

AGENDA
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF APRIL 17, 2008

- Call to Order
- Introduction of Visitors
- Approval of Minutes – [March 20, 2008, meeting](#)
- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chairman Nic Arning
- [Staff Report \(Level I Certificates\)](#): Ann Bennett
- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General

[402, 404, 406, 414, 1011, 1016 11th Street](#) – Jason DeBord (Cardinal Investment Properties, LLC) (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 40108 GEN

Work Description

Repair or replace windows as necessary, duplicating style of window being replaced if replacement is necessary. (Window styles vary among the Seven Houses, and include 1/1, 2/2, 2/1 and 4/4.) Remove glass atrium added to 1011 Laurel at the time of the World's Fair, returning house to its original footprint.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40108GEN. Proposed window repair and replacement are consistent with Standard #6. Removal of the added greenhouse at 1011 Laurel is consistent with Standards #2 & #3. The added greenhouse is inconsistent with the building.

Additional Comments

Standard #6: "Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials."

Standard #2: "The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #3: "Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken."

Market Square H-1

18 Market Square – Michael Brady, Inc. (Applicant), Cardinal Enterprises (Owner) – Certificate No. 40208MKT

Work Description

Repair existing brick facades where necessary, with replacement brick and mortar to match existing; repair existing window sills if necessary; install sign board on #16 in keeping with cornice of #18 & #20, smaller in scale and spanning between outer pilasters above storefront and below window sills; repair existing cornice at #18 & #20; install new sign board on #22, spanning between outermost pilasters and filling in space above storefront and below window sills, with signage to be relocated to sign board areas; review in concept one story rooftop addition.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE sign board requests of Certificate No. 40208MKT; DENY third floor addition. The requests for brick and cornice repair and installation of sign boards are consistent with adopted design guidelines. The third floor addition is not consistent.

Additional Comments

For items related to brick, cornice and sign board items, see Market Square Design Guidelines, see II.C.1. Masonry and II.D.1. Signs. Market Square Design Guidelines also contain provisions for New Construction in Section III. III.7. "The height and setback of new buildings shall be consistent with neighboring buildings." The design guidelines are based on the Secretary of Interior's Standards, which call for "9. . . . Alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural materials, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood or environment." 16-22 Market Square are two story buildings, as are the buildings on either side of them. Any addition to the rooftop of these buildings would be very visible from the street, and would be out of character and would not respect the scale of surrounding buildings. In guiding projects using the Secretary's Standards, the National Register review staff has sometimes allowed roof additions for buildings taking advantage of the Federal tax credits. Their interpretation of circumstances when rooftop additions would be allowed involve two caveats: first, that the addition must only take place on four story or greater buildings, and second, that the addition must be set back in such a way that it is not visible from surrounding streets. An addition in this location would not meet either of those criterion.

14 Market Square – John L. Sanders AIA, Sanders Pace Architecture, (Applicant), Allen Grady (Owner) – Certificate No. 40308MKT

Work Description

Black awning with downlights, no signage or logos, over width of storefront between piers (20'2" and 6" deep).

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40308MKT. Proposed sign and canopy are consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

See Section II.D.1., which allows a sign board located below the second story window sills and above the storefront, and II.E.2.-4, which allows canopies above the display windows and below the storefront cornice or sign panel, between the piers.

General

447 N. Broadway – Randall DeFord (Applicant) Minvilla Manor, LP, Ginny Weatherstone, President (Owner) – Certificate No. 40208GEN

Work Description

NOTE: To assist in describing the two sections of the buildings Allan Associates Architects PLLC has used the terms Building A and Building B. Building A is the portion of the building facing North Broadway. Building B is the portion of the building facing West Fifth Avenue.

Façade: Brick façade will be cleaned and repaired in accordance with the recommendations of the National Park Service’s Preservation Briefs; the brick will be repainted. Due to possible damage to the original brick façade, stuccoed portions of the façade will be cleaned and repainted. Existing windows will be restored; missing windows will be replaced with compatible new windows. One non-original window opening in the east end projecting bay of Building B will be removed and the opening filled in with brick and mortar to match that of the adjacent wall. Missing stone sills will be replaced. Metal cornice will be cleaned, repaired and repainted.

Porches: Brick piers will be repaired as described in the section on Brick Façade. Wood ceiling, brackets and cornice features will be repaired and replaced where missing. Enough molding and trim remain to replicate the missing portions.

Building A: the original porch floors and floor structure were removed in the 1960s to create a common lobby for both buildings at a new elevation between the basement and first floor. Much of the original porch material remains above the floor level. Because the first floor of Building A will be used as the main and accessible entrance to both buildings, no aspect of these porch floors are planned to be restored. Instead, a concrete porch floor will be installed at the level of the original building floor. This new porch floor will be linked with a new ramp to provide an accessible entrance to both buildings and a single set of concrete steps and brick wing walls with brick caps will be built at one end.

