

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF FEBRUARY 16, 2006

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Scott Busby
Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Herb Donaldson
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Duane Grieve
William Hoehl
Carol Montgomery
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel
Lila Wilson

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Lee Ingram
Jason DeBord
Jamie Rowe
Tom Brechko
Bob Whetsel
Mike Elliott
Kathryn Hurley
Mahasti Vafaie
Lee Ingram
Jason DeBord
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent (excused):

Duane Grieve
Art Clancy

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 19, 2006 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Reports to Commission: Chairman Nic Arning
Arning noted that Mr. Chet Kilgore, Old North Knoxville's neighborhood liaison with the Commission, was unable to attend the meeting but had contacted the Commission indicating approval of the Certificate to be considered at the February 16 meeting, involving the addition of stained glass transom, sidelights and cottage window transom at 510 E. Scott.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Bennett reported the following Level 1 Certificates:

1813 Washington (Edgewood-Park City H-1) Dept. of Comm. Dev. (Applicant) File No. 1206054&G: replace roof covering, add ridge vent and HVAC.
1640 Jefferson (Edgewood-Park City H-1) Matthew Kellogg (Applicant), File No. 12606EDG: remove stucco from existing chimney, repoint brick, construct missing top of second chimney to match existing chimney.

803 S. Gay (Bijou Theatre) Lee Ingram (Applicant), File No.1106GEN. Install blade sign, modifying size to 5'1" wide and 18'6" tall.

718 Morgan (4th & Gill H-1) Jack Woodrick (Applicant) File No. 111064&G: repair roof, soffits, weatherboard, first and second story porches, replacing balustrade with spindles on 4" centers set in top and bottom rails, t&g floor, replace roof.

918 Gratz (4th & Gill H-1) Virginia Douglas (applicant) File No. 112064&G: repair porch roof, floor (t&g) and ceiling (beadboard) if necessary; add balustrade of 2" spindles on 4" centers.

702 Luttrell (4th & Gill H-1) Ted Fisher (Applicant) File No. 201064&G: Install wood louvered vents in gable ends sized to original openings; color-clad storm windows; garage roof and door; repaint; balustrade on front porch with 2"x2" balusters on 4" centers set in top and bottom rails; repair siding and shingles in kind as necessary; repair rear stairs and retaining wall to basement with repairs to roof covering basement access; repair windows as necessary.

150 Major Reynolds Pl (Knollwood), Ken Bronson (Applicant) File No. 12506GEN: repair railing on one story ells.

602 S. Gay (Burwell Building), Jason DeBord (Applicant) File No. 13106GEN: modify previous Certificate to incorporate storefront windows on Gay Street elevation (Center) and Church Street.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Old North Knoxville H-1

510 E. Scott, Thomas Brechko (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: LEVEL I CERTIFICATE: Replace siding, fascia and soffits in-kind as necessary; replace two basement doors, neither original, with appropriate replacement doors (doors not visible from E. Scott Ave.); install new wood window in rear and side gables (for egress requirements windows would be casements with one over one appearance, mimicking appearance of front gable window); install gutters; install weathervane on front gable; and install utilities underground. Level II: Install 8'x8' deck on side of house behind lattice screen with copper trim; elevation of deck to be no more than 2'. Install stained glass per submitted attachments in sidelights and transom at front entry and in transom portion of cottage window on street side. Install wood screen/storm door at front entry using antique grille.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 020106ONK. Stained glass is consistent with the features in the Windows section of the Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines (pg. 15); remainder of items previously approved (Certificate No. 032904ONK). Owner is updating Certificate to reflect items previously approved but not yet completed on Certificate No. 032904ONK. Remainder of changes contemplated to transoms at front entry and cottage window on front bay are consistent

with the description of stained glass features found in the adopted design guidelines. There is now a leaded glass transom in place above the front entry. The sidelights and the Cottage window transom were probably either leaded or stained glass; the originals were removed prior to designation, and no record of their original design exists. The proposed stained glass is typical of the Victorian era and appropriate for the structure's overall design.

Tom Brechko – 510 E. Scott Avenue stated that he is asking for the commission's support of these projects.

The neighborhood is in agreement (letter from Kilgore noted in Chairman's Report.)

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mechanicsville H-1:

501 Arthur, John Michael Elliott & Kathleen Hurley (Owner/Applicants)

Description of Work: Modification to Certificate 100305MEC-Installation of Pella Architect Series one over one double hung wood windows (quote No. 64060118A to Mike Elliott).

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 11806MEC. Proposed replacement windows are appropriate for commercial building of 501 Arthur's design and era. Applicants received permission to rehabilitate Bradley's Food Market at the November, 2006 meeting of the HZC. Provisions of that certificate (No. 100305MEC) included repairing second story windows. Applicant began the repair and discovered that the windows were in very poor condition, and replaced them with one double hung vinyl windows. A stop work order was issued. This application is for one over one Pella Architect Series replacement windows featuring wood windows consistent with the design of windows from the era when Bradley's Food Market was constructed. Although they are not exact replacements, they are appropriately designed for the building. The original windows were not salvageable.

Mike Elliott (234 Douglas Avenue) noted that his partner is Kathleen Hurley (5405 Crestwood). They have applied for a façade program through the city that would cover up to \$50,000 for restoration. That program should replace the windows, but they will cover the costs if the program does not. Elliott wants to replace the windows after the Commission issues the Certificate and removes the stop work order.

Bennett stated that a stop work order was issued. Work may proceed under that order, but the building is flagged to insure that those windows are replaced with appropriate windows prior to release of the stop order and issuance of a Certificate of Completion. That will allow the owners to work on the store front and interior. Elliott stated that the entire rehabilitation of the building will not be finished for a few months. They will work on the finishes for the restaurant at the end of the process, and will need to rent the apartments in order to finance the completion of the restaurant. They cannot rent the apartments until they obtain the Completion Certificate. Bennett explained that the stop work order is the only insurance the HZC has that the work of replacing the windows is properly done. Lifting of the stop work order will allow them to continue without replacing the windows. Hurley stated that the building was falling apart when they started working on it. They want to go ahead and rent the apartments in about one month. Bennett suggested that the HZC approve what the Certificate before them today, and she will work with Community Development and Codes to get an assessment of the time schedule for the façade program. The item can be placed on the HZC agenda for March.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1:

Market Square Pavilion, Knoxville Department of Public Services (Applicant)

Description of Work: Change roof covering of current pavilion structure from fabric to translucent polycarbonate panels. Panels will be the same white color as the original fabric and will attach to the existing structure.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 20106MKT. Proposed replacement roof is an alteration in the original material approved for the pavilion design, but is not an alteration in the appearance or design of the structure. The originally approved material has already failed; reinstallation of the same fabric covering will create an ongoing maintenance problem which can be solved by the proposed material, without altering the design of the structure.

Bob Whetsel, Director of City Public Service Department, 400 Main Street, stated that money from city's roof fund will be used for this project.

Saunders stated the reason fabric was used was so the fabric could be removed if they wanted to. Whetsel stated it was never discussed with the Public Service Dept.

Busby recused himself as the architect for the project. Whetsel recused herself.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

12 Market Square, Mahasti Vafaie (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Replace current canopy with one of larger size, 10' deep by 26' long, built on 6" truss system and with clear rollup sides and front using Velcro tie-ups.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 12706MKT. Awnings are contemplated in the Market Square Design Guidelines (pg. 20, 1-3); the proposed design is consistent. Guideline at pg. 20, #4 provides that the standard street level awning should project 4-7 feet from the face of the building. The current awning at 12 Market has a projection greater than 7 feet; the proposed awning would also be greater than 7 feet. However, the modifications to sidewalk width installed several years ago provide a wider walkway than 7 feet, and anticipate that covered outdoor spaces for dining will be included at restaurants fronting on Market Square. The proposed awning depth of 10' is consistent with the seating width at the restaurant and is recommended for approval.

