



**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
STAFF REPORT - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION**

**PROPERTY ADDRESS:** 941 Eleanor St 37917  
**DISTRICT:** Fourth and Gill H-1

**FILE NO.:** 7-G-14-HZ

**MEETING DATE:** 7/17/2014

**APPLICANT:** Indya Kincannon; Benjamin Barton (owners)

**LEVEL OF WORK:** Level II. Major repair or replacement of materials or architectural elements

**PROPERTY DESCRIPTION:** Neoclassical (c. 1910)

Two-story frame with weatherboard wall covering. Hip roof with gabled front dormer, asphalt shingle roof covering, and engaged square columns on dormer, modillions above balcony, full cornice returns. Replacement windows with Palladian attic vent. One-story full front porch with round wood columns with Doric capitals, abacus spindles in swag pattern in balustrade, bead board ceiling, tongue- and-groove porch floor, and central balcony on second story. Two brick corbelled interior offset chimneys. Stuccoed foundation. Irregular plan. Side portico with embossed brackets. Transom and sidelights at front entries of first and second floors. (Contributing)

Garage (c. 1910) One-story hip roof with weatherboardsiding. (Contributing)

► **DESCRIPTION OF WORK:**

Replacement of modern overhead garage door containing 3 horizontal windows at top. Install a steel, paneled, windowless overhead garage door.

► **APPLICABLE DESIGN GUIDELINES:**

Fourth and Gill Design Guidelines, adopted by the Knoxville City Council on April 20, 1999 and June 29, 1999.

**OUTBUILDINGS**

It is acceptable to construct new outbuildings to the rear of lots on Fourth and Gill, with designs that respect the original designs.

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. Buildings resembling servants' quarters or carriage houses, work buildings, or simple one story-garages are appropriate to be constructed in the Fourth and Gill Historic District. Their size and construction should use materials that correspond to the original primary buildings on the lot.

**SECRETARY OF INTERIORS STANDARDS for REHABILITATION**

. . . acceptable option for the replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building. The new design should always take into account the size, scale, and material of the historic building itself . . .

**COMMENTS:**

This request is after-the-fact. The applicant relays that the garage door fell unexpectedly just prior to their leaving town and a new door had to be installed within a short timeframe in order to secure their belongings. The applicant also relays that it did not occur to them that a Certificate of Appropriateness was required. There is no entry to the



**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
STAFF REPORT - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION**

**PROPERTY ADDRESS: 941 Eleanor St 37917**

**FILE NO.: 7-G-14-HZ**

**DISTRICT: Fourth and Gill H-1**

---

garage except through the overhead garage door. The options available to applicants in this position are the following:

- 1) Remove the contents of the garage and request a special meeting of the HZC, but with 12 days notice in order to meet advertising requirements.
- 2) Construct a temporary closure for the opening with material such as plywood, with a small entry door if needed, until the application can be heard.
- 3) Install a temporary garage door, with building permit and application to MPC Historic Preservation Planner for next HZC agenda indicating a garage door that meets the design guidelines. The applicant would convey their intent to replace the temporary door with an appropriate door within an agreed-upon timeframe.

**STAFF FINDINGS:**

1. The hipped roof frame house and garage appear to have been constructed between 1903 and 1917 based on Sanborn maps and given its construction and materials. Some of the characteristics such as the roof shape, eaves, windows and trim mimic those on the house. Both were constructed c. 1910 according to the National Register inventory, in which the garage is listed as a contributing structure (gasoline-powered automobiles achieved dominance by 1910).
2. The front and side facades of the garage are visible from Caswell Street, which it faces.
3. Based on a 2012 file photo of the former overhead garage door, it was a late, paneled design with three horizontal windows across the top.
4. The currently installed overhead metal garage door does not match the former door and does not correspond with the style of the garage or house.
5. Stamped or raised faux wood-grained steel panels do not adequately simulate wood.

► **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends denial of the currently installed overhead metal garage door.



KGIS Copyright - 2014

**941 Eleanor Street**  
4th and Gill Historic Overlay  
HZC item

941 Eleanor - Front Facade





941 Eleanor Street garage facing Caswell Street



941 Eleanor Street - Rear of house and garage with current door facing Caswell



941 Eleanor Street - Garage with current door facing Caswell and adjacent to public alley



941 Eleanor Street - Close-up of current door facing Caswell