

**MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 15, 2005**

-----

**Members Present:**

Nic Arning  
Finbarr Saunders  
Duane Grieve  
Steve Cotham  
Melynda Whetsel  
Carol Montgomery  
Herb Donaldson  
Lila Wilson  
William Hoehl

**Others Present:**

Sharon Boyce  
Mark Donaldson  
Tom Reynolds  
Chester Kilgore  
Jamie Rowe  
Sean Martin  
Dwight Guinn  
Walter Cook  
Trudy Moore  
Randall DeFord  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West

**Members Absent (excused):**

Linda Claussen  
Kenneth Gresham  
Art Clancy

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 18, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Tom Reynolds, Chief (Knoxville Building, Zoning and Plans Review) stated that the owner of 238 E. Oklahoma, where a demolition by neglect order was issued, has not done any work. Sharon Boyce said his office should file a complaint to the Better Building Board. Reynolds stated that the Tazewell Pike case is still in court.
- Chairman Nic Arning announced that a meeting for all neighborhood representatives and other interested parties will be held on September 22 at 6:30 p.m. at the Time Warp Tea Room on N. Central, to encourage communication between the historic overlay districts and the Historic Zoning Commissions.
- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Six level 1 certificates have been issued. The first four allow temporary work such as removal of artificial siding, after which additional Certificates will be sought, if necessary.

**141 Leonard Place** - Old North Knoxville - Daniel Schuh – 80805ONK, 81705ONK – Remove siding, repair porch, repair windows

**205 Leonard Place** – Old North Knoxville – Jerry Rivers – 83105ONK – Remove artificial siding

**1621 Jefferson** – Edgewood-Park City – Robert Pickle – 81705EDG – Remove artificial siding

**1618 Washington** – Edgewood-Park City – Kevin Nicely – 83005EDGA – Temporary demolition permission, artificial siding removal

**710 Luttrell** – Fourth & Gill – Julie Langley – 818054&G – Wood siding repair

**14 Market Square** – Market Square – Jane Sampson – 82405MKT – Install hanging sign

- Certificates of Appropriateness

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **Edgewood-Park City H-1:**

*1620 Jefferson*, Walter Cook (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Replace louvered wood vent in front gable with a stained glass window in Eastlake pattern; Add hipped single window dormer to rear elevation.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 83005EDG. Insertion of stained glass window in existing frame in front gable adds a feature consistent with age and style of house; addition of rear dormer is consistent with adjacent houses and not visible from Jefferson.

Walter Cook, 1617 Winding Ridge Trail stated he is the owner and explained the work he plans to do on the house. Dwight Guinn of 1249 Park Ridge stated the neighborhood has no problems with it.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**1621 Jefferson**, Robert Pickle (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Level I: Remove artificial siding & repair siding as necessary, remove added side porch and rear stairs; remove second story porch enclosure; repair windows; repair or refloor front porch (first & second story) with tongue & groove floor; repair/repoint brick foundation; reinstall skirting; reroof.

Level II: Install gable dormer with two windows on rear elevation, wood siding; replace front door with wood panel door with leaded glass upper panel (old); add square sawn wood balusters on 5" centers inset in top and bottom rails; enlarge first floor porch posts to match bases of second story porch columns.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 81705EDG. Level I and II work are consistent with adopted design guidelines. Proposed work (in case of dormer) not visible from Jefferson, proposed balustrades and are consistent with design guidelines, style of house.

Dwight Guinn stated that the neighborhood approves of this certificate.

**MOTION BY WHETSELL AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**1904 Washington**, Charles Hassenboehler, Jr., (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Repair foundation; remove second story front added room and restore porch, if it was a porch, adding window to match historic windows; siding repair in kind; repair windows; remove added front door, replacing with matching window; remove storm door; remove rear fire stair.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 82405EDG. Proposed changes are consistent with design guidelines and will remove alterations and return the house to its original appearance.

Dwight Guinn stated that the neighborhood is pleased.

**MOTION BY WHETSELL AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Old North Knoxville H-1:**

*115 E. Scott*, Sean Bolen (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Move two story frame house with weatherboard siding, hip roof with lower cross gables, ornate gable trim and brackets, bargeboard and window pediments, from West Scott to vacant lot in Old North Knoxville and place on stuccoed block foundation; construct L-shaped porch with stuccoed block piers and lattice inserts, to duplicate shape of porch shown on historic Sandborn Fire Insurance Maps; remove replacement windows and install one over one double hung wood windows appropriate to style of house; install porch balustrade adapted from catalog designs of George Barber. This house is reminiscent of George Barber and thought to be a Barber design, although it has not been located in currently available catalogs of Barber's work.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 83005ONK. The house proposed for relocation of 115 E. Scott will be a tremendous addition to the street, and is appropriate in size and design for this significant block.

