



Staff Report

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission

File Number: 6-F-24-HZ

Meeting:	7/18/2024
Applicant:	Brian Dennison
Owner:	Clinch Development Group LLC

Property Information

Location: 1616 Clinch Ave.

Parcel ID 94 N H 014

District: Ft. Sanders NC

Zoning: O (Office), NC (Neighborhood Conservation Overlay)

Description: Queen Anne, c.1905

2.5-story hipped-roof residence with an exterior of wood lap siding, corbeling detail along the roofline, and a flatroofed porch with Ionic columns.

Description of Work

Level II Construction of Addition or Outbuilding, Major Repair or Replacement

Proposed reconstruction of roofline, addition of dormers, and second-story addition (within existing building footprint), along with exterior rehabilitation.

The existing hipped roof has a 10/12 pitch, measuring approximately 33'-2" to the midpoint of the roof slope, with hipped roof dormers on the front and rear roof slopes. Two smaller hipped-roof massings project to the house's right side, one will be retained in the revised drawings. The roof will be reconstructed, with a 10/12 pitch hipped massing over the original section of the house (similar to the existing) and a new hipped-roof dormer projecting to the rear roof slope. Two new hipped-roof dormers are proposed for both side roof slopes.

Addition to right and rear elevation's second story (on a section currently featuring a low-slope roof, single-story addition): the existing building footprint will be enclosed with the revised rooflines and lap siding.

The project also includes the installation of new double-hung windows in existing fenestrations and the enclosure of window openings on the rear and side elevations. On the façade, a non-historic secondary door on the rightmost bay will be replaced with a double-hung window to match the others. A new secondary door will be installed on the second bay.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Fort Sanders NC-1, adopted by the Knoxville City Council on September 13, 2000.

- H. Additions to Existing Buildings
- 1. Additions should be made to the rear or side of the building.

3. Transitional space shall be provided between the addition and the existing structure. This should include a courtyard or a connecting structure. The wall of the new connecting structure should not be continuous with thew all of the existing building, but have a minimum 4' by 6' indentation.

5. Windows or French doors and balconies shall provide 10% to 20% transparency on the sides of buildings.

9. Expansion to the front with a bay and/or a porch is acceptable.

A. Height, Scale, & Massing

2. Single-family detached infill housing should be proportional to other pre-1940 houses in terms of height and width.

B. Roofs

1. Select a roof pitch that is in keeping with other pre-1940 houses of the neighborhood, not being less than an 8/12 pitch.

2. Use variations in the form of the roof above the second story such as gables at different angles, hipped roofs, and dormers.

3. Use roofing materials that are in keeping with the historic development styles. Asphalt, shingle, tile, pressed metal, and slate were used.

4. Darker shades of shingles were historically used and should be selected in new construction.

D. In making additions to existing buildings, wall cladding should complement the original wall covering. Acceptable materials are clapboard, vinyl siding, cement fiber board, brick, and stucco.

E. Windows and Entrances

1. Window proportions and symmetry should be similar to the pre-1940 styles in the neighborhood.

2. Windows should be double hung, sash windows. Vinyl or metal-clad windows may be used in place of wood frame windows.

4. Double-hung sash windows are recommended for two- to three-story new construction.

6. The proportions of upper level windows should not exceed the proportion of the first level.

7. Upper level windows should be provided and aligned with doors.

F. Parking

1. In new building construction, the front yard space shall not be used for parking. Do not break up curbs or sidewalks to provide street access.

2. Provide parking access off the alley or off a side street.

4. In constructing residential parking, 8.5-foot stall widths and 24 foot wide lane widths may be used for 90 degree angled parking lots.

7. Surface parking area shall always be to the rear of the building.

Comments

N/A

Staff Findings

1. 1616 Clinch Avenue is a contributing structure to the Fort Sanders National Register Historic District and Neighborhood Conservation overlay. National Register eligibility or contributing status is determined by the State Historic Preservation Office. National Register status, including contributing versus non-contributing status, is not re-evaluated by the SHPO unless there is a precipitating event (like a project with federal funding or federal licensing requiring Section 106 Review).

2. The primary scope of work aims to increase the height and interior capacity of the house's upper level. The previous application proposed to remove and reconstruct the existing roof with one large hipped-roof. The addition will increase the building's height by approximately 11" and the reconstructed roof pitch will remain the same. The drawings indicate the intent to retain and/or reconstruct the corbelling detail underneath the wide eave overhangs; these detail elements should be preserved or replicated.

