

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 17, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Finbarr Saunders
Steve Cotham
Duane Grieve
Carol Montgomery
Herb Donaldson
Lila Wilson
William Hoehl
Linda Claussen
Kenneth Gresham

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Mark Donaldson
Dwight Guinn
Randall DeFord
Scott Haynes
Sean Martin
Wes Goddard
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent (excused):

Art Clancy
Faris Eid
Casandra McGee
Melynda Whetsel

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE
OCTOBER 20, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

1111 Gratz – Fourth & Gill - Bill Murraugh - 1031054&G – Repair brick wall, piers at front porch

1014 Eleanor – Fourth & Gill - Michael J. Reynolds – 1007054&G – Roof, soffit, half-round gutters

928 Eleanor – Fourth & Gill - Kent Kendrick – 1103054&G – Roof, siding, porch columns, rear porch

714 Luttrell – Fourth & Gill - Jeff Novinger – 1102054&G – Repair carriage house

522 E. Scott – Old North Knoxville - William McGowan – 101005ONK – Repair second story porch, roof bay window

410 E. Oklahoma – Old North Knoxville - Jimmy Chavis – 110305ONK – Repair fire damage, install 1/1dh wood replacement windows

4102 Tazewell Pike – Tazewell Pike - Lee Stephens – 103105TZL – Building storage shed in rear, wood siding

- Certificates of Appropriateness

Arning asked that until the vacancies for the city are filled, would the commissioners please call Bennett two days before the meeting and tell her if they attending.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1:

831 Deery, Scott Haynes, City Dept. of Development (Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II: Install porch handrails of 2x2s on 4-5" centers set in top and bottom rails; install gutters and downspouts; tuckpoint masonry following provisions of Preservation Brief No. 2; repair damaged, existing T-111 siding as required; repair fascia and soffits in kind; install foundation vents; install wood half-view front entry door; install French doors at rear of house, not visible from Deery; install 12/ x 12/ deck at rear of home, not visible from Deery.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 1102054&G. Work is consistent with the adopted Design Guidelines: wood railings on front porches (12-1), concealing added decks or porches on rear (18-1); replacing materials (14-3, 14-4), entrance doors (13-2) and gutters (p.10)

In this remedial project, most of the work being done on the house will correct deficiencies on the interior. Applicant hopes in the future to be financially able to restore the wood siding, which once existed on the house.

Scott Haynes, 7805 Galaxy Way, City Department of Development Housing and Rehabilitation. His department tries to make the homes safe, secure and sanitary for their new owners.

The Commissioners noted that the metal storage building located to the rear of the house, and clearly visible from adjoining streets, was approved on a hardship basis for the prior owner, who was elderly and infirm. Several neighborhood residents have asked that the storage shed be removed since there is now a new owner, and since the metal storage shed is architecturally intrusive in the historic district. Mr. Haynes noted that he would inform the owner of the need to remove the storage building.

Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor Street. The neighborhood approves and is glad work is being done on the house.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION BECAUSE IT MEETS THE GUIDELINES, AND TO REQUEST THAT THE METAL STORAGE BUILDING BE REMOVED. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1:

1701 Jefferson, Kent Kendrick (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level I: Install new roof, repairing deck; repair wood siding in kind. Level II: Reinstall new front porch that mimics original Barber design; restore original rear porch (now enclosed); restore side porch to original configuration; replace original roof cresting; tuckpoint masonry as necessary.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 110305EDG. Proposed changes are consistent with adopted guidelines: Roofs - 15, 1-3; Porches, pg. 19, 1-3; Entrances, pg. 21, 2; Siding, pg. 22-2; and Masonry, pg.25-5.

Applicant proposes to restore much of the original appearance of the George F. Barber-design McArthur Residence, returning a long neglected building to its historical architectural appearance.

Dwight Guinn of 1249 Monroe Street stated that the neighborhood appreciates his taking on this project and hopes he finds an owner that will keep it up.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION BECAUSE IT MEETS THE GUIDELINES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Ft. Sanders NC-1:

1508 Highland, Randall DeFord (Architect)

Description of Work: Rebuild front porch to match the original slope and location, with tapered round wood columns and pilaster, tongue and groove wood floor, wood handrail and pickets, wood stair, and sloped roof; extend rear gable of main house across currently flat roofed rear addition; install windows at rear side of originally flat roofed addition.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 110305FTS. Proposed work is consistent with Ft. Sanders Design Guidelines: Porches -C.1; Siding - D-2; Roofs - B, 1-4.

