

Staff Report

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission

File Number: 10-E-24-HZ

Meeting:	12/19/2024
Applicant:	Vince Marshall, Marshall Design & Construction Corp.
Owner:	Todd and Anita Davis

Property Information

Location: 1916 Emoriland Blvd.

Parcel ID 69 M B 016

District: Fairmont-Emoriland NC

Zoning: RN-2 (Single-Family Residential Neighborhood)

Description: Colonial Revival, c.1927

One story frame with brick veneer wall covering, corner quoins. Exterior end brick chimney. Side gable roof with asphalt shingle covering. One story gabled front portico with arched ceiling, replacement columns. Six over six double hung windows. Exterior end brick chimney. Rectangular plan.

Description of Work

Level II Construction of Addition or Outbuilding

New additions.

Front/east addition: new addition to east elevation along the façade, to measure 24'-6" wide by 12'-8" deep and be recessed 1'-5.5" from the front façade of the house. The front addition will feature a side-gable roof with an 8/12 pitch, an exterior of brick veneer, and two bays of 9/9 double-hung windows with "style, size, trim, and sill to match the existing," along with shutters to match the existing. Addition will feature brick quoins and a brick solider header course above the windows.

Covered porch addition: on the east elevation, located behind the proposed new front addition, a covered porch with a 2/12-pitch, shed roof will extend 22'-9.5" towards the rear of the house.

Garage addition: new three-car garage addition to the rear right corner (east elevation) of the house. The garage addition will measure 25' wide by 36'-1" deep and feature a 6/12 pitch hipped roof, an exterior of brick cladding, and three garage bays facing the east side elevation.

Rear addition: new addition to rear (south elevation) of house. The rear addition measures approximately 32'-2" wide (the full width of the existing house) by 17'-1.5" deep, and features a 6/12 pitch hipped roof and an exterior of brick cladding.

New driveway: new 12' wide driveway extending from Emoriland Boulevard, leading to an approximately 32' wide parking pad area outside the three-car garage.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Fairmont Park Neighborhood Conservation District Design Guidelines, adopted by the Knoxville City Council on

November 26, 2002.

Additions

1. The design of additions and accessory buildings should be consistent with the character of the main structure.

3. The width of side yard setbacks should duplicate the average side yard widths of the three adjacent existing buildings on each side of the subject property.

4. The recommended location for additions is to the rear or side of existing buildings. Additions to the front of buildings are not encouraged, because they obscure the original architectural designs.

8. If additions are to be made to the existing building they should be located at least five feet behind the front facade of the existing building.

Building and Roof Form

3. New buildings and additions should not incorporate round-topped windows, or windows with arched transoms. However, Palladian-design windows with flanking side windows, and flat-topped transoms are acceptable.

4. The minimum roof pitch should be appropriate for the style of house that is being constructed, as shown on the matrix in these guidelines.

Materials

2. If an addition is made to an existing house, the wall cladding materials should duplicate those on the existing house, or as shown on the matrix on page 6.

Access and Parking

1. The carports or doors of attached garages should not face Emoriland or Fairmont Boulevards.

2. Attached garages or carports should be located fifteen feet back of the front facing façade.

4. If driveways are built they should be 9-12' wide. Separate tire strips of aggregate exposed concrete are encouraged.

Landscaping, Walls, and Fencing

- 1. The maximum lot coverage for impermeable features such as paving and roofs on any lot shall be 40%.
- 2. If driveways are constructed, they should be as narrow as possible.

Comments

N/A

Staff Findings

1. 1916 Emoriland Boulevard is a contributing resource to the Fairmont Park NC Overlay. The house is a Colonial Revival-style Minimal Traditional house. Minimal Traditional houses are typically modest one-story forms with narrow facades and minimal architectural detail. The proposed additions revise the Minimal Traditional house to reflect a Ranch house in width and a contemporary house form with the attached three-car garage.

