



Staff Report

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission

File Number: 5-C-22-HZ

Meeting: 5/19/2022
Applicant: Bryant Brockett Falcon Roofing
Owner: Switzer Investments, LLC

Property Information

Location: 10915 Lake Ridge Dr. **Parcel ID** 153 G B 005
District: Village of Concord HZ
Zoning: CA (General Business)
Description: Vernacular Commercial, c.1890

Two-story, limestone building with a flat roof and a parapet wall. Paired half-light wood door centered on façade with single-light transom window. One-over-one, double-hung wood windows. One-story, shed-roof front porch.

Description of Work

Level II Major Repair or Replacement

Removal of existing metal roof on both buildings (10913 and 10915 Lake Ridge drive) and replacement with new standing-seam metal roof on both. On flat porch roof, removal of existing membrane roof and replacement with new TPO membrane roof. Installation of boxed metal fascia trim and gutters, vinyl soffit, and aluminum wrap around four wood posts.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Village of Concord Design Guidelines, adopted by the Knox County Commission on October 22, 2001.

Roofs

1. Replacement roofs shall copy the shape and pitch of original roofs, and the soffit, fascia, and trim detail between roof and wall should mimic the original.
3. Materials used in roofing existing buildings or new construction shall duplicate the original roofing materials as much as possible.

Porches

1. Porches on historic houses shall be repaired or replicated in size and design using wood materials for ceilings and floors, balustrades, posts and columns so that they duplicate the original size and design. Reconstruction of the documented original porch is appropriate.

Exterior Wall Coverings: Wood

1. Wood siding and shingles or other features original to the building shall be repaired rather than replaced, and only modified at all if they are deteriorated.
5. The application of synthetic or substitute materials such as vinyl or aluminum over original wood siding is not appropriate.
10. Repair wood fen features by patching, piecing-in, or otherwise reinforcing the wood. Repair may also include limited replacement with matching or compatible substitute materials, when elements remain and can be copied.

11. Wood features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building should not be removed.
 12. Replace only deteriorated wood. Reconstruction in order to achieve a uniform or 'improved' appearance is inappropriate because of the loss of good historic materials.
 13. An entire wooden feature that is too deteriorated to repair or is completely missing shall be replaced in kind. If features are replaced, the materials they are made from should be compatible with the original in size and scale. Replacement parts should be based on historical, pictorial, and physical documentation.
-

Comments

N/A

Staff Findings

1. 10915 Lake Ridge Drive is a contributing resource to the Village of Concord National Register Historic District and local overlay. 10913 Lake Ridge Drive is a modern building which connects to the east elevation of the historic structure at 10915.
 2. The work is being reviewed after-the-fact; the contractors have stated they are not required to permit re-roofing work in Knox County and minor scopes such as wrapping the porch in vinyl and aluminum would not require a permit either. The contractors were unaware of the historic zoning overlay and did not seek a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 3. The replacement of exposed fastener metal roofs on both 10913 and 10915 Lake Ridge Drive meets the design guidelines, as the applicant has upgraded to a standing-seam metal product, the roofs are minimally visible from the right-of-way due to parapets on both facades, and 10913 is a non-contributing, modern building. These scopes of work could have been approved as a Level 1 COA, had an application been submitted to staff in advance.
 4. The front porch elements, while most likely not original to the building, did adhere to the design guidelines as using wood elements instead of synthetic materials. The design guidelines state "porches ... shall be repaired or replicated in size and design using wood materials for [...] posts and columns so that they duplicate the original size and design." Guidelines also state that reconstruction in order to achieve a uniform or 'improved' appearance is inappropriate, along with noting the "application of synthetic or substitute materials such as vinyl or aluminum over original wood siding is not appropriate." While these are porch elements and not siding, general preservation principles (and the Secretary of the Interiors Standards) discourage enclosing wood elements with synthetic materials for simply aesthetic purposes.
-

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the work as completed, with the condition that the applicant remove the vinyl and aluminum porch elements and provide a revised porch design which meets the guidelines, with approval by staff.



DESIGN REVIEW REQUEST

- DOWNTOWN DESIGN (DK)
- HISTORIC ZONING (H)
- INFILL HOUSING (IH)

Switzer Investments, LLC

Applicant

04/14/2022

May 19, 2022

5-C-22-HZ

Date Filed

Meeting Date (if applicable)

File Number(s)

CORRESPONDENCE

All correspondence related to this application should be directed to the approved contact listed below.





