

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JUNE 17, 2004

Members Present:

Nic Arning
Duane Grieve
Bill Hoehl
Melynda Whetsel
Carol Montgomery
Steve Cotham
Art Clancy
Finbarr Saunders
Cassandra McGee
Faris Eid
Herb Donaldson
Lila Wilson
Barry Davis

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
David Harrell
Sandra McCall
Jamie Rowe
Lee Ingram
Charles Smith
Kay Osborne
Cecelia Peterson
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West
Susan Taylor

Members Absent:

Kenneth Gresham (ex.)

Arning called the meeting to order and asked if there were any conflicts of interests.

Bennett introduced Caroline Cox, a student intern from Radford. She is working on drawings for Knox Heritage and the North Hills Design Guidelines.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE MAY 20 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Level 1 certificates are issued for standard repair that doesn't alter the design of the building. The addresses listed below were issued Level 1 certificates.

729 Gratz Street
1607 Jefferson Avenue
1620 Washington Avenue
1700 Jefferson Avenue
1621 Jefferson Avenue

CITY OF KNOXVILLE

Old North Knoxville H-1:

321 E. Oklahoma Avenue. Knox Heritage, Inc., Option Holders – 060304ONK

Description of Work: Level I – Repair or replace gutters in kind; repair and point masonry as necessary, including chimney; repair front porch balustrade in kind; repair or replace front porch floor with tongue in groove flooring; install two HVAC units at rear or side of house; repair siding soffits and fascia in kind as necessary; remove asphalt shingles on front gable, replacing them with wood shingles; repair existing windows; reinstall double windows on rear of house, lowering them from current location; repair existing second story access stairs; install color clad full view storm doors; repair front door; repave driveway and front walk; repair storm windows; reroof with asphalt shingles.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level I Certificate No. 060304ONK. Proposed work is consistent with adopted Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines.

Bennett stated there are double and single windows that are too high, and the owners want to make them match, which changes the exterior and that is why it is a Level 1.

Bob Everage of Knox Heritage stated what work they are planning to do to the house.

MOTION BY HOEHL AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY WITH SAUNDERS ABSTAINING.

Fourth & Gill H-1:

1202 Luttrell. Allen and Sandra Osborne, Owners – 505044&G

Description of Work: Level II Certificate: Demolish existing (not original) rear porch and construct 16x24 deck at 8"3" to match existing floor level. Railing to match railing on front porch. Brick screening and posts at outer perimeter of carport on ground level, with posts on piers to support second story deck, to replicate design of front porch.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II Certificate 505044&G. Proposed changes are at rear of building, and will replace unattractive added rear porch with improved rear access. Note: Application has been modified to include more sympathetic design at ground level.

Bennett stated that this application was before the commission last month. The packet included picture of back deck and the plans for changing it. The question is what type of posts will be used.

Kay Osborne of 1202 Luttrell wants to make the deck a usable area. Montgomery stated that if the posts were copied from the front ones 16” posts would be too heavy. Whetsel stated that two-tone brick is too much and the columns would be too wide. Eid stated that the wood posts could be made bigger, apply trim and box them in. Whetsel thanked the Osbornes asking for commission approval before moving forward.

McCall of 940 Eleanor Street stated that she likes the plan they started with the best. The brick columns don’t work as a reproduction deck. The neighborhood doesn’t object, but the brick should be one color.

Osborne stated she wants to do what the neighborhood would approve and will use the original posts and box them in.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO USE WOODEN POSTS AND ADDED TRIM. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

General H-1:

James Park House, 422 W. Cumberland Avenue. Lee Ingram, Brewer, Ingram & Fuller Architects, Applicant for Linda Claussen, Owner. – 60204GEN

Description of Work: Level II Certificate: Repair existing masonry walls; add front porch to replicate c. 1890 previous front porch; reroof using standing seam metal; remove added front door; add rear door in previous location; remove windows on west elevation added c. 1930; repair cornice as necessary; add or repair gutters; rebuild chimneys on north and south elevations to match c. 1900 photographs; rebuild chimney on west elevation as part of repairing or rebuilding west elevation wall; add appropriate basement windows on east side and attic windows to replicate originals; remove door added to west elevation; add picket fence as shown in c. 1900 photographs; pave portions of rear and side yard for parking; construct three story gable roofed back ell joined to rear of main house by gable roofed glass walled connection. (NOTE: Demolition of rear addition previously approved by HZC, Certificate No. 123103GEN.)

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Level II Certificate No. 60204GEN. The proposed work is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s *Standards* (adopted design guidelines) and was previously discussed under Certificate No. 123103GEN with the exception of the design change for the front porch.

Bennett stated that the commission approved the demolition of the newest part of the building. This plan is detailed on what they want to do. The new addition on the back will look like the submitted plans.

Lee Ingram, one of the architects for the project, stated that they have researched in the McClung Collection and found photographs of 1890s porch. The entrance to the offices will be on the back of the new addition. To match the brick, it will have to be painted like the brick is now.

Arning asked that Ingram submit the sign drawings as soon as they are ready.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1:

17 Market Square. Faris Eid, Design Innovations Architect for Greater Knoxville Chamber Partnership, Owner. – 060304MKT

Description of Work: Level I Certificate: Install window and hanging signs for new Chamber Partnership office.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE Certificate No. 060304MKT. Sign design includes a flush-mounted signboard at the height where the transom would have begun, a hanging sign (base at 9’7”) and a directory on the storefront next to entry.

Eid, who is the owner of Design Innovations, and Donaldson, who is a member of the Chamber Partnership, recused themselves.

Cecelia Peterson works for the Chamber Partnership and asked for approval of the sign. Bennett stated there will be tenants on the first floors of these buildings, and there will be future requests for their signage. Arning would like to see traditional signs to fit in with the square. Grieve suggested they not use the “P” logo for the Chamber Partnership because it looks like a directional sign for a parking lot.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY CLANCY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY WITH EID AND DONALSON ABSTAINING.

Tom Reynolds from the City of Knoxville stated that the Pickle house going before the Building Board later this month concerning the demolition. He spoke with Mr. Grogan, who has the carport on Tazewell Pike that is not in compliance with the Tazewell Pike NC-1 overlay, and he is taking the carport down today.

- Discussion: Gay Street Viaduct railing design.

The Gay Street Viaduct is going to be replaced and the question is what the railing will look like. It is a recessed panel system. Bullock Smith has requested a pierced railing design. The original needs to be replaced with a new railing. Sam Parnell of City Engineering wanted the commission to look at this design, and the commission could write to the Tennessee Department of Transportation (TDOT) if they would like to see the design changed.

Charles Smith, Chairman of Bullock Smith stated that they have been meeting with Commissioner Gerald Nicely of TDOT for the last year. The bridge will be closed for two years. It will be 6' to 8' higher than the original. Bennett distributed four types of designs for the cutouts. Bullock Smith would like the arched cutout.

David Harrell, Chief Civil Engineer for the City of Knoxville, stated that it would be hard to get TDOT to change the design of the rail currently in the plans. TDOT would want a letter from the Historic Zoning Commission and the State. The railing is 32" and would have to be made 42" because of a pedestrian walkway on it. Arning asked how long the solid panels have been there and how much trouble it would be to change them. Bennett's preference is to replicate the original, but the railing has to be 42" and the whole bridge is being changed anyway. It is just being repaired and not replicated. The look of the historic Southern Railway building needs to be enhanced. Eid's preference is to use a rectangular profile and add extra pedestrian railings at the top.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO RECOMMEND THAT THE RAILING BE CHANGED AND A LETTER BE SENT TO THE TENNESSEE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bullock Smith has made a recommendation to Commissioner Nicely of TDOT. They would like to stay with the original recommendation of 4” openings and not add the Gothic openings at this time.

Bennett stated that when she sends a letter to TDOT about changing the railing, she hopes TDOT will ask Bullock Smith what they would prefer.

The meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on Thursday, July 15, 2004 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville, TN.