

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 16, 2004

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Duane Grieve
Melynda Whetsel
Carol Montgomery
Art Clancy
Finbarr Saunders
Cassandra McGee
Faris Eid
Herb Donaldson
Lila Wilson
Kenneth Gresham

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Chester Kilgore
Linda Claussen
Steve Symons
Margaret Simpson
Brett Honeycutt
Ray Snyder
Rapinder S. Sawhney
Gordon Coker
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West
Jarvis Reedo
Susan Taylor

Members Absent:

Steve Cotham (ex.)
Bill Hoehl (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests on any of the certificates.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 19 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett introduced Linda Claussen, who will be a new Historic Zoning Commissioner for the county and Jarvis Reedo, who is working as an intern at MPC with her.

Reynolds, Rehab Chief for the City of Knoxville, stated that the Clifford Quinton Tazewell Pike property is still in the legal process, and the city is dealing with the Pickle Mansion.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett – listed four reports that have been issued. The projects are 825 Morgan Street, 822 Deery Street, 1031 Eleanor Street and 1302 Luttrell Street.

Certificates of Appropriateness:

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Old North Knoxville H-1

1324 Grainger Avenue. Steve Symons, Owner (Applicant)

Description of Work: Level II Certificate. Enclose existing non-contributing carport with wood lap siding, windows and door in rear (not visible from Grainger), paired cross braced doors in front under full cornice return. On rear house addition add French doors to back yard and move existing window to side elevation of addition adding skylight or small shed roofed dormer to rear roof plane. None of these modifications would be made to the historic portion of the building and none would be visible from Grainger.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II Certificate (90104ONK). The proposed work is either consistent with the adopted Old North Knoxville design guidelines, or being made to a new addition that is not visible from Grainger. In the case of the carport, the applicant will convert an inappropriate carport to an appropriate outbuilding. The addition to the original house will also be improved.

Bennett stated that the previous owner built an open carport. Steve Symons of 1324 Grainger Avenue stated he is the new owner and is proposing to enclose the carport. There would not be any changes to the historic area.

Chester Kilgore of 1319 Grainger Avenue stated that the neighborhood has no objections, and it will be an improvement.

Eid stated that he would like to see how the cornice on the garage will fit with the house. Symons answered that the overhang matches the house. Kilgore stated that the new roofline will match the house.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO ENCLOSE THE CARPORT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSELL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO ACCEPT THE CHANGES TO THE REAR ADDITION.

Market Square H-1

29 Market Square. John Craig, Owner; Design Innovations Architects (Brett Honeycutt) Applicant.

Description of Work: Level II Certificate. Install railing at roof’s parapet wall.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II Certificate (90204MKT) Proposed changes are consistent with adopted design guidelines. The building is being completely rehabilitated with the inclusion of apartments on the upper stories. The apartments will have access to the roof. Building codes and safety considerations will require a parapet railing. The railing is designed to be simple and unobtrusive. (NOTE: Changes planned for the “penthouse” will not be visible from Market, and are not being reviewed.)

Brett Honeycutt with Design Innovations stated that they are putting a roof deck and a railing on the building using a cable railing and tube steel.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY WILSON TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH EID ABSTAINING.

Fourth & Gill H-1

917 Luttrell Street. Ray Snyder, City Department of Neighborhood and Community Services, Applicant.

Description of Work: Complete removal of aluminum siding; remove front porch enclosure and return one story front porch; replace all windows (due to lead-based paint requirements) with two over two divided light windows; remove added rear deck exterior stair; reroof; install gutters; brick faced foundation on front porch.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II Certificate (901044&G). Although the exterior changes proposed are extensive, they are consistent with the adopted design guidelines. The proposed rehabilitation will return a condemned house to use while reintroducing its notable two story front porch to the streetscape.

Ray Snyder, rehab specialist for City stated that this property has been a four unit complex, and the city issued a permit to do work on the house. It will become a duplex again.

Whetsel asked if there was any consideration to make it a single family house. Mr. Sawhney, the owner, of 1034 Eleanor Street answered that financially they couldn't do it.

Barbara Simpson of 1302 Luttrell Avenue stated that a neighbor spoke to the owner and was told it would be a duplex. The side porch entrance stairs are not shown and a porch is not shown. There should be a site plan for the work, and she would like to have a postponement. The neighborhood would like to see the entrance to the second story. Bennett stated that the City Code does not require a second story outside entrance.

Sawhney stated that there used to be a back entrance and that is no longer required. He talked to Mr. Arin Streeter, the architect, who documented that the house did not have a two-story porch originally. Snyder stated they are pleased with the Sawhney's work. A bid will go out within the next couple of weeks, and they will start the work as soon as a contractor is found. It will be completed in 6 to 8 months.

Bennett has been in the house and noted that the one story porch was appropriate, and the rear second story entrance was not original. The commission may wish to require a site plan.

Grieve asked if the second story stairway is required. Snyder stated that the stairway is in the interior. Could we approve the certificate and then let them come back with a site plan? Snyder stated that would be fine.

Simpson asked if this will be a low income housing project, and if the windows are in good condition, why does the paint have to be removed. Want them restored instead of replaced. Snyder stated they have to remove the lead base paint; it is expensive to remove it, and may be easier simply to replace the windows.

Arning stated that the Commission commends the Sawhney's for communicating with the neighborhood. Simpson stated he has only talked to Mr. Wimmer, and the whole neighborhood was not aware of the work. Arning noted that the Commission can't address the income of residents, use as a duplex or one or two lots. Bennett stated that the Commission has allowed replacement of windows with lead base paint, and that lead base paint requirements accompany any expenditure of HUD funds, and were more recently called into play with a house on E. Scott that was part of the homemaker's program. Snyder stated that he is willing to look at the windows to see if they could be repaired instead of replaced. He said that this is not designed as a low income project.

Sawhney stated that most of the houses are multi family, and he is working with the city on this. He is also meeting the legal requirements. Simpson stated that the issue is the replacement of the windows instead of using the original windows.

Gresham stated that the Commission wants to maintain the integrity of the neighborhood. If the new windows work better and you can't tell the difference, from an economic standpoint, he would want tight fitting windows. If people can't remodel and make it meet environmental issues, they will be hesitant to remodel their property. If the new windows replicate the old ones, and the old ones must be replaced, then it would be better. Snyder stated that single pane windows looks more like the original one and then storm windows would be used.

Montgomery thanked the owners for making the house look much better.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND ASK THAT THE OWNER SUBMIT A SITE PLAN. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH WHETSEL ABSTAINING BECAUSE SHE LIVES IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD AND DIDN'T KNOW ABOUT THIS PROJECT OR THE TYPE OF WINDOWS THAT WILL BE USED.

1000 Eleanor Street. Gordon Coker, Owner

Description of Work: Construct new storage building on existing concrete pad. One story 12'x16' wood framed with wood weatherboard siding, double front door facing Caswell, wood windows, end gable roof with asphalt shingle covering and 8/12 pitch.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II Certificate (809044&G). Proposed outbuilding is consistent with adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines, and is being built on exact location of formerly demolished outbuilding. The proposed materials and roof shape are consistent with the design of the primary structure on the lot. Placement of the building is consistent with neighboring outbuildings' locations.

Bennett noted that the original location of the garage, where the owner wishes to rebuild, would need a variance from setback requirements and it might be helpful to have the support of the Commission when that application is heard.

Gordon Coker of 1000 Eleanor Street, owner, stated that he wants to build on the existing slab.

Simpson stated that the neighborhood approves this project.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSELL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY EID TO BUILD WHERE THE SLAB IS LOCATED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mechanicsville H-1

1020 Tulip Street. Carol Johnson, Owner

Description of Work: Demolish concrete block addition at rear of house and repair siding and reinstall window to match original.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level I Certificate (90204MEC). Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines. Proposed work will return building to original configuration.

Arning stated there should be a representative from Mechanicsville attending the Commission meetings.

Grieve stated that he has been in the house and demolishing the structure would be an improvement.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Jamie Rowe, representing the Tazewell Pike Conservation District, stated that Joshua's Landing is being built adjacent to the district. The neighborhood has drainage concerns since there will be 92 houses and condos located there. There are sinkholes and wetlands on the property that might affect their property. The NC-1 guidelines note that any adjoining subdivisions that might affect the drainage patterns in the Tazewell Pike Conservation District should receive special review to be sure they do not endanger

Page Seven – Minutes
Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission
Knox County Historic Zoning Commission
Meeting of September 16, 2004

properties in the NC-1. The neighborhood has filed an appeal with City Council, which will be heard on September 28. She asked that the HZC write a letter to City Council stating that the Commission hopes City Council will mitigate any impacts this subdivision will have on the neighborhood.

MOTION BY CLANCY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS FOR BENNETT TO WRITE A LETTER TO CITY COUNCIL STATING THE CONCERNS THE TAZEWELL PIKE NC-1 NEIGHBORHOOD HAS REGARDING THE WETLANDS AND SINKHOLES IN THE PROPOSED JOSHUA’S LANDING SUBDIVISION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on Thursday, October 21, 2004, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.