

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF MARCH 17, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Finbarr Saunders
Cassandra McGee
Steve Cotham
Lila Wilson
Melynda Whetsel
William Hoehl
Carol Montgomery
Art Clancy
Linda Claussen
Herb Donaldson
Faris Eid
Duane Grieve

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Mark Donaldson
Dwight Guinn
Jamie Rowe
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Kenneth Gresham (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests on the certificates. He introduced Mark Donaldson, the new Executive Director of MPC.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 17, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

- Reports to Commission: Chairman Nic Arning thanked people working on the S & W project and the ones who went to City Council concerning Ft. Higley's historic designation. We show that we are interested in issues.
- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

The Level 1 certificates that Bennett has previously approved are:

1310 Luttrell: Fourth & Gill. Applicant: Trudy Moore. Certificate No. 211054&G. Wood shingles on dormer, beadboard porch ceiling.

941 Eleanor: Fourth & Gill. Applicant: Indya Kincannon. Certificate No. 225054&G. Soffit, fascia, roof, gutters.

2023 Washington: Edgewood-Park City. Applicant: Knoxville Pres. & Dev/Daniel Schuh. Certificate No. 2205EDG. Square porch columns, with square spindled balustrade.

1602 Washington: Edgewood-Park City. Applicant: Community Development. Certificate No. 30204EDG. Rear porch, rafter tails, storm windows, porch ceiling repair.

2106 Washington: Edgewood-Park City. Applicant: Jennifer Montgomery. Certificate No. 30305EDGA. Point chimney, install chimney caps, repair fascia, soffit, porch railing, new roof.

219 W. Glenwood: Old North Knoxville. Applicant: Vaughn McCoy. Certificate No. 22205ONKA. Roof.

201 E. Oklahoma: Old North Knoxville. Applicant: Knoxville Pres. & Dev/Daniel Schuh. Certificate No. 2205ONKB. Repair rear stair in existing size.

226 E. Oklahoma: Old North Knoxville. Applicant: Knoxville Pres. & Dev/Daniel Schuh. Certificate No. 22205ONKC. Remove asbestos shingles, roof, repair siding, install gutters, repair porch.

501 Main Street: General. Applicant: Neon Service Co. Certificate No. 30305GEN. New lettering on existing signs.

Arning explained that the Level I Certificates are for routine matters or repair, and for work that meets the provisions of the design guidelines. They are issued by staff. All other Certificates must be reviewed by the Historic Zoning Commission prior to issuance.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1:

811 Gratz, John & Judith Neff (Owners) and Beth Eason (Architect/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level III Certificate. Construct new primary building – two story residence.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 303054&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Bennett explained that the City has subdivided the McCallie School property into three residential lots, with the remaining quarter block becoming a city park. The City issued a Request for Proposals seeking purchasers for the three vacant lots, and she, Grieve, Carol Nickle (4th & Gill resident) and Lee Miracle (City Finance Department) have worked with the City Law Department as a committee to review the proposals and the plans. For this submission, Beth Eason is the architect. Whetsel stated she is pleased with the plans. Grieve commended Eason on her work. They plan to start work this spring.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY EID AND SECONDED BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

915 Luttrell, Ron Hall (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II Certificate. Install French doors on back; repair and replace siding; repair roof; point brick foundation using Preservation Brief No. 2; adjust rear grade to prevent drainage into rear of house. (This work reflects primary work not completed from prior Certificate; remainder of work has been completed.)

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 214054&G. The applicant has a recently expired Certificate under which he was working. He has made good progress on the building, but a few details remain to be completed. He has reapplied to avoid expiration of his building permit.

Ron Hall sent photographs of his house and the work he is doing. He is following the guidelines, and this certificate is a duplicate of the original one. Whetsel stated that although it meets the guidelines, she does not support the work because of the quality, and he has not cooperated with the neighborhood. The fence is too high, solid and you can not see through it. The work is not historic, but it does meet the guidelines. She is speaking also for many in the neighborhood. She will have to vote against this. Bennett stated that if it meets the guidelines, the commission would have to approve the plans and added that he is working diligently on the house. If the commission thinks the arbor is inappropriate, it could be voted on separately because it may have to have a permit. The fence and arbor were not part of the original application.

MOTION BY EID, SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE ITEMS THAT WERE ORIGINALLY REQUESTED. THE MOTION CARRIED 7-1 WITH WHETSEL VOTING AGAINST.

Eid asked that Bennett check with City Building Codes to see if the fence and arbor are appropriate. Bennett agreed to work through the issue with Building Codes, but for background explained that there was a wrought iron fence next door of exactly the same height, with the difference being that it did not obscure visibility into the yard.

Tazewell Pike NC-1:

4201 Tazewell Pike, Patricia Bush (Owner/agent)

Description of Work: Level II Certificate. Construct porte cochere, attached garage at rear of house, not visible from Tazewell Pike, and small bathroom addition at rear.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 21005TZL. Proposed work is consistent with design guidelines, being located to the rear of the building, and includes the reconstruction of a porte-cochere removed prior to designation of the area.

Jamie Rowe of 4215 Tazewell representing the neighborhood stated that they do not have any problems with his plans.

Grieve stated that he needs to see what the existing porch looks like before he can vote. Bennett said that the NC-1 designation states that the commission is to vote on new construction.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY GRIEVE AND SECONDED BY EID TO ALLOW THE HOMEOWNER TO PROCEED WITH THE WORK ON THE BACK OF THE HOUSE AND DEFER ON THE PORTE CACHE PLANS ON THE FRONT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Whetsel stated that the commission should have photographs of properties when they vote on a certificate.

Edgewood-Park City H-1:

1607 Jefferson, Knox Housing Partnership (Jackie Mayo, Agent)

Description of Work: Level II Certificate. Replace one over one double hung wood windows with wood double hung windows; move rear window on east approximately 18 inches and on west approximately 2 feet; remove added door on east side; replace window on east section of home with rear entry half-glass door; construct new deck on rear of house; replace metal entry door with decorative half-glass door and sidelights.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 30305EDGA. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines. Rear work is not visible from Jefferson.

Bennett stated that Knox Housing Partnership had also received a certificate to remove the artificial siding.

Dwight Guinn of 1249 Monroe Street representing Park Ridge stated that it the neighborhood would like for the door to be wooden instead of metal, if possible.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH EID RECUSING.

2023 Washington. Knoxville Preservation & Development LLC (Daniel Schuh, Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II – Install railing on first floor porch roof to convert it to second story balcony, as was original, with balustrade to match first floor.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II portion of Certificate No. 22205EDG. This combined with other elements of proposed modification of front porch will return front elevation of house to approximation of historical appearance.

Bennett stated that the commission had already approved the standard balustrade on the downstairs front porch. There were shadows that showed where the second story balcony was located and the balustrade will match the first floor.

Guinn stated that the neighborhood appreciates his work and has no problems with it.

Grieve asked if the house originally had brick and wood columns. Bennett said they were added in the 1930s. The base is stucco.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSELL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Other

Distribution of draft design guidelines – Old Westmoreland (potential NC-1)

Bennett is still working with the Old Westmoreland and the Scenic Drive section of Sequoyah Hills; both will be NC-1. She announced a meeting that will be held on March 29, at 7:00 p.m. at the corner of Westland and Morrell at the Baptist Conference Center to present a draft to the Old Westmoreland neighborhood.

She is still working on a draft for Scenic Drive and a meeting has not been set yet. Each subsection in Sequoyah Hills is working separately on their own designation; each subsection of the neighborhood groups areas that developed together, and are similar in lot size and layout, and the architecture of existing buildings. Grieve stated that every house in Sequoyah Hills has been photographed. Saunders stated that at the last City Council meeting, Roddy and Bailey suggested making an inventory of historic structures. He encourages MPC and City Council to help in this effort. Bennett explained that a study design for updating the survey and cultural resources plan is being prepared, but the final work program has not yet been determined.

Arning stated that he has distributed a copy of a letter he is sending to Steve Eagleton, owner of the Log Haven Property at Ft. Higley.

Bennett explained that the preservation report required by the City's Charter is being prepared and will be brought to the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission for action at the April 21, 2005, meeting. An explanation of the downtown plan should also be presented at the April meeting.

Bennett distributed two articles sent by Louis Jackson, Tennessee Historical Commission staff–

1. *Basic Principles of Traditional Construction*. Stephen A. Mouzon. Clem Labine's Period Homes. Winter, 2004
2. *Avoiding Fenestration Fiascos*. Christine G. H. Franck. Clem Labine's Period Homes. Winter, 2004.

Page Seven – Minutes
Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission
Knox County Historic Zoning Commission
Minutes of March 17, 2005 meeting

Bennett stated that the Tennessee Preservation Trust meeting is being held in Chattanooga on April 6-7. Their website tells about the meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on April 21, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville.