

MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MEETING OF DECEMBER 16, 2004

-----

Members Present:

Mr. Nic Arning  
Mr. Art Clancy, Jr.  
Mr. L. Duane Grieve  
Mr. Finbarr Saunders  
Mr. Faris Eid  
Mr. William Hoehl  
Mr. Kenneth Gresham  
Mr. Steve Cotham

Others Present:

Mr. Lendal Roberts  
Mr. Scott Redmond  
Mr. Rick Webster  
Mr. Chad Hellwinckel  
Ms. Katie King  
Ms. Sharon Boyce  
Ms. Ann K. Bennett  
Mr. Kevin Sidell  
Ms. Jamie Rowe

Members Absent:

Ms. Lila Wilson (ex)  
Mr. Herb Donaldson (ex)  
Ms. Melynda Whetsel (ex)  
Ms. Cassandra McGhee (ex)  
Ms. Carole Montgomery (ex)  
Ms. Linda Claussen (ex)

Meeting called to order by Arning, Chairman. Roll taken by Bennett. Quorum for City of Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission. Quorum not present for Knox County Historic Zoning Commission. Arning noted no items on agenda for consideration by Knox County Historic Zoning Commission.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE, SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 18, 2004, MEETING OF KNOXVILLE AND KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSIONS. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Reports to Commission: Sharon Boyce

The City of Knoxville Better Building Board had obtained a 120 day order of condemnation in March, 2000. In January of 2004, the Better Building Board reconsidered the case, and in March, 2004, requested a blighted/acquisition" order. In July, 2004, that order was granted and in September, 2004, it was issued. No further action has been taken on the order.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

Bennett: Five Level I Certificates for standard repair issued since November 4, 2004, as follows:

34 Market Square (111004) for cleaning brick, repairing window sills; 1314 Boyd (112004MECA) for repairing front porch, columns and roof; 1009 Tulip (112004MECB) for repairing wood siding and front porch; 209 W. Glenwood (111004ONK) for replacing storm windows with color clad storm windows; 209 Deaderick (111804MEC) for replacing tongue in groove porch floor.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **General H-1:**

*140 Major Reynolds Place*, Michael Brady, Inc./ Kevin Sidell (Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Level II Certificate. Install 3' x 3' sign, complete with landscaping.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 111504GEN. Proposed sign is 3' x 3', as specified in the design guidelines contained in Knollwood Designation Report. The sign board is smaller than that overall dimension and is contained within a brick frame.

**Comments:** The Commission should note that the brick foundation and frame for the existing sign, which does not meet the design guidelines, is being modified, not removed. This modification results in a berm, finished in landscape stones that will conceal the original brick foundation and make it unnecessary to remove that brick foundation. If the sign were located more directly in line of sight of Knollwood, the additional elevation of the sign might not be acceptable. However, given the location of the sign, and the reduction in size of the signboard, this modification, accompanied by extensive landscaping, is probably an acceptable solution to the problem posed by the existing sign. The overall height of the sign and the berm, from the original ground level, will be 57" to 59" tall. The sign originally applied for was 67" tall. The sign in this application will be 36" wide. The previous request was for a sign that was over 60" wide.

**Discussion:**

Kevin Sidell, Michael Brady, Inc., representing Jim Wallace, Wallace & Wallace, property owners.

Arning suggested that the entire brick wall supporting the sign be removed as a better solution to providing for visibility for automobile traffic. Grieve noted there were two alternatives that could be a solution to fitting the sign aesthetically into the site: 1) grade that portion of the site so that the sign does not look like it sits on a mound; or 2) remove brick wall and put the sign at the current ground level. Sidell noted that the brick wing walls could be removed to the foundation level, which was the ground level. Eid concurred in Grieve's assessment. Sidell asked if the Historic Zoning Commission had jurisdiction over site grading permits because imposing design requirements on grading seemed an assertion of that control. Eid explained that the sign and its small, obscuring berm, as they were submitted, were all part of the appearance of the sign, but that if the berm were made larger, it would seem a part of the overall site grading, rather than a part of the sign, allowing the Commission to consider the sign only.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE, SECOND BY EID, TO DENY PRESENT APPLICATION WITHOUT PREJUDICE SO THAT REVISED APPLICATION COULD BE HEARD AT THE JANUARY 20, 2005, HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MEETING. MOTION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Old North Knoxville H-1:**

*1113 & 1115 Harvey.* Rafik Hanna (Applicant).

**Description of Work:** Level II Certificate. Rebuilding continuous brick foundation using soft mortar; rebuild porch foundation in brick or repair existing block porch foundation using stucco parge coat; repair wood siding with 4" lap wood siding; repair chimneys and install chimney caps; install wood front steps; repair roof with asphalt shingles; install gable vents; install gutters and downspouts if necessary; repair soffit and fascia; install porch columns (6"x6" with chamfered edges) and railing (2"x2" on 4"-5" centers); repair windows as necessary; repair existing door (1113) and obtain door that is near match to 1113 for 1115; repair or replace sawn wood brackets on front porch posts; install glass, wood-framed attic vent, framed to existing opening.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 111604ONK.

**Comments:** Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines. Mr. Hanna is acquiring these properties through Community Development, and intends to use it as rental property. Both addresses are located on the same parcel, and covered by the same Certificate.

**MOTION BY EID, SECOND BY SAUNDERS, APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Bennett noted that the representatives from Old North had been unable to attend, due to illness, but supported the proposed project.

**Edgewood-Park City H-1:**

*1625 Jefferson.* Chad Hellwinckel (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Level II Certificate. Construct new workshed in rear yard, not visible from Jefferson. Building to be 10 x 10 with stone foundation, sided in barn wood (vertically laid 1" x 4" boards of hickory or maple) with 6/12 pitch roof covered with v-groove tin, salvaged windows and planked, paired entry doors. Photo submitted by applicant shows wood siding to be board and batten.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 112204EDG.

**Comments:** The adopted design guidelines provide on page 29, # 13, that new outbuildings may resemble servants' quarters or carriage houses, work buildings or simple one story garages that have been historically constructed in Edgewood-Park City. The proposed outbuilding has a gable roof of metal, vertically oriented wood siding, and a stone foundation, all appropriate for the age and historic character of the district. It is also located to the rear of the lot, and will not be visible from Jefferson Avenue.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE, SECOND BY SAUNDERS, TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Bennett noted that representatives from Fourth & Gill had been unable to attend, but supported the proposed projects.

**Fourth & Gill H-1:**

**809 Eleanor.** Scott Redmond and Rick Webster. Owners/Applicants.

**Description of Work:** Level II Certificate. Rework front porch, installing beadboard ceiling, tongue & groove flooring, and removing enclosed portion of north half of front porch, moving wall back to original position; repair and install original front door; replace vinyl windows with wood double hung, using one 66.75" x 53" on each side of front entry on first floor, and 38.5" x 37.5" on second story above front porch gable peak and using wood double hung windows throughout remainder of window openings; repair existing siding or, if not repairable, using 4" lap on first floor front elevation where porch wall is moved; repair and extend front porch brick balustrade to side; install gutters; install HVAC unit to rear of house; install rear deck (not visible from Eleanor); install front porch light fixture; repair or replace asphalt shingle roof covering with composition shingles, as necessary.

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 1130044&G.

**Comments:** Structure has been substantially altered several times, resulting in a very narrow front porch that stretches across the width of the building; it is condemned. Applicants' intention will restore some of the historic appearance to the house. Interior spaces have been altered to substantially and a change in the exterior will result in a change to the interior and to the building's floor plan. This proposal by the applicants, while it is not a complete restoration, will result in an improved historic appearance, and an occupied house, an appropriate exterior, and will remove the building from its current position as a liability.

Bennett noted that the house had probably been built as a two story, side gable, Folk Victorian in the 1880s, modified with Craftsman design details in the 1920s, and altered twice more, once in the 1950s when the front porch was diminished in size, and modified again in the 1980s with the addition of the current front windows and door. Very little is left of the Victorian era, and the most visible design details are from the Craftsman modifications; the proposed work will return a Craftsman appearance to the front façade and make the front porch usable as a living space.

The Commission thanked the applicants for being willing to work on the project.

**MOTION BY EID, SECOND BY SAUNDERS, TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**914 Luttrell.** Katie King (Owner/Applicant)

**Description of Work:** Install new rear deck, not visible from Luttrell, with parking access under deck and spiral stair to access first floor of house. Deck will be 5/4 pine decking with 4" x 4" posts and rail supports, and handrail of framed panels of sawn wood 1" x 1" uprights.

**Staff recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 1203044&G. Proposed work is at the rear of the house and is not visible from Luttrell.

**Comments:** Applicant also intends to install a fence and a stone retaining wall in the back yard; none of this will be visible from Luttrell.

Commissioners discussed the topographic relief of the lot, with Bennett noted that the vertical distance from the street elevation to the alley elevation at the rear of the lot was probably in excess of ten feet. Commissioners congratulated the applicant for this and the preceding certificate on their clear illustrations of requests.

**MOTION BY SAUNDERS, SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Ft. Sanders NC-1:**

**1201 Clinch.** Lendal Roberts (Owner/Applicant).

**Description of Work:** Level IV. Demolition of fire-damaged contributing structure

**Staff Recommendation:** APPROVE Certificate No. 120104FTS.

**Comments:** Fire damage has destroyed historic portion of building, which is frame, beyond ability to reasonably repair. Applicant understands that any future use on this lot must meet the standards contained in the adopted design guidelines for the Ft. Sanders NC-1.

Bennett called Commissioners' attention to printed copy of e-mail message received by Wes Goddard, which reluctantly concurred with the need to demolish the building. She also noted the request from Ft. Sanders that architectural artifacts be saved prior to demolition of the building. Roberts said he had no objection to salvaging architectural artifacts.

**MOTION BY GRIEVE, SECOND BY EID, TO APPROVE STAFF  
RECOMMENDATION. MOTION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Other

Ms. Jamie Rowe, representative of the Tazewell Pike NC-1 Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District, asked the Commission's help in having the sign of the Rufus Smith Foundation removed, since the housing was complete and occupied. Ms. Bennett noted that she would contact the foundation and ask if the sign could be removed.

There being no other business to come before the Commissions, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on January 20, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building, 400 Main Street, Knoxville.