

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF OCTOBER 19, 2006

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Kenneth Gresham
Melynda Whetsel
Carol Montgomery
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Finbarr Saunders
Sandra Martin
Linda Claussen
William Hoehl
Herb Donaldson

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Ed Klim
Sean Martin
Jonathan Wimmer
Dwight Guinn
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Scott Busby (ex.)
Duane Grieve (ex.)
Lila Wilson (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order. He asked Commissioners to recuse themselves if there were any conflicts with agenda items.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY HOEHL TO APPROVE THE SEPTEMBER 21 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett discussed a memo that she sent to the Historic Zoning Commissions regarding the application modification committee chaired by Duane Grieve. They received emails detailing what is required for submission for a building permit from the City of Knoxville and Knox County. The language is very similar, except that the HZC Level III language summarizes the requirements and the Level IV language involving demolition or relocation is more explicit. A table included with the memo compares county and city building permits against the Historic Zoning Commission applications for Level II, III & IV.

Arning stated that Frost will bring up in City Council about parking in front yards of historic districts.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

Bennett discussed the Level 1 certificates.

1120 Harvey, Old North Knoxville, Patrick Kennedy, 91206ONK, Repair garage gable ends; replace asphalt shingle roof in kind; replace garage doors in kind.

1120 Kenyon, Old North Knoxville, Kindel Collins, 91806ONK, New roof; repair siding in kind as necessary; repair porch floor in kind as necessary.

1318 Armstrong Avenue, Old North Knoxville, Kathryn Ottolini, 92006ONK, Demolish exterior chimney to point where it is leaning away from house and rebuild, using mortar mix as recommended in Preservation Brief No. 2; Reframe wall studs, ceiling joists that have deteriorated due to leak from chimney; flash rebuilt chimney; reroof with membrane replacement on flat sections and asphalt shingle replacement for asphalt shingle on sloped sections. Repair fascia and soffit as necessary with design identical to original. Repair siding as necessary with replacement siding duplicating original. Bennett noted that this Certificate is a reapplication for a previously approved certificate that will allow completion of that work.

1306 Kenyon, Old North Knoxville, Jeff Miller, 100406ONK, Repair exterior siding in kind, or replace with wood lap siding; repair or replace tongue & groove porch floor; repair or replace beadboard porch ceiling; repair or replace porch railing with 2x2 set in balusters on 4-1/2 - 5 inch centers; (cont.) repair rear chimney and side chimney as necessary using Preservation Brief No. 2 and low-Portland mortar; repair gutters as necessary; reroof; repair windows as necessary.

1207 Folsom, Old North Knoxville, Knoxville Preservation & Development LLC, 100406ONKB, Remove artificial siding and repair as necessary; remove deteriorated wood double hung wood windows and replace in kind or repair; reroof; remove metal front porch supports and replace with chamfered porch columns.

716 Deery, Fourth & Gill, Heather Evans, 918064&G, Remove inappropriate rear window, restoring opening to original size and inserting wood casement window. Repair in kind siding, soffit, gutters, etc., as necessary. Repair porch column bases in kind as necessary.

1025 Eleanor, Fourth & Gill, Tim Doyle, 920064&G, Repair existing garage, including removal of aluminum siding and repair/replacement with poplar siding; repair of windows; reroofing and/or repair eaves; installation of originally sized garage doors facing side yard. Structure not visible from Eleanor. Remainder of repairs are interior.

31 Market Square, Market Square, Gregg White, 91906MKT, Install tan shelf awning without sides, with black understructure, width of existing bay, depth of 8'. Attachment to be in the mortar joints, not the brick. Attachment to be off storefront, window framing or mortar joints.

4450 Candora Avenue, General, Charlie Richmond (RAAECO), 92006GENB, Repair of existing basement on north elevation of building, including replacing green roof presently existing; replace existing steel inoperable windows with identically designed steel frame windows.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

1701 Laurel, Fort Sanders, NC-1, Level 1. Ed Klim, Johnson & Galyon.

Description of Work: Demolish deteriorated, non-contributing outbuilding; construct paved parking at rear of lot with adjoining concrete retaining walls.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 100406FTS. Garage is in very poor condition. It is visible from the side street, and its removal does constitute removal of space. Ft. Sanders design guidelines specify that HZC may allow demolition. Ft. Sanders Design guidelines, Page 22, Section J. 1. "The HZC may allow demolition if . . . The HZC finds that structure problems . . . warrant demolition"

Ed Klim, Johnson & Galyon, Inc. 1130 Atlantic Avenue stated that Johnson & Galyon would like to demolish the deteriorated outbuilding and construct a paved parking lot.

Bennett stated that although this certificate could be considered a Level 1, she wanted the Commission to be aware it, since a demolition was involved, and recommended approval.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th and Gill

1126 Luttrell, Kent Kendrick (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Install stained glass window in stairwell window opening. Window is old, with stained glass forming image of sailing ship.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 920064&GB. Proposed window is appropriately styled and workmanship is appropriate for age of house. Window currently in place is not original to house.