Building B: These front porches will have their original floors restored in elevation and material, with the following exception. There are two sets of concrete steps and brick wing walls with concrete caps which we propose to leave in place. Three of these porch floors have been raised a few inches; we propose to return these to their original level and wood flooring. The floor of Building B is at one level and the porches of Building B were originally all at another level a few inches below the building floor level. New concrete steps and brick wing walls with brick caps

will be provided from the sidewalk to the porches.

While we possess physical evidence of most of the various architectural elements of the front porches, no portions of the porch railings exist. We have been unable to locate any historic photos of the building. The only evidence we have of porch railing is the shadow on the brick piers. There is an 'over paint' shadow of the vertical board which the rail abutted.

That shadow confirms the existence of a rail and its height. Our proposed rail is intended to suggest a simple and compatible reference to a historic wood porch rail without creating a false sense of history by using an elaborately turned spindle for which we have no documentation on these buildings.

Additions: Buildings A and B will be linked by a corridor and elevator core. This addition will be recessed away from the North Broadway façade to reduce visual impact. The painted brick addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

A new exit stair will be built behind the Building B near Queen Street in order to have a low visual impact upon the structure. The stair will be accessed via covered open air corridors placed in an area that would have originally been a recessed area between two townhouses. The painted brick addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

A new stair will be built behind Building A to meet exiting requirements with a low visual impact upon the structure. The stair will be placed in an area that would have originally been a recessed area between two townhouses. The addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

Demolition: Existing non original concrete and metal stairs will be removed. Additionally, on the rear of Building A, one of the original recessed exterior areas that would have been between two individual townhouses has been filled in with an enclosed addition. The enclosure closes off the originally open end of this area with a wood frame wall and clad with stucco. This frame addition, porch roof and concrete steps will be removed in order to return back of this portion of Building A to its original appearance.

Site

The entire rear area will be fenced with a 42-48 inch ornamental metal fence to provide security. The Building B (West Fifth Avenue) façade will receive a 42-48 inch ornamental metal fence and gates between the porches and city sidewalk.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40208GEN. The proposed changes are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards adopted as design guidelines for this property.

Additional Comments

The project that centers around this building will meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards adopted as design guidelines, and has been reviewed at the state and National level for conformity with those Standards.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2032 Jefferson Avenue – Jason Canada (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 040108EDG

Work Description

Remove unoriginal kitchen window on east side addition; remove rear bathroom window on first floor; install skylight on rear, west side, not visible from Jefferson (hidden by dormer).

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 040108EDG. Work proposed in Level II is consistent with approved Design guidelines; Level I certificate was issued 4/2/08.

Additional Comments

Applicant proposes to remove two windows, one on the rear elevation and one unoriginal window on an addition at the rear of the building; neither window is readily visible from the street, with the only original window being completely hidden on the rear elevation. Both are desirable to increase the efficiency of the interior floor plan. (See Windows, pg. 15, Design Guidelines)

Proposed skylight is at the rear of the side roof elevation, behind a larger dormer, and will not be visible from Jefferson, meeting the design guidelines provisions (see Roofs, Pg. 15, #5.)

Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1

2020 Emoriland Boulevard – Jordan Reagan/Reagan Investments (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 31208FEM - Construct new two story house, approximate 15' side yard on east and approximate 5' on west; front yard setback same as measurements of house on either side to front corner; siding (aluminum, vinyl, Hardi-plank smooth, or wood) to resemble wood, brick faced foundation, one over one windows; hipped roof with front gable (either asphalt shingle or metal roof); eight foot deep. Shed roof full front porch with paired square wood columns and sawn wood railing with rails set into top and bottom rails; rear deck; half view glass front door. If driveway is constructed, it will terminate in rear yard.

Work Description

Construct new two-story house, approximate 15' side yard on east and approximate 5' on west; front yard setback same as measurements of house on either side to front corner; siding (aluminum, vinyl, Hardi-plank smooth, or wood) to resemble wood, brick faced foundation, one over one windows; hipped roof with front gable (either asphalt shingle or metal roof); eight foot deep. Shed roof full front porch with paired square wood columns and sawn wood railing with rails set into top and bottom rails; rear deck; half view glass front door. If driveway is constructed, it will terminate in rear yard.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 31208FEM. The proposed house design is an appropriate interpretation of the Colonial Revival style detailed in the Matrix of Prevalent House Styles and Design Features, pg. 6 of the Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

The proposed site plan shows the house located to one side of the lot to allow driveway access to the rear yard.

Tazewell Pike NC-1

4226 Tazewell Pike - Cliff Sands (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 30208TAZ

Work Description

Construction of secondary (accessory) structure, approximately 20x37 feet, with gable end, shingled roof, siding to match existing house, foundation slab or to match existing home foundation if matching material can be found, with overhead garage door. Accessory building to be located approximately 180 feet from Tazewell Pike, and 5 feet from side line.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 21208TAZ. Proposed outbuilding is located to the side and well to the rear of the existing primary structure on the lot. Applicant is matching the materials on the existing building (see pgs. 8 & 9 of design guidelines).

Additional Comments

Even though it is well back of the existing dwelling and will not be visible from Tazewell Pike, the proposed accessory structure is consistent with the design guidelines.

