

AGENDA
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF AUGUST 21, 2008

- Call to Order
- Introduction of Visitors
- [Approval of Minutes – July 17 , 2008, meeting](#)
- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning
- [Discussion of Working Draft, Market Square Sign Guidelines Revision](#)
- [Staff Report \(Level I Certificates\): Ann Bennett](#)
- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Old North Knoxville H-1

[1409 Grainger Avenue](#) – Forest Kirkpatrick (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 71108ONK

Work Description

Replace currently deteriorated foundation at same elevation, jacking up house and using concrete block faced with original brick laid with low-content Portland mortar to protect the original bricks. Insert wood awning windows on side elevations. Install garage door on rear and 36" access door on rear side.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 71108ONK. Proposed foundation work is necessary to stabilize building, and will not be visible from Grainger Avenue. The foundation height will be fixed at the existing level, consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

The majority of buildings on the north side of Grainger were built with raised basements at the rear elevation, or have modified existing foundations to incorporate raised basements, since the lots slope so markedly down to First Creek. The applicant proposed to perform much needed structural work, and the final basement reconstruction will conform this home to others on the street. It will not be visible from Grainger.

[229 E. Scott Avenue](#) - Charles Richmond (Applicant), Steven and Lauren Rider (Owner) – Certificate No. 71708ONK

Work Description

Rebuild wooden front steps as concrete steps with sloping brick buttresses down each side and wrought iron railing, either one central or two (one on each buttress); install 42" wrought iron porch railing on front porch.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 71708ONK. Proposed improvements are consistent with adopted design guidelines (see Entrances, pg. 19, #4.)

Additional Comments

The wood steps accessing the front porch were repaired when the house was rehabilitated a few years ago, and have already deteriorated through exposure to the weather. The installation of concrete steps and brick buttresses, which are consistent in size, material and design with other front steps in the district, will correct an ongoing maintenance problem. The front porch does not have a railing; installation of a simple wrought iron railing is not only appropriate for the house's style, but is also the least obvious solution to the safety issue of a tall front porch without a protective railing.

4th & Gill H-1

1116 Luttrell Street – David Kerns (Applicant), Lois Presser (Owner) – Certificate No. 806084&G

Work Description

Convert covered porch at rear, right corner of house, not visible from Luttrell, replace with enclosed room. Exterior of wood lap siding, three over one windows, reusing existing roof with repairs to roof if necessary, reuse existing foundation. Install corner boards.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 806084&G. Proposed work will not be visible from Luttrell. Design guidelines recommend locating exterior additions at the rear of historic buildings (pg. 18, New Additions, #1).

Additional Comments

The rear porch is not a defining architectural element.

1065 Scenic Drive – Vern Patterson (Applicant), Richard & Deborah Whipple (Owner) – Certificate No. 73108SCN

Work Description

Construct one room, second story addition on rear of house above flat roofed garage, using slate roof to match existing, wood siding, and existing brick wall. Shallow slope to one side will be copper roof. Existing window on rear of house will be removed. New window will be added to rear wall. Footprint of house will not change; change will be in rear of house only, with intersecting cross gable roof replacing existing flat roof over garage.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 73108SCN. Proposed changes will not change appearance of house from Scenic Drive.

Additional Comments

The home has a large setback from Scenic Drive, and the rear ell is not visible from Scenic at the present time. The added second story, with details that are consistent with the design of the existing house, will also not be visible from Scenic.

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1644 Clinch Avenue – Alice Basler (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 80508FTS

Work Description

Demolish existing two story building, which is structurally compromised.

Construct new two story bungalow with lap siding, front gable roof with shingled front gable and exposed rafter tails, one story gabled front porch with kingpost, exposed trusses, and square wood posts on brick piers, sawn wood side rails, brick buttresses, eight over one windows, tripled on front elevation, rear cottage window with transom and one over one side windows, and tripled eight pane attic windows, brick foundation. New structure 16' from Clinch (with 10' deep front porch), 8' in each side yard, and a 31' rear setback with a 16' deep rear deck. Roof slopes and window measurements are not included on the submitted materials.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80508FTS as to demolition of building; DENY construction of new building as submitted, subject to some modifications as discussed below.

Additional Comments

The demolition of the existing building is allowed under pg. 22 of the design guidelines, paragraph J.1, which notes that "the HZC may allow demolition if a building has been condemned by the City of Knoxville for structural reasons . . ." The building that still stands at 1644 Clinch was apparently condemned by the city of Knoxville in 1998, although it continued to house tenants until 2006. Housing Codes Enforcement officials have indicated that structural issues are a part of the reason the building was condemned.

The applicant has also requested approval for construction of a new two story building of frame construction with Hardi-plank wall covering and shingles. The following points should be considered in discussing the proposed new design:

- 1) Hardi-plank wall covering is allowed under the design guidelines 9, pg. 9, #2, that allowed clapboard or clapboard-like and shingle or shingle-like materials.
- 2) The proposed Craftsman style is one of the historic building forms found in Ft. Sanders.
- 3) The applicant proposes a front gable roof that does include typical Craftsman style ornamentation. The Ft. Sanders Design Guidelines, B. Roofs, pg. 7 discuss the steep roofs, dormers, hipped roofs and other variations that are common in Ft. Sanders, while B2 calls for "variations in the form of the roof about the second story such as gables at different angles, hipped roofs and dormers". The roof slope in the submitted materials is not known, but appears to be 5/12 or 6/12.
- 4) Building height is appropriate.

- 5) Although the proposed infill building's front porch contains typical Craftsman-era detailing, the porch could be improved by increasing its width on the front façade. Typical porch width in Ft. Sanders is generally greater than the width of the porch on the proposed infill.
- 6) The proposed infill shows windows of varying size, but all are fairly small. The appearance of the building could be enhanced by small increases in the height and width of the windows, particularly on the second story.
- 7) The front setback for new buildings should be the same distance as the majority of pre-1940 houses on the block. (See pg. 16, I.1.) In this case, the setback for the original building was approximately 21 feet, which mimics the house next door to the east and a majority of the other houses on the block. The front porch, which is shown to extend ten feet into the front yard, may continue to extend into the front yard under the adopted design guidelines (see pg. 16, I. 3.) If a modification is made to the submitted design to allow for an increased setback, other elements of the design would be acceptable. The rear yard would be reduced by moving the building back on the lot, from 31 feet to approximately 26 feet.

Market Square H-1

4 Market Square – Robert Marlino (Smee Busby, Applicant) - 4MCLLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 80508MKT

Work Description

Install two signs. 1) hanging sign, sized 2'6" x 3'7", two sided, from simple bracket; 2) hanging blade sign on side wall, approximately 170.58" long x 32.63 wide (14'2" x 2'7" with a 6" projection from the building, internally light (using LED illumination) with outline of white light bulbs on perimeter and centered letters internally illuminated in white, and with blue outline on perimeter and flat edge on side and an arrow at bottom to resemble neon sign.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE hanging sign (first portion of 80508MKT), which is consistent with adopted Market Square Design guidelines (see Design Guidelines, D.2.) APPROVE blade sign (second portion of 80508MKT).

Additional Comments

The proposed blade sign is located on the walkway, off the frontage of Market Square, and uses modern lighting to replicate a neon blade sign typical of the 1920s when the Vogue Building was constructed. Its coloration, shape and lighting will enhance the historic character of Market Square, and will not set a precedent for the remainder of the buildings on the Square since none of them has access to a location removed from the front elevation of the buildings. Neon is discussed as an appropriate lighting for Market Square signs (see Signs, D.5.) NOTE: The size of the blade sign has been reduced to a 2'7" width and a 14'2" height, approximately, to address concerns about the size of the proposed sign.

Village of Concord H-1

1100 Church – Dan Tankersley (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 80408CON

Work Description

Repair or replace wood siding in kind; install appropriate windows (usually two sash multi-panes) corresponding to appropriate construction period; install new three panel door with 6 light one-quarter windows, to be installed at either end of front elevation facing Second; install two new windows facing Second; replace existing overhead garage door with carriage style garage door; replacing siding door with French doors; replace basement access plank door on east elevation (not visible from Second or Church); remove window on east elevation, not visible from Second or Church.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80408CON. The building has had numerous changes over time. The proposed alterations will unify many of those changes, making the interior spaces more livable and creating a unified and appropriate exterior appearance.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on September 18, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.