines also allow for partial enclosure with lattice encompassing not more than one-third of the linear distance. (pg. 12, Porches, #7). The proposed enclosure is on the side, and does not block the view from the front or back; the openness of the porch will be preserved.

Whetsel stated that the neighborhood approves. Sean Bolen stated he is pleased with the porch design.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SSECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

601 Gill Avenue – Isa Infante/Ray Snyder (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 906074&G

Description of Work

Install small shed roof stoop at rear door, supported by wood elbow brackets.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 906074&G. Applicant and Community Development have worked to create a design that is small and as unobtrusive as possible, while still offering protection from the weather. The new design is typical of Craftsman houses.

Additional Comments

The rear porch of this Craftsman house was enclosed many years ago, and the rear door is in deed of protection from the weather. Because the house is situated on the corner of Gill and Eleanor, any change at the rear entry will be visible from Eleanor and possibly Gill. However, the owner is also in need of weather protection for the rear door. The proposed addition of the roof at the rear entry will provide weather protection, while being small enough, and appropriate to the style of the house, so that it will not be obvious. The proposed redesign will achieve that without calling attention to the missing rear porch.

Ray Snyder, City of Knoxville Community Development, stated that the plan is to remove the existing deck and put a stoop in its place. This will protect the door. Modifications are necessary because when it rains, the water comes in the house interior. Whetsel stated that it meets the

guidelines and certainly meets the personal needs of the applicant, but it does not contribute to the historic fabric of the neighborhood.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

807 Gratz Street – Elizabeth Eason, Architect (Applicant) – John and Judith Neff (Owner) – Certificate No. 906074&GB

Description of Work

Construct new single family residence Craftsman-style residence: One and one-half story frame with cement fiberboard lap siding. Front gable 12/18 roof with telescoping front gables with fiber cement shakes in gable ends and on side of dormers; dormers are gabled side dormers; knee braces under front telescoping gables; roof covering is fiberglass shingles. Brick faced foundation. Splayed posts on piers on front elevation porch. Bay window on north elevation. Tripled one over one windows in some locations on all elevations, tripled single pane windows on front elevation, dormer and rear gable are single pane, some doubled, with three smaller panes at top of windows. Height of foundation approximately 12"; height, ground to eaves approximately 11', overall height approximately 25'. Front setback 20', side setback on south - 5' and on north 8'. Depth of front porch approximately 10'.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 906074&GB. Proposed house is consistent with adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines. The materials, roof shape, width, scale, massing, foundation and story height, porch depth, windows and trim details are appropriate.

Additional Comments

The materials and design of the proposed new construction are consistent with the following guideline provisions: Siding, pg. 14, #3; Infill Buildings, pg. 16-18 inclusive; Porches, pg. 12, #3 & #4; Entrances, pg. 13, #1, 4; Roofs, pg. 10, #1, 2 & 4.

Elizabeth Eason, 130 W. Jackson Avenue, is representing the Neff's who live next door. Whetsel asked why the small windows on the front are so different from the other windows. She would like to see one over one on the front of the house. There has not been a formal neighborhood meeting, but they are pleased about the infill housing. The Commission discussed a modification to change three single pane ribbon window on south side of front porch to either paired or tripled one over one double hung windows, same individual window size as windows to north side of front porch.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ADDING THAT EASON WILL CHANGE THE WINDOW DESIGN SOUTH OF THE FRONT PORCH WITH THE OPTION OF MIMICKING

THE SOUTH SIDE PAIRED OR TRIPLE WINDOWS . THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1

2013 Emoriland Boulevard – Certificate No. 82407FPK – Timothy Doyle - (Contractor/Applicant)

Description of Work

Construct in-kind 12x12 addition to primary structure, located on rear elevation and not visible from Emoriland Boulevard.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 82407FPK. Proposed addition is located to the rear of non-conforming house, and will not be visible from Emoriland Boulevard. The existing building was built prior to designation and does not conform to adopted guidelines.

Additional Comments

Section 3. A. 1 provides that the design of additions should be consistent with the character of the main structure, and 3. A. 4 recommends that additions be located on the rear or side of existing buildings. Both those conditions are met by the proposed addition.

Timothy Doyle stated the immediate neighbors are pleased with the proposed addition.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1414 Cornelia Avenue - Bill Pittman – (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 83007ONK

Description of Work

Restore original character of Craftsman Bungalow by installing 8" square wood columns with applied moldings to replicate Doric capitals and a wood rail with wide board (1"x4" with 6" or slightly greater spacing) balustrade, set into top and bottom rail, using existing metal posts as base for columns and building wood box around them, respecting size of shadow appearing on porch floor.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 83007ONK. Proposed porch design will remove an inappropriate balustrade and porch posts, and substitute an architecturally appropriate redesign. The proposed design is consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

The Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines, pg. 17, C. 1. Porches, calls for wood posts and sawn wood balustrades on front porches.

Bill Pittman, 7605 Holman Ridge representing his son, stated that they want to make the house look better by taking the wrought iron off the porch and putting the columns back. James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, thanked Pittman for returning the columns. Pierce stated that the neighborhood would like for the iron columns to be boxed in. Pittman stated that he will install the columns as close to the original as possible. The rails will be the correct code height. Wilson stated he will do a good job. Bolen thanked Pittman for the work he is doing in the neighborhood.

MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on October 18, 2007, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.