

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JULY 20, 2006

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Scott Busby
Kenneth Gresham
Duane Grieve
William Hoehl
Lila Wilson
Herb Donaldson
Melynda Whetsel
Linda Claussen

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Tom Reynolds
Arin Streeter
Brian Pittman
Tricia Stuth
Sean Martin
Ted Shelton
Dwight Guinn
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Carol Montgomery (ex.)
Steve Cotham (ex.)
Charles Faulkner (ex.)
Finbarr Saunders (ex.)
Sandra Martin

Arning called the meeting to order. He asked Commissioners if there were any conflicts with agenda items.

Whetsel stated that the June 15 minutes should be changed to read on page 2 concerning the guidelines, "that at this point, West's only recourse for future structures would be to have the guidelines changed."

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE JUNE 15 2006 MINUTES WITH THE CORRECTION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning
- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1

924 Eleanor, Kent Kendrick (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Add dormers to sides at rear of house, with wood windows to provide access to upper stories. Side walls of dormers to be either wood shingles or man-made or natural slate. Provisions of earlier Certificate to remain in effect.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 626064&G. Proposed dormers will not be visible from Eleanor, and will duplicate the existing dormer shapes already found on the building. (pg. 10, #1, 4th & Gill Design Guidelines). The addition of dormers will allow full utilization of attic space, and will not introduce a new element to the roof, or interfere with the original dormers that still exist on the building. (NOTE: Applicant obtained a Certificate (317064&G) that remains in effect and includes removal of artificial siding, front porch restoration, and full rehab of the building.)

Sean Martin of 1121 Eleanor Street stated that the neighborhood has no problem with this request.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General H-1

James Park House, 422 W. Cumberland, Arin Streeter/Brewer, Ingram & Fuller
(Architect)

Description of Work: Install restored semaphore in lawn to rear of primary building, near approved rear addition.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 70506GEN. The semaphore is proposed for installation to the rear of the James Park House. It has been restored and will function as an art installation that relates contextually to the proposed occupant of the house. The future tenant of the James Park House will be operating the Gulf & Ohio Railways and the Three Rivers Rambler from offices in the restored historic house.

Aaron Streeter of 401 Henley Street stated that he considers this a yard ornament of a restored signal. Wilson noted she felt that the signal is a sign and not art and just shows there is a railroad office there. Grieve stated it is not being set in front of the historic building but in front of the addition. He considers it part of history. Bennett stated that the city has determined it is not a sign.

Linda Claussen of 8200 Seven Islands Road stated that this signal was used on the railroads to show the train whether to stop or not. It is a part of railroad heritage. They want a distinctive way to show their railroad business is there.

Arning stated he is worried we are setting a precedent because it looks like a sign.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION FAILED ON ROLL CALL VOTE.

Those voting to approve the staff recommendation were Grieve and Donaldson. Those voting to deny the staff recommendation were Arning, Busby, Hoehl, Wilson, and Whetsel.

Mary Boyce Temple House, 623 W. Hill Avenue (Brian Pittman
(Architect/Owner/Applicant))

Description of Work: Demolish 3 story brick addition made to northwest corner of building c. 1940; demolish one story concrete block addition (c.1980) on west elevation; demolish hyphen connecting building on corner with guest house to the east; fire stair. West elevation: reinstall wood double hung one over one windows in original openings; reinstall roof line between chimneys, matching existing cornice and brackets; replace rear porch removed for addition, revealing arched openings with keystones, with East Tennessee marble or wood floors to match existing front steps; repoint mortar (matching existing mortar in color and composition) and repairing brick as necessary; reconstruct masonry basement wall on west elevation; reconstruct missing rusticated stone wall at edge of sidewalk on Henley; install wrought iron fencing to match existing detailing; replace existing one over one double hung wood windows in kind, with architect series windows that match originals; repair more elaborate windows in remainder of house; install half-round copper gutters and rectangular downspouts; install HVAC unit on north elevation, removed from Henley; repair roof as necessary, retaining slate; repair soffits and eaves in kind, as necessary. Guest house: replace existing slider windows (new addition) with casement windows; remove concrete block and glass block fill and put in casement, French doors and transoms. Install full width steps from existing front patio to front yard; put smooth stucco coat on exterior concrete block wall.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 62906GEN. The proposed rehabilitation meets the Secretary's Standards, and the proposed demolition of some sections will remove materials that have obscured the original design and architectural details. The Mary Boyce Temple House has been modified several times in the past. These new sections obscure, but have not removed, the original architectural details still present on the house. This proposed rehabilitation, which includes the recreation of original landscaping and masonry details such as retaining walls and wrought iron

fencing, as well as details on the building itself, will restore the house to a prominent appearance and allow original architectural details to regain visibility.

Brian Pittman of 137 Ford Valley Road stated he purchased the house 3 weeks ago and plans to detach the concrete structure. He will live in the house, and it will be a single family dwelling again. It had been divided into 10 apartments.

Whetsel and Claussen commended his efforts for restoring the house.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

109 (105) Gill, Ted Shelton and Tricia Stuth (Architects/Owners/Applicants)

Description of Work: Construct two new dwelling units adjacent to 105 Gill (101 and 109) per plans submitted with application, with steeply pitched complex roof shapes, metal roofs, wood lap siding, concrete block foundation walls; also repair to existing structure to replace metal roof in kind, repair siding, fascia and wood trim as necessary duplicating original material, half round gutters and round downspouts. Setbacks for new construction: front - minimum of 11'6", side yard minimum 2' (including corner), lot size which duplicates originally designated houses, minimum 44'10" width, rear yard minimum 11, 79' lot depth, lot size approximately 3470 sq. ft., maximum percentage of lot coverage 45-46%.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 70506GENB. The proposed infill structures are contemporary interpretations of the buildings originally found on the parcels; they respect the setback and dimensions, roof shapes, and other elements of those original dwellings, while using materials that reflect the varied construction found around the remaining structure. The proposed repairs to the remaining structure are consistent with Secretary's Standard #5 and #6, which provide that distinctive features and craftsmanship are to be preserved and that deteriorated features will be repaired or replaced in kind. The proposed design of the new buildings is consistent with Standard #9, which provides that "new construction will not destroy the . . . spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." The new construction is also consistent with Standard #10, which provides that ". . . new construction will be

undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Tricia Stuth of 105 A Gill Avenue is the owner, and stated she will be the one building the houses.

Bennett stated that the property is within Old North Knoxville boundaries, but she will not have to follow the Old North guidelines. Chester Kilgore sent a letter from the Old North Knoxville neighborhood supporting the infill, but they did not approve of the design.

Wilson stated that this design is not compatible with the old house. Ms. Stuth stated they will follow the footprint and try to build the houses to go with the cinder block buildings across the street and with the existing house.

Whetsel commended Ms. Stuth on her efforts, but asked why she would not try to match the existing house instead of matching the cinder block houses. Whetsel stated they do not complement the existing house.

Sean Martin of 1121 Eleanor Street stated that he had talked to the neighbors about putting modern houses in a historic district. There is a mixture on that street, and 4th and Gill has a mixture of houses. Modernism is fine if it is used appropriately.

Ted Shelton of 109 Gill Avenue stated that these houses are going to be residential, and he and Ms. Stuth will live in one of them.

Stuth stated that the location of the windows has to do with the light because there will not be air conditioning.

Claussen stated that they should not build a new house pretending that it is to be an old house.

Wilson stated that these designs are not compatible with the old house at all.

Stuth stated the compatibility of the houses comes from the massing, materials, setbacks, eaves and footprint. They are not trying to match the existing house just make them compatible.

Grieve stated the commission should look at the Secretary's Standards because the owners are not trying to copy the existing house and should be commended.

Dwight Guinn of 1249 Monroe Street stated that this is a good project. Neighborhoods need contemporary designs, and the neighborhood would like to see it passed.

Busby stated that we do not impose our judgment, just whether it meets the guidelines.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH WILSON OPPOSING.

Tom Reynolds, Chief Building Inspector for the City of Knoxville, stated that he talked to Ray Snider and Plante of 238 E. Oklahoma has been approved for a loan. Concerning the Lord Lindsey house, he has been working with the owner's son, and they are planning to meet with the architect. At 37 Market Square, the collapsed wall has been repaired. At 36 Market Square (West property), there is still a stop work order. At 26 Market Square, part of the roof is gone, and Reynolds has issued an interior building permit. The owner indicated he would shore up the building, but has not. Reynolds has been asked to look at the building as a possible demolition by neglect. Concerning the carports erected on Tazewell Pike carports, one was moved and the court decision on the other has not been issued.

Arning stated the he wants the carport situation resolved because it has gone on too long. Sharon Boyce of the City Law Department stated they may take the case to Chancery Court.

1345 (1349) Armstrong, Patty and Dennis Earl (Owner/Applicants)

Description of Work: Construct new frame 1-1/2 story garage with weatherboard wood siding, double hung one over one wood windows, brick foundation, hip roof with 9/12 pitch, dormer with Palladian style one over one window with gabled roof with cedar shakes and partial cornice return, corner boards and frieze to match existing house at 1349, door on east elevation, paired garage doors. Garage to be constructed on vacant lot that has been incorporated into residential lot currently addressed at 1349 Armstrong.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 70706ONK. Proposed garage is consistent in appearance with carriage houses in the historic district and with the house at 1349 with which it is associated.

Wilson stated that Old North approves of this plan.

Grieve stated that he does not know where the garage is going. Bennett explained that a one lot subdivision had been completed and she was told the carport would be put on the back of the pre-existing lot neighboring theirs prior to subdivision. Grieve stated that the commission needs to see a site plan

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND FOR THE OWNERS TO FOLLOW THE FORMAT OF OTHER GARAGES IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD AND TO SEND THE COMMISSION SITE PLAN DRAWINGS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

708 E. Scott, Charlotte Pence (Contract Holder/Applicant)

Description of Work: Repoint foundation and front chimney, using provisions of Preservation Brief No. 2 (low Portland-content mortar matching existing with joints struck to match existing); remove rear brick vent, not visible from Scott.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 70506ONK. Proposed repointing is consistent with the standards for Masonry on pg. 24, #7 and #8, which provide that mortar will match the original and will not be high-content Portland. The brick vent that is proposed for removal is at the rear of the building, not visible from Scott, and was probably intended to vent a kitchen cook stove or furnace.

Wilson stated she has no problem with this.

MOTION BY DONALDSON AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Other

Consideration of proposed designation and report on MPC action: Scenic Drive NC-1

Bennett explained that City Council approved a plan that would allow properties wishing to be excluded from the Scenic Drive NC-1 to file deed restrictions. The matter was referred to MPC, which approved. City Council will reconsider on August 15.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on August 17, 2006 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.