Mahasti Vafaie, 12 Market Square stated she would like to provide shelter for people to eat outside. Bennett stated that the owners on the Square are aware of the application. Busby asked if they were going to put a sign on the awning. The applicant stated she would like to but had not submitted a design. Bennett stated that the guidelines say the name has to be on the awning valance and can be printed or sewn onto the awning.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General H-1 Designations:

Bijou Theatre, 803 S. Gay, Lee Ingram (Architect)

Description of Work: Install automatic teller machine on recessed, splayed wall at corner of Gay and Cumberland.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 2206GEN. Proposed teller location replaces contemporary door at splayed northeast corner of building, which is discretely located behind supporting corner post; placement does not destroy historic material. State

Historic Preservation Office has indicated that the proposed changes are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Lee Ingram, 401 Henley Street, stated that he is here representing the Bijou Theater if anyone has any questions.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Candy Factory, 1060 World's Fair Park Drive, Buzz Goss (Architect)

Description of Work: Façade, west elevation: Replace existing gutters and downspouts with new system with black finish; clean existing exterior masonry surfaces, repoint existing mortar joints as necessary; replace windows with new metal awning window with black finish with "putty" bevel mullions to simulate Chicago windows; install new balconies with horizontal railing with glass panel inset behind guardrail; install new canvas canopies above existing plaza level storefronts; clean and paint existing storefronts replacing smoked glazing with clear.

East elevation: Replace existing gutters and downspouts; clean masonry; remove and replace windows with new metal awning windows with black finish and new entries to balconies and balconies as noted on façade; install new aluminum storefront system at park level patio locations; install new construction to fill in inset on elevation with prefinished metal panels and parapet (black finish) projecting 4-5' above existing roofline and topping glass curtain wall with clear anodized aluminum frame, clear glass, and tripartite entries behind balcony rail matching proposed balconies.

North and South elevations: Replace existing gutters and downspouts; clean and repoint mortar; replace windows with new metal awning window with black finish and clear glazing, and "putty" beveled mullions.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 2606BGEN except for proposed balconies and window configuration. Current windows are inappropriate and the proposed addition of "Chicago" style window divisions and the rear addition will improve the building. The proposed rear addition is transparent, and will infill a section of the building that is not fully utilized, and is not original. Window replacement is also appropriate, since the original windows were removed from the building a number of years ago, and replaced by fixed panes of glass than are not architecturally significant. Although the original design of the windows is not known, Chicago style windows are

appropriate to the age of the building and will return appropriate design features to the building. However, the balconies on the east and west elevations lead to the insertion of doors, which will alter the brickwork on the building. The addition of balconies will also have a negative impact on the east and west elevations of the building, which was constructed to house a wholesaling and manufacturing use.

Thought should also be given to the design of the windows. Research was unable to determine the design of the original windows, but it is unlikely that they were configured with small divided lights. Unless documentation can be found to support that design, it might be desirable to install large paned one over one windows.

Secretary's Standards referred to in these comments include:

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, space and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bennett stated that this building was nominated for historic designation several years ago.

Jason DeBord, 627 Gay Street, stated that the windows will look like the drawing. Whatever cutouts are made, the bricks will be saved so the original materials can be used where necessary.

Saunders stated that he thinks the balconies should be on the south side, also. DeBord stated that they had thought about putting balconies all away around but were being sensitive to the original building. Bennett stated that she does not think the south should have balconies. DeBord added that they want to be sure their final plans meet what the commission wants. Bennett said she had mentioned that she wants the balconies to be unobtrusive as possible. They should be painted to blend with the walls. DeBord stated the opaque panels that were going to be used on the balconies will not be on the next drawing. Bennett wants a deed restriction to maintain the integrity of the building.

Busby recused himself because of being the architect for the project.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AS AMENDED, REMOVING THE REFERENCE TO THE OPAQUE PANELS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

118 Major Reynolds Place (Knollwood), Bob Peters, BP Signs (Applicant)

Description of Work: Construct internal sign for Knollwood Development, 24" tall by 54" wide for a total of 9 sq. ft., per drawing submitted 1/23/2006.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 12406GEN. Sign in question is consistent with design guidelines; its removal from the stone base will bring it into conformance with the adopted design guidelines. The current sign for Wasabi restaurant has been non-conforming to the design guidelines since its installation over two years ago. The intention of the design guidelines was to avoid elevated signs that detracted from the view of the Major Reynolds house at the summit of the development. The sign proposed in this staff report will remove the elevated stone base and bring the current sign into conformance with the adopted design guidelines.

Bennett has met with Wallace of Wallace and Wallace on the design of his sign. The Wasabi sign is within the guidelines.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Arning announced that the next meeting will be March 16 and asked that the commission members please let him know if they not going to be at the meeting.

April 20-22 is the Statewide Preservation Trust Conference that will be held in Knoxville. A training session will be held for the commission.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox county Historic zoning Commissions will be held on March 16, 2006 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.