

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF AUGUST 18, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Finbarr Saunders
Duane Grieve
Kenneth Gresham
Steve Cotham
Melynda Whetsel
Linda Claussen
Faris Eid
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Mark Donaldson
Tom Reynolds
Chester Kilgore
Jamie Rowe
Sean Martin
Charles Richmond
Vance Carter
Arin Pennington
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent (excused):

Herb Donaldson
Lila Wilson
William Hoehl
Cassandra McGee
Art Clancy

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests.

He wants to make it clear who stated each sentence from last month's minutes concerning the Cherokee Country Club. Bennett will change the paragraphs to make them clear.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE JULY 21, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY SUBJECT TO THE CHANGES IN THE MINUTES.

Sharon Boyce of the City Law Department reminded the commission about the Sunshine Law requiring that all decisions be made in public. If as few as two people meet and could be discussing Commission actions, it is considered a meeting. Onsight inspections of property are an exception and are not included in the law. City policy does not have any statement about conflict of interest.

Tom Reynolds, Chief (Knoxville Building, Zoning and Plans Review) explained that Chris Plante at 238 Oklahoma has not responded to notices, nor does he appear to have worked on the house.

Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Level 1 Certificates

2008 Jefferson – Edgewood-Park City – Yvonne Fields – 80205EDG – Door repair; install full view storm doors.

810 Deery – Fourth & Gill – David Vogel – 804054&G – Window and siding repair.

822 Deery – Fourth & Gill – J & W Haynes – 72104&G – Repair roof at rear, replace original window and tongue and groove porch floor.

925 Eleanor – Fourth & Gill – Arin Streeter – 715054&G – Remove rear porch enclosures & repair, remove paint from masonry.

711 Gratz – Fourth & Gill – Scott McNutt – 726054&G – Reinstall porch floor.

219 Leonard Place - Old North Knoxville – David Metler – 72005ONK – Reinstall porch floor.

Bennett stated that Candoro Marble Company and Lincoln Park United Methodist Church have been placed on the National Register.

Fourth & Gill H-1:

911 Gratz, Johnathan Wimmer, (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Replace existing deteriorated carriage house at rear of 911 Luttrell with exact replica in slightly modified rear yard location. Plans for infill building will duplicate existing, except for some modifications to entrance, and will even reuse some elements. The proposed building will be a two story frame building with vertical siding, six over six double hung wood dormer windows and four light windows marking former horse stalls on ground floor and six light casements on second story. Hip roof with hip roof dormers on west, south and north elevations and hip roofed covering for second story entry door on east elevation. Central hip roofed lantern on roof with wood louvered vents on all elevations, duplicating lantern that was used as hose drying tower. Sliding doors on alley and cross braced doors on east elevation that were open with bars on the top half, to allow ventilation for horses. Entry door on south elevation. Brick

foundation. Square plan. Add replacement stairs and balcony to 2nd story entrance door on east elevation.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate 803054&G. Current structure is extremely deteriorated; replacement duplicates original and will allow continued use. Folk history in the Fourth & Gill neighborhood indicates that it was the original fire station for North Knoxville. That use is consistent with the design of the building; unfortunately, the building's present condition is very deteriorated, and has been altered in some respects. However, many of the exterior details and the original form and structure remain intact. The owner of 911 Luttrell wishes to reconstruct the original building, moving it to a slightly different rear location so automobile traffic can access it from the alley, reusing details that are salvageable, and replicating others. Alteration to the current features will include the following: installation of a balcony and French doors in the original second story east elevation, exterior stairs to the second story, replacement of a window with a door on the north elevation and installation of window boxes on the upper and lower windows on the east elevation. All other details of the original building will be salvaged and reused or replicated. The proposed changes will not obscure the design of the building.

Bennett noted that a repair of the building without changing its location would not result in a greater loss of historic fabric than rebuilding it in a slightly different location will create; the building is so deteriorated that most of it would have to be replaced whether it was moved or not.

Arin Pennington, representing Sanders Place Architecture, stated that the foundation is gone from most of the building. They will salvage as many of the materials as possible. They will keep the doors that face the house and replace the others. Grieve suggested to use wood instead of wrought iron for the balcony. Sean Martin, 4th and Gill representative, stated that the neighborhood does not have any problems with this. They are glad the unique structure will be preserved.

Arning stated that this is not a restoration but a replica is being built.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

807 Gratz, Charles Richmond (Owner/Applicant/Applicant)

Description of Work: Construct new two story single family house with design derived from Queen Anne, including front and side wrap around front porch, side bay, imbricated

shingles in gable, one over one double hung windows, second story balcony, brick foundation, one over one double hung windows, one story back ell with side porch, brick chimney.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 804054&GB. The proposed building will be an asset to the fourth & Gill neighborhood, meets the terms of the adopted design guidelines, and will help to catalyze redevelopment of this part of the Fourth & Gill neighborhood. The city and residents of Fourth & Gill have worked together closely to complete the subdivision of these lots, and are to be congratulated for adding to the amount of new construction going on in Knoxville's historic districts.

Charles Richmond, architect, 428 E. Scott, stated that he bid on the land and was awarded this lot for the infill house. Grieve stated he was on the committee and congratulated Richmond. Whetsel asked how big the columns will be. He said they will be 6" x 6".

Martin stated the neighborhood approves of the drawing except for a concern about the balustrades. Richmond stated the balustrades would be turned.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSELL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1119 Luttrell, Ken Bronson Construction Company/Vance Carter (Contractor/Applicant)

Description of Work: Install new rear porch, extending existing rear porch to rear corner of house, with wood flooring and shed roof; repair front porch floor with tongue in groove; replace wood front steps with new steps and install new handrails with either pipe rail or sawn wood; install window screens at downstairs windows; repair existing windows, installing new wood sashes if necessary, replicating original size and pane configuration; repair siding in kind as necessary; repair chimneys as necessary, using Preservation Brief No. 2 and installing metal caps on both chimneys.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE 804054&GC. The added rear porch will not be visible from Luttrell. Other changes are also consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

Vance Carter, 6230 Washington Pike, stated he is the contractor for the owner. His company has done other renovations in the neighborhood and is looking forward to working on this house.

Martin stated the neighborhood approves of the renovation.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ADDING THAT THE HANDRAILS WILL BE SAWN WOOD. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mechanicsville H-1:

1009 Tulip, Charles Richmond, Architect/Applicant)

Description of Work: Raise roof, add shed dormer on façade, add either three quarters or full front porch with splayed wood posts on wood paneled piers, sawn wood railing, add rear ell with windows to match existing and wood siding to match existing, brick foundation, retain interior right side chimney, extending it to accommodate new dormer and roof line, remove interior left side chimney.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 80405MEC. Proposed changes are consistent with the Craftsman style, and with the adopted Mechanicsville Design Guidelines. This house has been vacant for a number of years, and has been held by the Knoxville Builders' Exchange as they waited for a purchaser who they felt would maintain the building and return it to useful life. The proposed buyer is a long-term resident of the neighborhood, whose mother lives on Deaderick. He has been active in the neighborhood organization. The proposed design is consistent with other homes in Mechanicsville, and will make the home an asset to the neighborhood.

Charles Richmond, architect, representing the owner stated that the owner wants to build an addition on the rear because the house is so small. They would like to take one of the two chimneys down. Bennett stated the house was designed with the chimneys and should stay. Arning asked about the chimneys being in the way and could one chimney be removed and just use the part on the roof. Richmond stated that could be done. Eid stated that the windows and dormer would be missed from the new plan. Grieve would like for the three windows to look like the originals and keep both chimneys. Richmond stated he has no problem with that.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION EXCEPT MAKE THE WINDOWS MATCH THE ORIGINALS AND KEEP BOTH CHIMNEYS. THE MOTION WAS ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Other

Bennett asked the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission to consider the revised amendments to Article 4, Section 14 and Article 4, Section 22 of the *Knoxville Zoning Ordinance*. The changes include those recommended by H-1 and NC-1 designated neighborhoods. If adopted, these revisions will be forwarded to City Council to be heard on August 29, 2005. MPC has approved these revisions to the ordinance.

Chester Kilgore, 1319 Grainger, explained that the Old North Knoxville neighborhood approves of the ordinance amendments. The neighborhood is most concerned that property previously designated H-1 or NC-1 not have its designation removed, but understand that the ordinance will have to be amended. The neighborhood is particularly pleased with the addition of the requirement that anyone wanting to remove an overlay should talk to a neighborhood representative, and would hope that applicants would talk to the affected neighborhoods very early in the process, before the meeting packet for the Historic Zoning Commission has been distributed. Kilgore thanked the commission for seeking comments from the neighborhoods.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE proposed ordinance amendments.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE ADOPTION OF THE ORDINANCE AMENDMENTS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett explained that Central United Methodist Church, listed on the National register of Historic Places as part of the Fourth & Gill Historic District, has submitted an application to be considered as an individual historic property. She noted that central United Methodist Church is also listed as part of the 4th & Gill H-1 Historic Overlay District. Bennett explained that there is no particular advantage to an individual listing, since buildings that are listed as contributing in larger districts are considered to have individual status; however, she noted that the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission, in reviewing the National Register nomination of 1986 and in recommended inclusion of the building in the H-p1 Historic Overlay that was adopted more than ten years later, had twice affirmed their belief that the church was deserving of historic status. She recommended the Commission endorse their request.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY EID TO REQUEST THAT BENNETT SEND A LETTER TO THE TENNESSEE HISTORICAL COMMISSION RECOMMENDING THAT CENTRAL UNITED METHODIST

CHURCH BE RECOGNIZED AND LISTED SEPARATELY ON THE NATIONAL REGISTER. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH WHETSEL RECUSING.

Village of Concord – Bennett reported that Knox County Engineering had requested a letter from the Knox county Historic Zoning Commission expressing their opinion about the construction of a new bridge at Turkey Creek embayment. She noted that the existing bridge will be retained and used as a pedestrian/bikeway, with the new bridge paralleling the current one, and built at the same height as the current bridge. Commissioner Montgomery expressed concerns about the appearance of the bridge, hoping that its side railings would duplicate the look of the current bridge.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN ASKING BENNETT TO WRITE A LETTER ENDORSING THE BRIDGE AND EXPRESSING THE COMMISSION'S CONCERNS ABOUT APPEARANCE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Kilgore thanked Mark Donaldson for helping in writing the new ordinance. Also, the neighborhood wants to know who to address concerns when Bennett and Reynolds are out of town. Bennett stated they are to call the main number to City Codes at 215-2999 and report a problem; that office will respond with an inspection. Montgomery asked what to do in the county. Bennett stated that county would call 215-2325.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on September 15, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville.