

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF OCTOBER 18, 2007

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Scott Busby
Herb Donaldson
Duane Grieve
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel
Lila Wilson

Members Absent:

Sean Bolen (ex.)
Linda Claussen (ex.)
Kenneth Gresham (ex.)

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Lynne Sullivan
Catherine Sell
Alyssa Rosenquist
Robert Marlino
Gregor Smee
Mike Harding
Randall DeFord
Jim Garland
Marsha Bartlett
John Stancil
Jamie Rowe
James Pierce
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Arning (Knoxville HZC Chairman) called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

- Approval of Minutes – September 20, 2007, meeting

Whetsel stated that on page 5 of the September 20 minutes she would like this sentence added. “Whetsel stated that it meets the guidelines and certainly meets the personal needs of the applicant, but it does not contribute to the historic fabric of the neighborhood.”

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECONDED BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS AMENDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that the Park Ridge neighborhood is having a home tour on October 28 from 1-6 featuring eight houses, including two the Knox Heritage houses that have been refurbished.

- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning
There was no report.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

806 Luttrell Street, Fourth & Gill H-1, Hunter Jackson, Certificate No. 925074&G. Repair/rebuild existing deck at rear of house, not visible from Luttrell.

217 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville H-1, Joe MacDonald, Certificate No. 91207ONK. Repair exterior rear roof and walls where falling tree caused damage to structure.

315 E. Scott Avenue, Old North Knoxville H-1, Paul Delahunt, Certificate No. 91307ONK. Repair roof; repair existing windows; install color clad storm windows; repoint brick, using Preservation Brief No. 2; add small addition to rear deck, not visible from Scott; repair or replace in kind front steps and walkway; repair wood trim in kind as necessary.

229 Deaderick Street, Mechanicsville H-1, Smee Busby, Certificate No.100407MEC. Install codes compliant sawn wood porch railing with square balusters set into top and bottom rails.

327 Union Avenue, Market Square H-1, Pat McHugh, Certificate No.100407MKTB. Install hanging sign, 2x3, indirectly lighted with gooseneck fixture. Sign painted wood or metal frame.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Edgewood Park City

1912 Washington Avenue – Lynne Sullivan (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 10207EDG

Description of Work

Construct one story enclosed porch, behind north facing front ell, not apparent from either Washington Avenue or side street, with standing seam metal roof, brick piers with lattice infill, wood windows and doors with wood windows to resemble one over one double hung windows in existing house, triangular transom window on west façade, antique (c.1890) doors, fishscale on west gable, diagonal bead board panels below windows, accessed through already altered window from interior, with current exterior walls unmodified.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 10207EDG. Proposed porch addition is not visible from Washington Avenue, does minimal disturbance to original materials on historic structure, and is designed to complement historic architecture of structure.

Additional Comments

The adopted design guidelines for the Edgewood-Park City H-1 call for new additions to be on an inconspicuous side of the historic building, limited in size and scale, to be designed so that they are clearly a new addition that is compatible with the existing building and to avoid altering the basic character of the building. (pg. 29, #12, 13 and 14). The proposed addition meets all of these recommendations.

Lynne Sullivan, 1912 Washington Avenue, stated that she wants to build the porch because there is no exit from that side of the house.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that he has looked at the plan and is pleased with the design. He feels the porch will increase the value of the house.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1230 Armstrong Avenue – Catherine Sell (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 100407ONK

Description of Work

Remove first floor picture window and replace with three one over one double hung wood windows; remove aluminum siding and repair wood siding elements in kind; remove handicapped ramp; install one over one 32"x54" wood double hung window in front gable.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE all requested items except window in front gable. Remainder of requested items are consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Applicant has requested that she be allowed to remove aluminum siding and repair wood siding (Wall coverings, E1, 5 & 12) and replace added picture window on front elevation with three double hung wood windows (Windows, B2). Applicant has also requested to add a wood double hung 32x54 window in the front facing gable, which is now allowed under the design guidelines. Windows, B5 does allow installing additional windows, but specifies they must be on a rear or inconspicuous elevation.

Bennett recommended denial for a 32x54 window because she is not sure the opening will meet fire codes. If it will not work, the applicant will have to come back next month.

Catherine Sell, 1230 Armstrong Avenue, who is the applicant, stated she has learned about window sizes and if it is not up to codes, she will change it. Bennett stated that she wants to replace the front door.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that Old North Knoxville approves.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE CONDITION OF THE WINDOW SIZE TO BE DETERMINED AND WITH THE ADDITION OF THE FRONT DOOR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth and Gill H-1

936 Eleanor Street – Alyssa Rosenquist (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 1004074&G

Description of Work

Rebuild front porch to full width with pediment at front steps, 8' depth, tapered round wood columns, turned spindles in balustrade, tongue in groove floor, beadboard ceiling, lattice panels between brick piers, wood steps with boxed risers; repair wood siding in kind with imbricated shingles in gable of house and porch pediment; full view storm door; remove door to addition; restore side addition roof (north elevation).

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 1004074&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

Applicant has been unable to locate photographic documentation of the original front porch. In addition, the siding on the bottom half of the front façade has been replaced, obliterating any shadows of the original front porch configuration. She has done careful research on other neighborhood houses and in pattern books in order to determine a design for the front porch. She has also worked with a contractor to ascertain costs for all of the improvements she would like to make, and has decided that she must proceed with reconstructing the front porch in two phases. The resulting front porch will be an acceptable solution when the first phase is complete, and will lend itself to the construction of the remainder of the front porch in several years; that complete front porch, when both Phase I and Phase II have been accomplished, will be an acceptable design for the style and age of the house. That is the design that is being presented today. (See Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, Porches pg. 12, #1, #2; Entrances pg. 13, #5; Wall Coverings pg. 14, #2, #3, #6).

Bennett stated that this is the same resubmission from a few months ago. There are photographs now. The applicant will do Phase 1 now and Phase 2 later. Alyssa Rosenquist, 936 Eleanor Street, stated that her budget will not allow her to complete the whole front porch right now. The porch is rotting and she will only do Phase 1 now.

Whetsel has met with her and has talked to Sean Martin, and the neighborhood is in agreement. She commended her work. She asked Rosenquist what the roof on the back is going to look like. It will be a shed roof with a rubber membrane.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square

4 Market Square – Smee Busby (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No.100407MKT

Description of Work

Install 10' deep awning in front of central bay of combined #4 and #8 buildings, covering the outdoor seating only, and broken at the building lines. The top of the awning will be at the bottom of the higher transoms, and will not cover the divided light transoms. The awning will be in one color, with a full enclosure removable in the warmer months. Install grease trap at north rear elevation, removing and replacing in duplicate park features of sidewalk, lighting, landscaping and brick wall.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 100407MKT with modifications.

Additional Comments

The awning covers approximately 1/3 of the three storefronts as is appropriate for Market Square storefronts. The shape of the awning is typical of those in historic photographs of Market Square, and sized comparably to other Market Square awnings. The design guidelines do not deal with temporary enclosure of the awnings. In addition, the grease trap installation is approvable, with replacement of all altered landscape features, provided extreme caution is exercised in excavating for the grease trap. It is located adjacent to a load-bearing brick wall which may not have footers. Therefore, adequate shoring should be utilized to prevent the collapse of the brick wall.

Bennett stated that they want to enclose the awning in the winter. HZC guidelines do not mention these, but fire marshal does.

Robert Marlino and Gregor Smee, 29 Market Street, are the architects. They will take precautions about the brick wall. They will get approval from the fire marshal. Marlino stated that the awning will have a break at each building line. It will be one color and not striped. Andy Ray is pleased with the plan and glad Johnson and Galyon is the contractor.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH BUSBY RECUSING.

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1204 Laurel Avenue – Neely Realty Company (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 92707FTSA

Description of Work

Reroof, removing chimney. Replace artificial siding with artificial siding that includes corner boards and wide trim at windows, shingles in front facing cross gable. Remove enclosed front porch, reconstructing original depth front porch with square paneled columns on brick piers, shed roof. Install new replacement windows and three-quarter light front door.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 92707FTSA. Proposed rehabilitation is consistent with the Ft. Sanders adopted guidelines, and will return the original front yard and front porch to this block of Laurel, resulting in an improved appearance for Laurel Avenue.