The lot at 115 E. Scott has been vacant since the H-1 overlay was instituted. Several discussions have been held about the design of potential infill, but nothing has been proposed because the scale of any infill structure needs to be so large and so significant for this side of the block that no one has been willing to make the commitment to a new structure. Mr. Bolen's proposal to move the house on West Scott, which stands by itself and will be demolished if it is not moved, is a perfect solution for this location in the historic district. It will give an anchor to the beginning of the district on East Scott, and will be appropriate in scale and design for the Old North Knoxville neighborhood.

Chester Kilgore of 1319 Grainger Avenue stated that the neighborhood approves of this certificate.

**MOTION BY WHETSELL AND SECOND BY HOEHL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Fourth & Gill H-1:**

*1310 Luttrell*, Trudy Moore (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** 1) Enclose existing rear porch (6'7"x13'4"), continuing existing siding reveal of 7" overlap wood to join with wood shakes (duplicating wood shapes on dormers), with 1/1 double hung wood 36" - 42" window on north elevation (duplicating

existing original windows), and double leaf French doors on rear access; 2) remove added inappropriate stoop on north elevation; 2) add projecting rear deck, with step down ground level deck to north of raised deck or with paved patio; new raised deck to have lattice at foundation level and sawn wood balustrade of 2"x2" balusters set in to top and bottom rail, on 5-6" centers; 3) add garage (design to be heard at later meeting); 4) add pool and fencing (design to be heard at later meeting).

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 901054&GB. Proposed addition is at rear of structure and appropriate to original design. Portion of structure that will be changed is an addition from the 1990's. This is the application that Ms. Moore initially submitted in June and withdrew pending completion of drawings.

Trudy Moore of 1310 Luttrell explained the work she plans to do on the house. Sean Martin of 1121 Eleanor Street stated that the neighborhood approves.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSELL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1121 Eleanor*, Sean Martin (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Replace soffit if necessary, in kind; construct new one story rear addition, with end gable roof extension, fiber cement siding, wood windows, small shed roof and flat roof extension to form door covering, block foundation, 9' x 26' footprint, not visible from Eleanor.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 90105EDG with change in materials to wood weatherboard siding. The design of the addition is not visible from Eleanor, and although contemporary, meets the guidelines that call for design to be a product of its time. (Pg. 18)

The Commission should consider carefully the material that is used for this addition. The applicant proposes cement fiber boards. There is no wood siding on the existing building, so there would be no noticeable comparison between wood and cement boards (which are slightly different in appearance). The guidelines in Fourth & Gill do allow use of cement boards on new construction. There is, however, the question of the precedent that allowing cement boards on a pre-existing building could set. If the Commission wishes to allow the use of this material in this addition, care should be taken to avoid creating a precedent.

Sean Martin stated that he is the owner and wants to use cement fiber on the new addition. It is not supposed to duplicate the original but blend in with it.

Whetsell asked about the precedent this may set. Bennett stated that the guidelines do not restrict fiberboard. There have been certificates in the past asking to add fiberboard on new additions. Whetsell does not want to set a precedent but will approve this work. She stated that because this is a masonry house and there is no existing wood siding, there is no need to preserve the look of wood siding because there is none now.

Boyce said the motion should state that the commission will approve the work because it cannot be seen from the back and there is no wood on the house to have to match other wood siding. There will be characteristics to intentionally distinguish between the old and new portions, and the proposed addition is on the rear.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSELL TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE ALLOWING A FIBER CEMENT SIDING TO BE INSTALLED BECAUSE IT WILL BE ON THE REAR OF THE HOUSE AND THERE IS NO WOOD ON THE EXISTING HOUSE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Fort Sanders NC-1:**

*1502 Highland*, Randall DeFord (Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Demolish enclosed porch on side and rebuild on same footprint as enclosed space for fire stair; add open rear porch; remove vinyl windows and install wood double hung windows, one over one.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 90105FTS. Proposed changes are in keeping with design guidelines and appropriate to structure.

Randall DeFord of 1511 Laurel stated he is the architect for the properties. He noted that an email distributed to the commission from Wes Goodard states the neighborhood endorses the project. DeFord showed pictures of the house.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Jamie Rowe of 4215 Tazewell Pike, representing the Tazewell Pike NC-1 district, stated that adjoining their district there are 79 condos. They have appealed to the County Board

of Zoning Appeals (BZA) that subdivision regulations should be followed. She asked that BZA have the developer submit plans to them according to the subdivision regulations. Boyce stated that the commission can make a general statement regarding this issue. Exempt plats have to have approval by the planning commission and if you have less than 5 acres, it becomes an exempt plat.

Mark Donaldson, Metropolitan Planning Commission (MPC) Executive Director, stated there are state laws providing for exempt plats. This subdivision does not meet what a subdivision is in the county. MPC staff can not ask them to record their plats. The Register of Deeds has to record anything that is submitted to them. They do not have an application to review an exempt plat for this development. Rowe stated the neighborhood has filed an appeal to the BZA.

Saunders asked that the commission write a letter to express their concern of whether the procedures have been followed. Rowe wants the procedures to be followed. Bennett will write a letter to the Board of Zoning Appeals asking that the developer follow the County's procedures for developing a subdivision.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox county Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on October 20, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.