

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF FEBRUARY 15, 2007

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Scott Busby
Steve Cotham
Herb Donaldson
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Duane Grieve
William Hoehl
Sandra Martin
Carol Montgomery
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel
Lila Wilson

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Sharon Boyce
Jamie Rowe
Robert Marlino
Brian O'Conner
Betsey McGuire
Doug Kirk
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

Minutes for the January and February, 2007 meetings of the Historic Zoning Commissions will be reviewed at the March 15, 2007 meeting.

Saunders stated that 26 Market Square is being neglected and has no roof. He is concerned that the building might catch on fire. He would like to report this to Tom Reynolds.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO REQUEST A REPORT FROM REYNOLDS CONCERNING 26 MARKET. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

13 Market - Market Square, Trio Café, Certificate No.12207MKT. Install suspended sign, 30" maximum height, above entrance and below sign board. Sign will contain LED lighting to outline letters.

23 Market - Market Square, Matthew Kelley (Dewhirst Construction), Certificate No. 13107MKTB. Install slope at front entry door to comply with handicapped requirements and to match other storefront entries on Market Square.

930 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill, Michael Greenberg, Certificate No. 117074&G. Replace fascia in kind; remove artificial siding if possible; repair or replace siding in kind as necessary; repair skirt and corner boards as necessary; repair column bases; repair or replace porch floor with tongue and groove porch flooring; install new oversize gutters; repair or repoint mortar as necessary using low-Portland content mortar; reroof house and carport; replace access door to basement in rear.

1007 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill, Maxwell Swanson, Certificate No. 126074&GA. Remove vinyl siding; repair wood siding in kind in preparation for painting.

224 E. Scott Avenue - Old North Knoxville, Knoxville Preservation & Development LLC (Daniel Schuh), Certificate No. 13107ONKA. Level I (Issued 1/31/2007) Repair wood siding as necessary; repair wood double hung one over one windows as necessary; replace tongue and groove porch floor in kind; repair siding, fascia and other trim in kind as necessary; repair masonry as necessary using Preservation Brief No. 2.

11031 Lake Ridge - Concord, Don Kirk, Certificate No. 11107CON. Repair and reconstruct rear addition, reusing original footprint, original windows in location of addition (interior repairs on rear addition caused partial collapse of structure).

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Market Square H-1

8 Market Square - SmeeBusby Architects (Robert Marlino) (Applicant), Cornerstone Foundation (Owner), Certificate No. 13107MKT.

Description of Work

#8: Add 12/12 wood double hung aluminum clad windows on north elevation at second and third stories; remove existing second floor concrete block infill and replace with brick to match; add first floor window to match new existing windows; add double leaf entry doors (aluminum clad wood) with full lights; add wood bulkhead with trim around windows. #4 and 6: repair existing windows; add new small paned wood transoms; add three wood full-view doors on front elevation; add iron railing approximately 36"; remove metal bars on windows; remove metal fire escape; remove existing first floor windows on north side (#6) to add loading door; created openings and existing openings will be closed in brick to match existing; add egress door on same building; remove one first story window on #4 Market Square (rear) and add egress door. On all buildings, repair brick as necessary using Preservation Brief #2.

Staff Recommendation

Approve Certificate No. 13107MKT. Repair of windows on front elevation of both buildings (IIB, 1-2), construction of replacement storefront on #4-6 (small paned transoms, entry door in north bay and paired entries in south bay, store windows and bulkhead are consistent with Market Square Design Guidelines (IIA1-12). Inserted side and rear windows on north and east elevations are wood, single pane, double hung, color clad; some have been installed under a Certificate issued to the previous owner; the remainder have been purchased and are stored in the building awaiting installation. There is no alteration to historic windows resulting from this installation; the wall on which they will be installed was previously a common wall with no openings. Alteration of rear façade to provide for freight entry and access is on an elevation visible only from the alley, and necessary for the functioning of ground floor uses in the building.

Bennett stated that this application was discussed two years ago and approved for a door on the side going toward KUB. She is recommending clad wood windows on the side because they are not visible from Market Square.

Robert Marlino of Smee Busby Architects, 29 Market Square, stated that the windows stored in the building and ordered for it are one over one. They are not applying for the awning on the alley. They will come back later for that and signage. The front elevation is for 4 & 6 Market. He showed the commission what the trim on the front windows will look like. The ramp will elevate to 18” to match the inside floor.

Grieve asked if they are going to do anything with the brick wall in the courtyard. Marlino explained that the windows are inside the building and have not been installed. The metal lintels are installed. Bennett explained that the Commission may want to treat this building differently than the Victorian-era buildings on Market Square, allowing wood clad windows. The building originally had metal windows and never had wood windows; in addition, there were no windows on the north side of the building because that elevation was not exposed to view until the mid-1970s.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED WITH BUSBY AND MARTIN RECUSING.

Old North Knoxville H-1

224 E. Scott Avenue - Knoxville Preservation & Development LLC (Daniel Schuh), Owner/Applicant, Certificate No. 13107ONKA

Description of Work

Level II: Replace inappropriate replacement window in gable end, west elevation (not visible from Scott) with casement window of same size, in order to provide access required by fire codes. Level I (Issued 1/31/2007) Repair wood siding as necessary; repair wood double hung one over one windows as necessary; replace tongue and groove porch floor in kind; repair siding, fascia and other trim in kind as necessary; repair masonry as necessary using Preservation Brief No. 2.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 13107ONKA. The replacement window is necessary in order to bring building in compliance with fire safety codes, and because it is proposed for installation on a side elevation is not visible from Scott.

Additional Comments

There is a previously installed window located in this gable; it is not original to the building. (Please note that a portion of the work contemplated in this application was approved under provisions for a Level I application.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th and Gill H-1

1007 Eleanor - Maxwell Swanson (Applicant), Bennett & Sarah Hirschorn (Owners), Certificate No. 126074&GB.

Description of Work

Front porch: Build a two-story front porch, utilizing the existing front porch first floor, removing the metal second story roof awning, and installing wrapped square (8") columns with Doric capitals and bases on the first and second stories, repair tongue and groove flooring in kind as necessary; repair porch ceiling in kind as necessary; construct shed roofed second story porch with railing, flooring, ceiling and columns to match first story. Railing on both first and second story to be 2" square spindles set in to top and bottom rails on 4" to 5" centers. Remove metal fire story accessing second story. Install decorative panels below side and front bay windows. Windows: Retain existing windows, repairing as necessary. Doors: Retain existing doors, installing transoms above them. Gutters: Install if desired.

Masonry: Clean and/or repoint as necessary, using low Portland content mortar. Rear Addition: Replace with enclosed rear addition that covers rear elevation of house and provides enclosed space for electrical panels and other mechanical equipment, with wood siding to match siding on house and shed roof. Rear porch: Construct two story rear porch with columns and railing to match front, and stair to access second story, providing access to upper floor rear apartments.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 127064&G. Rear porch is not visible from Eleanor. Front porch replacement is consistent with adopted design guidelines, pg. 12, 1-3. The remainder of the items are repairs recommended for the buildings in the neighborhood.

The owner and the contractor have been willing to work closely with staff to plan porch additions that are in keeping with the architectural character of Fourth & Gill, which will create an asset for the neighborhood through the redesign of this building's porches.

Whetsel stated that the neighborhood has worked with the owners and they are to be commended for their work. Grieve asked if there are four doors on the front, and Bennett stated there are because it is a four-plex. Whetsel was not aware there are four doors on the front. Bennett noted that the Commission might want to approve the work mentioned on the Certificate application with the exception of the two story front porch. This would give the staff and applicant enough time to work through the design questions having to do with the front entry.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR ALL THE WORK ON THE SIDES AND BACK AND DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE THE WORK ON THE FRONT PORCH. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1108 Luttrell - Brian O'Conner (Owner/Applicant), Certificate No.130074&G.

Description of Work

Rebuild four square brick columns, in need of repair, changing design to four single piers, with four canted in wood columns; remove current, inappropriately designed and sized railing and install railing of 1x6 boards with pierced or cut-out patterned edge or central design, or with 1x3-4 inch balusters with 2 inch spacing, set in to top and bottom rails.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 130074&G. The current porch columns are in extremely poor condition, and may have been added when the concrete flooring was added to the front porch. Their proposed replacements are consistent with guidelines (pg. 12, 1-4).

Brian O'Conner, 1108 Luttrell, owner and contractor. The house burned, and he has renovated the interior. The columns are going to have to be replaced. He wants to keep the characteristics of the homes of this period by using the proposed columns.

Whetsel stated that she is pleased with the work.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fort Sanders H-1

1636 Clinch Avenue - Betsey McGuire, Design Innovations Architects (Applicant), Certificate No. 12907FTS.

Description of Work

Open up porch and balcony area. Add bay window, change window above. Add decorative trim and siding. Add columns and railing at porch and balcony. Remove crumbling chimney. Replace decks. Add new front door with sidelights and transom and new French doors at balcony. (See elevation submitted with application.)

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 12907FTS. Proposed alterations that will reintroduce porches and bay windows to altered house are in keeping with adopted design guidelines (pg. 6, 7, 10 and 12) for new construction or rehabilitation.

Additional Comments

The introduction of sidelights and transom to the entries, the front porch and balcony (with French doors) and the bay windows will reintroduce features long missing from this structure, and return the building to a degree of conformity with its original appearance and with other buildings on this block.

Betsey McGuire of Design Innovations Architects of 402 Gay Street stated that they propose to renovate the building inside and out and will bring it up to codes. It will have four units in it. Faris Eid, also of Design Innovations Architects, 402 Gay Street, stated that the fireplace will also be removed.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Grieve asked about the chimney removal. Bennett stated that an NC-1 does not have to retain the chimney.

Arning turned the meeting over to Gresham to hear the county applications.

Village of Concord

10717 Lake Ridge Drive - Douglas Kirk, Owner/Applicant, Certificate No. 20207CON.

Description of Work

Construct new two story 32x16 gable roofed addition to east side of house with front porch, and duplicating wood covering and windows found on original house on parcel.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 20207CON. Proposed addition is consistent in appearance with features of original house.

Additional Comments

The design of the proposed addition conforms to the adopted design guidelines for new construction and additions (pg. 41-42).

Doug Kirk of 10717 Lake Ridge stated that he plans to build an addition on the east side of the house. He will use saw mill siding. Faulkner asked if it is an L off the original house, and Kirk said that it is going to extend out to the side.

Carol Montgomery stated she is glad they are doing this work.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett talked about the Camdun Realty zoning at Topside Road. This was postponed at the February 8 MPC meeting. The house is historically and architecturally significant and should be preserved by placing it under a protective HC Historic Overlay. She has notified the seller and his buyer of that concern, and has requested a meeting to discuss that possibility. She hopes the developer will propose an HZ overlay.

MOTION BY FAULKNER AND SECOND BY COTHAM TO SUPPORT A RESOLUTION TO PUT AN OVERLAY ON EDELMAR ON TOPSIDE ROAD. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Martin asked about the renaming of Concord Road. Bennett stated there is a small portion in the City of Knoxville. The rest is in Farragut. MPC denied the request. Farragut has renamed the remainder of the road.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on March 15, 2007 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.