- Owner
- Contractor
- Engineer
- Architect/Landscape Architect

| | | | |
|------------------|---------------------------|----------------|-------|
| Bryant Brockett | | Falcon Roofing | |
| Name | Company | | |
| 5531 Berkford Rd | Knoxville | TN | 37918 |
| Address | City | State | Zip |
| (865) 455-8322 | admin@falconroofingtn.com | | |
| Phone | Email | | |

CURRENT PROPERTY INFO

| | | |
|--|------------------------|----------------|
| Switzer Investments, LLC | 10915 Lake Ridge Drive | (865) 675-2245 |
| Owner Name (if different from applicant) | Owner Address | Owner Phone |
| 10915 Lake Ridge Drive | 1536B 005 | |
| Property Address | Parcel ID | |
| Concord | Historic | |
| Neighborhood | Zoning | |

AUTHORIZATION

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | Lindsay Crockett | 4.19.22 |
|  |  |  |
| Staff Signature | Please Print | Date |
|  | Julie Switzer | 4/14/22 |
| Applicant Signature | Please Print | Date |

REQUEST

HISTORIC ZONING

Level 1:

- Signs Alteration of an existing building/structure

Level 2:

- Addition to an existing building/structure

Level 3:

- Construction of new building/structure Site design, parking, plazas, landscape

See required Downtown Design attachment for more details.

Brief description of work: _____

Level 1:

- Signs Routine repair of siding, windows, roof, or other features, in-kind; Installation of gutters, storm windows/doors

Level 2:

- Major repair, removal, or replacement of architectural elements or materials Additions and accessory structures

Level 3:

- Construction of a new primary building

Level 4:

- Relocation of a contributing structure Demolition of a contributing structure

See required Historic Zoning attachment for more details.

Brief description of work: Vinyl Elements on porch and deck

Level 1:

- Driveways, parking pads, access point, garages or similar facilities Subdivisions

Level 2:

- Additions visible from the primary street Changes to porches visible from the primary street

Level 3:

- New primary structure
 Site built Modular Multi-Sectional

See required Infill Housing attachment for more details.

Brief description of work: _____

STAFF USE ONLY

ATTACHMENTS

- Downtown Design Checklist
 Historic Zoning Design Checklist
 Infill Housing Design Checklist

ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS

- Property Owners / Option Holders

Level 1: \$50 • **Level 2:** \$100 • **Level 3:** \$250 • **Level 4:** \$500

| | | |
|---------------|-------------|--------------------------------|
| FEE 1: | 100 00 | TOTAL: 100.00 |
| FEE 2: | | |
| FEE 3: | | |

REQUEST

DOWNTOWN DESIGN

Level 1:

- Signs Alteration of an existing building/structure

Level 2:

- Addition to an existing building/structure

Level 3:

- Construction of new building/structure Site design, parking, plazas, landscape

See required Downtown Design attachment for more details.

Brief description of work: _____

HISTORIC ZONING

Level 1:

- Signs Routine repair of siding, windows, roof, or other features, in-kind; Installation of gutters, storm windows/doors

Level 2:

- Major repair, removal, or replacement of architectural elements or materials Additions and accessory structures

Level 3:

- Construction of a new primary building

Level 4:

- Relocation of a contributing structure Demolition of a contributing structure

See required Historic Zoning attachment for more details.

Brief description of work: Replace metal roof with new metal roof. Replace porch roof with new TPO membrane. Replace rotten fascia boards and posts on porch. Install metal fascia trim, soffit and wrap the posts. _____

INFILL HOUSING

Level 1:

- Driveways, parking pads, access point, garages or similar facilities Subdivisions

Level 2:

- Additions visible from the primary street Changes to porches visible from the primary street

Level 3:

- New primary structure
 Site built Modular Multi-Sectional

See required Infill Housing attachment for more details.

Brief description of work: _____

STAFF USE ONLY

ATTACHMENTS

- Downtown Design Checklist
 Historic Zoning Design Checklist
 Infill Housing Design Checklist

ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS

- Property Owners / Option Holders

Level 1: \$50 • **Level 2:** \$100 • **Level 3:** \$250 • **Level 4:** \$500

FEE 1:

FEE 2:

FEE 3:

TOTAL:

Work completed

- **Removed exposed fastener metal roof on both buildings and installed new standing seam metal roof (same color) About 8,000sqft**
- **Removed existing EPDM membrane from porch roof. Replaced rotten wood as needed. Installed TPO membrane on roof. Installed aluminum around 4 wooden posts. Installed metal fascia trim and gutters. Installed vinyl soffit.**



Google Streetview images of porch prior to work



Photo of work completed, submitted
by contractor