

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF MAY 19, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Finbarr Saunders
Cassandra McGee
Lila Wilson
William Hoehl
Carol Montgomery
Linda Claussen
Herb Donaldson
Faris Eid
Kenneth Gresham
Duane Grieve

Members Absent:

Art Clancy (ex.)
Steve Cotham (ex.)
Melynda Whetsel (ex.)

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Mark Donaldson
Dwight Guinn
Chester Kilgore
Jamie Rowe
Kim Trent
Juan Mino
Steve Hill
Rob Knudsen
Deborah Duncan
Thom Miller
Tom Reynolds
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests on the certificates.

**MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE
APRIL 21, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

Tom Reynolds announced that his new title is Building, Zoning, Plans Review Chief for the City. He stated that work is going on to stabilize the Park House. There has not been a judge's ruling filed regarding the carport on Tazewell Pike constructed by Clifford Quinton. The Pickle Mansion has been bought by John Haas. No work has been done on 238 E. Oklahoma Avenue. Reynolds' office has been looking at it because the owner has not been working on it, and the neighbors are frustrated. If the structure becomes dangerous enough, his office will inspect the electrical systems. Saunders asked about the owner making agreements on what he would do and not making any progress. Sanders wants the owner continue his work. The house is condemned. If the electrical inspector feels it is dangerous, he would cut the power. Sharon Boyce stated that the other legal option is demolition by neglect. She suggested starting with the ordinance and going through the procedure for historic structures in H-1 or NC-1. Arning asked Bennett to send the owner, Chris Plante, a letter expressing the concern of the Historic Zoning Commission about the lack of progress the owner is making, noting that the

schedule provided to the Commission by the owner has not been followed. Arning felt a letter should also be sent to the City Inspections Department asking for an inspection.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY EID TO SEND A LETTER TO CITY INSPECTIONS REQUESTING A DEMOLITION BY NEGLECT ORDER BE ISSUED, IF APPROPRIATE, AND A COPY OF THE LETTER BE SENT TO PLANTE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Edgewood-Park City

1620 Jefferson. Walter Cook (Owner) – Siding repair, fascia, gutters, porch ceiling, windows, window replacement in kind. Certificate No. 50405EDG.

1910 Jefferson. Charles B. Hassenboehler, Jr. (Owner) – Repair windows, siding, roof, porch beam, columns and capitals, floor and ceiling, repair entry doors. Certificate No. 42005EDG.

Old North Knoxville

1430 Grainger. Segundo Properties (Applicant). Repair gutters, fascia, remove asbestos shingles and repair wall covering. Certificate No. 50405ONK.

317 E. Oklahoma. Matthew Wright (Applicant). Remove aluminum siding and repair wood siding, install weatherboard on rear concrete block addition, gutters, new brick chimney in original location. Certificate No. 41805ONK.

321 E. Oklahoma. Knox Heritage (Applicant). Install rubber membrane roof on rear dormer.

Mechanicsville

1017 Oak. Thom Miller (Applicant). Storage building, 12/12 roof, wood siding. Certificate No. 41105ONK.

Fourth & Gill

1027 Eleanor. Kent Kendrick (Applicant). Remove artificial siding and repair original; gutters, reinstall wood windows (original) now in basement. Certificate No. 413054&G.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

Fourth & Gill H-1:

1027 Eleanor. Kent Kendrick(Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II - Install round wood columns on front porch; install entry door (wood-paneled) on second story balcony; rebuild second story porch/balcony, installing railing; rebuild rear porch.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 413054&G. Proposed work will return residence to appropriate historical appearance.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

803 Gratz. Juan Mino, (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level III - Construct new 1-1/2 story building of Craftsman-derived design with wood weatherboard siding, metal gabled roof with gabled dormers, accessory garage at rear of lot.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 422054&G. Proposed infill building will feature Craftsman-era features that are appropriate to 4th & Gill neighborhood, and will blend well with other residences on street. Applicant has been previously approved through City of Knoxville to receive one of three lots created by the City of Knoxville from the former McCallie School site.