Bennett stated that Kendrick plans to install a stained glass window in the stairwell window opening.

Sean Martin of 1121 Eleanor Street stated that the neighborhood is pleased with the window.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

911 Luttrell, Jonathan Wimmer (Owner/Applicant)

Work Description: Replace turret and cupola; convert 2/3 of rear porch to mud room, enclosing existing footprint, matching siding, moving door to new opening and matching existing windows if one is desired; install new railing on remaining open porch portion; restore carriage house.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 1005064&GB. Proposed work is consistent with Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines. Turret roof is photographically documented and supported by adopted design guidelines (Roofs, pg. 10, #3).

Additional Comments: The proposed rear porch enclosure is at the rear of the building, not visible from Luttrell, and consistent with Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, Pg. 18, New Additions, #1, which stipulates that new additions should be done at the rear of the building, limiting the size and sale in relationship to the historic building. The footprint of the structure will not change.

Jonathan Wimmer of 911 Luttrell Street stated that he is excited about adding the cupola and putting the house back to look as it did originally.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

831 Deery, Marian Sing (Owner/Applicant)

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 1005064&G. APPROVE Certificate No. 1005064&G. The proposed improvements are consistent with design improvements.

Additional Comments: The lots in this block of Deery have double frontage on Gratz, and creating parking areas in rear yards could provide unattractive street frontage for the houses on the west side of Gratz. This application has provisions for a new privacy fence that will screen her back yard from view from Gratz. NOTE Applicant received approval for a 12' x 12' rear deck in connection with rehab of her property; the rehab has been completed (Certificate No. 1102054&G). Approval for a 12' x 12' rear deck in connection with rehab of her property; the rehab has been completed (Certificate No. 1102054&G).

Bennett stated that Ms. Sing will install the parking pad far enough back to plant landscaping in front of it.

Sean Martin stated that he would like to see landscaping instead of a chain link fence or landscaping in front of the fence. He has problems with a chain link fence being in a historic district and would like for the fence to come down. Sandra Martin stated that if a person is renovating, they have to bring the property up to code, and the fence does not fit.

Whetsel asked if the shed has been completed. Bennett does not think she has built the shed.

Tom Reynolds, Chief Building Inspector, stated that there might be some problems with this application. Engineering would have a say about access to the parking pad. The city does not require permits for fences, but it cannot be in the front yard if it impedes vision. A chain link does not block vision. Adding a deck is considered lot coverage and if the design guidelines address this, then they take precedent. The certificate of appropriateness needs to include the setbacks. Bennett doubts it exceeds 30 percent. The additional 10' x 10' deck could be too much lot coverage. Lot coverage can be 30 percent. Historic design guidelines take precedent over the base zoning. He wants her to include the setbacks in the certificate for the inspector's information. Bennett stated that the guidelines for 4th and Gill do not allow chain link fences, but she thinks it is preexisting. Whetsel asked if the commission can only make recommendations. She would like the chain link fence to come down and replace it with landscaping to cover the parking pad to make the streetscape attractive. The privacy fence could stay and is preexisting. Bennett stated that if the commission feels comfortable with what is on the certificate, she will meet with the owner onsite about the parking and landscaping.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ADDING THAT THE CHAIN LINK FENCE BE TAKEN DOWN AND REPLACED WITH LANDSCAPING TO COVER THE PARKING PAD TO MAKE THE STREETScape ATTRACTIVE. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH MARTIN VOTING AGAINST.

General

543 N. Broadway, Charlie Richmond, RAAECO (Applicant) – Old Gray Cemetery – (Owner)

Description of Work: Install street lighting system in Old Gray Cemetery; restore gatehouse.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 92006GENA. Proposed changes are consistent with the era in which Old Gray was established and developed. Work items proposed for office building are repair and will not alter design of structure.

Bennett stated that these fixtures are the appropriate design the commission approved years ago through KUB. Cotham stated that street lighting seems to be the best security for the cemetery, and the lights are being donated. They are basically repairing the gatehouse.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

6829 Clinton Highway, Airplane Service Station - 11-A-06-RZ

Kenneth Gresham, Chair of the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission, began presiding to hear the county application. He stated that the Airplane Service Station deserves any recognition it can get. It has been a landmark in that area since 1930. Bennett stated that several years ago a graduate student in planning prepared the National Register nomination for the building.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO APPROVE THE HISTORIC DESIGNATION FOR THE AIRPLANE SERVICE STATION.

Other

Approval of Knoxville Cultural Resources Update.

Arning stated that Bennett has been working on an update to the report. City Council asked MPC to update it. The last update was in 1996. She has added quite a few landmarks to the report. She is only working on the city portion. MPC will hear it at their November 9 meeting and then it will go to City Council for their approval. It has always been funded by the Tennessee Historical Commission. Bennett has combined the list with sites that are eligible. Claussen stated that this report should be included in school history classes.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE KNOXVILLE CULTURAL RESOURCES UPDATE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

- The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on November 16, 2006 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.