

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 16, 2006

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Kenneth Gresham
Melynda Whetsel
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Finbarr Saunders
Sandra Martin
Linda Claussen
William Hoehl
Herb Donaldson
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Lila Wilson

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Sharon Boyce
Sean Martin
Scott Kehne
Dwight Guinn
Kathy Gonzalez
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Scott Busby (excused)
Sandra Martin (excused)
Carol Montgomery (excused)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 19 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- **Reports to Commission:** Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning

Boyce discussed the possible modification of the Administrative Rules regarding a disclaimer. Bennett distributed a copy of one from the Pittsburgh Planning Commission. It basically states that staff will take minutes in a meeting but does not make verbatim transcripts of the meeting. If applicants wish to hire a stenographer to make verbatim transcripts at their own expense, a seat can be provided for the stenographer at the meeting table. Boyce stated that if there is an appeal to court, the city provides the stenographer and transcript. She will look at the legality of this.

Grieve's Applications Review Committee reviewed what an applicant has to have for a building permit. They recommend following the guidelines established by Knoxville's Plans Review office.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE APPLICATIONS REVIEW COMMITTEE’S REPORT AND RECOMMEND THEY FOLLOW THE CITY GUIDELINES FOR BOTH CITY AND COUNTY APPLICATIONS. MODIFY THE APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO EMPHASIZE CONSISTENCY WITH BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION REGARDING MATERIALS PRESENTED FOR APPROVAL. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Gresham began presiding over the meeting

MOTION BY CLAUSSEN AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO APPROVE THE APPLICATIONS REVIEW COMMITTEE’S REPORT AND RECOMMEND THEY FOLLOW THE CITY AND COUNTY GUIDELINES. MODIFY THE APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO EMPHASIZE CONSISTENCY WITH BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION REGARDING MATERIALS PRESENTED FOR APPROVAL. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Tom Reynolds, Chief Building Inspector, stated there was a complaint at 726 Deery Street regarding a tent carport, and a stop work order was issued. The carport on Tazewell Pike will be cited to court. At 37 Market Square, the work has been completed to repair the building and all the debris has been moved upstairs. At 28 Market Square KCDC is looking at the building, and there has been a request to Reynolds for a demolition by neglect process. If so, the building will have to be stabilized. At 36 Market Square, Grieve stated the windows have been removed from the north side of the building. Grieve asked about the McClung warehouses on Jackson Avenue where the roofs have fallen it and bricks are falling off. Reynolds has had some complaints on that building, and there may be someone who wants to buy it and rehab it. Regarding the Plante house on 238 E. Oklahoma, a proposal has been submitted by the city to rehab the house.

- **Staff Report:** Ann Bennett

The Knox County Art Educators exhibit is November 20-December 29 at the Phoenix Building at 418 S. Gay Street. Melynda Whetsel’s art work is on the program cover and is displayed at the exhibit.

Saunders reported on the National Trust meeting in Pittsburgh.

Bennett distributed an agenda from the Pittsburgh Historic Zoning Commission meeting. They require that the planning director, building inspector and neighborhood planning person be voting members and also two citizens and two architects.

- **Level I Certificates:** Ann Bennett

1008 Gratz, 4th and Gill, Tom Donaldson, Certificate No.1011064&G. Replace or repair square cut spindles that are missing, front and rear porches; repair front and rear porches tongue & groove floor where broken; repair front porch ceiling (currently plywood); replace asphalt shingle roof with like kind 3 tab shingle (possibly dimensional) while repair rear roof as necessary to correct sag; move exit door on rear porch to enclosed portion of rear porch, with no alteration in size of enclosure or footprint of porch.

1012 Luttrell, 4th and Gill, Kim Stevens, Certificate No.1013064&G, Rebuild three sashes in same pane configuration, wood, double hung, same size. Replace damaged front porch floor boards as necessary, using identical materials.

505 E. Scott, Old North Knoxville, Steve Hill, Certificate No.102706ONK, Install 12x20 deck on north side of house at rear of building, not visible from Scott or Harvey.

29 Market Square, Market Square H-1, Judy King, Camel Custom Canvas Shop Certificate No.102006MKT, Install lettering on valance of awning, 8'7"x8", spelling "LaCosta."

- **Certificates of Appropriateness**

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Old North Knoxville

1164 Armstrong, Scott Kehne (Applicant), Farmers Mutual of Tennessee (Owner), Certificate No.102506ONK

Description of Work

Demolish existing house.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 102506ONK. This building has been poorly maintained, but is still capable of being rehabilitated. Demolition of the building is in clear conflict with the adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

The location of this building, as part of the Old North Knoxville H-1 Overlay, is important in safeguarding the boundaries of the historic district. The neighborhood and the applicant have been in discussion about the possibility of moving the building and retaining and expanding the H-1; at the time of compilation of the staff report, no final agreement had been reached.

Scott Kehne, owner, stated that the house can not be moved and has no access. They are waiting to hear from the Old North Knoxville neighborhood whether they are in favor of it being moved. He supports denying without prejudice.

Whetsel asked what the plans are for the building on Broadway. He will have the elevations and plans for the building at the next meeting.

Wilson stated that Old North Knoxville is pleased that negotiations are ongoing and the issues will be addressed.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO DENY THE APPLICATION WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mechanicsville

1317 Hannah, Kathy Gonzales, Owner/Applicant, Certificate No.102506MEC

Work Description

Construct one story rear addition with cross gabled roof, raised brick foundation, wood siding, two over two double hung windows, projecting bay with recessed panels and brackets, and shed roof enclosure with connecting shed roof enclosure. Roof covering will match existing roof; Extended porch will be tongue & groove floor, 2"x2" square cut balusters set in to top and bottom rail on 4-5" centers.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 102506MEC. The proposed addition is consistent in form and scale with the existing dwelling, is being made to the rear of the existing dwelling, and uses architectural details and materials from the original.

Additional Comments

The proposed materials and design for the exterior features are consistent with the adopted Mechanicsville Design Guidelines. See Pg. 6 - "Roofs, Pg. 7 - "Porches", Pg. 8 - "Doors," Pg. 9 - "Height of Foundation and Stories," Pg. 10 - "Walls," Pg. 12 - "Masonry Chimneys and Foundations," and Pg. 13 - "Windows."

Kathy Gonzalez of 1317 Hannah Avenue stated that they are putting the addition on so her mother can move in with them. They have worked with Steve Young of Odle and Young Architects. There are two different kinds of windows one over one and two over two, and they are not sure which will be required. Bennett told her to ask Knox Heritage ask if they have any two over two windows in storage. They want to modify the application asking for one over one. She asked about balustrades. Bennett suggested they use square posts and not turned posts. She asked about using stucco on the back at the foundation. Bennett does not see a problem with this. Façade foundation on the back to use stucco?? or brick.

Gonzalez is president of Mechanicsville stated that there is no neighborhood opposition. Arning thanked her for what they are doing and stated that it would help if a neighborhood representative could come to all meetings.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE WITH THE ALTERATIONS NOTED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

501 Arthur, Mike Elliott, Owner/Applicant, Certificate No.110106MEC

Work Description

Replace asphalt shingled roof with ribbed metal roof.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 110106MEC. The adopted Mechanicsville Design Guidelines (Pg. 6, "Roofs") allow for replacement roofs that duplicate original roofing materials, specifically mentioning metal roofs as acceptable.

A year ago Elliott had an application approved last year but did not replace the windows in kind. He applied and received Empowerment Zone funds and will replace the wrong windows and replace the roof. The first certificate did not include metal roof. Gonzalez stated that he has shown the neighborhood plans, and they are concerned about the parking. He has not been working with the community very much. Grieve is on the

façade review committee. He asked if the community has seen plans for the wrought iron railings and they have. They approve of the wrought iron railings.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- **Other**

214 E. Glenwood, Shumaker-Vance House (4th and Gill Addition)

Bennett discussed the Designation Report on the Shumaker-Vance House. The house was moved from the adjacent lot. She is recommending the 4th and Gill H-1 Historic Overlay be extended to include this house. Saunders is president of Knox Heritage. He hopes the houses across the street will join in the historic area. Whetsel stated that the neighborhood approves.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH SAUNDERS RECUSING HIMSELF.

Bennett stated that Knox Heritage has won a \$50,000 National Restore America grant from the National Trust for Historic Preservation and HGTV to restore two George Barber houses at 1618 and 1620 Washington Avenue in the Parkridge neighborhood. It will be combined with money Knox Heritage is raising to renovate the houses.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN ASKING THE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSIONS TO SEND A LETTER TO KNOX HERITAGE COMMENDING THEM ON THEIR WORK. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The annual election of officers will be held at the December 21 meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on December 21, 2006 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.