

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF APRIL 21, 2005

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Finbarr Saunders
Cassandra McGee
Steve Cotham
Lila Wilson
Melynda Whetsel
William Hoehl
Carol Montgomery
Linda Claussen
Herb Donaldson
Faris Eid
Kenneth Gresham

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Dave Hill
Bill Lyons
Chester Kilgore
Jamie Rowe
Kim Trent
Hollie Cook
Steve Hill
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Art Clancy (ex.)
Duane Grieve (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests on the certificates.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE MARCH 17, 2005 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Bennett stated that there has been a collapse of part of a historic wall, and the collapse of a non-historic (c.1960) west wall at the Park House. Contact has been made with the Tennessee Historical Commission to assure that tax credits will still be available, and flowable fill has been used in the trench at the base of those and other walls to arrest further collapse, until a design for reconstructing the damage portions of the house can be determined.

Arning stated that the Claussen's, who own the Park House, have brought a James Agee exhibit to the Customs House.

Level I Certificates for Repair:

29 Market Square: Sign application for hanging sign, applicant Gregor Smee.

32 Market Square: Redesign of second story window installation. A Certificate for the front façade was approved shortly after Market Square became a district. The specified window openings were too wide for the space. Reynolds and Bennett worked with the owner and contractor to reduce the number of windows from six to four and repair structural damage to the wall incurred in trying to install the original design, preventing the wall's collapse.

215 E. Oklahoma: Siding repair.

248 E. Oklahoma: Siding and roof repair.

254 E. Oklahoma: Repair of siding, tongue and groove porch floor, gutters, porch ceiling and columns, gable ornament, pointing, garage doors, storm windows, and shortening kitchen window to match original opening.

1300 Kenyon: Replacement of missing rear casement windows to match existing window in kitchen.

505 E. Scott: Slate roof and flashing repair.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1:

839 Deery, Greg Marlow (Owner/Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II - Remove added triangular vent on front roof slope. (The Level 1 certificate involves roof, bracket repair, storm windows, siding repair and shingled gable repair.)

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 317054&G. Gablet on front elevation is an added feature, not historically present and probably installed on roof during a phase of weatherization several decades ago. Applicant has been working on the interior and exterior of the house, including rebuilding the front porch columns and railing, and is beginning to remove artificial siding and restore the original weatherboard.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Tazewell Pike NC-1:

4201 Tazewell Pike, Patricia Bush (Owner/agent)

Description of Work: Level II Certificate. Construct porte cochere, attached garage at rear of house, not visible from Tazewell Pike, and small bathroom addition at rear.

Staff Recommendation: Owner has requested that certificate be denied without prejudice and rescheduled for May meeting so façade elevation can be completed.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO DENY THE CERTIFICATE WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1:

1301 Kenyon, John Wampler (Contractor/Applicant)

Description of Work: 1) Add dormer on northwest elevation towards Scott Ave (not visible from streets) with design to match other roof dormers, side walls covered in weatherboard and matching double casement window; 2) install new roof; repair or install gutters; 3) repair windows; 4) repair front porch beams; 4) install tongue & groove porch flooring; 5) rebuild rear porch steps in kind; 6) reopen existing door on rear porch and close door now providing access; 7) remove aluminum siding on rear porch; 8) remove rear brick vent, not visible from streets; 9) remove remainder of aluminum siding as a long-range goal.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 40605ONK. The work items proposed in Certificate No. 40605ONK are repair items, except for the addition of a roof dormer and the removal of a rear brick vent. Neither of these is on a street elevation. The proposed dormer will duplicate the existing roof pitch and the windows of the front gable, as provided in pg. 13, Sec. A1 and pg. 15, B1 & B5, while the rear brick vent is not a character-defining feature (see Pg. 23, Section F5).

Bennett stated that this has been a rental house but will be an owner-occupied house. It is visible from the street.

Chester Kilgore of 1319 Grainger asked who the current owner is and Bennett said HUD owns it. He stated that the neighborhood wants the dormer covered by siding that will match the original.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

215 E. Oklahoma. Sean Bolen (Owner/Applicant).

Description of Work: 1) Replace railing on second floor balcony and roof railing with one similar to first floor railing, with turned spindles on same centers; 2) install tongue & groove floor on second floor balcony; 3) repair or replace siding in kind as necessary.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 40605ONKB. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines. Applicant received approval for the re-installation of the second story balcony in March of 2003. The Certificate has expired, and he was not able to complete the work during that time frame, but wishes to complete the work now.

Kilgore stated that the neighborhood is pleased with this project. Eid asked about the height of the railing. Bennett explained that the railing is a second story porch railing, and must meet codes, although that requirement may be met unobtrusively with a modification at the bottom of the rail.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

505 E. Scott. Steve and Deborah Hill (Owners/Applicants).

Description of Work: Level II Certificate: 1) Addition at rear of house with raised basement containing 3-car garage and a one story sun room. Brick foundation, 6' double hung wood windows with single pane windows in raised basement, garage doors facing rear and flat roof, together with curb cut and driveway from Harvey; Clopay garage doors in traditional "carriage house" design; 2) Repair existing garage in kind, replacing board and batten as necessary and adding wood windows where missing; 3) Repair existing slate roof on primary structure; 4) Replace/repair rotten wood and shingles as necessary; 5) Straighten existing driveway at front of house, with curb cut on Scott; 6) Place iron fence (42" high maximum around front yard, with wood privacy fence in rear yard; 7) Repair existing windows in primary structure as necessary; 8) Repair existing masonry as necessary, using appropriate mortar mix.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE CERTIFICATE NO. 40505ONK. Proposed work is consistent with adopted Old North Knoxville Guidelines. Proposed work is also consistent with the admonition to repair existing materials present throughout guidelines. Under New Building Construction, pg. 28, Sections L1, L2 and L3, additions are recommended for the rear of existing buildings. This addition has appropriate scale and materials use. There was originally an addition, probably one story with a raised basement, at the rear of this house; it was demolished prior to designation. While the new addition will clearly be a product of the current time period, it is being carefully considered so that it remains compatible with the original building.

Steve Hill of 505 E. Scott is the owner. The garage will be at the basement level. He will match the brick as closely as possible. Eid stated that this new structure seems very massive for the house and wants to see a drawing to scale to see what it will look like when it is finished. He would like for the new structure to be offset from the house. Bennett suggested they install more windows on the Harvey side of the street.

Kilgore stated that the neighborhood is very pleased to see it restored and agrees with Eid's comments to drop it back from the house. Hill stated he is doing what is best for the house. Arning asked if he had elevation drawings and he does not. Eid asked that they approve subject to modifications.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION SUBJECT TO MODIFICATION TO ITEM 1 THAT IS BEING REVIEWED BY BENNETT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

238 E. Oklahoma – Kilgore stated that nothing has been done to the house, and it is still an eyesore. Arning asked if Reynolds could go look at it. Bennett spoke to housing inspector, and a complaint about the back yard had been filed. He can leave building materials in the front yard if it is under construction. Kilgore asked if the house could be put on the demolition by neglect list. Boyce stated Flynn would have to decide. Bennett will write a letter to Flynn concerning the house.

Emoriland-Fairmont NC-1:

2113 Fairmont (Accessory Building – Garage) Ken Flynn, Manager, City Housing Codes Enforcement (Agent/Applicant).

Description of Work: Demolish accessory structure, condemned and collapsing.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE LEVEL IV Certificate No. 40705FTPK. Garage is a blighting influence on the neighborhood, and due to its extreme deterioration, has lost architectural integrity and would now be classified as non-contributing.

Cotham of 1912 Emoriland representing the neighborhood, stated that Codes needs to talk to the neighborhood about saving structures, but this one should be torn down. A house across the street has a garage that has been torn down and the rubble is still there.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Other

Explanation of Downtown Plan. Staff Recommendation: Endorse work of Downtown Advisory Group.

Arning introduced Bill Lyons of the Mayor's office. Crandall and Arambula carried out analysis and planning work for the downtown task force and produced a report, and Mayor Haslam appointed Dave Hill to bring the amended plan to approval and implementation. Some of the primary thrust of the updated plan includes connectivity to the neighborhoods ringing downtown, initiating Central Business District involvement in restoring the buildings, initiating urban design guidelines with the help of MPC, and work on the streetscape. A final plan document will be presented. There is a city workshop today at 5:30 p.m. to discuss the plan. Gresham asked how the retail would compete with West Town because of the cost of parking uptown. Lyons stated that parking is free on nights and weekends. Montgomery thinks lower income housing like Habitat for Humanity should be included in the outskirts. Dave Hill thanked Arning for being on the committee.

Saunders asked about what was given about historic designations. The budget for MPC was \$30,000 to provide professional expertise for the guidelines. Arning stated that if you look at the organizational structure, the Historic Zoning Commission is a part of the process. Hill affirmed that the administration does not want to duplicate services.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS, SECOND BY EID, TO ENDORSE THE DOWNTOWN TASK FORCE REPORT. THE MOTION WAS ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.

National Register Nominations:

Bennett noted that the Tennessee Historical Commission Sites Advisory Committee will hear three National Register nominations from Knoxville and Knox County in May, 2005.

Candoro Marble Company Showroom and Garage, 681 Maryville Pike

Candoro was first nominated to the National Register several years ago. After there was an objection from the former owner, the National Register declared the buildings eligible for listing on the National Register, but the building was not officially listed on the National Register. A nonprofit group owns the marble company and wants it put on the National Register. The THC feels it is eligible. Bennett indicated that the nomination points to local significance. She feels that the building, representative of the marble industry that shaped so much public architecture for the first 50 years of the 20th century, should be considered nationally significant.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY GRESHAM TO APPROVE THE NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION OF THE CANDORO MARBLE COMPANY SHOWROOM AND GARAGE WITH NATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Lincoln Park United Methodist Church, 3120 Pershing Street

The Lincoln Park Church was built in 1926. Bennett stated that the congregation has kept the building close to the original.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO APPROVE THE NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION OF LINCOLN PARK UNITED METHODIST CHURCH. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Chilhowee Park, Beaman, Castle, Jefferson, Mary, Manor and Woodbine east of Cherry and north of E. Fifth Avenue.

This creates a district that adjoins one of the boundaries of the Park City National Register Historic District, but does not duplicate it. THC has not endorsed this designation because of some structures that have been modified.

Kim Trent of Knox Heritage stated that the neighborhood organization endorses this nomination. The changes in the houses proposed for the district can be reversed.

MOTION BY WILSON AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION OF THE CANDORO MARBLE COMPANY SHOWROOM AND GARAGE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Staff Recommendation: Endorse National Register nominations and forward endorsement to the THC.

2005 Mayor's Report on Preservation. Staff Recommendation: Endorse report for forwarding to Mayor Bill Haslam.

Bennett asked groups which structures should receive an overlay for the report. Listed details from the report. MPC approved it last week, the Historic Zoning Commission approves it, and then it goes to the Mayor.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO ENDORSE THE 2005 MAYOR'S REPORT ON PRESERVATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY DONALDSON TO ASK THE COMMISSION TO SEND A LETTER TO THE CITY STATING THAT THE MCCLUNG WAREHOUSES ON JACKSON AVENUE SHOULD BE CITED FOR DEMOLITION BY NEGLECT SO THE CITY CAN RENOVATE THEM BEFORE THEY CANNOT BE RESTORED. THE KNOXVILLE COMMUNITY DESIGN CENTER REPORT SHOULD BE INCLUDED, WHICH STUDIED THESE PROPERTIES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Arning thanked Bennett for attending all the neighborhood meetings. Kilgore stated that he would like to encourage the commissioners to attend neighborhood meetings of the areas that are already designated.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on May 19, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville.