



**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION**

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 1206 Luttrell St 37917

FILE NO.: 1-B-14-HZ

DISTRICT: Fourth and Gill H-1

MEETING DATE: 2/20/2014

APPLICANT: Carl Lansden (potential buyer)

LEVEL OF WORK: Level II. Major repair or replacement of materials or architectural elements.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION: Neoclassical (c. 1910) (altered)

Two-story frame with aluminum siding wall covering. Hip roof with asphalt shingle roof covering. Six-over-four double-hung replacement windows. One-story front portico with square stuccoed columns, replacement sawn wood balustrade and upstairs entry with outside metal stair on front. Stuccoed foundation. Regular plan. Sidelights at front entry. Contributing.

► **DESCRIPTION OF WORK:**

Work Description revised since January 16, 2014 meeting.

LEVEL I (approved by staff)

1. Replace non-original windows with 1/1 wood double-hung to more closely match originals.
2. Expose original bottom right window by removing vinyl siding and install 1/1 double-hung window into original opening.
3. Remove all vinyl siding to show original wood lap siding.
4. Remove steel stair cases from front of building.
5. Replace guttering in-kind.
6. Remove stucco from brick foundation and repoint brick according to Secretary of Interiors Standards.

LEVEL II

- 1) Remove non-original concrete pillars and replace with 12" square wooden porch supports with wood trim pieces to match that on:
 - a) the columns of 1101 Luttrell (See submitted photo.); or
 - b.) the columns of submitted 1920s to 1930s documentary photo showing Ionic volutes at top.
 - 2) Install a single french door panel in center bay of upper level that would be fixed and nonoperable to allude to the door shown in the 1920s to 1930s photo.
 - 3) Install wood handrail at front steps and wood balustrade of 2x2 square with molded handrail to meet code-required height at 36".
 - 4) Eliminate vertical strips in fascia board on front porch with by replacing board with smooth wood panel and molded trim along top and bottom.
 - 5) Construct new front steps from brick to match that revealed on foundation or repair and existing concrete steps.
-



**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION**

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 1206 Luttrell St 37917

FILE NO.: 1-B-14-HZ

DISTRICT: Fourth and Gill H-1

► **APPLICABLE DESIGN GUIDELINES:**

Fourth and Gill Design Guidelines, adopted by the Knoxville City Council on April 20, 1999 and June 29, 1999.

PORCHES

Properly proportioned porches are important to new buildings constructed in Fourth and Gill, helping new construction blend better with the neighborhood.

Rehabilitation and New Construction

1. Repair porches on historic houses using wood floors, balustrades, posts and columns, or replace duplicating the original size and design. Reconstruction of the documented original porch is also appropriate.
4. In new construction, the proportion of the porches to the front facades should be consistent with the historic porches in the neighborhood. Details such as columns, posts, piers, balustrades and porch flooring must use materials that present a visually and physically appropriate appearance historically.

WINDOWS

4. If replacement windows are necessary, they should be the same overall size as the originals, with the same pane division, and the same muntin style and exterior depth, width and profile. False muntins or grids should not be used.
7. It can be appropriate to design and install additional windows on the rear or another secondary elevation. The designs should be compatible with the overall design of the building.

SECRETARY OF INTERIORS STANDARDS

2. The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environmental shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.
3. All buildings, structures, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
4. Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity



**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION**

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 1206 Luttrell St 37917

FILE NO.: 1-B-14-HZ

DISTRICT: Fourth and Gill H-1

of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement or missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

COMMENTS:

The staff findings have been revised since the January 16th meeting, due to the discovery of a 1920s-1930s documentary photo and changes to the original proposal requested by the owner.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1) The house has been heavily altered overall prior to the establishment of the historic overlay. The windows, front door, and porch columns have been replaced or altered inappropriately. Metal stairs to the second-level have been added to the south front side in the more recent past, as well as a second-level door replacing a window to the porch roof. The original full-façade front porch has been reduced to a single-bay central porch, or stoop.
- 2) Documentation on the original appearance of the house in the 1920s or 1930s has been submitted to indicate the design of the front porch and a portion of the front façade. One-over-one windows are shown and a central door on the 2nd level leading to a balustraded porch roof. The columns supporting a full-façade are square with ionic volutes. The photos do not show a balustrade on the historic porch does not
- 3) The two proposed square wood columns with trim on the top and bottom are appropriate for the Neoclassical style of the house. The ionic volutes would not look as appropriate on the more recently existing "stoop" version of the porch as wood simple wood trim.

► **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Approval of two square wood replacement columns to match those at 1101 Luttrell Street or with ionic volutes. Construct new brick steps if mock-up shows that the brick will match that existing on the foundation; otherwise the steps are to be of concrete. Construct fixed multi-light french door panel in center 2nd level. Install 2x2 square balustrade and handrail with molded top rail to meet building code.



KNOXVILLE-KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Date Filed: 12/23/2013

File Number: 1-B-14-HZ

Application Accepted By: Kaye Graybeal

HZC Meeting Date: 12/19/2013

APPLICANT INFORMATION

Name: Carl Lansden
Address: 5315 Asheville Hwy Knoxville, TN 37914
Phone: 865-414-8492 Email:
Relationship to Owner: potential buyer

OWNER INFORMATION

Name: Helen Ross McNabb Center
Address: Knoxville, TN
Phone: Email:

LOCATION OF PROPERTY

Address: 1206 Luttrell St 37917
District: Fourth and Gill H-1

LEVEL OF WORK

Level II. Major repair or replacement of materials or architectural elements.

DESCRIPTION OF WORK

LEVEL I (approved by staff)

1. Replace non-original windows with 1/1 wood double-hung.
2. Expose original bottom right window by removing vinyl siding and install 1/1 double-hung window into original opening.
3. Remove all vinyl siding to show original wood lap siding.
4. Remove upstairs door on the front and replace with window same as noted in #1 above.
5. Remove steel stair cases.
6. Stucco repair at foundation.
7. Replace guttering in-kind.

LEVEL II

Remove non-original concrete pillars and replace with appropriate wooden porch supports between 10" and 12" square inches as approved by staff. (See submitted specs.)

SIGNATURE OF APPLICANT

Date: 12-23-13

Return application to:

Knoxville-Knox County Historic Zoning Commission
Suite 403, City-County Building, 400 Main Street
Knoxville, Tennessee 37902

See Part 2 for submittal information requirements. Incomplete submittals will not be accepted.



KGIS Copyright - 2014

0 50 Feet

1206 Luttrell Street
 HZC agenda item

KGIS - 606 Main St - Suite 150 - Knoxville, TN 37902 - www.kgis.org

Printed: 1/7/2014 at 6:51 PM

Disclaimer: KGIS makes no representation or warranty as to the accuracy of this map and its information nor to its fitness for use. Any user of this map product accepts the same AS IS, WITH ALL FAULTS, and assumes all responsibility for the use thereof, and further covenants and agrees to hold KGIS harmless from any and all damage, loss, or liability arising from any use of this map product.



Square columns with trim at 1101 Luttrell proposed for 1206 Luttrell.
1-16-2014 HZC meeting submittal



1206 Luttrell – Front



1206 Luttrell –View from southwest



1206 Luttrell – Front porch



1206 Luttrell – Front door



1206 Luttrell – North side



1206 Luttrell – South side



1206 Luttrell – Older photograph