# MINUTES KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MEETING OF JUNE 15, 2006

\_\_\_\_\_

| <b>Members Present:</b> | Others Present     |
|-------------------------|--------------------|
| Nic Arning              | Sharon Boyce       |
| Scott Busby             | Tom Reynolds       |
| Steve Cotham            | Greg Marlow        |
| Charles Faulkner        | Sean Martin        |
| Kenneth Gresham         | Daniel Schuh       |
| Duane Grieve            | <b>Bob Whetsel</b> |
| William Hoehl           | Florence Drury     |
| Finbarr Saunders        | Richard Bender     |
| Lila Wilson             | Scott West         |
| Herb Donaldson          | Ann Bennett        |
| Melynda Whetsel         | Charlotte West     |
| C 1 1 / 4 ·             |                    |

Sandra Martin

#### **Members Absent:**

Linda Claussen (ex.) Carol Montgomery (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and introduced Sandra Martin, recently appointed to the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission. He asked Commissioners if there were any conflicts with agenda items.

### MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE MAY 18, 2006 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning

Tom Reynolds, Chief Building Inspector for the City of Knoxville, stated that Chris Plante, the owner at 238 E. Oklahoma, still has a valid application. Concerning the fallen wall at 37 Market Square, he has issued a permit for Richard Bender to take the wall down. At 36 Market Square, vinyl windows were installed and not allowed. He has issued an interior demolition permit for Lord Lindsey's; Dwight Guinn is the architect representing the owner, Kent Kendrick, who has indicated the building defects will be corrected.

• Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

**839 Deery** – Fourth & Gill – Greg Marlow – 5188064&G – Demolish two story rear addition, returning house to original footprint. Add shed roof over side porch and enclosed rear space. Use previously approved railing of 2" balusters on 5" centers set in top & bottom rails.

Page Two – Minutes Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Meeting of June 15, 2006

\_\_\_\_\_

**721 Luttrell** – Fourth & Gill – Mary & Kathryn Waggoner – 522064&G – Replace roof.

**37 Market** - Market Square – Richard Bender – 52206MKT – Conduct partial demolition to determine cause of structural collapse; install shoring to prevent further collapse; correct structural deficiencies.

**36 Market** – Market Square – Bernadette West – 52306MKT – Install new wood double hung two over two windows in existing masonry openings using specifications from the initial Cardinal Properties/Kinsey Probasco project for Market Square.

**1316 Grainger** – Old North Knoxville – Ray Hyde – 52506ONK – Install new roof; rebuild existing rear window; replace siding, fascia and soffits in kind as necessary; remove rear aluminum siding.

**509 E. Scott** – Old North Knoxville – Larry & Janie Lauver – 51606ONK – Replace metal porch columns with wood tapered, fluted porch columns.

• Certificates of Appropriateness

#### KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Scott West – 18 Market Square, Suite 211 – He stated that he owns Earth to Old City, Preservation Pub, Oodles and World Grotto. At 36 Market Square he is asking that the vinyl windows he has already installed not have to be replaced. He did not know vinyl was not acceptable, and the cost to replace them will be more than they can afford.

Saunders stated that the commission's job is to uphold the guidelines. Bennett read from page 18 of the guidelines, specifying that replacement windows be wood, duplicating the originals.

Reynolds stated that the building permit has a stop work order on it. The windows facing Market Square are wood, but along Wall Street they are vinyl. Vinyl is not permitted in a fire district and does not meet guidelines for H-1.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR WOOD WINDOWS IN AN H-1 AND FIRE DISTRICT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Whetsel stated that the merchants on Market Square chose wooden windows in their guidelines, and West could talk to the owners and try to have the guidelines changed.

Page Three – Minutes Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Meeting of June 15, 2006

\_\_\_\_\_

#### **Edgewood-Park City H-1**

**2023 Washington**, Knoxville Preservation & Development, LLC – Daniel Schuh (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** 16'x8' kitchen addition with shed roof with asphalt shingle covering, wood double hung one over one window relocated from current rear wall; addition of one matching window, wood 4" lap siding, two pairs of French doors in rear wall. All improvements are on the west wall of the building, and will not be visible from Washington or adjacent streets.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate 52506EDG. See Secretary's Standard #9, pg. 12, Edgewood-Park City Design Guidelines. Proposed improvements are at rear of structure, adding a rear porch to existing home, and are not visible from Washington Avenue. Details of improvements are consistent in materials and character with existing building.

Dan Schuh of 230 E. Oklahoma stated that the owner wants him to add a kitchen with new windows blending with the house and not shown from the street.

# MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

#### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

1342 Grainger, Florence C. Drury (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Reroofing using identical materials (asphalt). (Level I) Remove interior brick chimney. (Level II).

**Staff Recommendation:** DENY Chimney removal as contemplated in the Level II portion of Certificate No. 53006ONK. Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines, Roofs, Pg. 13, #3. The applicant has indicated that the chimney was deteriorated, and was removed to roof level in preparation for the installation of a new roof. Applicant is concerned that the existing chimney structure will not support a new chimney's added weight. The chimney was removed before application was made for a Certificate. The Level I portion of this Certificate, allowing roof replacement, has been issued.

Florence Drury of 1342 Grainger Avenue stated she is waiting on permission to replace chimney or leave it off. Schuh stated the guidelines say that chimneys are not to be torn down.

Page Four – Minutes Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Meeting of June 15, 2006

\_\_\_\_\_

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DENY THE CHIMNEY REMOVAL AND ASK THAT THE OWNER PUT THE CHIMNEY BACK. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

#### Fourth & Gill H-1

1015 Luttrell, Bob and Melynda Whetsel ((Owner/Applicants)

**Description of Work:** Level I: Remove unoriginal front porch. Level II: Install wood double hung one over one windows; Install new wood, 3/4 glass doors and glass transoms with original sizing off front porch and one at rear; Repair or install wood siding where original cannot be reused; save original ornamentation and create new, consistent reproductions where necessary; replace front porch to replicate original front porch with turned wood columns, tongue and groove bead board ceiling, tongue and groove porch floor, turned wood balusters set into top and bottom rail; reroof; point masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2 (chimney) and repoint and restucco foundation if necessary; add rear screened porch with square posts and tongue and groove floor.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE LEVEL II of Certificate 602064&G. (Level I previously issued). Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines: Porches, pg. 12, #1, Entrances, pg. 12, #1, 2 & 4, Wall Coverings, pg. 13, #3, 6, 7 & 11, New Additions, pg. 18, #1, and Windows, pg. 11, #4. Applicant has removed artificial siding and porch enclosure (as previously approved), and new windows will be same size as originals. Porch will be rebuilt to original design. Removal of enclosures and artificial siding has clearly revealed the original features of the building; applicant is proceeding with a renovation that meets the requirements of the Secretary of Interior's Standards and the Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines.

Bob Whetsel of 1018 Luttrell Street stated that when restoration of this house is complete, all of the houses on this block of Luttrell will have been restored.

Shawn Martin of 1121 Eleanor Street pointed out that the neighborhood is very pleased with what the Whetsel's are doing to the house.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH WHETSEL RECUSING HERSELF. Page Five – Minutes Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Meeting of June 15, 2006

\_\_\_\_\_

#### General H-1

**Bleak House, Confederate Memorial Hall**, 3148 Kingston Pike, United Daughters of Confederacy/Charlotte Miller (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Install monument sign with overall size of 6' high and 4+' wide (sign board size 3'x4') installed on 2 PVC Posts with caps. Sign to be colored high density urethane, double-sided and sandblasted, with words "Bleak House, Confederate Memorial Hall, Circa 1858".

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate 6106GEN with modification of sign board to overall 9 sq. ft. Conforms to Knoxville Zoning Ordinance sign regulations and to the Secretary of Interior's Standards, #9. Bleak House is the site of many functions, such as weddings and other catered events, and derives much of its operating income from those functions. The museum house is the only one on Kingston Pike that does not have a large identifying sign, and due to the traffic volume and speed, is difficult for guests to find when attending those functions. Installation of a sign is necessary if the Chapter is to continue to realize the source of income from the rentals; however, the overall size of a sign proscribed by the Knoxville Zoning Ordinance is 9 sq. ft. The suggested modification will bring the sign into compliance with those regulations.

Bleak House is the only historic house on Kingston Pike without a sign and it has to be designated H-1 to put one up. They have applied for 12' sign and 9' is only allowed. They will get it within the 9 sq. ft. City Council should approve this within the next week for H-1.

# MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

#### **Market Square H-1**

37 Market Square, Richard Bender (Structural Engineer/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Correct structural collapse in south wall of building. Ground floor to second floor level to receive 4" reinforced concrete facing wall dowelled to the existing brick after the collapsed area is repaired or removed. Second floor is to receive stucco finish after loose brick is removed or repaired. Downspouts and gutters are to be reworked as required.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate 6106MKT. The proposed repairs will stabilize the building, are not visible from Market Square, and are in keeping with other repairs done prior to designation. This building is in extremely poor condition, with the structural collapse of the

Page Six – Minutes Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Meeting of June 15, 2006

-----

south wall. Inappropriate repairs were made to the building many years ago, and prior to designation. They involved filling a large breach of the north wall with concrete block, followed by a cement coating of the entire wall. The west wall facing the alley has also been covered with a stucco coat which is likely to be made of a high content Portland cement mix. The south façade wall is inaccessible; it is inches away from the north wall of 35 Market.

# MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other

Review of current developments: Scenic Drive NC-1

Bennett stated that City Council met and heard the request for NC-1 overlay for the Scenic Drive area. Council adopted a motion that omitted 33 parcels from the original petition for designation. The owners of those parcels have indicated an intention to place themselves under deed restrictions in lieu of the NC-1designation. Council has referred the proposed overlay district back to MPC to assess the impact this would have on the district. The matter will be heard at MPC's July 13 meeting. City Council is directed by the state enabling legislation to seek MPC's opinion in the event there is a substantive change in a zoning petition. Bennett was asked to describe the impact on properties adjacent to a smaller Scenic Drive NC-1 if they decide in the future they would like to be included in the overlay, and stated that a rezoning petition would be required to change the status of those properties.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on July 20, 2006 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.