

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF DECEMBER 15, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Herb Donaldson
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Duane Grieve
William Hoehl
Carol Montgomery
Finbarr Saunders
Lila Wilson

Others Present:

Ann Bennett
Sharon Boyce
Art Clancy
Tom Reynolds
Susan Taylor

Members Absent (excused):

Melynda Whetsel

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 17, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds

Tom Reynolds, Rehab Chief, City of Knoxville, – nothing new to report

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

1420 Fremont – Old North Knoxville – Aaron Pennington – 113005ONK – Repair windows, siding, fascia, soffit, gutters and roof

1421 Fremont – Old North Knoxville – Shawn Mason – 112805ONK – Repair/replace windows with wood, 1/1, dh, repair siding in kind, repair gutters

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General H-1:

602 S. Gay Street, Jason DeBord, Cardinal Investment Properties, LLC (Applicant)

Description of Work: Rework storefronts to replace original Gay Street first story façade; remove deteriorated signage; relocate brass entry doors; point and clean brick as necessary; install balconies and access stair in rear ell of building, not visible from Gay Street, with balconies and stair of steel; repair terra cotta as necessary; repair metal top cornice.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 111705GEN. The proposed changes will return openings to the bays facing Gay Street, and will result in needed maintenance on the Burwell Building's facades.

The stuccoed planters that block the façade openings on the west and north elevations are recent additions, and obscure the original storefront design found in the Burwell Building. PLEASE NOTE: The attached tax map shows only the allocation of space for the first floors of the Burwell Building. As noted in the Detailed Description on this staff report, the upper floors of the Burwell Building extend across the Tennessee Theater to the south. Certificate No. 111705GEN applies to the southern, upper story, bays of the Burwell Building.

Jason DeBord, 602 Gay Street said he was excited about the project, prominent address for downtown, and people were excited about moving into the building.

Arning asked to have the entry doors described.

Jason DeBord stated he planned to restore the look of the original doors and the pattern of access. The entry doors will be wood with a metal frame to meet codes.

Faulkner asked to have façade explained further.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1:

323 Union Avenue/#2 Market Square, Pat McHugh (Owner/Applicant), Indigo (Tenant on Union Avenue)

Description of Work: Install wall mounted hanging sign on south façade near alley east of Market Square for storefront facing Union. Sign will be larger than design guideline required 4-6sq.ft. 48" x 32") located approximately 15 feet west of alleyway, white painted wood background with painted surface letters detailing name of business (Indigo).

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 113005MKT. Adopted Design Guidelines call for hanging signs that are no more than 4-6 square feet facing Market Square; however, this sign is on a side street removed from Market Square.

The business applying for this sign is not located on Market Square. Requiring their sign Union to meet the size requirements of hanging signs on Market Square would remove the visibility that the tenant must have in order to attract foot traffic from Market and Gay Street. The sign is larger, but that size will be necessary if pedestrian traffic is to find it. In every way but size, the sign is consistent with the design requirements of the Market Square Design Guidelines for hanging signs.

Chris Desarno, 327 Union (Indigo) having problems with customers finding them, move visibility on Union.

Grieve asked what the address was.

Bennett answered, 2 Market Square (327 Union) and remarked store fronts travel down Union.

Grieve stated side streets and alleys need guidelines for signs.

Arning questioned if the size of the sign could be cut down on corners to fit guidelines.

Chris Desarno thought the sign could be cut down because it's wooden.

Grieve wanted to know if the guidelines should be amended to allow signs on side streets and alleys, or if the commission should stick to the guidelines.

Bennett said if the guidelines were to be amended they would have to go through MPC and council.

Arning mentioned an exception was made previously for a larger sign to allow two business names on one sign. The sign issue won't go away, and a decision should be made.

Bennett said in the past every business had a separate sign.

Saunders stated "that's our job to uphold the guidelines".

Bennett asked the commission if they wanted to consider hardship if the sign can't be cut?

Grieve made a motion to deny.

Saunders asked to amend the motion and to wait until next month when the question to cut the sign could be answered.

Chris Desarno wants to figure out way to get sign up as soon as possible.

Bennett told Desarno if you can modify the sign, she can give permission without waiting until next month.

Grieves withdrew his original motion.

MOTION BY GRIEVES AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mechanicsville H-1:

232 Cansler, Scott Haynes, City Dept. of Development (Applicant)

Description of Work: Replace three windows on north elevation with wood, double hung, one over one windows slightly larger (3'x5'2") than current windows to provide fire access; remove burglar bars on north elevation windows; replace rear deck porch in kind; repair masonry foundation using appropriate mortar as specified in Preservation Brief No. 2; reroof, replacing roof deck as necessary; repair siding as necessary.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 112805MEC. The proposed replacement windows will more nearly approximate the likely size of the original window openings and configuration of the window panes. The remainder of the work is consistent with the design guidelines.

This building was altered prior to designation, including the addition of replacement windows that were smaller in size and varied in pane configuration from the original windows. This building was altered prior to designation, including the addition of replacement windows that were smaller in size and varied in pane configuration from the original windows.

Scott Haynes, Dept. of Development stated will meet health & safety for egress, and a 3rd window will be added.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1:

1640 Jefferson, Matthew Kellogg (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Replace existing wrought iron porch columns with wood, boxed or round, columns and porch railing with sawn wood 2x2 balusters set in top and bottom rails on 4-5" centers.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 112205EDG. The proposed work meets the adopted Edgewood-Park City Design Guidelines (Porches, pg. 19 - #1).

The owner has secured another Certificate to begin exterior repair, and in the course of that work, determined that it was desirable to remove a partial enclosure of a wrap around front and side porch, and return the porch to one of its historical iterations.

Dwight Gwinn, 1249 Monroe stated he supported Mr. Kellogg.

MOTION BY GRIEVES AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth & Gill H-1:

610 Caswell, Michele Dotson (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Replace one over one double hung wood windows with identical wood double hung windows.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 1129054&G. Proposed window replacement is consistent with the adopted design guidelines (pg. 11, Windows - #4) allow this replacement.

The size and design of the original, extremely deteriorated, current windows is being duplicated with the proposed replacement windows. The original windows have not been maintained and are not reusable.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION BECAUSE IT MEETS THE GUIDELINES. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

831 Deery, Marian Sing (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Face walls and roof of large storage structure in rear yard to accomplish a better blending of the structure with the neighborhood. Roof will be shingles, sides will be obscured with lattice and door hardware and trim will be consistent with the period.

Staff Recommendation: DENY Certificate No. 1130054&G. The storage building does not meet the provisions of the adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines. (See Outbuildings, pg. 19 - #1). Outbuildings are allowed, but should resemble servants' quarters or carriage houses.

The storage building was installed in the summer of 2000, and came before the KHZC for discussion in September (Certificate No. 829004&G). The Commission unanimously approved the staff recommendation, which approved the building, noting that the owner had suffered a stroke and the storage building was placed on the lot by his family in order to store his belongings and ready the house for his return home. The staff report comments noted that the approval was in the nature of a hardship certificate because the structure could eventually be removed if the owner moved or his health issues were resolved. Discussion of the KHZC focused on the eventual removal of the storage building.

The applicant has made a careful attempt to disguise the storage building. Constructing a gable roof and obscuring the side elevations with lattice will do much to blend the building into the background, but there is still a large portion of the shallower sloped

lower mansard roof that is exposed. If the peak of the gable could be extended upward so the sides of the gable covered and obscured the mansard roof completely, the installation might be more acceptable.

Arning stated he drove by the property.

Bennett spoke with Melynda Whetsel. Whetsel said the repair was not adequate for the building and Commission should not allow.

MOTION BY GRIEVES TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND ALLOW APPLICANT TO COME BACK. SECOND BY SAUNDERS. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Other

Administrative Rules Draft: Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Administrative Rules for the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission.

Gresham asked that the Secretary be removed under list of officers to be elected.

MOTION BY CLAUSSEN TO ADOPT THE RULES AS AMENDED. SECOND BY MONGOMERY. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Election of Officers

MOTION BY CLAUSSEN TO ELECT GRESHAM. SECOND BY MONGOMERY. THE MOTION WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

Gresham stated need to elect vice chair.

MOTION BY CLAUSSEN TO ELECT COTHAM. SECOND BY MONGOMERY. THE MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS TO ELECT ARNING. SECOND BY WILSON. THE MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett stated the City needs to modify the Administrative Rules to read identically as the County Administrative Rules.

MOTION BY GRIEVES TO ADOPT THE RULES AS AMENDED. SECOND BY SAUNDERS. THE MOTION WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY GRIEVES TO ELECT DONALDSON. SECOND BY SAUNDERS. THE MOTION WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

Ann stated the city charter will be forward to mayor's City Council meeting next Tuesday night, and the new roster will be distributed.

Art Clancy was recognized for his service by the commission and the mayor acknowledged him with certificate which was presented by Arning.

- Adjournment

MOTION MADE BY ARNING TO ADJOURN. SECOND BY SAUNDERS.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox county Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on January 19, 2006 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.