

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JUNE 16, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Finbarr Saunders
Cassandra McGee
Lila Wilson
William Hoehl
Kenneth Gresham
Duane Grieve
Art Clancy
Steve Cotham
Melynda Whetsel

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Mark Donaldson
Dwight Guinn
Chester Kilgore
Jamie Rowe
Kim Trent
Tom Reynolds
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent (excused):

Linda Claussen
Herb Donaldson
Faris Eid
Carol Montgomery

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests on the certificates.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY HOEHL TO APPROVE THE MAY 19, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Tom Reynolds, Chief, Building, Zoning, and Plans Review, stated that he received the letter from the Historic Zoning Commission regarding requesting him to inspect the house at 238 E. Oklahoma, owned by Christopher Plante, to determine if it is an appropriate subject for a demolition by neglect proceeding. He will schedule an inspection this week. There is an open building permit from 16 months ago. Arning stated that he looked at the house and has not seen any progress. Also, the owner has not kept the Commission informed.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Level 1 Certificates

2001 Jefferson, Edgewood Park City, Bernard Phifer, Owner – 52705EDG – repair small amount of artificial siding at rear of structure; repair rear porch.

208 E. Oklahoma, Old North Knoxville, David Goodpasture, owner - 525605ONKB - repair porch.

1122 Luttrell, Fourth & Gill, Dennis Parsons, owner – 518054&G - repair roof, fascia, soffit, brackets, attached garage & deck on rear.

725 Gratz, Fourth & Gill – Gerald Huggins, owner – 5200544&G – Remove aluminum siding and repair original poplar siding as needed, repair windows, storm windows, gutters, fascia, soffits & stucco, reroof.

Fort Sanders NC-1:

1633 Clinch, Jon Haas (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: 1) Replace primary roof, destroyed by fire. Applicant has presented three alternatives for roof replacement, with the final alternative to be selected based on budget and bearing capabilities of existing structure. First alternative: Hip roof with lower cross gables, flat roof over front rooms, gabled roof over bay and a turret at the southwest corner of building, dormers on east side and north and south side of east ell. Preferred roof surface of pitched roof would be slate, with asphalt shingles as second choice. Turret will be copper clad. Second alternative: Will duplicate first alternative as outlined above, except that turret will not be rebuilt and will be flat roofed, and there will be no dormers. Third alternative will eliminate gabled roof over bay, substituting shed roof. 2) Install access stair at rear of building. 3) Construct wood frame, wood sided, gable roofed, two-story garage with garage apartment at southwest corner of lot, to provide work space during the course of rehabilitating the building.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 52705 FTS, allowing applicant to select alternative roofing scheme and covering for main structure, approving rear access stair, and construction of garage with living quarters on second story.

Applicant intends, if costs allow, to provide a timber framed roof structure that duplicates the original. Any of the three roof schemes will allow the building to be repaired, following the disastrous fire that occurred 6/23/2003, resulting in saving this extremely significant building. The added garage will provide needed workshop space for the next three to four years of construction, and serve as a garage for the building and living quarters for the applicant while the rehabilitation of the primary structure is underway. The rear access stair is necessary in order to provide safe access to the rear apartments and satisfy building fire and safety code requirements.

Jon Haas of 2215 Highland Avenue stated that he is the owner and would like to use the first alternative roof plan. He hopes to use a slate roof. He will work with the Ft. Sanders neighborhood to get their approval. He hopes to have the roof design within a month and have it on by fall. He wants to place a concrete pad in the front side yard as a staging area for constructing the roof trusses, and eventually build a 2-story carriage house on the concrete pad for his equipment. There may eventually be an apartment over the garage area. It will be set back 35' from the street. Bennett received an email from Wes Goddard stating that the neighborhood approves of his plans.

Grieve stated that we do not know what the building will look like. Reynolds stated they can issue a foundation permit. This property is zoned R-3, and the owner needs to be sure what he wants to do can be approved by the use and parking. Grieve suggested approval for the roof of the main structure, and withholding approval of the carriage house until the applicant presents a drawing of the proposed carriage house. The Commission, under NC-1 guidelines, is not required to approve the concrete pad.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE ANY OF THE THREE ALTERNATIVES, WITH THE COMMISSION RECEIVING NOTICE OF THE FINAL ROOF DESIGN DECIDED ON SO THAT THE FINAL PLAN CAN BE PART OF THE PROPERTY FILE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WILSON TO DENY THE CARRIAGE HOUSE PLAN WITHOUT PREJUDICE SO THAT THE APPLICANT CAN BRING A DRAWING TO BE APPROVED AT A FUTURE MEETING. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

29 Market Square, Jim Klonaris (Business Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Replace temporary hanging sign with more permanent hanging sign. Sign is 2'x3' wood, painted with business logo.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 51105MKT. Sign is consistent with adopted Market Square Design Guidelines.

MOTION BY CLANCY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

35 Market Square, Progressive Engineering Group (Sandy Brockwell – Tenant Agent/Applicant)

Description of Work: Install two hanging signs, each 2x3 feet, identifying two tenants of building.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 52505MKT. Proposed signs meet the adopted Market Square Design Guidelines.

MOTION BY CLANCY AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

32 Market Square. (Jeff Gencay, Owner/Applicant.)

Description of Work: Level II - Install painted sign board, 2-1/2' high x 8' long, with tenant name painted on board, over southern half of storefront.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 50505MKT. Proposed signage meets the specification of the Market Square Design Guidelines and is appropriate to the building.

MOTION BY CLANCY AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS THAT BENNETT APPROVE SIGNAGE ON MARKET SQUARE AND MAKE A LEVEL 1 CERTIFICATE IF THE PROPOSED SIGNS FALL WITHIN THE ADOPTED DESIGN GUIDELINES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1:

305 E. Scott, Melissa May (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Construct new garage in rear yard, not visible from Scott, with metal overhead door, 6/12 roof, wood siding, 20'x20'. Construct separate one story walkway attachment to rear door, not visible from Scott or Cornelia, to access side rear door, with gable roof supported by wood posts.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 51605ONK. Proposed garage is consistent with adopted design guideline recommendations. Garage will be visible from side street, but garage and walkway will not be visible from Scott Avenue.

Chester Kilgore of 1319 Grainger Avenue stated that this follows the guidelines and the neighborhood approves.

Arning stated that every owner should provide drawings or pictures to make it easier for the commission to approve.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

248 E. Oklahoma, Jeff Miller (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Remove deteriorated, partially missing chimney below roof line. (NOTE: Owner applied for, and has received, a Level I Certificate for Standard Repair.)

Staff Recommendation: DENY Level II portion of Certificate No. 52505ONK. Chimney was extremely deteriorated, and missing some of the brick, but was present when current rehabilitation project began.

Adopted design guidelines provide for retaining historic masonry features that define the historic character of the building, including . . . chimneys . . . (Pg. 23, F4).

Chester Kilgore stated that the neighborhood agrees with Bennett that the guidelines state the chimney should be left. They want to support the staff recommendation to deny.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DENY THE CERTIFICATE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth & Gill H-1:

1310 Luttrell, Trudy Moore (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: 1) Enclose existing rear porch (6'7"x13'4"), continuing existing siding reveal of 7" overlap wood to join with wood shakes (duplicating wood shapes on dormers), with 1/1 double hung wood 36" - 42" window on north elevation (duplicating existing original windows), and double leaf French doors on rear access; 2) remove added inappropriate stoop on north elevation; 2) add projecting rear deck, with step down ground level deck to north of raised deck or with paved patio; new raised deck to have lattice at foundation level and sawn wood balustrade of 2"x2" balusters set in to top and

bottom rail, on 5-6" centers; 3) add garage (design to be heard at later meeting); 4) add pool and fencing (design to be heard at later meeting).

Staff Recommendation: DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE Certificate No. 524054&G. Applicant's architect was not able to complete elevations prior to June meeting of HZC. Applicant will reapply when drawings are complete, probably for the July 21, 2005 meeting.

Sean Martin of 1121 Eleanor Street stated that the neighborhood supports the staff recommendation. Arning encouraged the neighborhood to talk to the applicant before the next meeting.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1131 Luttrell, David Velarde (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: 1) Remove artificial siding, repair original wall covering material; 2) replace unoriginal windows and deteriorated original windows, as necessary, with wood double hung one over one windows; 3) Repair first story front porch columns, beadboard ceiling and porch floor, in kind; 4) Replace unoriginal balcony railing on second story porch with sawn wood railing.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 517054&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines.

Sean Martin stated the neighborhood approves.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

910 Gratz, Jennifer and Steve Hendricks (Owners/Applicants)

Description of Work: 1) Remove vinyl siding; 2) return current windows to original height and width, possibly with use of transoms; 3) replace unoriginal windows with wood double hung windows; 4) replace added doors with wood doors, possibly add screen door to front door opening; 5) add window banks (2 or 3 full height windows) on left sides of west (front) and south elevations, where additions were originally made to structure; 6) convert current unoriginal front porch to wrap around front and side porch with wood turned columns with square plinths and capitals, 3"x3" balusters on 6" centers,

shallow sloped roof; 7) screen in south elevation side porch with screens placed so shadow lines cast by roof overhang remain intact; 8) replace south elevation (back) door with paired wood French doors); return appropriately sized, 1/1 double hung wood windows to the three sides of the south elevation bay; 9) install window screens on all windows, color clad to match trim.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 523054&G. Proposed work items meet Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines.

The property at 910 Gratz has undergone several modifications over time, and it is difficult to discern the style, design features and details of the original construction, or of changes that were probably made some 80 years ago. Although the proposed work items will change the structure further, they will improve it; make it more consistent with neighborhood architecture and with the Queen Anne Cottage that the building probably was originally, and will also make the house more competitive in the market place, helping to assure that the building will survive. What is proposed is not a restoration, but rehabilitation. The rehabilitation should serve to improve the house itself and make it blend better with the block where it is located.

Steve Hendricks of 910 Gratz, who is the owner of the house, stated they have not been able to find any pictures of what the house used to look like. The Commission commended him on providing detailed pictures and drawings. Arning suggested that he meet with the neighborhood. Martin stated that the neighborhood is excited about the plans.

Grieve asked Bennett where we draw the line on what was on the house originally. What are the boundaries on redoing a house with no idea what it looked like? Bennett noted that it depends on how much the building has changed over the years. As the partial demolition association with a rehabilitation proceeds, the owner may find shadows that indicate the original design of the house looked like. In this instance, the new owner has made an attempt to introduce features that are consistent with other houses in the neighborhood, and with houses of the original era of construction. For example, there are other houses in the neighborhood that have a circular porch on the front, and that feature was common on houses of that era.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on July 21, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville.