

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF AUGUST 16, 2007

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Herb Donaldson
Duane Grieve
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel
Lila Wilson

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
Sean Martin
Tony Yanniello
John Stancil
Joe McDonald
Arthur Seymour, Jr.
James Pierce
Leonard Vaughen
Dwight Guinn
Chris Nickels
Ray Snyder
Isa Infante
Jack Justice
Alyssa Rosenquist
Bill Threlkeld
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Charles Faulkner (excused)

Arning (Knoxville HZC Chairman) called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO HEAR THE WALKER SHERRILL DESIGNATION FIRST ON THE AGENDA. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

H-1 Designation

Kennedy-Baker-Walker-Sherrill House – 9320 Kingston Pike

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE designation; APPROVE Design Guidelines.

Bennett described the house, which was built in 1849, and has been recommended for designation. The house is part of a much larger tract that is being considered for rezoning and redevelopment. The staff report focuses on two points in addition to the Secretary of interior's Standards that are recommended as design guidelines. First, the viewshed into the house from Kingston Pike should be preserved, although parking or other site features might be permissible if they are screened without jeopardizing that viewshed. Second, there is a c. 1955 garage addition that is attached to the historic rear ell, is not

contributing and can be torn down. The property was included in a rezoning proposal that went to MPC a week ago. The rezoning request approved 40 acres fronting on Kingston Pike for mixed use commercial development, and appended the H-1 to those 40 acres. Bennett explained that the applicant for the rezoning, represented by Mr. Seymour, did not intend for that extensive an H-1 designation, but did support an H-1 designation for the house and immediately surround land. Bennett is recommending designation of a parcel that is 200 ft along the Kinston Pike right of way, and is 250 feet deep from north to south.

Arthur Seymour Jr., who is representing Raymond Higgins of Andrews Properties, stated that the property consists of over 100 acres. The home is on the northwest corner of the property fronting Kingston Pike. Andrews proposes a commercial development on 40 acres and plans to integrate this home in the development. Later, offices and a senior retirement center will be added. MPC passed the rezoning at their meeting last week and recommended sending it to go to City Council. Seymour explained that his client is anxious to see the rezoning proceed, and recommended the commission approve an H-1.

Grieve asked if Bennett has addressed Dr. Faulkner's letter concerning the archeology. Bennett stated this is pristine land, and Dr. Faulkner wants to walk the property because there may be cemeteries and barns. Mr. Seymour stated he will send the engineering firm a copy of the letter from Faulkner.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE H-1 DESIGNATION AS PROPOSED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE DESIGN GUIDELINES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE JULY 19 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Reports (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

501 Main Street - Jennifer Mitchell, Williams Services LLC - 71107GEN. Replace existing sign information in front monument sign, retaining shape, size and location of sign. Replace ATM and traffic signs; replace all existing ATM signs.

1012 Laurel Avenue - Jason DeBord, Cardinal Properties - 73007AGEN. Repair or replace siding, skirt board, corner boards, fascia and soffit in kind; repair or replace porch flooring and decking in kind.

1016 Laurel Avenue - Jason DeBord, Cardinal Properties - 73007BGEN. Repair or replace siding, skirt board, corner boards, fascia and soffit in kind; repair or replace porch flooring and decking in kind.

414 Eleventh Street - Jason DeBord, Cardinal Properties - 73007CGEN. Repair or replace siding, skirt board, corner boards, fascia and soffit in kind; repair or replace porch flooring and decking in kind.

406 Eleventh Street - Jason DeBord, Cardinal Properties - 73007DGEN. Repair or replace siding, skirt board, corner boards, fascia and soffit in kind; repair or replace porch flooring and decking in kind.

404 Eleventh Street - Jason DeBord, Cardinal Properties - 73007EGEN. Repair or replace siding, skirt board, corner boards, fascia and soffit in kind; repair or replace porch flooring and decking in kind.

402 Eleventh Street - Jason DeBord, Cardinal Properties - 73007FGEN. Repair or replace siding, skirt board, corner boards, fascia and soffit in kind; repair or replace porch flooring and decking in kind.

206 Clinch Avenue - Heather Whiteside/Whiteside Art - 73107GEN. Install one metal hanging sign from iron, painted on both sides showing typical architectural motif from theatre and words Tennessee Theater Gift Shop, not lighted internally, 25"x35".

625 Luttrell Street - Melanie McGee - 717074&G. Install color clad storm windows.

221 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Donn "Tre" H. Berney, III - 71807ONK. Replace purlins currently forming roof decking with continuous sheathing; reshingle; repair failed beam on front porch, leaving ceiling and remainder of porch intact. Repoint masonry, using Preservation Brief No. 2.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2019 Washington Avenue – Leonard Vaughen – (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 80207EDG

Description of Work

Rebuilding fire damaged front porch and left side of house, using wood weatherboard, one over one double hung windows, turned wood balustrade and turned columns with sawn wood brackets (reproducing original); new brick faced foundation; wood double hung windows to match original size; new mechanical; new rear addition to square off rear of house by removing shed roofed addition with slopes down from each gable and constructing single plane shed roof addition.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80207EDG. Proposed work is consistent with following adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Roof (pg. 15, #3); Windows (pg. 17, #1, #3); Porch (pg. 19, #1); Wall coverings (pg. 23, #3, #7); and Additions (pg. 29, #12).

Bennett stated that this house is fire damaged, and Mr. Vaughen has altered his plans and has come back to you for approval. He has a revised front porch drawing and is replacing the fire damaged windows.

Leonard Vaughen, 2019 Washington Avenue, stated that the house has been a duplex for years, and he wants to return it to a single family house. The addition will extend the house 3 feet.

Saunders stated that the commission needs drawings of the plans for the rear addition. Bennett stated that it is not visible from Washington Avenue. Vaughen added that this will appear as a shed addition. Bennett asked that he give her drawings of his plan.

John Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated speaking for the neighborhood, they are happy with the other work he has done in the neighborhood.

Tom Reynolds, Chief Building Inspector, asked about the railing height because he is going to the variance board, and he will renovate under the international code which does not regulate height.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Dwight Guinn, 1249 Monroe Street, the neighborhood supports the variance request for the lowered railing.

2117 Jefferson Avenue – Tonya Dukes (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 73107EDG

Description of Work

Replace front door with wood paneled, half-view light door and reproduction stained glass or plain glass transom; replace gutters and downspouts; install new porch ceiling fixture and motion detector lights; clean and tuck point masonry, using Preservation Brief No. 2; replace porch floor with tongue & groove flooring, install balustrade with 2" balusters on 4-5" centers set into top and bottom rail, same size square porch columns with routed fluting and chamfered edges; install new mechanical systems; replace concrete asbestos roof with dimension or fishscale fiberglass shingles; replace shutters, with proper dimension for windows; repair or replace double hung windows with wood (if replaced); replace second story door on west elevation with double hung wood window; repair or replace siding, soffits, fascia, skirt board and corner boards in kind as necessary.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 73107EDG. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

See Edgewood Design Guidelines, Roofs, pg. 15, #4; Windows, pg. 17, #1; Porches, pg. 19, #1; Wall Coverings, Pg. 22, #2, #4 and Entrances, pg. 21, #1, #3.

This house has been vacant for some time. Bennett questioned the shaped asbestos tiles on the roof, and they are not being made anymore. The roofing material falls under a level 2. Guinn asked if that is a wall or roof. Bennett stated it is the roof. Bolen asked if the shutters could be functional. Bennett stated they are not sure if they are going to use shutters. It is a composite material.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

106 Major Reynolds Place – Federal Heath Sign Company (Jack Justice) (Applicant)
Spartan Holdings, LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 80607GEN

Description of Work

Install two aluminum panel signs. First, post mounted, with overall height from ground at 6' 2-1/2" tall and 2' wide. Second, hanging sign oval with 4' width and 2'4" height. Both with black backgrounds, yellow and white design identifying Bravo's "to go" function.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE portion of Certificate No. 80607GEN that refers to the hanging sign. DENY portion of Certificate No. 80607GEN that refers to the pole sign, unless modified to be no more than 3' high total, including height of sign.

Additional Comments

Directional signs may be no more than 3' tall as provided in the design guidelines adopted for Knollwood. The pole sign could be approved if it does not exceed that height. The hanging sign will not be visible outside the restaurant grounds, and does not create an excess wall sign area.

Jack Justice, Signs of Integrity, 5720 Middlebrook Pk. He was contracted to make the signs. The hanging sign is on the east side under an awning. The directional sign would be in the islands in the interior property. Arning stated that the guidelines say signs should not be over 3 feet and asked if they could be moved where cars would not obstruct their view.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE HANGING SIGNS AND DIRECTIONAL SIGNS, IF THEY ARE NOT MORE THAN 3 FEET HIGH. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

106 Major Reynolds Place – Chris Nickels, Managing Partner, Bravo (Applicant)
Spartan Holdings LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 80607GENB

Description of Work

Install sign in place of monument sign adjacent to Kingston Pike, with Bravo's logo and other information on black background and post with cover to resemble column. Two alternatives: One 15' post with 5'x10' sign area or other 6'x12' sign area on 15' post (15' alternative requested via e-mail from applicant on 8/2/2007).

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 80607GENB. The design guidelines for the Knollwood district are designed to preserve the importance of the Major John Reynolds house as the dominant feature of the site. The proposed sign does not fall within the signs allowed.

Additional Comments

Design guidelines allow directional/identification signs within the development that are no more than 3 feet high and contain no more than nine square feet per tenant; an identification/directory sign for the development as a whole; wall signs or banner for each building wall that faces into the site, with a maximum area of 40 sq. ft. and a vertical height of 5 ft., and an additional like size internally lit wall sign for each building facing Kingston Pike; and awnings or marquee containing a sign provided it falls within the 40 sq. ft. maximum allowed for wall signs. Bravo currently has a monument sign on the slope fronting Kingston Pike; that sign was allowed by the Commission because it was recognized that the topography of the site would make building signs invisible from Kingston Pike. The monument sign is somewhat larger than the size allowed by the design guidelines for directional signs, but smaller than the 40 sq. ft. of wall sign that would be allowed.

Bennett stated that commission approved a monument sign for the previous owner on Kingston Pike. The applicant is requesting two signs 20 feet tall. It does not meet the guidelines.

Chris Nickels, 1304 Burton Road, Manager of Bravos, stated he is looking for an alternative to the monument sign so his business could be located. Grieve added that we should maintain the guidelines.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DENY. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Whetsel stated she is glad he has maintained the guidelines. Arning stated if he moves the sign, we can hear it next month. Montgomery asked about the contrast on the sign. Nickels responded that it will be black with white and yellow letters and symbols. Montgomery said if it had brighter colors, it might be seen even if it is lower.

4th & Gill

936 Eleanor Street – Alyssa Rosenquist - Certificate No. 729074&G

Description of Work

Rebuild front porch to full width with pediment at front steps, 8' depth, tapered round wood columns, turned spindles in balustrade, tongue in groove floor, beadboard ceiling, lattice panels between brick piers, wood steps with boxed risers; repair wood siding in kind with imbricated shingles in gable of house and porch pediment; full view storm door; repair or replace trim around windows in original design; repair or replace skirt board; remove door to addition; install metal paneled doors at basement level rear; restore side addition roof (north elevation); install gutters and downspouts.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 729074&G. Proposed work is consistent with approved design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Applicant has been unable to locate photographic documentation of the original front porch. In addition, the siding on the bottom half of the front façade has been replaced, obliterating any shadows of the original front porch configuration. She has done careful research on other neighborhood houses and in pattern books in order to determine a design for the front porch; it is that design that is being presented today. (See Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, Porches pg. 12, #1, #2; Entrances pg. 13, #5; Wall Coverings pg. 14, #2, #3, #6.

Alyssa Rosenquist, 936 Eleanor Street, stated there is a rotting back door that will be taken out and covered up.

Grieve stated we need elevation drawings. Ms. Rosenquist showed the commission a picture of a similar house, but does not have drawings of her plans. Whetsel stated she would be glad to draw a sketch for her. Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor, stated that the neighborhood needs to see drawings of the work she plans to do. Arning stated we need drawings. She could ask John Wampler to start on the front porch and to get drawings to Bennett as soon as possible. Bennett stated she will include everything in the certificate but the design of the front porch, and it would come back to the commission in September.

Whetsel modify the motion and subject to drawings of the shed. We are asking that no work be done on the front of the house until we see drawings. All the rest would be on hold until we see the drawings.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE FRONT PORCH AND SIDE ADDITION RESTORATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bolen added that when Ms. Rosenquist begins adding a porch, she will have to go with the height restrictions, and he asked that she pick larger spindles.

601 Gill Avenue – Ray Snyder (Applicant), Isa Infante (Owner) – Certificate No. 731074&G

Description of Work

Replace unoriginal entry doors with six panel doors; repair or replace siding, fascia, cornice, rafter tails, soffit as necessary in kind; repair roof covering and structure in kind as necessary; repoint masonry chimneys and foundation as necessary using Preservation Brief No. 2; repair front porch tongue & groove flooring in kind as necessary and install quarter round; install pipe rail at front porch entry; install access door on existing rear foundation opening; repair existing 2/2 double hung wood windows; install storm windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 731074&G. Proposed work is consistent with Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

Existing front doors are not original to building. See Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, Wall coverings, pg. 14, #2, #7; Entrances, pg. 13, #7; Masonry pg. 15, #5, #6; Windows, pg. 11, #2, #3.

Bennett stated that today we have an amendment to the drawing to put a roof on the addition. It is a shed roof with a 4x4 corner post for support. The owner stated that the porch deck has started to warp.

Ray Snyder, Community Development Project Manager, stated that the roof addition over the deck is a new part of the application. Most of the houses of the vintage have covered doorways. Isa Infante, 601 Gill, stated she is the owner. Sean Bolen asked her if there is going to be glass in the six panel door. Snyder answered that it will be a half glass door. Tom Reynolds asked where the roof will go over the deck. From our standpoint there is an established setback. If the porch is 7', it will need a variance for the 1'. Infante stated there is an error on the drawing and it will only be 6'. Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor Street, asked if the new handrail will match what is on the front porch. Whetsel stated she can not speak for the neighborhood since they do not know what the deck will look like. Bolen stated that when it is covered, it becomes a porch. Grieve suggested everyone get together and come back next month concerning the new addition.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION NOT INCLUDING THE NEW ADDITION. THE OWNER WILL SUBMIT ANOTHER APPLICATION FOR THE PORCH AND COME BACK NEXT MONTH. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1015 Luttrell Street - Melynda Whetsel (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 802074&G

Description of Work

Construct new frame garage 7 feet from alley paving, 2 feet from south property line and 24'x30', one story, poplar siding, with possible imbricated shingles in gable facing house, turned porch post, 12/12 roof, one over one wood double hung window, paneled metal door, and overhead, paneled metal garage door.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 802074&G. Proposed design is consistent with adopted design guidelines, and proposed location is appropriate to surrounding neighborhood.

Additional Comments

See Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, Outbuildings, Pg. 19, #1.

Whetsel recused herself.

Melynda Whetsel, 1015 Luttrell, stated they have submitted pictures and drawings. The photograph is of a previous garage they built, there will be a turned columns and a pitched roof. We will use wooden fishscales to match the house. Bennett stated that composite material is acceptable.

Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor, stated that the neighborhood is pleased.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Arning turned the meeting over to Kenneth Gresham.

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

10917 Gilian (925 Olive) – Bill Threlkeld (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 80207CON

Description of Work

Constructing additions on side elevations, with 18'x18' addition on west elevation and 14'x18' addition on east, both to have brick faced foundation, hipped roofs with standing seam metal covering, three over one double hung wood windows, horizontal lap siding, corner boards and skirt boards.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80207CON. Proposed additions are consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Village of Concord Design Guidelines call for shapes and materials that are consistent with historic shapes and materials (pg. 26, #1); windows (pg. 28, #6); wall coverings (pg. 34, #1, #2); and pg. 44, #5, #7, #9, #13 and #14.

Bennett there are discrepancies in the address. 10917 Gillian is the official address and the applicant uses 925 Olive.

Bill Threlkeld, 925 Olive Road, stated that they bought the house in 1995 and it was comprised of four lots. We are adding on to the house. He is demolishing a house and using the material for his addition.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on September 20, 2007, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.