Bennett and Grieve were on a committee that reviewed the plans. Juan Mino of 425 E. Scott Avenue stated he is the owner of 803 Gratz.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1:

20 Market Square. Rob Knudsen, 3-D Sign Company, Applicant.

Description of Work: Level II - Install new hanging sign, 28" x 44", internally lit with a black surface and a light source that highlights lettering and symbols that represent two business names (Oodles and Uncorked), while the background of the sign is opaque.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 50405MKT. Several businesses have installed hanging signs that, because of painted backgrounds, symbols or lettering, advertise the single business they represent. The design guidelines allow a 4-6 sq. ft. hanging sign for each business. The overall size of the sign applied for in this instance is 7.9 sq. ft. However, it contains signage for two businesses and the largest portion of the sign is a back painted Plexiglas surface that is opaque and dark gray/black in color, so that only letters and symbols are lighted and visible, one for each business represented. The portion of the sign that represents "Oodles" is 2.7 sq. ft.; the portion of the sign that represents "Uncorked" is 2.2 sq. ft. for a total of 4.9 sq. ft. Although the outside dimensions of the sign are in excess of the design guidelines, the portion of the sign containing the business advertising is considerably smaller.

Arning stated that he is concerned that the sign is bigger than the guidelines allow, and the sign has already been installed. He does not want the Commission to set a precedent by approving a sign bigger than the guidelines state can be used.

Rob Knudsen works for 3-D Sign Company in Oak Ridge and is the applicant. He stated that he did not know to get a permit for the sign.

Eid stated that the signs should be on a case-by-case basis whether they should install one sign for each building with all business names on it or more than one sign. Bennett will write another letter to the owners on Market Square concerning the installation of signs.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR THE SIGN BUT ASKED THAT EACH APPLICATION BE LOOKED AT INDIVIDUALLY REGARDING MORE THAN ONE BUSINESS ON A SIGN LARGER THAN THE GUIDELINES ALLOW. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

32 Market Square. Jeff Gencay, Owner/Applicant.

Description of Work: Level II - Install painted sign board, 2-1/2' high x 8' long, over southern half of storefront. Install 2'x3' hanging sign.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 50505MKT. Proposed signage meets the specification of the Market Square Design Guidelines and is appropriate to the building.

Saunders stated there is not a design for the sign only a description. Grieve stated that he does not know where he is putting the sign or what it is going to look like.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO DENY THE CERTIFICATE WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1:

306 E. Oklahoma. Deborah Duncan (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level III Certificate - Construction of new one story Craftsman-derived cottage with raised basement (stuccoed), wood lap siding, 8/12 roof slope, projecting front porch with telescoping front gable, exposed rafter tails, splayed wood posts on brick piers, corner boards, 2/1 double hung wood windows, wood plank front door with three small lights & dentil molding below projecting shelf.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 50505ONK. The proposed residence is a Craftsman-derived style, appropriate for this part of the Old North Knoxville H-1 where other Craftsman era styles are found. The details proposed for the residence include wood double hung windows, corner boards, splayed posts on brick piers, telescoping front gables, a stucco foundation, and rafter tails on the front porch, and a foundation height and height to the eaves that recall original Old North Knoxville residences. These are all details that help the residence to blend with existing architecture in Old North Knoxville.

Deborah Duncan of 2917 Bellview Avenue stated that she is the owner.

Chester Kilgore of 1319 Grainger Avenue stated that he represents Old North Knoxville, and they support this certificate.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

505 E. Scott. Steve and Deborah Hill (Owners/Applicants).

Description of Work: Level III Certificate: Construct new one story rear addition (on northwest elevation) with raised basement inset from side wall of historic house by same distance as original (since demolished) addition, brick wall cladding, parapet wall disguising flat roof and intersecting historic house below molded brick stringcourse, three double hung windows with sills that continue the line established by window sills from historic house, three rear facing garage doors, corresponding windows and entry door on northeast elevation.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 50505ONKB, which refines design details of Certificate 40505ONK. HZC approved idea of rear addition at April 21 meeting, but asked owner and his contractor to meet with staff and Mr. Eid to refine the design, which has been done. Although some of the design details suggested by Mr. Eid were not adopted, applicant has modified the design to include a different cornice, to refine the addition's intersection with the historic house, and to include a continuation of the line established by the window sills of the historic house, making the addition blend better with the significant design details visible on the southwest elevation of the historic house, which is visible from Harvey and, to a lesser degree, from Scott.

Bennett and Eid met with Steve Hill and looked at his plans. Hill of 505 E. Scott Avenue stated that he wants to use the drawing with three sets of windows.

Eid stated his concern was that the porch would not be set off the side elevation of the house, but ascertained on the field visit that the addition would be set in from the side elevation at the same distance as the addition that predated historic overlay designation. Bennett thinks there may have been two rear additions on the original house, both of which were demolished before designation.

Kilgore stated the neighborhood is pleased with this plan.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General H-1:

3128 Kingston Pike, Judge Taylor House. Ron Hutchins, Agent/Applicant.

Description of Work: Level II - 1) Remove glass panels installed on screened porch. Replace with casement windows and bottom panels to infill the originally sized openings. 2) Remove a center window of the second story east/southeast elevation, as stipulated in the 1929 Barber plan. 3) Repair exterior shingles in kind. 4) Repair existing double hung windows. 5) Install gutters and downspouts if necessary.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 42205GEN. The Taylor House was substantially redesigned by Barber & McMurray in 1929. Applicant is proposing changes that will return the house to that 1929 design. In the 1929 design, the screened porch was finished with vertical posts framing inset panels at the bottom of each opening topped by screen wire panels with a vertical center separating strip. Applicant proposes to remove the glass and shingle panels installed 5-6 years ago, replacing them with duplicate wood panels and using casement or other windows above the wood panels that will replicate the 1929 screen wire dimensions. Applicant also proposes to remove a second story window on the southeast elevation, which was specified for removal in the 1929 plan, and which will not be visible from Kingston Pike.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mechanicsville H-1:

1017 Oak. Thom Miller (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II – Build porch on west elevation with turned spindle rail, full light double doors; new historically appropriate front porch rail with turned spindles, at least true dimension 2"x2"; modify added garage roof at rear of house to 12/12; new roof on house and garage, possibly metal, eventually, and removing vinyl siding, if time permits.

Staff Recommendation: DENY installation of full light double doors at new side entry; APPROVE single full-light door at that location and APPROVE remainder of Certificate No. 41105MEC. The proposed deck is in an offset on the west side of the house and the entrance doors are fully visible from Arthur. The double doors are out of scale with their location on the house, but a single door with a full pane would be appropriate. The remainder of the details contained in the Certificate application are appropriate.

Thom Miller of 1017 Oak Avenue stated he is the owner.

Bennett stated that the neighborhood approves.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett stated that a copy of a letter that was sent to Patricia Bush at 4201 Tazewell Pike was distributed which stated the commissioners' concerns about needing more design details.

Eid asked about applicants not providing drawings before the deadline. He feels we need a standard. Bennett tells them they will be denied if they do not provide drawings at the meeting. Bennett stated that it is general practice in other communities that the requirement by a historic commission for drawings triggers the services of a staff member who prepares them. Arning said we should just suggest that drawings be submitted but not require them. Chet stated that he wanted to thank Bennett and Eid for meeting with applicants. He wants the Commission to consider not asking for professional drawings because he is concerned the additional requirement could result in fewer property rehabilitations.

Arning pointed out that Bennett spends much time with neighborhoods that are considering local historic and neighborhood conservation overlays. One of the chief objections to overlay is that owners do not want to be told what to do with their property. Dwight Guinn of 1249 Monroe Street stated he is an architect and that any drawings would be helpful because they define the project and help with the cost. Kim Trent of Knox Heritage stated that she does not want a drawing to be required but suggested that the Commission encourage it. A staff architect would be nice to have. The Commission discussed the possibility of working with UT's School of Architecture students to produce drawings; Bennett expressed her concern that supervising students who entered the process on a random basis, without prior knowledge or a continuation of effort beyond a few meetings, could be very demanding of staff time.

Wilson stated that a new neighbor on Scott wants to put a 2-car garage in her backyard. She applied to Bennett on Monday. Bennett stated her contractor is ready to go. The garage will go at the back of the lot, not visible from Scott, with a covered walkway constructed from it to the back door. The contractor does not have a building permit at this time. Kilgore stated that the neighborhood would not want this garage to be built without going through the proper process. Boyce stated that it has to be published to be heard. The request will be put on the June 16, 2005 meeting agenda.

Page Nine – Minutes
Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission
Knox County Historic Zoning Commission
Meeting of May 19, 2005

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on June 16, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville.