

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING OF NOVEMBER 15, 2007**

-----

**City HZC Present**

Nic Arning  
Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Herb Donaldson  
Duane Grieve  
Melissa McAdams  
Sandra Martin  
Finbarr Saunders  
Melynda Whetsel  
Melissa McAdams

**Members Absent:**

Herb Donaldson (ex.)

**County HZC Present**

Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Charles Faulkner  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Others Present:**

Sharon Boyce  
Tom Reynolds  
Lila Wilson  
Mike Harding  
Sean Martin  
Paul Delahunt  
James Pierce  
Frank Sparkman  
Myers Morton  
David Montgomery  
Daria Krol  
Lisa Gamelkoff  
Jamie Rowe  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West

Arning (Knoxville HZC Chairman) called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. He introduced Lila Wilson, who has been a Historic Zoning Commissioner for 25 years. He presented her with a certificate for her years of service.

He introduced Melissa McAdams, the new city commissioner, who is a community volunteer and retired lawyer with an interest in the environment, education, historic preservation and gardening/landscape design.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 18 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Tom Reynolds Chief Building Inspector stated that he talked to Ray Snyder, and he told him that Chris Plante has signed a contract, and the house will be rehabbed.

Sean Bolen asked about loopholes in the fence guidelines. Bennett stated that all guidelines have fencing in them. The only time a certificate is brought before the commission is when they need a building permit. As long as fences are transparent or 45” or shorter, they do not need a building permit. He asked if we could do anything about this. Reynolds stated guidelines and zoning ordinances do cover fences. The zoning ordinance states that hedges, bushes or structures that cannot impede vision in the front yard. Sharon Boyce stated that fences can cause problems with neighbors, and there is no reason we could not add it. Whetsel stated that the only reason we cannot is because fences do not require a building permit. A chain link fence negates the historic nature of

houses. Neighborhood representatives worked on their own guidelines and have fencing included. Whetsel stated that under current circumstances, historic property owners are at the mercy of anyone who wants to install a fence, whether it is appropriate to the historic district or not. Saunders stated that the Historic Zoning Commissioners are not legislators, and if the neighborhoods want them to get a certificate for a fence, they should initiate it. Sandra Martin agrees with Bolen that appropriate fences should be regulated by the guidelines. Bennett explained that most NC-1 guidelines do not include fence suggestions, but H-1 guidelines do; however, when the guidelines were adopted, fencing provisions were always explained as a recommendation, rather than a requirement, and the historic districts should be consulted if that situation changes. Whetsel feels an ordinance should come first and then it could be added to the guidelines. Grieve suggested that we look at each set of guidelines and add to them. The guidelines would have to be taken back to City Council. Arning stated that we have to decide if we want City Council to require a building permit for fences. Bennett suggested that Boyce and Reynolds look at the whole process and come back to the commission in December. The recommendations have to go to MPC, HZC and City Council. Kenneth Gresham stated that each city or county community needs to make the recommendation.

**MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY FAULKNER REQUESTING THAT BENNETT SEND A LETTER TO THE CITY AND COUNTY TO LOOK INTO FENCE GUIDELINES INCLUDED IN EACH OF THE CITY AND COUNTY HISTORIC GUIDELINES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Arning explained that although Knox Heritage has successfully rehabilitated two deteriorated Barber Houses in the Edgewood-Park City H-1, and did appear before the Historic Zoning Commission to explain the project, several people have noted that the turret at 1618 Washington is not a replica of the one indicated in Barber's plans. Bennett explained that the Knox Heritage Executive Director, Kim Trent, had explained in one of her appearances before the Historic Zoning Commission that the turret would be replaced with a typical Barber turret, but not with the original. Saunders stated that people should communicate to the board what their problem is. Steve Cotham stated they came to the History Center and could not find plans for a turret. Martin confirmed that Trent had discussed the turret with the Commission and affirmed Bennett's recollection. Bolen noted he has received emails and phone calls concerning this. He asked what happened routinely if people did not follow what they have been approved for on the certificate; Bennett explained that Reynold's office or she should be informed. If the certificate and guidelines are not being followed, the owner will be contacted and a stop order issued. Bennett stated there are certain words she uses on a certificate like "in kind" to make the certificate as clear as possible.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

**815 Luttrell Avenue**, 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill, Barry Bruce, Applicant, Certificate No. 1017074&G. Repair siding and soffits with identical design and materials, as necessary; Replace lower sashes only of wood windows with one pane wood sashes to duplicate original size.

**719 Deery Street**, 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill, David Vogel, Applicant, Certificate No. 1023074&G. Install screen door on front door.

**234 E. Oklahoma Avenue**, Old North Knoxville, Kevin Jeske, Applicant, Certificate No. 100907ONK. Clean and point masonry, using Preservation Brief No. 2 guidelines.

**6829 Clinton Highway**, General, Airplane Filling Station Preservation Association, Inc., (Rock Bernard), Applicant, Certificate No. 102407GEN. Repair existing structural beams in wings.

**2647 Bafford Place**, General, Ruth Jones, Applicant, Certificate No. 101507GEN. Install identifying sign for Montessori School.

**1005 Olive Road**, Concord, Carol Montgomery, Applicant, Certificate No. 101907CON. Install small vents for attic space on sides and rear of building; repair roof.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **Ft. Sanders NC-1**

**1204 Laurel Avenue** – Mike Harding, Neely Realty Company (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 103007FTSA

#### **Description of Work**

Reroof, removing chimney. Replace artificial siding with artificial siding that includes corner boards and wide trim at windows, shingles in front facing cross gable. Remove enclosed front porch, reconstructing original depth front porch with square paneled columns on brick piers, roof that retains existing front facing gable over entrance. Install new replacement windows and three-quarter light front door.

#### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 103007FTSA. Proposed rehabilitation is consistent with the Ft. Sanders adopted guidelines, and will return the original front yard and front porch to this block of Laurel, resulting in an improved appearance for Laurel Avenue.

#### **Additional Comments**

The adopted guidelines for Ft. Sanders allow for artificial siding. The provisions for porches (pg. 8, #1 & #2) are that the porch must complement pre-1940 housing, and must be 6-10 feet deep. Wall materials (pg. 9, #2) may be clapboard-like materials such as aluminum or vinyl, and shingle-like material. Windows and entrances (pg. 10, #1, 2 and 9) are to be appropriate for pre-1940 styles, and should be double hung (with vinyl or metal-clad windows allowed), and entrances provided from the street. Roofs (pg. 7, #3) may be asphalt shingle; no provisions are made for retaining chimneys. Applicant has met with Historic Ft. Sanders Neighborhood Association representatives, and the changes requested in the front porch roof design have been incorporated in this application.

Bennett stated that this certificate was before the commission last month, and Mr. Harding has worked with Randall DeFord to make changes to the certificates. Both certificates were modified to change the bay window and the design of the porch roof.

Mike Harding, 2718 Painter Avenue. He met with DeFord and wanted to keep the gable on 1208.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR BOTH ADDRESSES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Bolen stated that he has rebuilt chimneys and it is expensive. He suggested reconsidering removing the chimneys.

*1208 Laurel Avenue* – Mike Harding, Neely Realty Company (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 103007FTSB

**Description of Work**

Remove deteriorated artificial siding and replace with artificial siding, utilizing wide board trim at windows and corner boards. Reroof, removing chimney, and repairing deteriorated hipped extended roof at dormer on existing square bay, and utilizing artificial shingles on second story half of façade that contains bay; remove front porch enclosure, returning original porch depth, retaining the gabled entry and squared columns with square plinths and Doric column capitals.. Remove multistory deck and stair system at rear west corner and enclose footprint involved in the deck system, squaring off the rear corner of the house, to provide square footage that will enable the front porch to be exposed; install two side by side three quarter light front entry doors.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 103007FTSB. Proposed rehabilitation will return original front porch space to house, and complement this block of Laurel Avenue.

**Additional Comments**

The adopted guidelines for Ft. Sanders allow for artificial siding. The provisions for porches (pg. 8, #1 & #2) are that the porch must complement pre-1940 housing, and must be 6-10 feet deep. Wall materials (pg. 9, #2) may be clapboard-like materials such as aluminum or vinyl, and shingle-like material. Windows and entrances (pg. 10, #1, 2 and 9) are to be appropriate for pre-1940 styles, and should be double hung (with vinyl or metal-clad windows allowed), and entrances provided from the street. Roofs (pg. 7, #3) may be asphalt shingle; no provisions are made for retaining chimneys. Property owner's representative has met with HFSNA, and agreed to retain and repair the original dormer and porch rooflines.

**Fourth & Gill H-1**

*815 Luttrell Street* - Barry Bruce (Owner/Applicant) - Certificate No. 1017074&G

**Description of Work**

Replace window in stairwell, on side elevation and not visible from Luttrell, with new wood window with identical mullion pattern. Replace side gable attic vent window with three light wood window, Palladian like in design with central window taller than window on each side, with mullions to mimic existing mullion pattern. Add skylights on rear roof planes, not visible from Luttrell.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 1017074&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

**Additional Comments**

Proposed work is consistent with the Windows section of the design guidelines, pg. 11, #1, 2, 4 and the replacement attic vent windows with #7 of that section. The proposed skylights, which are located on a back roof plane and not visible from Luttrell, are

Bennett stated that the owner also had a level 1 certificate on this property.

Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor Street, stated that the neighborhood is pleased with what he is planning to do.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Old North Knoxville H-1**

*315 E. Scott Avenue* -Paul Delahunt (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 101507ONK

**Description of Work**

Replace unoriginal dormer windows with wood double hung windows; replace deteriorated side and rear windows with wood one over one, same size, windows. Repair oversize front windows and front door, inserting plain glass in door opening replacing existing Plexiglas. Repair existing brick balustrade, repointing or rebuilding in same pattern, reusing same brick, as necessary.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 101507ONK. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines. (See, pg. 17, C 1, Porches; pg. 15, B 2, Windows; pg. 23, F 3&5, Masonry.)

**Additional Comments**

Dormer window replacement has proven particularly problematic. The windows that were in the front dormers were replacement windows, and were allowed to stand open for a number of years. As a result, they were deteriorated and required replacement.

Applicant is using a six over six grid pattern, as appeared in the replacement windows found at the time of designation.

Bennett stated that the owner wants to add that he is replacing the windows with the same type that was there.

Paul Delahunt, 315 E. Scott, stated that the brick work is almost finished. He will keep the grid pattern in the windows. Bolen asked if the 3 over 3 windows are original, and Bennett does not have any idea. Bolen requested that the chimney be brought back up to the original height. Mr. Delahunt is planning to do that.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, visited the house yesterday and commended him on his work. The neighborhood does not agree with the replacement of 3 over 3 and felt they should have been 1 over 1. True divided light and 1 over 1 windows are in the rest of the house. The siding should have been wood instead of Masonite. Delahunt stated the siding is wood. Materials identical to the original were used for replacement; Bennett confirmed that the siding was wood, and that other Old North neighbors had also seen the siding before it was primed and confirmed that it was wood. She noted that the certificate issued last month was for repointing, but the brick porch balustrade was being replaced in kind, and had been included on this certificate. Delahunt noted that the dormer windows were an exact replacement for what he found in the house that had deteriorated, and Bennett affirmed that was true, but that the original design of the dormer windows was unknown.

Pierce quoted provisions from the guidelines about true divided light windows. Bennett explained that the mullions that will be added will be wood and painted and will be identical to the windows they are replacing and appear as true divided lights from the street. Arning suggested that Delehunt should have talked to Ann and the neighborhood before he came to us.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE AGREEMENT THAT WAS MADE BETWEEN HIM AND THE NEIGHBORHOOD THAT THE OUTSIDE GRIDS ON THE DORMERS WILL BE PAINTED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**1518 N. Broadway**- Frank Sparkman (Applicant), Myles Morton (Owner) – Certificate No. 103107ONK

### **Description of Work**

Exterior & interior renovations, including modification of existing flat roof to hipped roof with asphalt shingle covering, replace existing wood siding with new, horizontal cement board siding, install new metal windows, parking to resurfacing, repair retaining walls.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 103107ONK, requiring siding to be wood rather than cementitious material; with that alteration, the proposed redesign will be in keeping with the adopted Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines.

**Additional Comments**

This building is a non-contributing building; designation includes only the east half of the building. The design of the building is not significant; however, the proposed modifications will create a more attractive building, and allow it to blend better with the architecture in this section of Old North Knoxville.

Frank Sparkman, Sparkman Architects, 3991 Midland Avenue, is the architect. Myers Morton stated he is the owner and is not sure he could afford wood instead of cement board. Sparkman stated that it depends on the contractor, but he does not think there will be that much difference in price. He recommended that the owner come back if there is a problem with replacing with wood.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that the neighborhood welcomes the changes, and they would like to see him use wood siding.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRE THAT WOOD BE USED INSTEAD OF CEMENT BOARD. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Edgewood-Park City**

*1907 Washington Avenue* - George Carter (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 101707EDG

**Description of Work**

Replace wood one over one double hung window in front bay with one over one double hung wood window, same size to match existing opening.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 10107EDG. Proposed work is consisted with adopted design guidelines. (See pg. 17, Windows, #3; pg. 19; and Masonry, pg. 25, #2 & #5. The rear porch proposed for screening is not visible from Washington Avenue.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that a neighbor called Bennett to report the work, and the neighborhood agrees with the recommendation.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1**

*1805 Fairmont Boulevard* – Champion Window Company (David Montgomery, Applicant) Billy Russell (Owner) – Certificate No. 100907FEM

**Description of Work**

Construct rear enclosed sun porch, shingled shed roof, knee wall, knee walls and side wall enclosure under shed to be solid white material with pebble grain, remaining walls glass. Dimension of enclosed area approximately 36' x 8' deep, filling in irregular portions of back wall, including space under present awning.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 100907FEM, which is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

**Additional Comments**

Although this house is a corner lot, and the proposed sunroof will be visible from the side street, the design of the addition is consistent with the character of the main structure, and is not located on the front façade. (Pg. 5, A 1, 4, 5 & 8.) Alterations have already occurred at the rear of this house; the addition will unify and substitute a more refined appearance for those prior additions.

David Montgomery, 10630 Lexington Drive, stated that he will extend the roof all the way across. The knee wall is vinyl.

Steve Cotham stated that the neighborhood does not have a problem with it.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Scenic Drive NC-1**

*523 Scenic Drive* – Daria Krol, R2R Studios (Applicant), Edward Vickers (Owner) – Certificate No. 110107SCN

**Work Description**

Add two story Tudor Revival design garage with carriage door replica garage doors, end gable roof with slate roof covering, projecting front gable, stuccoed, with half-timbers to match house, windows and brick to match existing house; infill screened porch with stucco and matching windows to form sun room; enlarge existing covered porch behind house, not visible from Scenic; demolish existing utility shed/work shop and existing deck. All materials on additions to match existing brick and stucco. Roof covering to be either slate or a dimensioned shingle.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 110107SCN. Proposed modifications are consistent with the original architecture and materials, and the design, of the property.

**Additional Comments**



The proposed new addition is consistent with the provisions for New Construction - Primary Building, Additions and Accessory Buildings with regard to setbacks, lot coverage, design of addition, materials, and other factors. The existing work shed proposed for demolition is not a contributing structure to the conservation district; its replacement will enhance the conservation district and the original building on the lot.

Daria Krol, 2575 Willow Point Way, is the architect. Arning asked if the roof is going to be slate or shingle. Krol stated that the owner is still getting prices.

Lisa Gamelhoff, 901 Scenic Drive, stated there is not a problem with the neighborhood. They are pleased to see that the overlay would cause them not to be able to tear down a storage shed.

Bolen stated that the guidelines state additions should be located 5 feet behind the front façade. Bennett the zoning ordinance defines where an addition can go. From a design standpoint, it is a rear addition.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1111 Scenic Drive* – Clyde Baker, C. B. Contracting, Inc. (Applicant), Patricia D. Siler (Owner) – Certificate No. 101907SCN

**Work Description**

Construct a 20x26 unenclosed pool pavilion and pool deck around existing pool, connecting to garage. Pavilion to be timber frame, brick knee walls, stone fireplace and slate floor, slate deck.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 101907SCN. Proposed work is in rear yard, not visible from Scenic, but will enhance the design of the primary building. (See New Construction, pg. 8 & 9, Nos. 6, 8, 9 & 13.)

Lisa Gamelkof, who lives on Scenic Drive, is encouraged by the quality of work described in the certificate applications, and voiced the neighborhoods approval.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Bennett stated that Phillip Morris, formerly the editor of *Southern Living* magazine, will be speaking at the Knox Heritage annual meeting at the Museum of Art tonight.

- Adjournment

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on December 20, 2007, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.