

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JULY 19, 2007**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel
Lila Wilson

County HZC Present

Kenneth Gresham
Steve Cotham
Carol Montgomery
Charles Faulkner

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
Sean Martin
Tony Yanniello
John Stancil
Joe McDonald
James Pierce
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (excused)
Herb Donaldson (excused)

Arning (Knoxville HZC Chairman) called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts. He introduced Sean Bolen as a new member of the commission representing the city.

A corrected set of minutes were distributed to include the roll call votes.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE JUNE 21 MINUTES AS CORRECTED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

726 Deery Street - 4th & Gill, Donna Gass, Certificate No. 611074&G.

Repair or replace roof as necessary; install wood ramp to access front porch; repair rear porch steps; install front porch railing of wood weatherboard; reinstall gutter on front porch.

1007 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill, C. Randall DeFord, Certificate No. 705074&G.

Demolish rear addition and added rear deck.

502 E. Scott Avenue - Old North Knoxville, James Calloway, Certificate No. 62207ONK. Repair or replace wood siding in kind as needed.

122 W. Glenwood Avenue - Old North Knoxville, Judy Gerstmeyer, Certificate No. 70307ONK. Replace plywood porch floor with tongue & groove porch floor; replace sheetrock porch ceiling with beadboard ceiling.

1710 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City, Isa Infante, Certificate No. 61807EDG

Roof repairs with in-kind materials.

543 N. Broadway - General, Charles Richmond, Certificate No. 61507GEN.

Phase I- To address the water leaking in the basement, replacement of basement access door and entrance steps, a concrete floor slab along with the structural restoration for support and leveling the Visitor Center/Office main floor.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General

300 Main Street – Public Building Authority (Stan Collins, PBA/Knox County Government, Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 70307GEN.

Description of Work

Replace deteriorated one over one wood windows with like windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 70307GEN. Windows to be changed were replaced with rehab that occurred prior to designation, and are deteriorated. Replacement will not remove original material; proposed windows are consistent with original design.

Bennett stated that she talked to Stan Collins (PBA) and he is not sure about the budget for this year and not sure the project can proceed, but decided to leave the application in place since the certificate does not expire for two years. The windows being replaced are not original wood windows; they were replaced 15 years ago, but have deteriorated.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th & Gill

726 Deery Street – Donna Gass (Applicant), Richard Bridgeman (Owner) – Certificate No. 611074&G

Description of Work

Install wood 8'x10' shed in rear yard, wood sided, gable roof with shingled roof, doubled wood doors.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 611074&G. Proposed shed in rear yard is consistent with design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines provide for buildings resembling work building or simple one story buildings using materials that correspond to the original primary buildings on the lot. (4&G, pg. 19, Outbuildings, #1).

Wilson asked where the drawings are and Bennett stated she has seen the shed but does not have a picture. Whetsel wants to see where it will sit on the lot. Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor, stated that he would like to know where it will sit on the lot. Bennett will tell them to put it as close to the inside lot as possible. Grieve stated that we want to see what it will look like and where it will be placed.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE BECAUSE THE COMMISSION NEEDS TO SEE DRAWINGS AND WHERE THE BUILDING IS TO BE PLACED ON THE LOT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1007 Eleanor Street – C. Randall Deford (Applicant), Property Action LLC, Bennett Hirschorn (Owner), Certificate No. 705074&G

Description of Work

Remove existing second floor decking, metal railings and posts on façade and metal posts on front porch, replacing with true tapered wood columns with pilasters against façade, sized and trimmed to match shadow of original columns, new wood guardrail of square 2"x2" posts on 4" centers with doubled top rail, set into top and bottom rail, and construct one story porch roof (hipped at edges) with 2/12 slope; install paired French doors on façade accessing front porch where single entry now appears with doors to be 2/3 glass with base wood panels, 7' total (2'6" each); install single 3'6" entry door at primary entry, 2/3 glass panel with wood panels below; repoint all masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2; remove metal fire stairs on north elevation; restore historic windows, and add new windows to replace openings cut for doors, with new windows to be same size as existing and wood double-hung thermal pane (new windows on second story facade in place of existing door, on north elevation flanking porch in dormers and at second story above bay on south elevation; reroof, installing ridge vents; rebuild porch on north elevation, installing newel post and railing to match front porch, tongue & groove decking; restore front dormer, replicating cornice and "column" trim as revealed by shadows; construct new dormer on north elevation replicating trim details and roof shape of existing north dormer; remove recently constructed rear addition and deck and reconstruct rear deck covering south half (approximately) of rear elevation, with wood deck stairs and rail to match rail on north elevation and façade porches; repair rear dormer and replicate "column" trim that appears on front dormer; install paired French doors in 7' opening to access exterior from first and second stories.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 705074&G. As submitted, proposed changes and revisions are appropriate to original design of structure, and will restore architectural integrity lost with changes made mid-20th century.