3. The primary relevant guideline in the Fort Sanders NC Design Guidelines states that "additions should be made to the side or rear of the building." However, dormer additions have been approved in Fort Sanders, both by increasing the size of existing dormers and adding new dormers. The proposed fiber cement shake siding on the new dormers meets the guidelines. The front dormer will be larger in width than the original. The side elevation dormers are also large in scale. The Commission should discuss the scale of the dormer additions.

3. The addition to the second story is proposed for a rear and side corner of the house that currently features a onestory, low-slope roof addition. The addition does not expand the building's footprint. The addition will incorporate materials and roofline details compatible with the overall house. The roofline has been revised from a single large massing to a lower hipped-roof dormer, breaking up the addition into multiple massings.

4. The building's exterior has already received significant modifications, including windows of varying sizes on the secondary elevations, the enclosure of the basement level with non-historic siding, and non-historic additions to the right side and rear. Most of the proposed windows to be enclosed are on secondary elevations and at basement level, and are not character-defining features of the building. On the façade, the proposed window and door modifications relate to non-original elements and will create a more symmetrical façade.

5. Guidelines for parking recommend providing parking access off the alley or a side street, and note that "surface parking area shall always be to the rear of the building." Access from the alley does not appear feasible due to the substantial slope at the rear of the property, the narrow width of the alley, and the placement of the parking garage to the rear. 1610 and 1616 Clinch Avenue already have large gravel surface parking lots between the two houses, and front driveways extend off Clinch Avenue up to 1630 Clinch Avenue. All efforts should be taken to place new parking areas beside or behind the primary building, and avoid the front yard. Final site plan revisions will be necessary based on accessible parking requirements and City Engineering standards. Staff may approve minor revisions to site plans provided they meet the guidelines.

Staff Recommendation

Pending additional discussion by the Historic Zoning Commission on the scale of the proposed dormers, staff recommends approval of Certificate 6-F-24-HZ, subject to the following conditions: 1) reconstructed roof to retain wide eave overhangs and decorative corbel detail of existing roof; 2) final site plan to meet City Plans Review and Inspections and City Engineering standards, avoiding creating new front yard parking unless infeasible due to accessibility requirements.



DESIGN REVIEW REQUEST

□ DOWNTOWN DESIGN (DK)

□ HISTORIC ZONING (H)

□ INFILL HOUSING (IH)

Applicant				
		6-F-24-HZ		
Date Filed	Meeting Date (if applicable)	File Number(s)		
CORRESPONDENCE				
All correspondence related to this applicati	on should be directed to the approved cor	ntact listed below.		
🗌 Owner 🔲 Contractor 🗌 Engineer	Architect/Landscape Architect			
Name	Company	Company		
Address	City	State Zip		
Phone	Email			
Owner Name (if different from applicant)	Owner Address	Owner Phone		
Property Address	Parc	Parcel ID		
Neighborhood	Zoni	Zoning		
AUTHORIZATION				
AUTHORIZATION Lindsay Crockett	Lindsay Crockett	5.31.24		
Staff Signature 🖉	Please Print	Date		
Pars)				
Applicant Signature	Please Print	Date		

REQUEST

DOWN IOWN DESIGN	Level 1: Signs Alteration of an existing building/structure Level 2: Addition to an existing building/structure Level 3: Construction of new building/structure Site design, parking, plazas, landscape See required Downtown Design attachment for more details. Brief description of work:
HISTORIC ZUNING	Level 1: Signs Routine repair of siding, windows, roof, or other features, in-kind; Installation of gutters, storm windows/doors Level 2: Major repair, removal, or replacement of architectural elements or materials Additions and accessory structures Level 3: Construction of a new primary building Level 4: Relocation of a contributing structure Demolition of a contributing structure See required Historic Zoning attachment for more details.
INFILL HOUSING	Level 1: Driveways, parking pads, access point, garages or similar facilities Subdivisions Level 2: Additions visible from the primary street Level 3: New primary structure Site built Modular Multi-Sectional See required Infill Housing attachment for more details. Brief description of work:

	ATTACHMENTS	FEE 1:	TOTAL:
USE ONLY	Downtown Design Checklist	100.00	100.00
õ	Historic Zoning Design Checklist	FEE 2:	
JSE	Infill Housing Design Checklist		
STAFF I	ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS		
ST/	Property Owners / Option Holders	FEE 3:	
	Level 1: \$50 • Level 2: \$100 • Level 3: \$250 • Level 4: \$500		

