2. The application was postponed at the October 2024 meeting to allow the applicant to revise the drawings in response to the design guidelines, staff recommendation, neighborhood input, and Commission discussion. Discussion related to the placement of the front addition and the massing of the third-story garage. Continued discussion at the November 2024 meeting related to the front addition not meeting the design guidelines, and the attached third-story garage not being compatible with the neighborhood's historic context. The applicant is unwilling to modify any element of the request.

3. The proposed additions are significantly large in footprint, approximately doubling the overall square footage of the house.

4. Guidelines recommend that additions are placed on the side or rear of buildings, discouraging additions to the

front that obscure original architectural designs. The proposed rear addition and garage additions meet the guidelines for placement. The front/east addition is set back from the façade by only 1'-5.5" and almost doubles the existing façade width. Guidelines note that "if additions are made to the existing building, they should be located at least 5' behind the front façade of the existing building." The front addition is not sufficiently differentiated from the original façade of the house and should be revised in placement.

5. The additions use materials and design elements compatible with the primary structure, including brick cladding, quoin detailing, brick soldier header courses above windows, and windows with sills and shutters to reflect the existing.

6. Guidelines recommend that doors of attached garages do not face Emoriland Boulevard, and they should be located at least 15' behind the front façade; the design does meet these guidelines. The garage will be large in scale and visible from the street due to the adjacent vacant property. Three-car garages are typically not in character with the neighborhood context. SOI Standards note that new additions "shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment." There is no historic precedence for a three-car garage in the neighborhood. The Commission has extensively discussed the overall massing of the proposed garage and allowed the applicant two postponements to submit a revised proposal.

7. Guidelines recommend that driveways be "as narrow as possible," 9'-12' wide, and encourage separate tire strips. The driveways are 12', comparable to the minimum required width of 10'. The parking pad outside of the three-car garage is relatively large. Additional landscaping and screening would be necessary to obscure the large garage and parking pad.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends: 1) approval of the proposed rear addition; 2) approval of the front/east addition, subject to the placement being revised to meet the design guidelines ("at least 5' behind the front façade"); and 3) denial of the proposed attached three-car garage.



<u>DIA Homes Project #:</u> 24016 <u>Date</u>:12/10/2024 <u>Client</u>: Todd and Anita Davis <u>Project Address</u>: 1916 Emoriland Blvd, Knoxville, TN 37917

The following letter is being issued as an addendum to the second review of Case # 10-E-24-HZ held on November 21, 2024, and pertaining to an addition and renovation to an existing home located at 1916 Emoriland Blvd.

Dear Committee Members,

This letter is being issued on behalf of Todd and Anita Davis regarding the status of their project at 1916 Emoriland Blvd.

After further consideration of the commission's comments and requests, the owner has decided not to pursue revisions to the current design for their home renovation and addition. Although the owner understands the intended value of the neighborhood guidelines:

- 1) They do not recall being informed or involved in the development of the neighborhood guidelines that now overlay their family's estate.
- 2) They believe that the only non-compliant aspect of their project relevant to the language of the guidelines is the 2' (proposed) versus 5' (recommended) setback to the front addition from existing home. However, we believe that the 2' setback offers the most appropriate architectural and constructability solution and ask the committee to evaluate this proposed variance for approval. The guidelines are not regulation and are intended for subjective oversight where a guideline recommendation may not be feasible or the most appropriate solution.
- 3) The owner does not wish to collaborate with the neighborhood on the design of their home addition. Going into retirement, they understand their functional and spatial needs, and love the current design. This project is a \$500,000 investment in the Fairmont Park neighborhood, between home addition and landscaping, and the owner does not believe the proposed design poses any negative risk to the street or adjacent property values.

<u>The owner asks that the committee vote to approve the new addition and renovation</u>. They do not wish to spend more money on travel, work leave, and design fees, so we ask that you proceed to vote without attendance from the applicant or design team.

Additionally, this will be the last submission by the owner. They have already secured a realtor and have made preparations to sell the two lots (not yet combined) individually if they cannot proceed with the expansion to their family's estate.

Sincerely,

DIA Homes, LLC

Joseph Goldman President DIA Homes, LLC <u>jgoldman@dia-homes.com</u>



DESIGN REVIEW REQUEST

□ DOWNTOWN DESIGN (DK)

HISTORIC ZONING (H)

□ INFILL HOUSING (IH)

Vince Marshall

Applicant				
9/25/2024				
Date Filed	Meeting Date (if applica	able)	File Numbe	r(s)
CORRESPONDENCE All correspondence related to th	is application should be directed to	the approved contact	listed below.	
🔳 Owner 🔳 Contractor 🗌	Engineer 📕 Architect/Landscape	e Architect		
Vince Marshall	Marshall Design & Construction Corp.			
Name		Company		
1201 Heartland Dr.		Maryville	TN	37801
Address		City	State	Zip
	mdcc04@gmail.com			
865-314-1252	mucco4@gmail.com			

CURRENT PROPERTY INFO

Todd & Anita Davis	1916 Emoriland Blvd.	1916 Emoriland Blvd.	
Owner Name (if different from applicant)	Owner Address		Owner Phone
1916 Emoriland Blvd.		069LG049	
Property Address		Parcel ID	
Knoxville		RN-2	
Neighborhood		Zoning	

AUTHORIZATION

indray Crockett

Staff Signatu

Please Print

Vin

Vince Marshall 2024.09.25 17:59:20 -04'00' Vince

₎' Vince Marshall

Applicant Signature

Please Print

9/25/2024

Date

Date

REQUEST

DOWN IOWN DESIGN	Level 1: Signs Alteration of an existing building/structure Level 2: Addition to an existing building/structure Level 3: Construction of new building/structure Site design, parking, plazas, landscape See required Downtown Design attachment for more details. Brief description of work: Adding addition to the existing home.
HISTORIC ZONING	Level 1: Signs Routine repair of siding, windows, roof, or other features, in-kind; Installation of gutters, storm windows/doors Level 2: Major repair, removal, or replacement of architectural elements or materials Additions and accessory structures Level 3: Construction of a new primary building Level 4: Demolition of a contributing structure Demolition of a contributing structure See required Historic Zoning attachment for more details. Brief description of work: Adding addition to the existing home.
INFILL HOUSING	Level 1: Driveways, parking pads, access point, garages or similar facilities Subdivisions Level 2: Additions visible from the primary street Changes to porches visible from the primary street Level 3: New primary structure Site built Multi-Sectional See required Infill Housing attachment for more details. Brief description of work:

	ATTACHMENTS	FEE 1:	TOTAL:
ΟΝΓΥ	Downtown Design Checklist		
0	Historic Zoning Design Checklist	FEE 2:	
USE	Infill Housing Design Checklist		
STAFF	ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS		
STA	Property Owners / Option Holders	FEE 3:	
	Level 1: \$50 • Level 2: \$100 • Level 3: \$250 • Level 4: \$500		

A NEW ADDITION FOR THE **DAVIS RESIDENCE** 1916 EMORILAND BLVD, KNOXVILLE, TN



PROJECT LOCATION NOT TO SCALE **GENERAL NOTES SYMBOLS ABBREVIATIONS** A ADDITION FOR THE DAVIS RESIDENCE 1916 EMORILAND BLVD, SYMBOL LEGEND ABBREVIATION <u>Codes:</u> All work must comply with all Codes & Regulations - Federal, State, & Local - of the jurisdiction in which the house is constructed. Elashing: Provide flashing wherever required in the construction, whether or not indicated on the drawings. See specifications o drawings for flashing materials & other additional requirements METAL NOT APPLICABLE NET SQUARE FEET NOT TO SCALE OCCUPARY/OCCUPA ON CENTER POST ABOVE POST BELOW PREPENDICULAR PLATE PLATE PLUMEING POLYROPYLENE POLYROPYLENE POLYROPYLENE MOVE & RECUP AGONETT LE AGONETT A **KNOXVILLE, TN** ELEVATION BUILDING/WA ns on the Drawings, onform to the latest I Code (IRC) & City OUTET -SHEET # SITE AP DETAIL # INTERIOR SHIFT • *** WINDOW NUMBER DOOR NUMBER ted above doors & POLVERO
 PAVEOD
 PAVEO POLYURETHANE current Revision ITEMS INSIDE CLOUD REVISION CLOUD REFERENCE IOSE BIBB CURRENT REVISION CLOUD **RELEASE:** (•) HZC REVIEW rfst R.O. R-S Sim Samf CALL OUT DETAIL RID UNE (X)æ -DETAIL # -SHEET # **BUILDING AREA** DRAWING LIST REVISIONS SATB PROJECT NORTH No. Description Date SFTI GROSS BUILDING AREAS: MEASURED TO INSIDE FACE OF FRAMIN SUE DATE REV. DATE PN TN IETAIL I DRAWING TITL & prop INSULATION (M) TOALDS STELL STANARD STELL STANARD STELL // STANARD STELL // STANARD STELL STANARD STA SS STD STL STN STR SUPCD SYP T&B T&B T&B T&G T.B.D. T.O. TYP UON UL DESCRIPTION OF NEW CONDITIONED & UNCONDITIONED SF **ENERGY EFFICIENCY** FLOOR AREA HEATED FLOOR(SF) NON HEATED (SP The Contractor shall be respor required during progress of the & joints must be straight give ITE AND ZONING P PRESCRIPTIVE MINIMUMS ARE TO BE ACHIEVE 2018 INTERNATIONAL ENERGY CONSERVATION -------*THE FOLLOWING DICTATED BY THE TRUE NORTH FRT FTG G.L.B. GSF GWB H-B HDG HDPE MATERIAL LEGEND ZONE 44 CONCRETE CONCRETE MASONRY Project Numbe 24016H PER \$N1102.1.1(R402.1.2): INSULATION & FENESTRATION REQ'S BY COMPONENT: 1 REQUIRED The Contractor shall be responsible for all shoring, temporary supports, & temporary bracing 09/25/2024 BRICK MASONR STONE FENESTRATION U-FACTOR U-0.32 WEIGE HOLGE HOLGE + HOREONAL - HORE HONT INSULATION INTERMEDIATE JOINT JOINT JOINT JOINT AN AFENETREAT I KIDATE TREAT I KIDATE TRAATE I KIDATE SKYLIGHT U-FACTOR U-0.55 JPG Finish Grade: Slope grade away from building on all sides HORZ H.P. INSUL INT INTM JNT JST K-F GLAZED FENESTRATION SHGC ATTIC R-VALUE 0.40 \ge WOOD FRAMING NETAL WAR VER VERT VCT VSB VGV VP WD WH R-49 OR R-38 PER R402.2.1 AS NOTED Refer to structural drawings & Specifications for Scale all stee WOOD FRAME WALL R-VALUE R-20 OR R-13+5 CONT. FINISH WOOD BLOCKING MASS WALL R-VALUE FLOOR R-VALUE R-8/13 R-19 COVER SHEET BATT INSULATION CELLULAR PVC BASEMENT WALL R-VALUE R-10/13 <u>/E/P Fixtures & Devices:</u> Coordinate framing I Mechanical, Electrical, & Plumbing fixtures SLAB R-VALUE & DEPTH R-10, 2'-0 KD KD--A KDHM L--C LNL L.P. MDF URETHANE FOAM RIGID INSULATION CRAWL SPACE WALL R-VALUE R-10/13 DIMENSION LEGEND DIMENSION NOTES PER \$N1101.12.3(2) [R303.1.3(2)] : DEFAULT DOOR U-FACTORS UNINSULATED META U-1.20 U.O.N. ALL DIMENSIONS ARE TO (WOOD FRAMING, CONCRETE, M SEE DIMENSION LEGEND FOR DI INSULATED METAL U-0.90 A001 woon U-0.50 M.O. 7 5/8 INSULATED, NONMETAL EDGE, MAX 45% GLAZING, ANY GLAZING DOUBLE PANEL Building Code or by k O NOT INCLUDE SEET OF U-0.35