Removal of the artificial siding and the addition of an appropriate front porch and more appropriate massing for the rear addition are a significant positive step for the Ft. Sanders NC-1 district, providing not only a more appropriate exterior design for this historic structure, but also an excellent example of a historically-based rehabilitation that allows multi-family use of the structure.

Randall DeFord, 1511 Laurel Avenue, stated he is glad to work as the architect with John Craig on this project.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION BECAUSE IT MEETS THE GUIDELINES.

219 Twelfth Street, Carrie Brown (Owner's Representative/Applicant)

Description of Work: Requesting total demolition because of house's extremely deteriorated condition; parcel to become parking lot for residents on 11th Street.

Staff Recommendation: DENY Certificate 103105FTS. As noted in the architectural description written at the time of designation, artificial siding and a modified interior and partially enclosed porch were present then. JPI committed to an exterior restoration.

According to documentation presented at the Historic Zoning Commission hearing on October 21, 1999, JPI Development, which owned 219 12th, committed to the Historic Ft. Sanders Neighborhood Association to make this property a pilot project with the Ft. Sanders community, intended to establish a foundation of development and maintain a sensitivity to the community's original historic structures. During the course of the next year, JPI did apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the artificial siding and began an exterior restoration; it appears that no work was completed pursuant to that application.

The history of the house has not been altered. The appearance and condition of the house, while it has not been improved over the intervening years, is not noticeably different than was the condition at the time of designation. The agreement with the Ft. Sanders community and the preservation community, which allowed JPI to build, and eventually sell its properties to the current owners, should not be ignored in favor of

demolition of an historic building designated at the owner's request, and not appreciably changed since that designation.

Bennett received an application several weeks ago for demolition of the structure. The house was put on the local register before NC-1 was placed in Ft. Sanders. JPI agreed in 1999 to restore and received certificates and did no work on the house. JPI is now called The Commons. Bennett received a letter to withdraw the request for demolition on November 16, 2005. The public notice has already gone out and Commission will have to vote to withdraw the application. Arning and Bennett left a message with Ms. Brown and have not heard from her.

Sharon Boyce stated that an application can be withdrawn whenever the applicant wants to withdraw. Arning asked her about the neighborhood being prepared for the vote. Boyce stated that a vote is not necessary because it was withdrawn.

Wes Goddard, 1511 Laurel Avenue, stated that at a recent neighborhood board meeting, they voted to oppose the demolition. They want the current owners to work with Knox Heritage to see if there is an economic use for the house.

Arning asked the commission's opinion on the demolition. Saunders stated that the new owners need to be made aware of any agreements JPI had made. No action can be taken since the application has been withdrawn.

- Other

Administrative Rules Draft: Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Administrative Rules for the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission.

Arning stated that last month the commission looked over the draft for the Administrative Rules. Boyce asked about Article 4 Section 3 next to last paragraph stating that "new construction on vacant lots shall not be required to post signage." She suggested that signs should be placed on new construction.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO ACCEPT THE CITY ADMINISTRATIVE RULES AND ELIMINATING THE PARAGRAPH IN SECTION 3 REGARDING SIGNS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett stated that the County has corresponding bylaws, which will be placed in the packets to be considered at the December meeting of the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission. The Knox County Administrative Rules will be discussed next month.

Arning stated that Steve Wise, MPC attorney, recommended that officers be elected for both city and county commissions. They would still meet together but only vote on city or county issues. The county chair would run the meeting when a county matter comes before the board and the city chair when a city matter is before the board. Bennett stated that there is a legal question about county matters being handled by the city chair.

Boyce stated that it is just important who votes for either the city or the county but does not feel officers are needed for both.

Arning suggested that a chair be elected for the county. Gresham stated he is concerned that whatever action they take, the public will raise questions. If the county has a separate chair, they would take the blame for any matter that was handled in the county. Anyone can comment on matters relating to the city or county as a citizen. A county chair will be elected in December. Arning asked that they read the Administrative Rules before next month.

Grieve noted that although he was displeased with the idea of demolishing 219 12th Street, the new owners at 219 12th Street requested a demolition permit in Ft. Sanders, following proper procedure, and should be commended for following appropriate procedures.

- Adjournment

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on December 15, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.