Old North Knoxville H-1

409 E. Oklahoma – William Meredith (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 32708ONK

Work Description

Replace window in front gable roof. Replace windows in block building (non-contributing) located to the rear of primary building and not visible from E. Oklahoma; install vinyl siding on block building.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 32708ONK. If the attic window is changed, a specific design will call for more information than was provided in this application. The Design Guidelines, pg. 29, Accessory Buildings, call for wood siding and windows.

Additional Comments

Applicant has indicated that window in front gable of the house is deteriorated and in need of replacement. If he chooses to replace this window, the new window should be consistent with the architecture of the building, and any grandfathering that accompanies the existing window will be lost. Originally, the front gable would have had a very small glassed opening or louvered shutter, since the attic space was probably converted to living space. Code requirements for a

bedroom opening would include a minimum 5.7 sq. ft. of open exit space, with minimum dimensions of no smaller than 20" in width and 22" in height. An exact sign and design must be submitted in order to allow an adequate review.

1518 Broadway - Malleharris LLC, J Myers Morton (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 40308ONK

Work Description

Use cementitious siding because wood siding is not available to execute siding design approved at Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting of November 15, 2007.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 40308ONK.

Additional Comments

Although the design guidelines adopted for Old North Knoxville specify wood siding, there are three mitigating factors in the case of this building - 1) only half of the building is in the historic overlay; 2) the building was built in an era when non-traditional building materials were commonly used; and 3) the applicant (Frank Sparkman, architect for the project) made the Commission aware at the November 15, 2007, meeting that he did not know if wood to execute this design was reasonably available; Sparkman and the commission noted that it would be possible to revisit the type of materials used if securing wood siding became a problem. The current design and materials are not in keeping with the overall design of Old North Knoxville, and the appearance of the building will be improved by the installation of new materials contemplated in this certificate.

General

1164 Armstrong (Armstead Pl.) – Scott Kehne, Farmers Mutual of Tennessee – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 32608GEN

Work Description

Demolish designated structure.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 32608GEN. Proposed demolition is not consistent with adopted Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

Farmer's Mutual (Mr. Kehne's firm) purchased 1164 Armstrong in March 2005. The building was in poor condition then, and its condition has not improved since there has been no maintenance since 2005.

Some time after it purchased the property, Farmer's Mutual indicated a desire to demolish the building in order to accommodate a retention basin in connection with proposed construction at the corner of Broadway and Wells (not included in an H-1 overlay). Mr. Kehne offered the building for removal to another lot in the Old North area; the costs of moving it could not be

recouped in the sales price, and no appropriate location was found for the building. Old North then worked with Mr. Kehne to allow provide for landscaping and other buffering, both on the H-1 lot and on the adjacent undesignated parcel. The initial design proposed by Farmer's Mutual was a brick office building with limited front yard parking and heavy landscaping, which could have been acceptable to Old North. In the current proposal, the undesignated parcel appears to contain more front yard parking and diminished landscaping. However, that site plan and the design of the building are not the subject of this review, since that property is undesignated.

Under the currently submitted proposal, the lot at 1164 Armstrong, which is designated, will be used for 7 parking spaces and a dumpster. The south and west sides of the dumpster will be screened with "Otto Luyken" Laurels, while the parking area to the west will be ringed with alternating Sky Pencil Hollies and Dwarf Boxwoods. Access to the parking will be screened on the west with Viburnum and Thornless Honeylocust. On the north and west sides of the detention pond will be Foster Hollies on an 11' spacing. The bottom of the detention pond will be sodded. Sweetbay magnolias will be the three easternmost trees at the eastern south side of the detention pond. Along Broadway will be two Cloud Nine Dogwoods. The corner of Broadway and Wells will be planted with two Kousa Dogwoods and Otto Luyken Laurel. Three additional trees on the Wells side of the parcel will be planted with Washington Hawthorns. The trees that are called out are generally 15-20 feet tall, while most of the shrubs are 8-10' tall, all at maturity. They will adequately buffer the residential properties to the west, although granting demolition of the building at 1164 Armstrong will not guarantee that the applicant's new building will be constructed or the landscaping installed.

Fourth & Gill H-1

1310 Luttrell – Trudy Moore – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 403084&G

Work Description

Construct one story gable roof garage, roof pitch to match house, wood shingle wall covering. Clopay custom overhead doors to mimic carriage house, building turned to avoid direct door opening on Luttrell. In-ground pool.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 403084&G.

Additional Comments

The design guidelines, pg. 19, Outbuildings #1, provide that simple one story garages are appropriate in the Fourth and Gill Historic District, provided their size and construction materials are consistent with the primary building on the lot.

Applicant proposes to install an in-ground pool with a pool deck resembling stone, in the large front/side yard on corner of Luttrell and Glenwood, with garage behind it and turned so it does not open directly on Luttrell. The corner of Glenwood and Luttrell is a major neighborhood entrance.

Although the design of the garage and the pool are consistent with the design guidelines and appropriate to the district, the location of the pool at a major neighborhood entrance may not be appropriate. The adopted design guidelines do not address this issue, providing only that outbuildings should be built at the rear of lots in Fourth & Gill.

- Adjournment

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on May 15, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.