Additional Comments

The adopted guidelines for Ft. Sanders allow for artificial siding. The provisions for porches (pg. 8, #1 & #2) are that the porch must complement pre-1940 housing, and must be 6-10 feet deep. Wall materials (pg. 9, #2) may be clapboard-like materials such as aluminum or vinyl, and shingle-like material. Windows and entrances (pg. 10, #1, 2 and 9) are to be appropriate for pre-1940 styles, and should be double hung (with vinyl or metal-clad windows allowed), and entrances provided from the street. Roofs (pg. 7, #3) may be asphalt shingle; no provisions are made for retaining chimneys.

Mike Harding, 2718 Painter Avenue, stated that he has done the houses next door and is trying to improve the neighborhood.

Randall DeFord, 1511 Laurel Avenue, stated they are asking that the old front porch gable remain. Harding asked DeFord if his architect does not agree with leaving the gable, will DeFord approve it. Bennett stated it could be denied without prejudice. It will be heard at the November meeting.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND COME BACK TO BE HEARD AT THE NOVEMBER MEETING. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1208 Laurel Avenue – Neely Realty Company (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 92707FTSB

Description of Work

Remove deteriorated artificial siding and replace with artificial siding, utilizing wide board trim at windows and corner boards. Reroof, removing chimney, and removing deteriorated hipped extended roof at dormer, installing through-roof shed roof on existing square bay, and utilizing artificial shingles on second story half of façade that contains bay; remove front porch enclosure, returning original porch depth, installing a shed roof and squared columns with square plinths and Doric column capitals. Remove multistory deck and stair system at rear west corner and enclose footprint involved in the deck system, squaring off the rear corner of the house, to provide square footage that will

enable the front porch to be exposed; install two side by side three quarter light front entry doors.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 92707FTSB. Proposed rehabilitation will return original front porch space to house, and complement this block of Laurel Avenue.

Additional Comments

The adopted guidelines for Ft. Sanders allow for artificial siding. The provisions for porches (pg. 8, #1 & #2) are that the porch must complement pre-1940 housing, and must be 6-10 feet deep. Wall materials (pg. 9, #2) may be clapboard-like materials such as aluminum or vinyl, and shingle-like material. Windows and entrances (pg. 10, #1, 2 and 9) are to be appropriate for pre-1940 styles, and should be double hung (with vinyl or metal-clad windows allowed), and entrances provided from the street. Roofs (pg. 7, #3) may be asphalt shingle; no provisions are made for retaining chimneys.

Harding stated that DeFord wants to preserve the gable.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND COME BACK TO BE HEARD IN NOVEMBER. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

110 Thirteenth Street – Becky Wade (Applicant), Mark Norton (Owner) – Certificate No. 100407FTS

Description of Work

Demolition of a condemned, vacant building partially destroyed by fire.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 100407FTS. At the time of designation, buildings in Ft. Sanders that were noted as Non-contributing were considered likely candidates for demolition approval.

Additional Comments

The designation of Non-contributing is explained in the designation report as applying to properties that may be " . . . Structurally questionable, or isolated and not supported by adjacent historic buildings." Although there has been one Certificate of Appropriateness approved for this property that involved window replacement and repair of the front porch, that work was apparently never completed. Since that Certificate was issued (9/24/2002) the property has continued to deteriorate, and recently burned. It does not appear to be a likely candidate for rehabilitation. Any new construction in this location would be reviewed using the adopted Ft. Sanders Design Guidelines.

Randall DeFord, 1511 Laurel Avenue, asked to withdraw and resubmit next month.

Jim Garland, 210 13th Street, representing the owner's sister, Marsha Bartlett, 6504 Sherwood Drive. She asked what was just requested. There will not be any action taken for 30 days. Arning stated we will hear this next month.

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on November 15, 2007, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.