Additional Comments

See Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, Windows, pg. 11, 2, 4; Porches, pg. 12, 1, 4; Entrances, pg. 13, 1, 2, 3, 4, 7; Wall coverings, pg. 14, 7; Masonry, pg. 15, 5, 6, and New Additions, pg. 18, 1, 2, 3, 4, 7 & 8.

Bennett stated that this project has been before you in the past. Randall DeFord is the architect and Bennett Hirschorn is the owner. The front elevation of the house will be returned to its original appearance.

Sean Martin stated that the house looks fine. Whetsel has talked to neighbors on both sides and everyone is pleased.

Sean Bolen asked about the dormer. It is unusual to have unsymmetrical dormers on this type of home. Whetsel stated the owner has said he may not install a dormer. Grieve asked if French doors are what would have been on a house at this time. Bennett asked him about the doors, and she stated that the owners wanted more light. It should have one door or a window there.

Grieve stated that we are responsible for the front elevations of historic houses and having two French doors on the front is inappropriate. If there was a window there, then we should consider a window.

Sean Martin stated that a four-square house may have had a dormer at one time. The entry is already asymmetrical. It messes with the style and allows for variety in this type of house because we do not know what was originally there. Sandra Martin feels the one dormer looks fine. Bolen stated it is very uncommon to only have one dormer. He suggests a third dormer should be added on the other side. Bennett pointed out that one advantage of the additional dormer is that it will be obvious to future architectural historians that it was added, and give hints as to the major early 21st century rehabilitation now being considered.

Carol Montgomery stated that if the doors were made to look like windows, you would not be able to tell from the street. Whetsel stated that they have worked on this design for months, and she would like to see it approved.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO ACCEPT THIS DESIGN AND STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND ASK THAT THE FRENCH DOORS AND DORMER BE REVISITED. VOTING NO: ARNING, BOLEN, BUSBY, GRIEVE, WHETSEL AND WILSON. VOTING YES: MARTIN AND SAUNDERS. THE MOTION FAILED.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH TWO EXCEPTIONS:

- 1) THE FIRST FLOOR FRONT ELEVATION FRENCH DOORS (WHERE A WINDOW TO MATCH OTHER WINDOWS ON THE HOUSE IS APPROVABLE), AND**

- 2) **THE DORMER CONTEMPLATED FOR THE NORTH (SIDE) ELEVATION, WHERE THE APPLICANT SHOULD CONFIRM THAT HE INTENDS TO INSTALL IT, AND REVISE THE SIZE AND CONFIRM THE LOCATION, FOR FUTURE COMMISSION REVIEW.**

THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Grieve stated that if we approve French doors on this façade, they will occur on other front facades.

Old North Knoxville

1316 Grainger Avenue – Tony Yanniello (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 62907ONK

Description of Work

Demolishing concrete block garage at rear of lot (roof has collapsed and doors and windows are absent); construct wrap around deck on rear and east side; install full view paired French doors at rear east corner, not visible from alley or from Grainger.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 62907ONK. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines. Garage was listed as non-contributing at time of demolition. French doors and added rear deck will not be visible from Grainger.

Tony Yanniello, 1316 Grainger, the neighbors talked to him about the visibility from Grainger. The French door will be in the offset. The deck elevation will be under 30” so he will not be adding a railing.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, thanked him for taking on this project and agrees with removing the garage. Their concern was the deck but since they have talked to him and as low as it will be, it should not be visible from Grainger.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

238 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Department of Community Development (Joe McDonald, Applicant), Chris Plante (Owner) - Certificate No. 62707ONK

Description of Work

Rebuild east chimney to original design; tuck point west chimney and brick foundation, using Preservation Brief No. 2. Construct rear deck not visible from Oklahoma. Replace asphalt shingles with asphalt shingles; install 2 steel turbine vents on roof, located below ridge and not visible from Oklahoma. Repair wood shingle siding, replacing missing shingles. Repair rafter tails, fascia and soffit, matching originals. Rebuild front porch with hip roof system, tongue & groove decking, square wood columns and bead board porch ceiling to conform to original dimensions and design. Replace windows (all deteriorated) with wood one over one double hung Marvin Windows or equivalent.

Demolish rear enclosed porch and reconstruct rear porch, not visible from Oklahoma. Replace front door and north elevation door facing front with wood paneled half-view doors.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 62707ONK.

Additional Comments

APPROVE rebuilding east chimney to original design; tuck-point west chimney and brick foundation, using Preservation Brief No. 2 (Masonry, pg. 22); demolition of enclosed dilapidated rear porch and construction of rear deck, not visible from Oklahoma (Entrances, pg. 19, D4); repairing wood shingle siding, replacing missing shingles (Wall Coverings, Pg. 20, 5, 7, 12); repairing rafter tails, fascia and soffit, matching originals, replacing asphalt shingle roof with asphalt shingles, installing 2 steel turbine vents on roof, located below ridge and not visible from Oklahoma (Roofs, pg. 13 A. 3, 4, 5); rebuilding front porch with hip roof system, tongue & groove decking, square wood columns and bead board porch ceiling to conform to original dimensions and design (Porches, Pg. 1, C1, 2); replacing windows (all deteriorated) with wood one over one double hung Marvin Windows or equivalent (Windows, pg. 15, B2); installation of wood paneled half-view doors on front elevation (Entrances, pg. 19, D3).

Bennett stated that Joe McDonald from the Department of Community Development has been conferring with Plante to accomplish this work. The use of CDBG funds has been approved.

James Pierce stated that the neighborhood wants to thank everyone involved for this project. They asked about the porch and deck on the back. Joe McDonald stated that the rear addition is deteriorated. The 36x14 section that has to be demolished will be replaced as a roofed porch 20x14 with railings, not enclosed.

Saunders stated there is an extensive amount of work to be done, but we would like to see drawings. McDonald distributed the plans. Reynolds expressed his gratitude to McDonald and Community Development for their work on this house. Bolen asked about the brick supports that were on the front porch, and McDonald answered that he is going to match the house next door.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Chairman Kenneth Gresham (Knox County HZC) began presiding over the meeting.

Village of Concord H-1

1009 Olive Road – George C. Montgomery (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 70507CON

Description of Work

Construct potting shed of board and batten with tin roof and stone foundation. 10' x 10' footprint, 12-11' tall with gable end roof, small windows on each side and vertical board door, reconstructed from outbuilding currently existing on property located in West Knox County.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 70507CON. Proposed outbuilding is consistent with materials used on primary and existing secondary structure. Design guidelines allow outbuildings consistent in design with one story work buildings using consistent materials.

Additional Comments

Village of Concord Design Guidelines, pg. 42, Outbuildings.

Carol Montgomery recused herself.

Dr. Faulkner asked Carol Montgomery what the original use of this building was, and she stated it was a smoke house. It will cover the well, but the well will still be in use. Montgomery stated the neighborhood is fine with it.

MOTION BY COTHAM AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Village of Concord Markers

The Old Concord Residents Association is requesting approval to place three signs in the Village of Concord to identify the local and National Register historic district. A description of the markers, together with a map showing their placement and an illustration of their design is attached.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE the placement and design of markers for the Village of Concord as requested, and commend the Old Concord Residents Association for their efforts.

Bennett explained that the Old Concord Residents Association would like to place three signs to designate the boundaries of the Village of Concord and commended them for their efforts. Montgomery stated that the neighborhood has had many meetings concerning these markers. Dr. Faulkner asked what type of posts they are going to use, and Montgomery answered they are using metal.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Gresham stated that installing these signs is a very good idea.

Montgomery asked about an article in Metro Pulse about solar panels being placed in a historic district. Bennett stated that solar panels are not in the guidelines. Bennett also noted that it is often common thing to install freestanding panels and not put them on a roof, and that in the last several years solar panels have become available that are designed to mimic standard roof shingles, and are very inconspicuous. The guidelines do state that skylights should be on an inconspicuous elevation.

Sandra Martin stated she was sure this was done, but wanted to emphasize that applicants attend the meeting. Bennett replied that each applicant receives a copy of the staff report and a reminder of the time and place of the meeting, complete with an agenda. Whetsel added that if had Ford or Hirschorn been here, their applications would have been approved. Arning stated we have seen today what happens if drawings are not submitted.

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on August 16, 2007, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.